

University of Cincinnati



August 19, 1994

College of Medicine

Department of Otolaryngology -
Head and Neck Surgery
University of Cincinnati
PO Box 670528
Cincinnati OH 670528

231 Bethesda Avenue

Patrick Murphy
Jacobson, Maynard, Tuschman
Attorneys at Law
7001 Lakeside Avenue, Suite 1600
Cleveland, OH 44114-1192
FAX (216)621-3947

DOC 405

(see DOC 406 1/20/94)

RE: Boyd vs. Brown

Dear Mr. Murphy:

I am writing to inform you that when I was first asked to review the case (Boyd vs. Brown), I did so from the point of view concerning the prevailing standard of care, which I felt was appropriate and within the accepted standards of care. As my review progressed, I came upon several facts that were disturbing. First, Mr. Boyd was unusually young to have developed a head and neck squamous cell carcinoma. Even though he smoked, this particular cellular cancer is most often found in men in their upper 50's, 60's, and 70's. Secondly, the mode of metastasis was extremely unusual. It is stated that the major meta-stasis was actually in the left supraclavicular area, which is extremely unusual for a primary tumor that is presumed to have arisen on the left side of the tongue. In addition, the extremely aggressive behavior of the metastasis is suspicious for an additional primary tumor since the lesion in the tongue was so quiescent, it went unnoticed by a number of examiners, and the patient himself did not bring it to their attention, since it obviously did not bother him or concern him. A review of the CT scan makes note of a "lesion" that was seen in the trachea at the carina, and extended to the bronchus. This was never pursued.

In summary, the very unusual "youth" of Mr. Boyd plus the extremely dramatic aggressiveness of the metastasis with, if it were the only primary, a quiescent primary lesion on the tongue, plus the location of the metastasis (supraclavicular as vs. upper digastric cervical chain). would strongly indicate another primary lesion of a much more aggressive nature. This concept is strengthened by the fact that one in three head and neck cancer patients will develop a second primary within the next five years after the diagnosis of their first primary, and approximately 11% have two primary lesions when first seen. The second primary may not be causing symptoms at all at that time.

175 YEARS OF CREATING FUTURES TOGETHER

An affirmative and equitable opportunity institution

Patrick Murphy
Page 2

If I can give you any further information, please do not hesitate to call upon me.

Sincerely,

Donald A. Shumrick, M.D., M.B.A.
Professor

DAS/kd