	1
1	IN THE COURT OF COMMON PLEAS
2	CUYAHOGA COUNTY, OHIO
3	REBEKAH BERLINGER, DOC. 281
4	etc., et al.,
5	Plaintiffs, <u>JUDGE J.P. Kilbane</u>
6	-vs- <u>CASE NO. 94277</u>
7	MT. SINAI MEDICAL CENTER, et al.,
8	D e f e n d a n t s .
9	
10	Deposition of <u>LEON I. MANN, M.D.</u> , taken as if
11	upon examination before Dawn M. Hagestrom, a
12	Registered Professional Reporter and Notary
13	Public within and for the State of Ohio, at the
14	Cleveland Metropolitan General-Highland View
15	Hospital, 3395 Scranton Road, Cleveland, Ohio,
16	at. 10:00 a.m. on Friday, July 31, 1987, pursuant
17	to notice and/or stipulations of counsel., on
18	behalf of the <b>Plaintiffs</b> in this cause.
19	
20	MEHLER & HAGESTROM, INC.
21	Registered Professional Reporters
22	650 Engineers Building Cleveland, Ohio 44134 (216) 621-4984
23	(210) 021-4904
24	
25	

Stands .

1	<u>APPEARANCES</u> :
2	Don C. Iler, Esq.
3	Law <b>Offices</b> of Dan C. Iler 1640 Standard Building Clausland Obio
4	Cleveland, Ohio (216) 696-5700,
5	On behalf of the Plaintiff;
6	Patrick J. Murphy, Esq. Jacobson, Maynard, Tuschman & Kalur
7	100 Erieview Plaaa Fourteenth Floor
8	Cleveland, Ohio $44114$ (216) $625 - 5400$ ,
9	On behalf of the Defendant
10	Dr. Robert Schwartz;
11	Gary H. Goldwasser, Esq. Reminger & <b>Reminger</b>
12	7th Floor 113 St. Clair Building Cleveland, Ohio 44114
13	(216) 687-1311,
14	On behalf of the Defendant Mt. Sinai Hospital;
15	ALSO PRESENT:
16 17	Nancy Iler
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
2 4	
2 5	

3 1 LEON I. MANN, M.D., of lawful age, called by the Plaintiffs for the purpose of 2 examination, as provided by the Rules of Civil 3 4 Procedure, being by me first duly sworn, as hereinafter certified, deposed and said as 5 follows: 6 7 EXAMINATION OF LEON I. MANN, M.D. BY MR. ILER: 8 9 MR. ILER: Let the record reflect 10 that we are taking the deposition of Dr. Mann as 11 on cross-examination and as discovery of an expert's opinion concerning the above-entitled 12 13 case. All the attorneys involved in the 14 litigation have been notified of the deposition, 15 and if there are any imperfections in the notice 1€ of this deposition it's been waived; we are all 17 here by agreement, is that agreed? 18 MR. MURPHY: I will object to the 1: characterization as if on cross-examination for 2 the discovery. 2 Doctor, can we have your full name? Q. 2 Leon Isaac Mann. Α. 2 That is M A N N? Q. 2 \_ Α. Correct.

		4
1	Α.	2 Foxwood Lane, Pepper Pike, Ohio 44124,
2	Q .	How long have you lived there?
3	Α.	One year.
, 4	Q.	And your office address is here at Cleveland
5		Metropolitan Hospital?
6	Α.	Correct.
7		MR. ILER: Can I have his
8		curriculum vitae?
9		MR. MURPHY: I guess the record
1 0		could show we will incorporate that into the
11		record.
1 2		MR. ILER: That would be fine, Mr.
13		M u r p h y ,
14		We just received a copy of the curriculum
15		vitae of Dr. Leon I. Mann. We will get a copy
16		of it later on, Mr. Murphy will get me one, so
17		it will help us move along a little bit.
18	Q .	You have written a report concerning the care
19		and treatment of Rebekah?
20	Α.	Yes, I have.
21	Q.	The report is dated June the 8th of 3987, right?
22	Α.	Correct.
23	Q.	And did you have, do you have a file an this
24		case? Do you have any personal notes?
25	Α.	Yes, 1 do.

nisiyetin direvela

<u>(</u>1917) (2017)

\*\*

•

,		
		5
1	Q.	Can I see them?
2	Α.	I don't have them here.
3	Q.	Could you get them for me?
4	A .	Sure.
5		MR. ILER: Could the court reporter
6		please mark these.
7		
8		(Whereupon, Plaintiffs' Exhibit
9		Nos. 1 through 6 were marked for purposes of
10		identification.)
11		
12	Q.	Thank you very much, doctor. I have had the
13		court reporter mark Plaintiffs' Exhibits Nos. 1
14		through 6. Can you identify what these yellow
15		sheets of paper are?
16	Α.	These yellow sheets of paper represent my notes
17		as I reviewed the materials sent to me by the
18		attorney for the defendant and
19	Q.	Are the notes made in your handwriting?
20	Α.	Yes, they are.
2 1		MR. ILER: Can we at a later time
22		get a legible copy of them?
23		MR. MURPHY: We will Xerox them for
24		everybody.
25		MR. ILER: May I have an agreement-

-

e de la compansión de la c

6 1 with you, Mr. Murphy, if I find I cannot rear! 2 the doctor's handwriting for whatever reason, I would rather not make a mistake, can I work 3 through you? If you send me a copy and I can't 4 5 read a notation can you please ask him, the 6 doctor, so that I don't misinterpret anything? 7 I think I would rather MR. MURPHY: 8 do that than take time now to have him read 9 everything. 10 MR. ILER: Yes. 11 MR. MURPHY: Okay, sure. I understand from your curriculum vitae, you 12 Ω. 13 have attained quite a record and congratulations 14 to you on a marvelous curriculum vitae. Very, 15 very nice. And I just will not go through your 16 medical education because it's all Listed here. 17 And the staff appointments you have are 18 remarkable and you have also published a number 19 of articles, too, in the field of OB/GYN and 20 neonatology; I see those listed. 21 Α. Not neonatology. 22 Q. Just OB/GYN? 23 Α. Yes. 24 Q. This is the first time I have seen this. I'11 25 just spend a moment with you on the, in the

		7
1		immediate past position category of your
2		background and your work.
3		In July of '85 to June of '86 you were
4		professor and director of obstetrics, the
5		department of obstetrics and gynecology in the
6		Indiana School of Medicine?
7	Α.	That's correct.
8	Q.	That was from July to June. That covers about a
9		year or thereabout?
10	Α.	Correct.
11	Q.	Was that like on a rotational thing? Why were
12		you there only a year? is there an academic
13		reason that I do not know about?
14	Α.	No, there is no academic reason.
15	Q.	Do you. take appointments like this appointment
16		at Indiana University, it being for a year? Why
17		is it only for a year, why isn't it for five
18		years or ten years?
19	Α.	Initially it was not for a year, it was when I
20		decided to return to academic medicine from the
21		corporate job that I had that had brought me to
22		Indianapolis, I went and was recruited for a job
23		at the Indiana University as director of
24		obstetrics, not a particular time limit.
25	Q.	Insofar as the Limeframe, did you go to Indiana

ومحرجوه والموجود جوا

í

		8
1		University after working with the Lilly Company?
2	Α.	Correct.
3	Q.	Did you go from Eli Lilly Company to Indiana?
4	Α.	Yes.
5	Q.	The next position that, is earlier than that is
6		from July of '84 to June of '85 where you were
7		the executive director, corporate medica3
8		affairs Eli Lilly research department,. Eli Lilly
9		& Company, Incorporated,. Indianapolis, Indiana?
10	Α.	That's correct.
11	Q.	You were there for approximately a year?
12	Α.	Correct.
13	Q.	And what did you do as an executive director of
14		the Eli Lilly Company?
15	a.	I was primarily involved with the medical
16		aspects of the research and development of
17		various drugs.
18	Q.	And are you free to say what those drugs were or
19		is this a corporate, you know
20	Α.	I don't know whether I'm free or not free. I'm
21		not sure I can remember any number of them, but
22		there are $\mathbf{a}$ number that $\mathbf{I}$ would remember there
23		are certain restrictions in discussion because
24		they were at the early stages of development.
25	Q.	The corporate competitiveness of the subject

4.000

		9
1		matter I understand. You were the executive
2		director of Lilly Corporation in the research
3		and development of drugs?
4	Α.	I also had involvement with other parts of the
5		corporation.
6	Q.	Can you describe those for me?
7	Α.	I worked with the legal division as medical
8		consultation to various questions and issues
9		that might arise.
10	Q .	And in that regard in the legal field of the
11		Lilly Company, can you tell me a little bit more
12		about that? How were you involved in legal
13		matters of the Lilly Company?
14	Α.	If there was <b>a</b> particular product liability that
15		they wanted discussion with a medical person
16		regarding the medical aspects of the case, they
17		discussed it with me, as well as other
18		physicians, as part of my assignment.
19	Q.	When you worked with the legal department of the
20		Lilly Company were you involved in pending
21		claims that users of Lilly products had made
22		against the Lilly Company?
23	Α.	Yes.
24	Q .	And in that regard, would you did you give
25		medical advice to the Lilly Company insofar as

ł,

and the second second

		1 0
1		those claims that users of Lilly drugs or
2		products were making against the company?
3	Α.	In some part, yes.
4	Q.	And did you also work together with lawyers in
5		the Lilly Corporation to give them medical
6		advice in defending claims that people who had
7		used Lilly products were making against the
8		company?
9	a.	Yes, I did.
10	Q.	Did you, were you represented and did you give
Ιf		depositions in pending cases against Lilly
12		C o m p a n y ?
13	Α.	No, I did not.
14	Q.	Did you ever testify in court for the Lilly
15		Company?
16	Α.	No, I did not.
17	Q.	Okay. Was there a, this was in the year 1984 to
18		1985. At that time were these a series of
19		lawsuits brought against the Lilly Company for a
20		particular drug?
21	Α.	A number of lawsuits €or various drugs.
22	Ω.	Do any of those drugs stand out in your mind?
23	Α.	Not any in particular.
24	Q .	Did Lilly produce an early morning, pardon me, a
25		drug used by, used for women who were pregnant?

,

1 A.	Yes, they did.
2 Q.	What was that drug's name?
3 A.	Diethylstilbestrol.
4 Q.	Wasn't there Litigation involving that
5	particular drug throughout the country?
6 A.	Yes, there was.
7 Q.	What seemed to be the claim?
8	MR. ILER: Am I going too far?
9	MR. MURPHY: I think you are. I'm
10	going to <b>object.</b>
11	MR. ILER: That's all right.
12 Q.	Insofar as your legal aspect, were you giving
13	the Lilly Company advice about that particular
14	drug?
15 A.	Well, actually for most of the time $I$ was there,
16	counselor, I was sort of learning about it,
17	never paid all that much attention to that one
18	particular drug, learning more about the drug in
19	that short time that I was there.
20 Q.	Well, the issue of learning about the drug was
21	to get you acquainted with the use of the drug,
22	the way the drug operated on pregnant women, ${f I}$
23	assume?
24 A.	Yes, I would say that.
25 Q.	And then after you had accumulated that

in the second second

12 Ι knowledge with your medical background then you were prepared to give opinions either to 3 3 executives of the Lilly Company or to their 4 legal staff on what your medical opinion was 5 concerning that drug, right? 6 I'm sorry. Could you repeat that? Α. 7 8 (Thereupon, the requested portion of 9 the record was read by the Notary.) 1.011 Yes, correct. Strictly the legal department. Α, 12 Aside from that particular drug, did you ever Ω. 13 work on any other drugs? 14 Α. Yes. Which were they? 15 Q. 16 MR. MURPHY: Let me note an 17 objection. I think this is far afield of a 18 discovery deposition of an expert unless and if 19 you can show me there are drugs in here that may 2.0 be an issue that were given by Dr. Schwartz to Mrs. Berlinger, if the doctor knows something 21 22 about them and can give opinions, but otherwise let's move along and get to this case. 23 24 MR. ILER: I'm just trying to get a 25 little more background on the drugs because

杨岛

		13
I		there were drugs used here with this lady.
2		MR. MURPHY: Well, ask him about
3		these drugs.
4	Q.	What other drugs were you involved with with the
5		Lilly Company?
6		MR. MURPHY: You are not going to
7		answer that question, doctor. Let's move on.
8		MR. ILER: Would you certify the
9		question to Dr. Mann?
10		MR. MURPHY: Yes.
11		MR. ILER: Under agreement of
12		counsel, I want to know what other drugs that
13		Dr. Mann has worked in with the Lilly Company
14		and I also want to know why he was so doing it.
15		and whether it was involved in litigation.
16	Q.	Now then, what I see is on your curriculum
17		vitae, doctor, after you had been to Lilly
18		Company, before that you were professor and
19		chairman of the department of OB/GYN, University
2 0		of Vermont, and as a <b>professor</b> you were there
21		from 1976 to 1984, am I right?
22	Α.	That's correct.
23	Q .	And during that period of time, were you
24		actually practicing OB/GYN or simply the
25		professor, the academic side of that profession?

(

_		
		14
1	Α.	Both.
2	Q.	You were seeing patients then at the University
3		of or at the medical center hospital at
4		Vermont?
5	Α.	That's correct.
6	Q.	Have you ever, in your experience as a
7		physician, as a teacher of medicine ever heard
8		of Reily-Day syndrome?
9	Α.	Yes, I have.
1.0	Q •	Is that syndrome associated with people of
11		Jewish heritage who have come from Ashkenazi,
12		Poland?
13	A .	I'm vaguely familiar with the syndrome. I'm not
14		sure. I believe it is, but I would not render
15		an opinion.
16	Q.	On that?
17	Α.	On that.
18	Q.	Okay. I want to see how far I can go wjth you
19		on your memory so <b>far</b> as Reily-Day syndrome. Is
20		it your understanding that the Reily-Day
2 1		syndrome is a set of problems that occur from
22		people of Jewish heritage, is that true?
23	Α.	I believe that to be true.
24	Q.	In your lecturing and teaching of medical
25		students and residents, I assume, have you ever
	1	

 $f_{i^*} = f_{i^*}$ 

(

 $\frac{1}{2} = - (a^{2} + a^{2}) + (a^{2} + b^{2}) + (a^{2} + b^{2})$ 

talked A. I woul it's p
H N M

.

Sec.

		16
1		have described?
2	Α.	l don't know I described them, but yes.
3	Q.	Okay. So then on a day-to-day basis at
4		Cleveland Metro, do you check on other people
5		who are working in the department of OB/GYN?
6	Α.	Yes, sir.
7	Ω.	See that they are getting their jobs done and
8		their assignments are being kept, is that what
9		you do?
10	Α.	Partly, yes.
11	Q.	And do you have any financial responsibilities
12		or administrative duties here at Cleveland
13		Metro?
14	Α.	I'm sorry. I don't understand the question.
15		MR. MURPHY: Objection.
16	Q.	Administrative duties like do you have to, what.
17		I mean by administrative duties as the director
18		of OB/GYN here, you have to make like reports to
19		say we have so many doctors, we have done so
20		many cases here, our budget is 50 million
2 1		dollars, 25 million dollars and we need some
22		more money. That's the kind of administrative
23		thing I'm talking about.
24	Α.	Yes.
25	Q.	How much of your time is spent in the

and the second

		17
1		administrative duties that we <b>talked</b> about?
2	Α.	A quarter of my time.
3	Q.	Okay. And then insofar as the professor of the
4		department of reproductive. biology at Case, what
5		is that, what do you do as professor of
6		reproductive biology?
7	A.	Well, we are all part of the Case Western
8		Reserve system.
9	Q.	Cleveland Metro is?
10	Α.	Yes.
11	Q.	True.
12	Α.	My position is a tenured professorship with the
13		medical school which has me participate in the
14		curriculum for the students in research
15		activities of the medical school.
16	Q.	How often do you teach there?
17	A.	I'm sorry, sir?
18	Q.	How often do you teach there?
19	A.	Those students from Case Western come here to
20		Cleveland Metro, and I teach on a daily basis.
21	Q.	Daily?
22	A.	Yes.
23	Q.	Hour, two hours in the morning or afternoons?
24		How much time do you spend each day,
25		approximately?

Sec. 1

		78
I	Α.	We have morning report each morning where the
2		students are present for approximately an hour,
3		I meet with the medical students on assigned
4		time of approximately an hour, hour and a half
5		once a week, and throughout the day there are
6		various times when I meet with students.
7	Q.	Who is Dr. Dyker? Do you know him?
8		MR. GOLDWASSER: Dierker?
9	Α.	Dr. Dierker?
10	Q,	Yes. Who is he?
11	Α.	Dr. Dierker is a member of the faculty,
12		department of $OB/GYN$ , here at Cleveland Metro.
13	Q.	What are his duties here? What does he bo?
14	A.	Dr. Dierker is director of obstetric and
15		maternal-fetal medicine.
16	Q.	You are the director of <code>OB/GYN</code> and he was the
17		director of what?
18	Α.	Of obstetrics, which is a division of the
19		department of OB/GYN.
20	Q.	Okay. Have you this is not your first
2 1		deposition, I assume?
22	Α.	No, sir.
23	Q.	Can you tell me if you have given medical
24		reports defending the practice of physicians in
25		given cases before?

water?

and the second second

1	Α.	Yes, I have.
2	Q.	And approximately how many of those times have
3		you done that?
4	Α.	I'm sorry, sir. Did you <b>ask</b> me written
5		reports?
6	Q.	Yes, just the reports.
7	Α.	Written reports approximately five, six times.
8	Q.	In your entire lifetime?
9	Α.	That's correct.
10	Q.	And were those five, six reports done within the
11		last five years or so or three years or so?
12	Α.	Yes.
3.3	Q.	And were they made, were the reports made after
14		review of medical records and. was an opinion
15		rendered in your reports?
16	Α.	Yes to both parts of the question.
17	Q.	Do you know the difference between a plaintiff
18		and a defendant?
19	Α.	Yes, I do.
20	Q.	And were the reports written on behalf of
21		d e f e n d a n t s ?
22	Α.	Yes.
23	Q.	Have you ever written a report on behalf of a
24		patient against a physician in a suit?
25	A .	Written report?

• ~ • × ×

**∢** 1 \_2

ç		
I		2 0
1	Q.	Y e s.
2	Α.	Not have I reviewed a case?
3	Q.	No. Have you written a report, on behalf of a
4		patient who was suing a physician?
5	Α.	I have not written a report. I have reviewed
6		plaintiff cases.
7	Q .	Okay. Now, these five cases, were they reviewed
8		€or Ohio while you were in Ohio or were they
9		reviewed in other states?
1 0	Α.	Most of them since I have been in Ohio.
11	Q.	Have you ever reviewed a case outside of Ohio
12		while you were at Vermont or Indiana?
13	Α.	Yes, I have.
14	Q.	How many times have you written a report while
15		you were in the State of Vermont?
16	<b>A</b> .	My figure of five or so is a total figure.
17	Q .	And how about while you were in the state of
18		Indiana, did you write any medical reports while
19		you were in Indiana?
20	Α.	I might have written one. I'm not sure.
21	Q.	Okay. So, insofar as medical <b>reports</b> are
22		concerned written on behalf of physicians, would
23		you estimate you have ten to 15 times done so?
24	Α.	No, sir. You are asking me, if I understand
25		your question, written reports.

化输出工作 计公式分子 网络花花花花花花花

¢.

\$

1	Q.	Yes.
2	Α.	And I said I believe earlier approximately five
3		or six written reports.
4	Q.	The five or six written reports are included
5		while you were in Vermont, while you were in
6		Indiana and while you were in Ohio, is that
7		correct?
8	Α.	That's correct.
9	Q,	How did it come to $\operatorname{pass}$ that you were called by
10		the firm of Jacobson, Maynard, Tuschman & Kalur
11		and particularly Mr. Murphy to review this case,
12		how did that happen?
13	Α.	I'm not really sure.
14	Q.	Okay. Well, did somebody just pick you up?
15	Α.	Mr. Murphy.
16	Q,	Did you inquire of him how he got your name
17		or
18	Α.	I don't recall having asked him that.question.
19	Q.	Okay. Are you insured by the Physicians
20		Insurance Exchange Company?
21		MR. MURPHY: Objection. You can
22		answer.
23	Α.	I'm sorry.
24		MR. MURPHY: I objected for the
25		record. You can answer the question, though.

المحافظة المراجع المحاد المحافظ ومحمد ومحافظ فالمحافظ ويعرفونها المحاد

n.

		22
1	Α.	No, I'm not.
2	Q.	Do you know any of the lawyers at the Jacobson,
3		Maynard, Tuschman & Kalur law firm?
4	Α.	Yes, I do.
5	Q.	Who do you know?
6	Α.	${f I}$ know Mr. Bonezzi, and Mr. Kalur I have met and
r <b>7</b>		somebody else, but I'm not. sure.
8	Q.	Did you help Mr. Kalur with a case?
9	Α.	No, I did not.
10	Q.	And did you ever help Mr. Bonezzi with a case?
11	Α.	Yes, I did.
12	Q.	Was the case a case here in Cleveland, Ohio, do
13		you know?
14	Α.	Yes, it was.
15	Q.	Do you remember the name of the people involved,
16		plaintiff?
17	<b>A</b> .	I do not.
I 8	Q.	Did you go to trial?
19	Α.	No, I have not been to trial.
20	Q.	Do you know who the name of the baby was that
2 1		was involved <b>or</b> the patient?
22	Α.	N o .
23	Q.	Do you know who the name of the plaintiff's
24		lawyer was?
25	Α.	No, I can't remember.

1

(jege

If at any time during our questioning and our 1 Ω. 2 discussion of the Berlinger case you need to 3 look at either your own personal notes or 4 hospital records or charts or anything just take 5 the time to take a look at them so that you are 6 really confident about your answer insofar as 7 applying to **a** record. 8 Can we say that insofar as Heidi Berlinger is concerned, we know this was her first. 9 10 pregnancy with Rebekah, true? 11 Α. Correct. 12 That her pregnancy was a full term one, true? Ο. 13 Α. Correct. 14 There was no prematurity involved in her Q. pregnancy, correct? 15 16 Α. Correct. 17 That her pregnancy proceeded for nine months Ω. 18 with no diabetes on the side of the mother, she 19 exhibited none, Heidi, right? 20 Α. Correct. 21 She had no preeclampsia, right? Ω. 22 Correct. Α. 23 Ω. And she had no severe bleeding during her pregnancy? 24 Correct. 25 Α.

5....

		24
1	Q.	She had no heart problems herself, Heidi that
2		is?
3	Α.	Correct.
4	Q.	And insofar as the fetus was concerned, Baby
5		Rebekah, during the time that she was in her
6		mother's womb she exhibited no fetal problems
7		and no fetal distress, true?
8	Α.	Correct.
9	Q.	That insofar as the mother and child, I will
10		couple them both, both Heidi and Rebekah, that
11		during the time of the pregnancy neither
12		exhibited any lung problems or respiratory
13		problems, is that true?
14	Α.	As far as the fetus goes, we have no way of
15		identifying that. From the mother's point of
16		view, there was one episode of dizziness and
17		syncope in June of the pregnancy. Generally,
18		n o .
19	Q.	Okay. With the syncope part, do you put any
20		importance of that particular dizziness problem,
21		and I think it was a brief fainting episode. Is
22		that what you understand?
23	Α.	That's what I understand. from the record.
24	Q.	Is it important in this case or can we just
25		throw it out and disregard it?

Ę

<u>na serie de la s</u>

1	Α.	I wouldn't. throw it out and disregard it. I'm
2		not sure, I don't believe it does.
3	Q.	You want to keep it €or consideration, see how
4		we go along in this deposition, maybe it will be
5		of some import to you later?
6	Α.	Y e s.
7	Q.	Now, insofar as Baby Rebekah is concerned, if
8		there was something structurally wrong with
9		Rebekah's lungs, hypothetically speaking, okay,
10		would that show up during <b>her</b> pregnancy?
11	Α.	N o .
12	Q.	And insofar as the pregnancy of Heidi Berlinger
13		during nine months did you want to say
14		something?
15	Α.	I think the answer to that question is no. If
16		there was severe pulmonary hypoplasia it's
17		possible that there may be changes that one
18		would see in the amniotic fluid volume, but the
19		general answer is no.
20	Q.	Did you understand whether or not any
21		ultrasounds were taken of Mrs. Rerlinger, Heidi,
22		during the course of her pregnancy?
23	Α.	I'm sorry, counselor. Did I understand?
24	۵.	Do you know if there <b>was</b> or wasn't?
25	Α.	Yes, there was.

£,

•

and the second second

1	Q.	How did they come out? What were the results of
2		them?
3	Α.	The ultrasound was done for dating of the
4		pregnancy, I believe on 12/14/86, and Dr.
5		${\rm S}chwartz$ felt that the uterus was 14 weeks, that
6		the size of the uterus was 14 weeks when the
7		dates were only ten, and he had an ultrasound
8		performed which revealed that the uterus was in
9		fact, the gestation was ten weeks.
10	Q.	So no problems with the ultrasound, I assume?
11	Α.	Not that I'm aware of.
12	Q.	Okay. Can we conclude this way then, that the
13		pregnancy of Heidi <b>Berlinger</b> moved normally and
14		for all important matters this pregnancy moved
15		along uneventfully?
16	Α.	Absolutely.
17	Q.	So now we, you are not a pediatric neurologist.,
18		is that correct?
19	Α.	That's correct.
20	Q.	You have confined your practice to obstetrics
21		and gynecology? .
22	A.	Correct.
23	Q.	Do I understand that you will give no opinion at.
24		the trial of this lawsuit on a neonatology
25		basis; is that outside your field?

or7253

Ć

1 I'm not trained **as** a neonatologist. Α. My 2 experience would be simply in followup on the obstetrical care that we have been, that we 3 deliver and as an individual who has done 4 research in basic questions, issues surrounding 5 perinatal life which includes both the fetal 6 7 life, intrapartum period and the immediate newborn training, but not by clinical training. a 9 Q. We have never met before, doctor, and the only 10reason I'm asking that is so I can be certain as 11 to what to expect from you as to what opinions are concerned, what branch of medicine. 12 I'm just trying to narrow down what branch of 13 14 medicine you will testify in so I can prepare myself now for questions of you if you testify 15 16 at trial. I will note that you are going to 17 confine yourself to OB/GYN only, am I right in 18 that point? 19 Α. That's correct. 20 We have talked to several physicians and they Ο. have described for us what a late deceleration 21 22 is, what an early deceleration is, what a 23 variable deceleration is and what a beat-to-beat

25

24

deceleration is. We had that discussion with

other doctors in this matter, and can I just ask

1		you, what. is your definition that. you use
2		insofar as a late deceleration; what does that
З		mean to you, doctor?
4	Α.	Late deceleration by definition is a
5		deceleration or decrease in the fetal heart $rate$
6		that has its onset at the peak of the uterine
7		systole, continues into the diastole of the
8		contraction and into the interval between two
9		contractions.
10	Q.	If we had a graph of a contraction like a
11		mountain up one side and down the other, and as
12		we mentally look at a picture of this mountain
13		and then we impose on that a late deceleration,
14		where, insofar as this mountain, would the $late$
15		deceleration begin and where would it end?
16	Α.	At the peek of the mountain it would begin.
		Right, yes.
18	Α.	And it would end in the valley beyond the base
19		of the mountain.
20	Q.	Okay. Very well. Thank you very much.
2 1		And with an early deceleration, let's use
22		our mountain again if we can, if you will permít
23	ļ	me to, and now we have an early deceleration;
24	ř	insofar <b>as</b> our mountain is concerned, where
25		would the early deceleration start during the

.

		29
1		contraction and where would it end?
2	Α.	That is less well defined, hut generally it
3		would start sometimes on the ascension of the
4		mountain, the upwards slope, may start toward
5		the peek, but the characteristic feature of the
6		early is that there is generally recovery,
7		general recovery by the time you come <b>back</b> down
8		the mountain to the valley.
9	Q .	Okay. During this period the mountain that we
10		have talked about as being a contraction, right?
11	Α.	As you have described it, yes.
12	Q.	When you say a recovery you mean that the baby's
13		heart recovers <b>from</b> that contraction, is that
14		correct?
15	Α.	Recover may be a poor word. Return to baseline
16		value.
17	Q .	Okay. Yes. During the period, as I understand
18		it, doctor, that, during the period of a
19		contraction, that is a mother's contraction
20		during labor, that the circulation of blood to
2 1		the mother and, of course, to the fetus is
22		stopped, is that right?
23	Α.	To the mother and the fetus, I'm sorry. You
24		will have to be a little more specific.
25	Q .	During the period of a labor contraction, is

1-80.4

		3.0
1		there any interruption of blood flaw between
2		mother and/or child?
3	Α.	Between mother and child?
4	Q .	Yes.
5	Α.	Yes.
6	е.	And when does that occur?
7	Α.	That occurs when the pressure within the muscle
8		of the uterus, myometrium, exceeds that of the
9		pressure within the <b>blood</b> vessel carrying blood
10		to the area of the placenta where exchange
11		occurs between mother and fetus.
12	Q .	Okay. Then during the, this period of pressure
13		changes, during a contraction, is it so that
14		oxygen, which is carried by the blood and is
15		exchanged at the placental area to the baby, is
16		that also stopped?
17	Α.	When the pressure of a contraction is greater
18		than the pressure within the <b>blood vessel</b> , yes.
19	Q.	All right. Hypothetically speaking, if we took
20		a contraction, this mountain that we talked
21		about as an illustrative point, and instead of
22		the mountain just going up and then coming down
23		we had a contraction which went up and extended
24		out for a long period of time and then came down
25		the child would be without oxygen during that

. . .

.

Ć

		31
1		period of time, is that correct?
2	Α.	No, that's not.
3	Q.	Okay. Is there a relationship between the time
4		and length, is what I mean, of a contraction and
5		the oxygen supply that the baby is getting?
6	Α.	There could be.
7	Q .	And can you explain what could effect that?
8	Α.	You would have to have a contraction whose
9		intensity was greater than the pressure within
i 0		the vessel for this long period of time in order
11		to prolong the obstruction of the exchange from
12		mother to baby of the oxygen.
13	Q .	Within the period strike that.
14		You, of course, are familiar with external
15		and internal monitoring of babies?
16	Α.	Yes, Iam.
17	Q .	Rehekah had both an external monitor and she had
18		an internal monitor, true?
19	Α.	Correct.
20	Q.	Of the phenomenons or the occurrences such as
2 1		late decelerations, early decelerations,
22		variable decelerations and beat-to-beat losses,
23		of those four items, are they important to be
24		observed during the monitoring of the mother?
25	Α.	Yes, they are.

All and a second

 $(a_1,a_2^{(1)},a_2^{(1)},a_3^{(1)}$ 

1 Q. Tell me why?

 $(1, \dots, n)$ 

- 4

2	Α.	Because the association between the type of
3		deceleration and the severity of the
4		deceleration and most importantly the
5		persistence of the deceleration is correlated in
6		some manner with the condition of the fetus.
7	Q.	Okay. You used the word decelerations. Does
8		that include all of them, <b>earlies,</b> lates,
9		variables, or are there certain specific ones
10		you believe require careful monitoring because
11		of their importance to this process?
12	A.	Well, as I said, the importance of the
13		monitoring is to be able to identify
14		deceleration or examine acceleration pattern.
15		The answer to your question is that once you
16		look and determine the type of either
17		acceleration, deceleration patterns of the heart
18		rate in relation to the contraction one can
19		classify them in <i>to</i> what is referred to <b>as</b>
20		innocuous or ominous, again, as it correlates to
21		the objective biochemical and newborn evaluation
22		of the fetus and newborn.
23	Q.	Which of the decelerations, first of $all,$ do you
24		consider to he ominous?
25	A .	Generally considered ominous decelerations are

		33
1		moderate to severe variables and moderate, mild,
2		moderate or severe delayed decelerations,
3		particularly if they persist for any substantial
4		length of time they might, should he considered
5		as indicators of fetal stress and need to be
6		e v a l u a t e d .
7	Q.	When we use the word decelerate, what is
8		decelerated?
9	Α.	Decrease.
10	Q.	Decreased. Pardon me, what is
11	Α.	When you use the term deceleration?
12	Q.	Yes.
13	Α.	I'm sorry. I don't understand your question.
14	Q.	What is decelerated, the heart heat of the child
15		or the heart beat of the mother for purposes of
16		this record?
17	Α.	It's the heart rate of the fetus as we are
18		talking about fetal heart rate monitoring.
19	Q.	Yes, yes. Do you agree that you can have a late
20		deceleration with a fetal or have a baby's heart,
21		rate of 120 to 130 beats per minute?
22	Α.	I'm sorry, counselor. I don't understand that
23		question.
24	Q .	Okay. Can you have a late deceleration and
25		still have a fetal heart beat of 120 to 130

34 1 beats per minute? 2 By still have a fetal heart rate of 120, 130, Α. 3 you mean in between the contractions, you mean 4 at the lowest level of the delayed 5 deceleration? I'm not sure I understand what 6 you are asking me. 7 Let me see if I can move that one along for Q. 8 you. You see, sometimes it is said that you can 9 have a late deceleration between a fetal heart rate of 120 to 130, anywhere within those i o parameters, you see; in other words if you have 11 12 a fetus who has a heart rate of 120 to 130, 13 within those two numbers? That's the baseline heart rate? 14 A, That's right. Within the beat of 120 to 130 do 15 Ω. you have an opinion as to whether or not you can 16 37 still have a late deceleration within that fetal heart rate? 18 19 The fetal heart rate, baseline heart rate Α. between contractions, 120 to 130. 2.0 Yes. 31 Ω, 22 Α. And your question again, counselor, is can you 23 have a delayed deceleration associated with the 24 contraction when the baseline heart sate is 120 25 to 130?

(

35 ο. Exactly?1 Yes. 2 Α. 3 0. Then is this true, you cannot, rely on a fetal 4 heart rate of 120 to 130 to exclude a monitored 5 tracing that. may indicate a late deceleration, is that true? 6 7 Α. I'm sorry, I don't --8 You don't understand the question? Ο. 9 Not reaily. Α. 10 That's good. Whenever you don't understand I ο. 1 1 would really appreciate your telling me what you 12 are doing now, telling me you are not clear 13 about it. I can try to reword it for you. 14 Is the oxygen supplied to the baby 15 interrupted during a deceleration? 16 Yes. it is. Α. 17 Why? Just as briefly as you can without Ω. 18 compromising your medical opinion. 19 During the uterine contraction as we reviewed A. 20 before, there is, there can be depending upon 21 the pressures generated in the myometrium 22 vis-a-vis the intravascular circulation of the 23 placenta, there is an interruption in the 24 oxygenation of the fetus in the terms of the 25 oxygen tension.

. . .

Oxygen tension is measured in millimeters 1 of mercury, and it is the oxygen tension that 2 the chemoreceptors in the carotid arch and the 3 aorta are sensitive to. 4 Changes in the oxygen tension that occur as 3 a result of this interruption of the oxygenation 6 7 of the fetus result in the stimulation of a reflex that is an afferent stimulation to the 8 9 brain stem of the fetus, and the cardioregulatory sense which sends out an 10 afferent stimulation to the heart by the 11 12parasympathetics that results in a slowing of 13 the fetal heart rate. Now, this is oxygenation in terms of the 1.4 oxygen tension that initiated the reflex slowing 15 deceleration. It says nothing about the true 16 17 oxygenation of the fetus in terms of its 18 consumption of oxygen, which is calculated entirely differently as a product of the 19 arteriovenous difference across the umbilical 20 21 circulation of oxygen in terms of blood flow 22 which one requires to speak specifically and objectively about, quote, oxygenation of the 23 fetus. 24

It's possible to have a decrease in the

25

3.6
		37
1		oxygen tension in the fetal circulation as a
2		result of the interruption of the exchange of
3		oxygen from mother to fetus that can stimulate a
4		reflex deceleration of the fetal heart rate
5		which in no way has an effect on the actual
6		consumption of oxygen by the baby that could
7		result in anaerobic glycolysis, formation of
8		lactic acid, lacticacidemia, an increase in the
9		carbohydrate oxygenation and decrease in pH. So
10		that on the one hand, oxygenation can refer to
11		oxygen tensions, and on the other hand, in terms
1 2		of milliliters of mercury to oxygen, which is a
13		reasonable measure of whether the fetus is
14		oxygenated or not.
15	Q.	Is that the true measure?
16	Α.	In a purely scientific matter, that's correct.
17	Q.	Now, during the time that Rebekah Berlinger had
10		her internal monitor on, were the nursing
19		personnel that were watching and observing the
20		monitor strips that were on Rebekah Berlinger
21		supposed to know what you just have described to
22		us in your answer?
23	Α.	They really don't have to know that. No, the
24		answer is no.
25	Q.	Insofar <b>as</b> the, let's say, the nurse that

1997 - 1

33	observes the internal monitoring strip from the	time it was placed on Rebekah, which we know was	after 8:00 in the morning, is that right, on	July the 10th, the membranes were ruptured?	. I'm sorry. The internal system?	. The internal system.	. I believe was placed at	. We all know it was in at 8:00.	MR. MURPHY: Maybe a little before	that.	. The internal system was placed at 8:00 a.m.	after artificial rupture of membranes where	there was clear fluid.	So from 8:00 a.m. on July the 10th of 1984 and	up until the time a cesarean section was done on	Mrs. Berlinger the internal monitoring strip was	in place, is that what your understanding is?	That's correct.	And that would bring us for a period of how many	hours, doctor, that the internal monitoring	strip was on?	The strip that is available here well, I'm	sorry. The internal electrode, if we agree it	started at 8:00, I believe the strip ends at	3:30. I'm not exactly sure of that. I'm	
					A.	i.	Å	à		-	Ā			01				¥	8			A				
	ri	2	т	4	പ	9	7		ማ	10	1 1	12	13	5 T	15	16	17	18	19	20	21	22	23	24	25	

. . .

		39
1		sorry. The last panel is 126 and I believe that
2		time is 3:30, although there is a part of
3		that so the answer to your question would be
4	ļ	8:00 to 12:00 is four, it would be 7 hours and
5		20 minutes, approximately, that I have a strip
6		available to me.
7	Q.	All right.
8	Α.	126, <b>yes, sir.</b>
9	Q.	Now, during these seven and one half hours,
1 0		<code>right</code> , <code>give</code> or <code>take</code> a few <code>minutes</code> , we know $it$ 's
11	1	in excess of seven hours, was the monitoring,
12		the strip itself, was that, in your judgement.,
13		to be observed carefully for decelerations?
14	<b>A</b> .	Decelerations, yes.
15	Q.	For arrhythmias?
16	Α.	Arrhythmias, I'm not sure what.you are
17	Q.	Okay. Accelerations of heart beat?
18	Α.	Correct,
19	Q.	Decelerations of the <b>baby's</b> heart beat?
20	Α.	Correct.
21	Q.	And any other unusual cardiac responses from the
22		child?
23	Α.	Correct.
24	Q.	Should a person who is taking on that task of
25		watching the monitoring strip from approximately

		4 0
1		8:00 in the. morning of July the 10th until
2		approximately 3:00, 3:15, 3:20 in the afternoon
3		have the ability to know what a late
4		deceleration is, what an early deceleration is,
5		what coupling is and what beat-to-beat
6		variability is?
7	Α.	What was the personnel? I'm sorry. Which
8		personnel, any personnel?
9	Q .	The person who is supposed to be watching it.
10	Α.	Y e s.
11	Q.	Okay. Would you say that based upon your
12		experience as a physician and experience you had
13		that if somebody was <b>assigned</b> between the hours
14		of 8:00 a.m. and 3:30 or 3:15 in the afternoon
15		and did not have the ability to know what a late
16		deceleration on a monitoring strip was or what
17		an early deceleration was or what beat-to-beat
18		variability was that that would be below the
19		standard of care?
20	Α.	That's correct.
2 1	Ω.	Here at your hospital when you have an internal
22		monitor on one of your patients, let's assume,
23		are your nurses here instructed that as the
24		doctor €or the mother and the baby that you want
25	ł	to be told when there are late decelerations; is

-

متروم معرورة المحرار الأراب الرابية ومرار ورور الراب المراجع المراجع المحرار المراجع المراجع المراجع المراجع ال

		41
1		that what you instruct your people?
2		MR. MURPHY: I'm going to object,
3		You can <i>go</i> ahead and answer.
4	Α.	I'm sorry. Here we have a resident staff who
5		while I may be the attending the resident
6		physicians are the first line of reporting.
7	Q,	Yes. The resident would be your eyes and your
8		ears. Well, I mean, what you do here at the
9		hospital, you say, look, we have qualified
10		residents, we think they are good people and if
11		the person who is watching the monitoring strips
12		goes to tell the resident, if you can't find the
13		resident, find the floor supervisor of nursing,
14		if you can't find the floor supervisor, and you
15		can't find them, come talk to me about it, is
16		that about right?
17	A.	It may be a nurse, it may be a <b>medical</b> student,
18		it may be a resident. Everybody is the
19		attending on these cases evaluating the monitor
20		strip.
2 1	Q.	Do you think that Dr. Schwartz in this case of
22		Rebekah Berlinger should have been present in
23		the very room that Mrs. Rerlinger <b>was</b> in during
24		the time the internal monitoring strip was
25		running?

é.

ĺ

		4 2
1	Α.	No.
2	Q.	Do you think that Dr. Schwartz should have had
3		accurate reliable information as to what the
4		monitoring strip was showing insofar its
5	4	decelerations of any kind or beat-to-beat
6		variability, should he have known that or been
7		told that?
8	A.	Yes.
9	Q.	Did you review the record from Mt. Sinai
10		Hospital for both mother Heidi and the baby?
11	Α.	Yes.
12	Q.	Did you review the nurses' notes made on both
13		Heidi and the baby from the time she was
14		admitted at about 11:00 on July the 9th of '84
15		until the cesarean was completed?
16	Α.	Yes, I did.
17	Q.	Anywhere in those notes did you ever find a note
18		in the nurses' notes that told you when a
19		contraction started in labor and when it ended
20		and how far the contractions were separated from
21		each other and whether or not the decelerations
22		occurred or not; did you ever see that. written
23		down?
24	A.	Yes, I believe I did.
25	Q.	Do you want to get that?

		4 3
1	Α.	On <b>several</b> occasions.
2	Q.	Okay. And how often should those notes have
3		been made in the hospital records? Let me
4		withdraw the question first of all.
5		Let's see if there is a, your judgement is
6		for a requirement that the contractions in a
7		mother such as Heidi should be recorded in the
8		medical record; do you believe that is true?
9	Α.	We have ${f a}$ continuous monitor both externally and
10		internally.
11	Q.	Just listen to my question.
12	Α.	I'm sorry.
13	Q.	What do you think about it?
14	Α.	Would you repeat the question?
15	Q.	Do you think that the contractions, the number
16		of contractions and the <b>spacings</b> and <b>time</b>
17		between contractions should have been recorded
18		in the Mt. Sinai Hospital records during the
19		time the internal monitoring strip was being run
20		on Mrs. Berlinger?
2 1		MR. GOLDWASSER: Now you are
22		including the monitor as part of the hospital
23		record, I trust, because it is, are you or are
24		you telling the doctor to include the monitor?
25		MR. ILER: No, I'm not telling him

ĺ

44 1 to include anything. I'm saying should there he 2 a recording. 3 MR. GQLDWASSER: He answered your 4 question, that's why I'm curious, because he 5 told you it was in the monitor. That's why I 6 didn't understand why you were repeating the 7 That's my point. question. 8 I have to start over from the beginning here. Ω. 9 You confused me. 10 Is it required in your judgement that in a 11 case where an internal monitoring strip is being 12 run on a mother such as Mrs. Rerlinger, that 13 there be a record kept in the hospital records 14 during the period of time the internal 15 monitoring strip is running which indicates the 16 contractions, the number of contractions, how 17 they were separated by time one from the other, 18 the severity of the contractions and any 19 abnormalities in the contractions, should those 20 be recorded? 21 Α. They are recorded on the monitoring strip, which 22 is a part of the record, it's a continuous, 23 on-going. If the, if we did not. have continuous 24 monitoring then there is the requirements that 25 the nurses' notes and the doctor's notes record

1		
2		and the types of deceleration patterns or no
3		deceleration patterns with a certain frequency
4		in the hospital record. Hut with a continuous
5		record, counselor, it's right there. We
6		sometimes make notes on the record, which is
7		part, on the monitoring strip which is part of
8		the record, we sometimes make a progress note at
9		intervals depending on where we are. It's
10		difficult to answer your question with a yes or
11		a no.
12	Q.	Okay. Can we do it this way then so we move
13		along. The answer is if you do not have a
14		monitoring strip that is running on paper and
15		that's not. being done then notes should be made
16		in the hospital record that indicate the number
17		of contractions, the time between them and the
18		severity?
19	Α.	Yes, 1 agree with that.
20	Q.	If there is a monitor strip I think your
21		testimony is no, you don't have to record them
22		other than on the monitoring strip if you wish
23		because you have <b>a</b> record with the strip itself,
24		is that true?
25	Α.	It's partially true, counselor. I would also

in the second se

		4 6
I		want, certainly, progress notes written at
2		intervals to summarize what, has gone on on the
3		monitor strip €or a while.
4	Q.	Why do you want that, why do <b>you</b> want the
5		progress note?
6	Α.	Because it's going to take what. is or the
7		monitor strip and incorporate it into the total
8		picture of the case as it <b>relates</b> to <b>dilatation</b> ,
9		effacement, maternal condition, et cetera.
10	Q,	Why should it be on the progress note?
11	Α.	I'm sorry.
12	Q,	Why should it be put <b>on</b> the progress <b>note?</b>
13	Α.	Because that's where we record our observations
14		of the progress of the patient.
15	Q,	In this case was the internal monitoring strip
16		run continuously from the time it was put on at
17		approximately 8;00 a.m. on July the 10th, 1984
18		and run until 3:00 or 3:15 continuously?
19	Α.	I believe by looking at the number of the panels
20		on the monitoring strip the answer is yes.
2 1	Q.	How do you reach that conclusion? If you could
22		just explain how you reach that conclusion I
23		would appreciate it?
24	Α.	I reached that conclusion by first noting ${f a}$
25		confusing print on the record an Panel 77 that

1 indicates 11:00 a.m. and then a note on the 2 pane3 that indicates 13, which would be 1:00 3 p.m., but the numbers on the chart paper are 4 consistent in the progress of the numbers with 5 no interruption in the strip, so I assume that what was done in error in putting in the time 6 7 and that, in fact, this was 11:00 when it was meant to be, when it says 13. 8 9 Q, When you say 11:00 you mean 11:00 in the morning 10 of July the 10th? 11 That's correct. Α. So the first reporting you have on the internal 12 Ω. 13 monitoring strip is at what time? 14 MR. GOLDWASSER: You are changing streams now. That's a whole different 15 16 question. Okay. 17 The first report, I think it says right here an Α. 18 Panel 37, internal EKG. 19 Q. Okay. And what time would that be? 20 That time says 7:42 and a half. Α. 21 Okay. At 7:42 and one half do we take it now Ω. 22 the internal monitoring strip, internal monitor was placed in Mrs. Berlinger? 23 Written on the monitor strip is internal EKG, 24 Α. s o 25 I assume --

		48
1	Q.	That would be Panel Number 37, correct?
2	Α.	Panel Number 37, I believe, sir.
3	Q.	Okay.
4	Α.	About there. Now, I don't know if you are
5		asking me specifically when that electrode was
6		clipped and when we began getting a recording,
7		I don't know. We would, this may be that they
8		are going to do it, this may be that they had
9	1	done it. I would <b>say</b> that we have to have a
10		range here of somewheres from 7:42 and a half
11		to, I don't know, I guess about 8:00. So I'm
12	I	not sure, counselor, exactly where this is, hut.
13		it's at this point that we were putting on an
14		internal electrode.
15	Q.	Let's assume that the electrode is placed in at
16		that time, let's say 7:42 or 8:00, whichever
17		that is, would you now tell me how you concluded
18		from the numbering of the panels $or$ from the
19		times that. the monitoring, internal monitoring
20		strip ran continuously from the time it was
21		starting to record, let's assume the latest
22		point at 8:00 a.m., till when it was
23		discontinued?
24		MR. MURPHY: I'm going to just
25		object because it was just asked <b>two</b> minutes ago

Ċ,

×.4

No.

49 and answered. If you can answer the question, 1 2 Α. Well, we can do a calculation, counselor, if you 3 want **me** to get my computer. We can assume about 8:00, and went to Panel 126. We can go from 4 5 panel -- yes, sir, I believe we can do the 6 calculation. I may be off by two or three 7 minutes. Okay. 8 Q . If we take, for instance, 37, Panel 37, which is 9 Α. 10 a little bit earlier than 8:00, and I agree we don't know, and that's Panel 37. 11 12 Q. Right. 13 And we go to 126, we subtract the two, is 89 Α. 14 panels with 5 minutes in a panel, that's 445 minutes, 60 minutes in an hour divided into that 15 16 would give us 7 hours and 25 minutes; and I 17 believe we calculated 7 hours and 20 minutes. We considered a little over seven hours. 18 0. 19 MR, GOLDWASSER: Seven, seven and a 20 half hours. MR. ILER: I think that's where we 21 22 are. 23 MR, GOLDWASSER: Between those 24 two. If I did it correct. 25 Α.

1	Q.	The question now then is <b>did</b> you <b>review</b> each of
2		those panels before rendering your opinion in
3		your letter report. of July, pardon me, June the
4		8th, 1987?
5	Α.	Yes.
6	Q.	From your report of June 8th, 3987 you indicated
7		some of the items which you reviewed before
8		making up your report, that's true, but I notice
9		in your letter of June 8th you had not read the
10		deposition of the defendant Dr. Robert, Schwartz
11		before writing out your opinion, is that true?
12	Α.	That's correct.
13	е.	You did not read the deposition of the
14		plaintiffs' expert Dr. David Abramson?
15	Α.	Correct.
16	Q.	You did not read the deposition of Nurse Thomas
17		who was watching the monitoring strip?
18	Α.	Correct-
19	Q.	From the medical records that we have in this
20		case, your report indicates on Page 2, if you
21		would not mind getting that, doctor, that on
22		July the 9th of '84 Mrs. Berlinger was admitted
23		to Mt. Sinai Medical Center for approximately
24		three hours €or observation of early labor.
25		That's what you gleaned from the records?

E K

.

		51
1	Α.	Correct.
2	Q.	And she was sent home?
3	Α.	Correct,
4	Q.	And then she returns back to the hospital later
5		that evening and is admitted at approximately
6		11:00 or so?
7	Α.	Correct.
8	Q.	Is she in labor then?
9	Α.	She is in very early Patent phase labor.
10	Q.	When you say latent phase, what does latent
11		mean?
12	Α.	Before the active phase of labor.
13	Q.	Well, anyhow, she is admitted and when she is
14		admitted your notes reflect that the cervix was
15	1	one centimeter dilated and 50 percent effaced,
16		right?
17	A.	Correct.
18	Q.	Where was the <b>baby</b> in position?
19	Α.	The position was not determined.
20	Q.	It says effaced with the vertex at minus two
21		station.
22	Α.	That's station.
23	Q.	Okay. Does let me see. I'll show you a
24		diagram, it's not anatomically exact, perhaps it
25		will help us, maybe it won't, but can I show you

ł

		5.2
1		this diagram. And I'll have it marked, if you
2		would.
3		
4		(Whereupon, Plaintiffs' Exhibit No.
5		7 was marked for purposes of identification.)
6		
ij <b>7</b>	Q.	Okay. Doctor, I brought out a diagram and I had
8		it marked Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 7 and it shows
9		in a way a <b>baby's</b> head coming in a position and
10		it's got a center line where it says zero then
11		minus one, minus two, minus three, a midpoint
12		and then it's got plus one, plus two, plus three
13		below the midpoint point.
14		Now, when Mrs. Berlinger has come to the
15		hospital and the station is this diagram, can
16		I use this diagram to indicate the baby's
17		station?
18	Α.	Yes.
19	Q.	Now, when the lady comes into the hospital she
20		is at minus two station, am I correct?
21	Α.	As reported, yes.
22	Q.	Okay. Can you mark or can I mark an arrow at
23		minus two admitted, can I do that on this
24		diagram? Would you mind doing that on this
25		diagram?

		53
1		MR. GOLDWASSER: There is nothing
2		to suggest. you can't do it.
3		MR. MURPHY: Why don't you do it,
4		Don.
5	Q.	What I'll do is next to minus two I'll put or
7		this baby was at minus two station?
8	Α.	Correct.
9	, <b>Q</b> .	From the time that she was admitted at 11:00 on
10		July the 9th of '84 did the baby's head ever
11		descend below zero station?
12	<b>A</b> .	Yes, sir.
13	Q.	And how far down below zero station did it go?
14	Α.	I believe plus one.
15	Q .	What record, can you show me a record that thfs
16		baby descended below <b>zero</b> station?
17	Α.	Panel 106 here, sir.
18	Q .	What does it say?
19	Α.	What I read on the chart is E to plus one, nine
20		centimeters, pit drip. Then I can't read that.
2 1	Q.	What time would that monitor strip reflect?
22	Α.	106 would be, if my calculations are correct,
23		1:21.
24	Q.	Okay. And what the note shows on the monitoring
25		strip is a range on Plate 106 from zero station,

Non-

محير بالإسلام من الممتحمة المالية المالية التربي الرابية المالية المالية التي المالية التي المالية التي المالي

54 correct, and zero on our little diagram would be 1 right where the diagram says zero in the middle, 2 3 right? Correct. 4 Α. And on the monitoring strip it shows zero to 5 Q. 6 plus one, so there is a range between zero, 7 according to this monitor note, and plus one? 8 Α. Correct. Can we agree that the baby never descended from 9 Q. 40 the time of admission, insofar as stations are 11 concerned, anywhere below, giving the zero to 12 plus one interpretation on the monitoring strip? 13 Would you repeat that, counselor. Α. 14 15 (Thereupon, the requested portion of 16 the record was read by the Notary.) 17 18 That's correct. Α. 19 There is a note in the progress notes, doctor, Ο. 20 if you would not mind turning to the progress 21 notes. 22 MR, MURPHY: What time? 23 MR. ILER: That would have to be at 3:30 on 7/10/84, 24 25 Do you have that progress note? Q.

tr.

a

		55
1	Α.	Yes, sir.
2	Q.	On the progress notes, what is the time that it
3		was written, the date and time?
4	<b>A</b> .	7/10/84, 3:30 p.m.
5	Q.	What does <b>it</b> say?
6	Α.	You want me to read the note?
7	Q.	Sure, yes.
8	Α.	Despite two hours of good pushing patient has
9		not brought head down past the zero, minus one
10		station, therefore, a symbol, will do cesarian
11		section.
12	Q.	Go ahead.
13	Α.	Well, then there is red parentheses.
14		MR. MURPWY: That's mine.
15	Α.	Cervix-complete, pushing since approximately one
16		p.m., Dr. R. Schwartz present.
17	Q	we can conclude then at 3:30 p.m. in the
18		afternoon the baby's head never descended below
19		zero, minus one station, correct?
20	<b>A</b> .	According to this note, correct.
21	Q.	And we notice that Pitocin was administered,
22		Oxytocin was administered to Mrs. Berlinger, am
23		I correct?
24	Α.	Correct.
25	Q.	What do you understand the reason to be why Dr.

No.

		56
1		Schwartz ordered that Pitocin to be
2		administered?
3	Α.	He felt that he had inadequate uterine
4		contractions that were related to a protraction
5		disorder and correctly augmented the labor with
6		O x y t o c i n .
7	Q.	When we use Oxytocin, we have been agreeing for
8		a long time Oxytocin, Pitocin means the same
9		thing?
10	Α.	Correct,"
11	Q.	So with the use of and when do you
12		understand, I think it was at 11:45 in the
13		morning that Pitocin was first administered to
14		this lady Heidi, right?
15	A .	Your time, sir?
16	Q.	11;45.
17	Α.	Correct.
18	Q.	What. was the dosage?
19	Α.	I believe it was infused at two milliunits per
20		m i n u t e .
2 1	Q.	That's how it was started, right, at two
22		milliunits?
23	A .	I believe so.
24	Q.	Was it done with an IV, right?
25	A .	Infusion pump is my understanding.

and the second secon

Yuna I

	57
Q .	What do you mean?
Α.	It is a pump that regulates the infusion rate.
	The settings are according tu the dilution that
	you have.
Q.	Right.
Α.	I believe in this case they put ten units in 250
	cc's.
Q.	But. through an IV?
Α.	Correct, yes.
Q.	Now, the doctor believed that this lady now has
	been in labor strike that. Strike that
	question.
	When do you believe that Heidi Berlinger
	went from latent labor to labor, to legitimate
	labor?
Α.	I don't understand your question.
Q.	Okay.
Α.	To labor or legitimate labor.
Q.	Okay. You know earlier you mentioned on your
	report that she <b>was</b> in latent labor.
Α.	Correct.
Q.	When she was admitted, and you characterize that.
	labor <b>as</b> being what?
Α.	As a stage prior to active phase labor.
Q.	Now, when do you believe that Heidi went into
	A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A.

		58
1		active labor?
2	A.	Somewheres between 9:00 and 10:00 a.m.
3	Q.	What day?
4	A.	The 10th of
5	Q.	July?
6	A.	July.
7	Q.	1984?
8	Α.	Right.
9	Q.	So then she was in active labor from that point
10		until when?
11	A.	Until she reached full dilatation.
12	Q.	And what time would that be?
13	A.	That would be somewheres about 1:30, to about
14		1:30. It's difficult.
15	Q.	So at 1:30 in the afternoon on July the 10th
16		active labor ceases in Heidi Berlinger, true?
17	A.	The active stage of labor ceases.
18	Q.	Now, we're going to be talking to jury people
19		who don't understand all of this medicine or may
2 0		understand some of it, so what I'll try to do,
21		and if you can do it without compromising your
22		medicine, maybe you can help us along.
23		Now, do I understand that her active labor
24		ended at about 1:30 in the afternoon of July the
25		10th of 1984?
	L	

Vigering

1	Α.	At approximately 1:30 on that day she reached
2		full dilatation, which puts her into the second
3		stage of labor,
4	Q.	Which is called what?
5	Α.	Which is called second stage of labor.
6	Q.	Okay. All right.
7	Α.	At the time period from approximately 9:00 or
8		thereabouts to that time she was in what is
9		called the active phase of the first stage of
10		labor.
11	Q.	Okay. And was she progressing normally during
12		that first stage of active labor?
13	Α.	After the use of the Pitocin augmentation, yes.
14	Q.	No, before the use of Pitocin, from 9:00 oh,
15		I'm sorry. Okay. Go ahead. After the use of
16		Pitocin at 11:45, go ahead, sir, she was
17		proceeding normally in active labor, is that.
18		your judgement?
19	Α.	Correct.
20	Q.	So everything was proceeding satisfactorily
21		insofar as the active stage of Heidi's labor is
22		concerned after the Pitocin was administered at
23		11:45?
24	Α.	That's correct.
25	Q.	What is the protraction of active phase of

		6 0
1		labor, what does protraction mean?
2	Α.	Protraction basically means that the expected
3		dilatation, centimeters per hour, that one would
4		expect during the active phase in a primigravida
5		patient was not being met. The curve, the
' 6		tracing of time versus dilatation is flattened
7		from the normal.
8	Q.	Therefore, the use of Pitocin assists in that
9		regard?
10	Α.	I'm sorry.
11	Q.	The use of Pitocin assists in that regard?
12	Α.	After evaluation <b>of</b> the patient who has a
13		protraction disorder of the active phase Pitocin
14		augmentation is one of the options and is within
15		the standard of care.
16	Q.	Okay. When Pitocin was started on Mrs.
17		Rerlinger at 11:45 a.m., should somebody
18		personally be watching the effects of the
19		Pitocin on Mrs. Berlinger?
20	Α.	The answer to this relates back to the
21		discussion we had previously. With a continuous
22		monitor and an internal system in place you are
23		doing that continuously.
24	Q.	Okay, So the answer to my question is what; no,
25		somebody does not, have to be standing over Mrs.

مراجعة الانجاب والمراجع والمحاري المراجع المراجع المراجع المراجع المراجع المراجع المراجع المراجع المراجع المراجع

The second second

I		6 1
1		Berlinger watching the drip, drip, drip of
2		Pitocin into her?
3	Α.	That's correct.
4	Q.	Okay. Is it true that wjth the use of Pitocin
5		the labor contractions become more severe?
6	Α.	Could you define severe?
7	Q.	Increased in severity from $what$ they were
8		without the use of Pitocin.
9	Α.	Well, if they were less than normal the Oxytocin
10		would bring their intensity to normal.
11	Q.	And does the use of Pitocin extend the time $of$
12		the labor contraction?
13	Α.	The use of Fitocin generally would reestablish a
14		normal labor contraction frequency and
15		intensity. That is the objective of using the
16		Oxytocin or Pitocin.
17	Q.	So is it true that in your judgement the use of
18		Fitocin on Mrs. Rerlinger was to establish the
19		normal frequency of the contractions and the
20		normal severity of Mrs. Berlinger's
2 1		contractions?
22	Α.	If we can replace the word severity $with$ the
23		ward intensity, yes.
24	Q.	When you <b>say</b> intensity what do you mean by it?
25	Α.	I mean <b>as</b> measured by the internal pressure

Sec.

		62
I		catheter in millimeters of mercury.
2	Q.	Okay. Now, what was the basis or the baseline
3		for Mrs. Berlinger's contractions before the
4		
5	Α.	She was having irregular contractions every
6		three to four, five minutes of an intensity that,
7		was low.
8	Q.	And for <b>how</b> long a period of time had that been
3		going on before the use of Pitocin?
10	A .	A good many hours.
11	Q.	So then how, in your mind, do you determine what
12		the normal contraction would be in Mrs.
13		Berlinger with the use of Pitocin?
14	A .	I <b>would</b> not know exactly what the normal is for
15		any one individual. I would only have a range
16		of normal.
17	Q.	All right. What would you expect if you were
18		looking at Mrs. Berlinger while the Pitocin is
19		run <b>n</b> ing?
20	A .	I would like
21	Q.	What would you like to be looking at?
22	Α.	I would like to be looking at contractions that
23		are occurring every two to three minutes,
24		regular, with that regular frequency with an
25		intensity that was somewheres $\texttt{between}$ 50 and 60

\* Always in the state of the

ţ

		63
1		millimeters of mercury above the baseline.
2	Q.	When you say with frequency, how frequent would
3		you like those contractions?
4	Α.	Every two to three minutes.
5	Q.	With that formula that you have described on
6		what you would have liked to have seen did that,
7		in fact, occur to Mrs. Berlinger with the use of
8		Pitocin?
9	Α.	She began to get contractions that were of
10		increased frequency and intensity.
11	Q.	After the use of Pitocin $did$ they go to two to
12		three minutes per contraction?
13	Α.	Yes, fewer intervals of time.
14	Q.	And also did the contractions with the use of
15		Pitocin on Mrs. Rerlinger also accomplish the
16		purpose of the Pitocin?
17	Α.	Well, as we discussed earlier, the flattened
18		curve of time versus dilatation `that allowed us
19		to make the diagnosis of protraction disorder
20		began to accelerate and come back to the normal
21		curve, and between 11:45 when the Pitocin was
22		initiated and $1:30$ or thereabouts she had
23		progressed from five to six centimeters to full
24		dilatation.
25	Q.	Okay. <b>so</b> at approximately <b>1:30</b> she is now fully

		64
1		dilated, is that right?
2	Α.	That's correct.
3	Q.	And what does that mean, for purposes of the
4		record, when you say fully dilated?
5	A.	It means the cervix is approximately ten
6		centimeters or greater dilated.
7	Q.	The cervix then is ready for the baby to descend
8		into, right?
. 9	Ά.	Correct.
10	Q.	All is in readiness for delivery with one
11		exception, the baby must now enter the birth
12		canal, true?
13	Α.	Must descend the birth canal.
14	Q.	Right. Now, at the time Mrs. Berlinger reached
15		full dilatation of ten centimeters at 1:30, what
16		was the position of the baby's head in Rebekah
17		insofar as station is concerned?
18	A.	Position as defined by a correlation of a
19		landmark of the fetal presenting part to the
20		landmark of the maternal pelvis is recorded only
21		one place, and I believe it's from the
22		transverse position.
23	Q.	Well, doctor, if you would look at the progress
24		note of the 10th of July and at will you look
25		at the note of the progress note. July 10 at

(ain) (ain)

i

		6 5
1		12:30 there is a progress note. Would you take
2		a look. It says CX, what is that, at 12:30?
3	Α.	Cervix.
4	Q.	FCM is what?
5	Α.	No, that's a 7.
6	Q.	I'm sorry. Seven centimeters dilated, right?
7	Α.	Right.
8	Q.	Then <b>slash</b> C. What is C?
9	Α.	Complete.
10	Q.	And what is zero?
11	Α.	I didn't write this, but 1 imagine it's the
12		station.
13	Q.	Can we conclude at 12:30 on July the 10th of
14		1984 this baby is at zero station?
15		MR. GQLDWASSER: You asked the
16		doctor what position now. You are confused,
17		Don, between position and station.
18		MR. ILER: That's all right;.
19		MR. MURPHY: It's not. all right.
20		MR. ILER: I want to stay with
21		station.
22	Q.	What station is the baby at at 12:30 in the
23		afternoon?
24	Α.	Well, according to this note, it's zero. I'm
25		getting confused on the times now. This is 106,

Ĺ

1		6.6
1		106 is 1:21, other notes I'm just trying to
2		check if these were other notes.
3		I think that's correct, counselor.
4	Q .	Okay. So now the <b>baby's</b> head being at zero
5		station that we see from our diagram, Exhibit
6		No. 7, the baby's head is approximately in the
7		position shown on the arrows in this diagram, am
8		I correct, on the big line?
9	Α.	As you have pointed to that diagram at the left
10		of the ischiospines at zero station, correct.
11	Q.	I'll mark in red at zero station 12:30,
12		7/9/84 7/10/84, pardon me.
13		Now, doctor, insofar as the station of the
14		baby Rebekah, we know that at 7:30 there is a
15		progress note, also, which indicates that the
16		station of the baby is at zero station, minus
17		one, right?
18	Α.	That's what <b>it</b> says.
19	Q.	Okay. At 3:30 in the afternoon on July the 10th
20		of 1984 the baby has been receiving Oxytocin or
2 1		Pitocin for close to four hours, right?
22	Α.	Correct.
23	Q.	The dosage of Pitocin was increased from its
24		initial dosage of two millileters to two
25		what?

Ę

		67
1	Α.	Milliunits.
2	Ω.	Milliunits to how many milliunits?
3	Α.	I believe it was doubled to four, and I can't
4		determine from the records whether it was
5		increased beyond that, but I don't believe so.
6	Q.	Okay. Would it make any difference to you as to
7		whether or not the Pitocin was increased beyond
8		four milliunits?
9	А.	No.
10	Q.	It would make no difference in your medical
11		judgement as to whether or not the increase of
12		Pitocin in Mrs. Berlinger increased beyond four
13		milliunits despite the fact the child had not
14		descended beyond zero station?
15	A.	No, because I have the monitor strip regarding
16		uterine contraction frequency and intensity and
17		I have no significant abnormality recorded on
18		that monitor.
19	Q.	Okay. Now, did the child Rebekah ever descend
20		below station, zero station before the cesarean
21		was performed.
22		MR. GOLDWASSER: The doctor has
23		answered that question already.
24	Q.	Did you, did you answer that?
25	Α.	Well, we spent time on Panel 106, counselor,

-

...

68 1 that says zero to plus one. 2 And the cesarean was performed at about 4:14 or Ω. 3 4:12 in the afternoon? 4 Α. The baby was delivered at 4:14. The cesarean, 5 preparation for and incision I believe was made 6 at 4:04. 7 Ω. Now, do you believe that based upon reasonable 8 medical certainty that Pitocin should be stopped 9 in a patient who is suspected of having a 10 cephalopelvic disproportion? 11 Are you through with the question? I'm sorry. Α. 12 Yes, I am. Q. 13 Now I have to have it repeated. A. 14 15 (Thereupon, the requested portion of 16 the record was read by the Notary.) 17 18 Absolutely not. Α. 19If there is a **cephalopelvic** disproportion, does Ω. 20 that mean that the baby's head is bigger than 21 the pelvis of the mother? No. 22 Α. What do you understand cephalopelvic 23 Okay. Q. disproportion to be, what is that? 24 25 Α. First, determination of cephalopelvic is made

and and a second and

6.5

retrospectively after one has evaluated the situation. What it is is the relationship between, if you will, as simplistic as I could explain it to you, the power, the passenger and the pelvis.

1

2

3

4

5

Sometimes the, quote, "cephalopelvic 6 7 disproportion" may be due to inadequate uterine 8 contractions that need Pitocin. Sometimes the pelvis is of adequate size and the passenger is 9 10 too big. Sometimes the passenger is of normal 11 average size and the pelvis is too smali. It's 12 a relationship between those three parameters. Is it your medical opinion that Rebekah 13 Q. Berlinger's head or skull was too big for her 14 mother's pelvis? 15 16 I'm sorry. There is one word you said in there Α. 17 that. I didn't hear. Stuck? 18 19 (Thereupon, the requested portion of 20 the record was read by the Notary.) 21 It would either be that the head was somewhat 22 Α. 23 larger than the size of the pelvis or that there 24 was a position change from the normal 25 well-flexed head.

4 400 44 4 1		7 0
1	Q.	Hypothetically speaking, if Rebekah's head was
2		too big to pass through the pelvis of the mother
3		you could not deliver this <b>baby</b> vaginally?
4	Α.	That's correct.
5	Q.	If it was determined that her head, Rebekah's
6		head, in fact, was too big for her mother's
7		pelvis should you do a cesarean as quickly as
8		possible after making that determination?
9	Α.	No.
1 0	Q.	Okay. And you indicated earlier you still would
11		not stop Pitocin once you recognized that the
12		baby's head was too big for the mother's pelvis?
13		MR. GOLDWASSER: Objection. I
14		don't think that's what he said at all.
15	Α.	That is not what I said.
16	Q.	Okay. Thank you. If you learned while the
17		mother is getting Pitocin that the baby
18		Rebekah's head is too big for her mother's
19		pelvis and cannot be delivered vaginally, would
20		you stop the use of Pitocin?
2 1	A .	I would stop the use of Pitocin when I made the
22		decision to do the cesarean section for
23		cephalopelvic disproportion.
24	Q.	When would that be, doctor?
25	<b>A</b> .	In this case Dr. Schwartz made this decision

71 1 after two hours of full dilatation, appropriate 2 time for Mrs. Rerlinger to push and to try to 3 effect the descent of the baby's head. 3:30 in this case would be the answer, 4 5 counsel. Would you change your mind on the timing to do 6 Ο. 7 the cesarean section insofar as Mrs. Rerlinger is concerned if Mrs. Rerlinger was pushing and 8 qushing ineffectively during her labor? 9 10 I don't know what that means, pushing Α. 11 ineffectively. I'm sorry, counselor. If during the point in labor Mrs. Rerlinger is 12 Q. 13 determined that she is not getting any result 14 from her pushing during the labor contraction, 15 you know, would that alter your opinion as to 16 when you would do the cesarean section? 17 What would alter my decision would be less Α. 18 related to her perception of pushing as it would 19 to the progress that was being made in the 20 descent of the fetal head. 21 After a period of time, which was 22 appropriate in this case, where no further 23 descent, it arrested, there was an arrest of 24 descent, and during which time the fetus was, in 25 my opinion, positioned to be all right, at that

		7 2
1		point $I$ would have stopped and done the cesarean
2		section.
3	Q .	All right. And would you have done the cesarean
4		section early if active labor failed to
5		progress?
6		MR. GOLDWASSER: Objection. Early
7		is a relative term. I object to the question.
8	Q.	He objects to the question. Let $me \ give \ a$
9		nonobjectionable question.
10		We know the decision to do the cesarean
11		section was made by Dr. Schwartz at 3:30 p.m.,
12		true?
13	A .	Correct.
14	Q.	Let us assume that there is a <b>point</b> earlier than
15		that that is earlier than 3:30 when active
16		progress of labor has ceased in Mrs. Berlinger,
17		would you then change your mind and make an
18		earlier time, earlier than 3:30 p.m. to do the
19		cesarean?
20		MR. MURPHY: Objection.
2 1		MR, GOLDWASSER: The record should
22		reflect
23		MR. ILER: Just make an objection.
24		MR. GOLDWASSER: At 3:15 a nurse
25		said, Dr. Schwartz examined, no progress, will
	L	

Γ

¢
	73
	do C-section. There is $\mathbf{a}$ progress note written
	by a doctor at 3:30 that says C-section will be
	done, but the nurse says Dr. Schwartz decided.
	MR. ILER: What do you want to do?
	MR. GOLDWASSER: I want you to use
2	facts accurate in the record.
	MR. ILER: What fact do you want?
	MR. GOLDWASSER: 3:15.
Q.	Doctor, let's change this question around and
	say at 3:15 Dr. Schwartz has indicated to
	somebody he is going to do the cesarean section
	and you find that there has been no active
	progress of labor; would you change your mind of
	doing the cesarean earlier?
	MR. MURPHY: Objection.
Α.	I'm not trying to it's hard for me to
	understand the question.
	MR. MURPHY: That's why I object.
Α.	At 3:15 or 3:30 Dr. Schwartz, as I reviewed the
	case, looks back over two hours of full
	dilatation, plus or minus a certain period of
	t i m e .
Q.	Right, right,
Α.	And he <b>says</b> fully dilated, good pushing, I have
	not, I do not observe further descent of the
	A . A . Q .

		7 4
1		fetal head. I'm going to do a cesarean
2		section.
3		He has to experience that time period which
4		is normal accepted standard of obstetrical care
5		and then look back over that period of time in
6		order to make that decision. He can't start
7		back here at full dilatation and say, well, she
<sup></sup> 8		is now fully dilated and zero station, I'm going
9		to do a cesarean section, that would he a
10		deviation from standard of care, because these
11		is no reason to do the section.
12	Q.	He has no reason to do the section when?
13	Α.	When she reaches full dilatation.
14	Q.	O k a y .
15	Α.	She has now reached full dilatation. He then
16		within good obstetrical care allows <b>a</b> period of
17		time, as Song as the fetus is okay, to allow
18		this lady to deliver vaginally by pushing. At
19		that point he then looks back and he said in
20		retrospect here, I am two hours, I'm not going
21		to go any further. I'm going to stop because
2 2		there is no further descent.
23	Q.	Was that the main reason that Dr. Schwastz
24		decided to do the cesarean was because the
25		baby's head had not descended into the birth

ديو:

		7.5
1		canal?
2.	Α.	Well, I believe in the operative report,
3		discharge summary I think he also, somebody also
4		adds on, I say I think there is a couple of,
5		question of fetal stress or mild decelerations.
6	Q.	Was it two reasons then, mild decelerations and
7		also
8	Α.	I need the records in order to answer. If I
9		understand the question asked me is why he did
10		the section. That's his primary reason for
11		doing the section.
12	Q.	If that's your judgement.
I <i>3</i>	Α.	Fine.
14	Q.	During the period of time that the Pitocin was
15		running, that would be from 11:45 until the time
16		that it was stopped, approximately shortly
17		before the cesarean section, was Mrs. Berlinger
18		still going through labor contractions?
13	Α.	Yes,
20	Q.	During the period of contractions between 11:45
21		and the time that the cesarean was done was
22		there pressure exerted on Rebekah the fetus in a
23		downward position?
24	Α.	You mean was there fundal dominance?
2 5	Q.	What is fundal dominance?

No.

and constrained		76
1	Α.	Fundal dominance reflects coordinated
2		contractions that begin in the cornual, the
3		sight and left cornual.
а	Q.	The upper portion?
5	Α.	The upper portion of the uterus that then comes
6		down from the upper myometrium, upper segment,
7		the midsegment, the lower segment establishing
8		fundal dominance and downward pressure.
9	Q.	I'm interested in downward pressures. Was that
10		occurring?
11	Α.	There is absolutely no way one can determine
12		that.
13	Q.	There isn't?
14	Α.	Not by the methods that were involved in this
15		case.
16	Q.	Isn't there a way to tell by clinical feeling ${f b}{f y}$
17		a trained physician as to whether or not there
18		is pressure being exerted downward to the fetus?
19	Α.	The only objective way of establishing fundal
20		dominance is to have a series of tocodynamometer
2 1		or internal myometrium balloons at the upper and
22		mid and lower and to establish the propagation
23		of the wave in a downward. A clinical
24		observation would give a feeling, but the best
25		evidence of downward pressure would be further

No.

dilatation, effacement of the cervix and descent Ι 2 of the head. Those are the clinical parameters 3 that we use to coordinate with this downward а pressure concept that you have asked me about. 5 Q, Is it your medical judgement that after the Pitocin was used that there was no downward 6 7 pressure on the fetus? 8 Α. If we determine -- are you asking me after 3:30 9 when the Pitocin was turned off? 10 Yes. After it was turned off. I want your Q., 11 opinion as to between the period of time from 12 11:45 when the Pitocin was started until it was 13 turned off at say approximately 3:30 in the 14 afternoon, was that baby being propelled 15 downward by the contracting force of the uterus? 16 Well, obviously there was no descent of the Α. 17 baby's head beyond zero station, as you have 18 identified zero to plus one station in the 19 diagrams. But at the same time the downward 20 pressure that I agree has been exerted was not 21 being excessive because there was no molding of 22 the fetal head. Neither described by clinical 23 examination of Rebekah Berlinger during the 24 labor nor in the immediate newborn period could 25 I find a description of abnormal molding.

ng the second second

		78
1		There is always, thank God, a normal amount
2		of molding that we all go through as we descend
3		the canal. It was created this way to allow us
4		to accommodate to our moms' bony pelvises, but
5		there was no excess molding.
6	Q.	How would you describe that excess molding?
7	Α.	I would describe excess molding as clinically
8		suspected by the inability to determine suture
9		lines in fontanels on the baby's presenting part
10		and an actual deformation of the skin with
11		formation of edema over the baby's head, the
1 2		scalp.
13	е.	How about a misformation of the forehead?
14	Α.	That's a general statement, counselor. A
15		misformation of the forehead, there is no
16		normal, what a normal forehead looks like on
17		birth. I think we a31 have different foreheads.
18	Q.	Would you consider then a dysmorphic
19		presentation of the forehead to be indicative of
20		this kind of pressure which was excessive on the
2 1		baby's head?
22	Α.	No. A dysmorphic would appear differently.
23	Q.	Doctor, insofar as meconium is involved, we know
24		the individual
25	Α.	As far as what is involved?

		79
1	Q.	Meconium. These is no question it was heavy
2		meconium on delivery of Rebekah, wasn't that
3		right?
4	Α.	I'm sorry, sir. I don't mean to be rude, hut
5		meconium.
6	Q.	Right.
7	Α.	And the question was was meconium found? Yes.
8	Q.	Was it in heavy quantities?
9	Α.	The meconium was found at the cesarean section
1 0		and the quantity <b>I'm</b> not sure. There was enough
<b>1</b> 1		of <b>it</b> so that appropriate and immediate
1 2		intubation in attempting to <b>suck</b> out that
13		meconium <b>was</b> done, I believe, three times.
14	Q.	What did that mean to you insofar as when the
15		meconium occurred first; does that, give you any
16		indication?
17	Α.	Does what give me an indication of when
18	Q.	The heavy meconium which was found.
19	Α.	It could have occurred well, we know, if the
20		records are correct, at 8:00 a.m. artificial
21		rupture of membranes is clear fluid, and I don't.
22		remember seeing any note about any meconium
23		during the labor in the doctor's notes or the
24		nurses' notes that I reviewed until clearly
25	   	there was meconium noted at. the time of cesarean

I

(

		8 0
1		sectinn?
2	A.	Right.
3	Q.	Right.
4	Α.	The baby was given to Dr. Lee, I believe and $$
5		I don't know it is Dr. Lee. The pediatricians
6		in the room who immediately intubated, which is
7		the important part of the management of the
8		meconium here.
9		If it's found at delivery, it's not there
10		at 8:00 and there is no notes all the way along
11	11 <sup>1</sup>	the line here, I can't answer the question. I
12		don't know when the meconium was passed.
13	Q.	Meconium can result from stress on the fetus, is
14		that right?
15	Α.	That's one of the causes, yes.
16	Q.	Did you find any evidence of stress on the fetus
17		between 8:00 a.m. in the morning and the
18		delivery of the child at 4:12 or 4:14?
19	Α.	Any stress that has me concerned or any stress?
20	Q.	Any stress.
21	Α.	If we use the appearance of some isolated and
22		nonpersistent <b>early</b> I'm sorry, late
23		decelerations, there are a couple of those
24		somewheres through there.
25	Q.	When did they occur, the late decelerations?

-

		8 1
1	Α.	I'm not sure, questionable where they are, what
2		they are. I think if you go to panel
3		Counselor, can I go back? Are you asking
4		me about decelerations, when decelerations are
5		occurring, because I can go through here and
6		pick out. any of these. These are isolated
7		nonpersistent early decelerations.
8	Q.	I would like to have you
9	Α.	Do you want one particular or a series of <b>a</b>
10		couple that you want me to interpret? I don't
11		know what you want me to do.
12	Q.	See, you have given an opinion that in reading
13		the monitoring strips you find no decelerations
14		which cause you any concern, am I correct.?
15	Α.	That's correct.
16	Q.	Ail right. And I want to test your opinion by
17		you going over and finding for me each
18		deceleration, where it is and tell me whether it
19		is early, whether it is late or whether it is
20		variable or whether there is a beat-to-beat
21		problem that you see $so$ that I can take your
22		opinion and have ${f i}{f t}$ matched ${f as}$ to what somebody
23		else may think is a late deceleration, is an
24		early deceleration, is a variable deceleration
25	3	or is <b>a</b> beat-to-beat deceleration, so then I'm

82 1 in a better position to evaluate your opinion, see? 2 MR. MURPHY: Can I ask you a 3 4 question? Do you want to **match** it with somebody 5 else's? Can we match it with at least the timeframe of Dr. Abramson? 6 MR. ILER: No. I want. to know what 7 8 his judgement is on these panels. 9 Do you want me to start in the beginning of the 10 monitor strip. 11 Yes, sir, that would be wonderful. Just run 12 through each of those plates so I can understand the foundation for your judgement. 13 1.4 I thought your original question was where you found ominous, where I found ominous 15 16 deceleration. 17 No. I'm sorry. I want you to start with the 18 very first plate. I think you said it was 37? 19 MR, GOLDWASSER: Internal or external or both? 20 MR. ILER: I'm sticking with 21 22 internal. 23 We have agreed that internal is beginning at 37. Now, during the period -- do you want me to 24 25 go 37, 38, 39?

		83
1	Q.	That's <b>it</b> , that's exactly right.
2	Α.	Okay. 37, there is a pattern of reactive
3		tachycardia probably due to the placement of the
4		internal electrode.
5	Q.	Okay.
6	Α.	You want an interpretation of significance to
7		the fetus?
8	Q.	No.
9	Α.	Or do you just want classification?
10	Q .	Just tell me what your thinking is with Plate
11		38. If you want to comment go ahead.
12	Α.	Excellent condition of the baby.
13	Q.	All right.
14	Α.	The reactivity continues through 38, 39, 40.
15		Baseline heart rate is 150 with good charted
16		long tern beat-to-beatvariability. Panel 41
17		may have an early deceleration. 42, an early
18		deceleration but the reactive tachycardia
19		continues reflecting no concern on my part for
20		the fetal condition.
21		Panel 45 and 46 shows
22	Q .	What happened to 43 and 44?
23	Α.	43 and 44?
24	Q.	Yes.
25	Α.	43 is, I think I just said, has an early

.,50

84	appearing deceleration. 44 looks fine, may have	a very slight early deceleration.	Panel 45, when you get to variables,	variables cannot be determined by simply one	panel. You have to look at the profile of	panels because they vary from one to the other	But 45, 46 look to me as the possibility of a	variable deceleration.	47 shows nice reactive tachycardia.	Q. Is that tachycardia on 47?	A. Reactive tachycardia, yes. 48 has variable	appearing	Q. Decelerations?	A. Corr¤ct Good variability. 49 th¤r¤ is a	µ¤cel¤⊭ation of µro≽ably the early type.	Through 50 51 52, 53 B therm are somm early	decelerations, greatest deceleration being about	25 beats per minute with heart rate of about	150.	Panel 54, and these are always plus or	minus a couple of minutes here where we go	forward or backwards, there is no decelerations	associated with the contraction. Another early	in 55.	57 appears like an early, may have the	
	1	2	ю	4	<u>م</u>	é	L	ω	Ø	10		12	с П	<del>درا</del> ء جراء	12	16	17	18	61	20	21	22	23	24	25	L

. M

		85
1		characteristics of a variable, it's
2		indeterminate.
3		59 has some nice reactive tachycardias.
4		This may be an acceleration pattern which
5		reassures me, this acceleration pattern asures
6		me of good fetal oxygenation.
7		62, 63, good beat-to-beat, again a reactive
8		tachycardia or an acceleration pattern. 65, 66,
9		67 fine, good.
10	Q.	Was that a deceleration then?
11	Α.	Where is that?
12	Q.	At 65, 66 and 67.
13	Α.	No. 65, 66 and 67 the heart rate looks fine to
14		me.
15	۵.	I was just interesed in knowing
16	Α.	You want to know ~he::the deceleration are?
17	Q.	Yes. I want you to look through a17 of these.
18	Α.	You want me to go through and identify only the
19		decelerations?
20	Q.	J thought that's what you were doing.
21	Α.	I thought you wanted me to look at each panel
22		and give you an interpretation.
23	Q.	No. What I want from you, doctor, is your
24		decelerations, your variables, your lates,
25		that's all <b>I</b> want.

ĺ

Γ

		86
1	Α.	The ominous stuff, you don't want the
2		innocuous?
3	Q.	Listen to me carefully. What you call ominous
4		some other physician may not think it's
5		ominous. You may look at an early deceleration
6		and somebody else may look at it and say that's
7		a late deceleration.
8	Α.	Fair enough.
9	Q.	So what I'm trying to get, from you is your
10		opinion on each plate that you consider to he a
11		deceleration or a variable so I can say this is
12		what Dr. Mann says about this, see.
13		So we are apparently 65, 66 and 67 are
14		okay, you wouldn't include those as a
15		deceleration. Okay. Just if you want to just
I 6		go right ahead.
17	Α.	Panel 73, maybe there is an early deceleration
18		there. 74 may be a mild early. Good reactive
19		tachycardia throughout here at 77, 78, 79.
20	Q.	They're normal then or are they tachys?
21	Α.	No, those are nice reactive tachycardias. Those
22		are reassuring.
23	Q.	Without the characterization, because it's
24		confusing me, about your reassurance, the only
25		thing I want to know is are they evidence of

		87
1		tachycardia or no, if you would, doctor.
3	Α.	Counselor, there are different types of
3		tachycardia. There is persistent tachycardia of
4		the baseline, there are intermittent
5		tachycardias that are in relation to uterine
6		contractions, and then there are tachycardias
7		that are related to fetal movements. There are
8		all kinds of tachycardia. It's hard for me to
9		understand what you want or don't want me to do.
10	Q.	If you say a tachycardia that is a result of
11		fetal movement I think that would be fine,
12		okay.
13	Α.	Most of what I see here as tachycardias are
14		reaction to fetal movement or uterine
15		contraction which prognostically is
16	Q.	Is that 74 or 75?
17	Α.	This is the whole record.
18	Ω.	What whole record?
19	А.	As we are going along here there are, has been
20		these recurrent reactive tachycardias to fetal
2.1		movement or uterine contractions. I have not
22		seen to this point a persistence of a baseline
23		tachycardia above 160 or so.
24	Q.	Okay. What panel are we on now?
25	Α.	We are up at Panel 88.

2<sup>1</sup> -

		8.8
1	Q .	What happened from 74 to 88?
2		MR. GOLDWASSER: You just told him
3		to go through, Don.
4		MR. MURPHY: You said just tell me
5		when there is a deceleration.
6	Q.	My question is is there anything on 74 to 88.
7		MR. MURPHY: He said on 74 there
8		might be a slight mild deceleration.
9		MR. ILER: I have a mild early
10		maybe. Now that's the last record I have.
11	Α.	Panel 84 there is a deceleration that cannot be
12		determined because there is temporary
13		discontinuation of the toco.
14	Q.	Doctor, would you listen to me for just. a
15		minute? Between Panel 74 and 88 is there
16		anything there insofar as a deceleration?
17		MR. GOLDWASSER: Don, you have got
18		to get your act together.
19		MR. MURPHY: It would he nice if
20		you listen to your own question. You asked him
21		t.o $go$ through and call to your attention when he
22		has seen a deceleration so he has gone from 74
23		to <b>84.</b>
24	Q .	That's my only question. There are none between
25		74 and 88. I'm just confirming a point. Am I

a a provincia da seconda

		89
1		right?
2	Α.	Yes, other than the suggestion of maybe a few
3		early, mild early decelerations.
4	Q.	And when are those, what panels show me mild
5		early deceleration? That's what I want.
6	Α.	78. Maybe 77.
7	Q.	Okay.
8	Α.	Now, counselor, where are we?
9	Q.	I'm at panel 78.
10	Α.	My instructions now are to go to the next
11		deceleration?
12	Q .	Wait a minute. Hang on a minute here. You see
13		what I want from you, doctor, is as you go
14		through these panels, and we are now at 78, what
15		I want is your opinion or each of the panels as
16		to whether like Panel 79 or 80 or 81, which will
17		follow, indicate some kind of a deceleration, a
18		beat-to-beatvariability or a late or early
19		deceleration in your judgement so that when $I$
20		finish all of the panels I'll know what your
2 1		opinion is <i>as</i> to each panel as to whether they
22		show a deceleration which is either a late one
23		or is an early one or is a mild early or is a
24		mild late or is a variable.
25	Α.	Earlies, lates and variables with mild moderate

and a second second

No.

		9.0
1		or severe. You don't want to hear about
2		acceleration patterns? I want to follow your
3		instructions, counselor, as best I can. I'm
4		very confused at this point.
5	Q.	I'm really interested in the deceleration here.
6	Α.	Okay. 79
7	Q.	Let me help you a bit. The next panel is 79.
8		Okay. Does that show a deceleration?
9	Α.	No, it does not.
10	Q.	Does 80?
11	Α.	80?
12	Ω.	Panel 80.
13	Α.	Maybe a mild early deceleration.
14	Q.	How about Panel 81, does that show a
15		deceleration of any kind?
16	A.	No, sir.
17	Q.	And 82?
18	A.	No, sir.
19	Q.	83?
2 0	Α.	There is something here on 83 but there is no
21		contraction, so there is a very mild something,
22		some type of deceleration.
23	Q.	You can't identify whether it's early or late?
24	Α.	No, sir.
25	Q.	What panel was that?
	1	

ť

1	Α.	83.
2	Q.	All right. How about Panel 84?
3	Α.	84 there is a deceleration.
4	Q.	And how long does it last?
5	Α.	That's approximately a minute no, two
6		centimeters, <b>about</b> 45 seconds.
7	Q.	Okay. And the next panel, Panel Number 85?
8	Α.	85, no deceleration.
9	е.	86?
10	Α.	There is, from 86 there is an increase in
11		this you don't want me to comment on that.
12	Q.	That's all right. Comment.
13	Α.	There is no specific deceleration.
14	<i>a</i> .	On 86?
15	Α.	Correct.
16	Q.	87?
17	Α.	Maybe mild early.
18	Q.	88?
19	Α.	No, sir.
20	Q.	89?
21	Α.	No, <b>sir.</b>
22	Q.	90?
23	Α.	No, sir.
24	Q.	91?
25	Α.	91 is where I would have gone to if I had gone

Support .

and a second a second a second second a second s

1		specifically to the way <b>we</b> started this. These
2		have it's hard to classify these.
3	Q.	When you say these, do you mean PI, 92, 93?
4	Α.	91, 92, 93.
5	Q.	Okay.
6	Α.	There are just three of them and then 94, 95, 96
7		other than a 160 beat per minute baseline heart
8		rate with good beat-to-beatvariability, you
9		don't see them.
10	Q .	I'm confused. Start me back, doctor, with Pane!
11		Number 91. Do you see any decelerations on 91,
12		92 and 93?
13	Α.	Yes, sir.
14	Q.	How do you classify them?
15	Α.	I would classify them as early decelerations.
16	Q.	All right. And then with 94, 95 and 96, are
17		there any decelerations in those panels?
18	Α.	N o .
19	Q.	And are there any variabilities in those
20		panels?
21		MR. MURPHY: I'm trying to figure
22		out what he is asking. Any variable
23		decelerations?
24		MR. ILER: Yes, right.
25	Α.	There is on Panel 93 a deceleration which

· the strategy of the state

93 doesn't really fit into any classification. 1 Ιt might very well be a variable, somebody might 2 call it a deceleration, somebody might call the 3 91, 92 a mild deceleration. It. would have no 4 significance to me because it does not persist. 5 Your next panel would be? 6 Q. 7 94, 95 no deceleration. 96, 97, 98, 99 no Α. deceleration. 8 Okay. And the next ones? 9 Q. 10 Where were we? Α. MR, MURPHY: 99 you left off. 11 99, no deceleration. 100, maybe  $\mathbf{a}$  mild early 12 Α. maybe in 101 or just over the hundred mark maybe 13 14 a mild early, 100 -- you don't want 15 accelerations. 102 has a little acceleration. Maybe a 16 little deceleration as an early, I'm not sure 17 18 whether that's just not normal changes. 103, 19 maybe a mild early. 104, mild early. In each of these my determination of them 20 21 being an early is that they return to the 22 baseline heart rate by the time the pressure has reoccurred, has returned to baseline. 23 104, again mild early. 105, no 24 25 deceleration. 106, a nice -- sorry. I'm not

		9 4
1		supposed to identify acceleration patterns.
2	Q.	You can if you want to. If you want to offer it.
3		in go ahead.
4	Α.	107, it's hard to tell because the uterine
5		contraction is not recording well. Again I
6		would say that's an early, though.
7	Q.	Why isn't the uterine contraction recording
8		w e 1 1 ?
9	Α.	Well, this happens from time to time. It
10		depends upon the pressure being reflected in a
11		tube that's passed into the uterine cavity and
12		that tube very frequently gets blocked, you have
13		to flush it through. This is a very frequent
14		occurrence.
15		I believe at this point already she is now
16		pushing.
17	Q.	What time would that be?
18	Α.	We're at Panel 108. 110, we are beginning to
19		see, we're about 2:00, I believe, sir, and from
20		this point forward we have multiple let me be
2 1		a little more specific.
22		Panel 108 to Panel 113 we see decelerations
23		that somebody might call earlies, somebody may
24		call them variables. They are not late
25		decelerations.

ĺ

 $C^{(1)}$ 

		95
1	Q.	Okay.
2	Α.	Panel 113 I'm sorry. Panel 114 to, through
3		Panel 117 is very reassuring. These is an
4		acceleration pattern. I'm sorry.
5	Q.	All right. There is an acceleration pattern.
6	Α.	117, you have got some moderate early or
7		variable, it's very hard to distinguish these.
8		It is not an uncommon pattern when a lady is
9		pushing in the second stage of labor, these are
10		not deep decelerations, there is a good return
11		to baseline in between them with good
12		beat - to - beat.
13	Q.	What is your conclusion?
14	Α.	My conclusion is that
15	Q.	114 to 117 are okay, moderate, earlies or what?
16	Α.	114 to 117?
17		MR. MURPHY: He has commented.
18	A.	I believe we just commented on.
19	Q.	What was
20		MR. MURPHY: 117 to something.
21	Q.	To what, sir?
22	<b>A</b> .	117 the reason that I get into looking at the
23		pattern of panels, a number of panels is because
24		no interpretation of a monitor, of the monitor
25		heart rate and its relationship to contractions

-

والمتحمة فيهج ويرارحه المحمد المراجع المراجع المراجع المراجع المراجع المراجع المراجع

		96
1		can be made by one panel. You have to look at a
2		profile of these.
3	Q.	So you are looking from 117?
4	Α.	117.
5	Q.	To where?
6	Α.	To basically to the end.
7	Q.	What would the end be, Panel 116?
8	Α.	126, sir.
9	Q.	What do you see in there?
10	Α.	I see periods of <b>early</b> or maybe they're variable
11		decelerations that at most are of $30$ , $40$ heats
12		maximum, never much below 120 beats per minute.
13		They always recover. There is good
14		beat-to-beat. There continues to be <b>some good</b>
15		reactive tachycardia and acceleration.
16	Q.	s o
17	Α.	I'm not particularly concerned about the baby at
18		this point.
19	Ω.	In concluding, <b>from</b> Panels 117 to Panel 126 you
20		see some of those as being early and variable
21		decelerations, is that true?
22	Α.	I said they may. I don't know what they are,
23		early or variables.
24	Q .	You cannot tell me what they are?
25	Α.	I can tell you what they are not.

Ĺ

1	Q.	What are they not?
2	Α.	They are not late decelerations.
3	Q.	Okay.
4	Α.	And they are not severe variable decelerations.
5	Q.	Okay. That's fine. Now we have concluded with
6		the monitoring strip, doctor, and I want to take
7		a ten minute break for just $\mathbf{a}$ minute and see how
8		far we have to go.
9		
10		(Thereupon, a recess was had.)
11		
12	Q .	Okay. Let's go to the doctor's notes, if you
13		would, doctor. These are Exhibit No. 1, they
14		are your notes that you made during your review
15		of this case. On page, it looks like the second
16		page under orders, which are orders that yon
17		have marked, I can't read the first line after
18		orders,
19	Α.	These are just some notations from the external
20		monitors. 20 minutes every two hours.
21	Q.	What does that mean? Was that the orders the
22		doctor made?
23	Α.	Yes.
24	Q .	That was done, right?
25	<b>A</b> .	In fact, I don't know what time that refers to

(

		9.8
1		but she had a continuous monitor on.
2	Q,	The next line, Pitocin begun at two?
3	Α.	Two milliunits per minute.
4	Q.	Underneath that it says what?
5	Α.	Mefoxin at cesarean section. It's an
6		antibiotic.
7	Q.	Then you have an asterisk and it says what?
8	Α.	It says there is an order ${\mathfrak E}$ or activity in the
9		postoperative orders ad lib, and I say
10		inappropriate.
11	Q.	What is that, what do you mean by that.?
12	Α.	Why did I write inappropriate?
13	Q.	What does the whole thing mean? Why did you
14		write inappropriate and
15	Α.	The order was written for activity ad lib as the
16		patient wanted to get up and walk around, and my
17		feeling was that she $had$ a spinal headache and I
18		just as soon her not up walking all over the
19		place. Inappropriate. Deviation from standard
20		of care, no, just not appropriate.
2 1	Q.	At the top of the Page 2 you have got what looks
22		to be with an asterisk, it's got FHT, fetal
23		heart rate, is that mild late decels?
24	A .	Correct. That's from the nurses' notes.
25	Q.	Okay. That's when you believe she was given

A MORES

in tr

		99
1		oxygen and turned on her left side?
2	Α.	I believe so.
3	Q.	That's appropriate for a late deceleration,
4		that's what you should do or not, it doesn't
5		make any difference?
6	Α.	It's not. in appropriate. Yes, it's appropriate,
7	Q .	Is it necessary to turn the patient on the left
8		side and give her 02 after a couple of late
9		decels?
10	<b>A</b> .	You mean in general?
11	Q.	Yes. Is it required? Do you do it?
12	Α.	Yes.
13		MR. ILER: Pat, I have trouble
14		reading all of his writing. Do you want him to
15		transcribe this and send it to you or do you
16		understand <b>it</b> all?
17		MR. MURPHY: I haven't read it.
18		all.
19		MR, ILER: I'm having a little
20		trouble reading $it$ and $I$ don't $know$ whether $I$
2 1		should take the time to go through his notes,
22		maybe that would be actually easier.
23	Α.	Actually you are doing a wonderful job of
24		reading my writing, counselor.
25	Q.	I just don't want, to misinterpret.

Ę

•

100 1 MR. MURPHY: Why don't we do this, 2 at the outside if there are particular things that you say, I don't know what that means, call 3 4 me and I'll call Dr. Mann and I'll get hack to 5 you. I'm not going to impose on him to sit down and dictate this for us. 6 7 On the first page at this point where it says Ο. 8 Uterine size equal 14 weeks. Α. 9 Q. We already got that. No allergies? 10 Allergies Erythromycin, codeine. This is all Α. 11 taken from the --12 Q. The hospital record? 13 There is nothing that appears or the first two Α. 14 pages other than what you have identified as 15 order for activity ad lib --16 Q. Okay. 17 Α. -- that is not in the chart somewheres and at 18 some point I put it into my notes. 19 Q. Okay. Do you know Dr. Schwartz? 20 Α. No, I do not. 21 Dr. Nudelman? Q. 22 Α. No. 23 Do you do any work at Mt. Sinai? 0. 24 No, sir. Α. 25 The second last page, would you turn t.o that, Q .

(

ſ		101
1		doctor?
2	Α.	Second to last page?
3		MR. MURPHY: Exhibit 5, Don?
4	Α.	Okay.
5	Q .	On 5 there are some notes here that say, I think
6		it says ominous decelerations?
7	Α.	No, sir. That says, right there it says
8		gushing, decelerations, accelerations, and $it$
9		says no bradycardia or ominous decelerations.
10	Q .	Okay. 4:14 you have marked as the delivery on
I1		that page?
12	A.	Right.
13	Q.	Under the summary portion?
14	Α.	Yes, sir.
15	Q.	What is the first thing it says, number 1?
16	Α.	It says need cord gases.
17	Q.	Who needs cord gases?
18	Α.	We need to , I need to inquire of whether there
19		were cord gases obtained.
20	Q .	why? Why do you need the cord gases?
21	Α.	It's not that I need the cord gases. It would
22		be a question of on Page 3 I write the same
23		thing up there, question <b>mark</b> result of cord
24		blood gases.
25	Q.	Yes.

		7 0 2
1	Α.	I'd like to know if cord blood gases were done
2		and what the result was to help me interpret the
3		case.
4	Q .	Yes. And what will cord gases give you?
5	Α.	Cord blood gases will give me the pH, the PC02
6		and the P02.
7	Q .	All right. And that would be during labor?
8	Α.	No, sir.
9	Q.	During?
10	Α.	Cord. That's cord is only in the newborn
11		period.
12	Q .	And did you ever get those?
13	Α.	I believe I was told that they were not done.
14	Q.	Okay. And so, therefore, what information can
15		you not have because there is no cord gases
16		done?
17	Α.	I cannot have the information of the pH, PO2 and
18		POC2 on the cord on delivery.
19	Q.	What, would those <b>relate</b> as to whether the child
20		was acidotic?
2 1	Α.	That's correct.
22	Q .	Number 1 under summary, would you tell me what.
23		that is?
24	Α.	It says labor and delivery management. okay.
25	Q .	Okay. And Number 3?

2.35.3

No.

and the state of the second

		703
1	Α,	Monitor, it says occasional earlies, mild, few
2		variables, not persistent.
3	е.	Okay. Number 4?
4	Α.	It says no encephalopathic picture.
5	Q.	What does that mean?
6	Α.	It means the newborn did not have any picture
7		that was suggestive of hypoxic encephalopathy.
8	Q.	And then Number 5?
9	Α.	It says dysmorphic picture.
10	۵.	What does dysmorphic mean?
11	Α.	Dysmorphic means abnormalities in the morphology
12		of the individual.
13	Q.	Okay. And what do you have under that?
14	Α.	I have these are all from the notes of people
15		that are written here. Hypontonia, questionable
16		hearing loss, hemivertebra.
17	Q.	Okay. And then Number 6?
18	Α.	It says syncope dash dizziness and postpartum
19		seizure. The question I'm asking was the
20		mother's problem, was any further follow-up done
2 1		and what, is this related.
22	Q.	Okay. And then the last item, Number 7 says
23		what?
24	Α.	Defendable.
25	Q.	Do you mean defendable suit?

		104
1	A.	Correct.
2	Q.	When were these notes made? Is there a date on
3		any of these?
4	Α.	Oh, boy.
5	Q.	We know that there has been correspondence.
6		MR, MURPHY: Check when I sent you
7		the records and we will know it's from that
8		point forward.
9	Α.	November 13th, 1986 I received the records.
10	Q.	Did you receive any other reports from any other
11		physicians to review?
12	Α.	In this case?
13	Q.	Yes.
14	A.	I have said I have the deposition of Dr.
15		Schwartz, the deposition of Dr. Abramson. Is
16		that right, Dr. Abramson?
17	Q.	Yes.
18	Α.	And the written report of Dr. Scher, since I
19		reviewed, made these notes.
20	Q.	Okay. But before, as you were going through the
21		case did you get in any other medical reports?
22		Did you get Dr. Milley's report to read? Do you
23		know <b>who</b> he is?
24	A.	Could you spell it?
25	Q.	M 1 L L E Y. From Pittsburgh.

C

لي المركز ال المركز المركز

		105
1	Α.	No.
2	Q.	Did you get Dr. Scher's report.?
3	Α.	Yes, I think I said that.
4	Q.	Did you get any other doctor's reports to
5		review?
6	Α.	What I have reviewed for the case is what we
7		went over in my opinion letter of June 8th and
а		since then Dr. Schwartz, Abramson and Scher.
9	Ω.	Okay. Are there any medical textbooks that you
10		consider to be authoritative in the field of
11		obstetrics and gynecology?
12	Α.	No, sir.
13	Q.	Do you use any textbooks when you teach your
14		residents?
15	Α.	Will I refer to a textbook from time to time for
16		information regarding one thing or another.
17	Q.	Yes. That's the question, well, it wasn't, hut
18		I'll take your question.
19	Α.	Yes.
20	Q.	Which one?
2 1	Α.	Which one?
22	Q.	Ones, one or which book or books would you refer
23		to?
24	Α.	We would refer to many of the textbooks of
25	L	obstetrics and gynecology because on many issues

		106
1		each textbook presents something a little bit
2		different in terms of the interpretation.
3	Ω.	Which books would they be?
4	Α.	They would be Williams' Textbook of Obstetrics.
5		They would be Danforth's textbook, Wilson's,
6		Romney's, Creasy, the Resnik, on and on.
7	Q.	With each of those textbooks I think what your
8		testimony is, they each may be, each may contain
9		a portion that you consider to be valuable or
10		authoritative or not the entire book?
11	Α.	No, sir. I don't consider any textbook to be
33		authoritative. I think I consider them
13		informational.
14	Q.	Do they use any of these textbooks to teach
15		people who, students who are going to be
16		OB/GYN's?
17	Α.	I'm sorry. Who is they?
3 B	Q.	I mean do medical schools use any textbooks in
19		the teaching of medical students?
2.0	Α.	Yes, sir.
21	Q.	Which books do the medical schools use at Case
22		Western Reserve?
23	Α.	At Northwestern you are going to use Dr.
24		Danforth's. If you are in Boston you are likely
25		to use Dr. Reed's hook, Dr. Romney's bonk. If

	:	107
1		you are in California you may use Drs. Creasy
2		and Resnik's.
З	Q.	How about Case Western Reserve?
4	Α.	I really don't know which textbook we used. We
5		usually, because of the cost of these books,
6		usually use them as a resource for the students
7		and the students will pick up their information
8		from the series of lectures that we give in some
9		condensed form or a curriculum type of book and
10		then refer in our library to any of the several
11		books that I mentioned and others for more
12		detailed information. And more particularly
13		they and us, residents and faculty refer to the
14		literature, the present literature and past
15		literature, journals for information.
16		MR. ILER: I think those are all
17		the questions I have of the doctor at this time,
18		and I thank you and $a  s  k$ for a waiver of
19		signature.
20		MR, MURPHY: When $it's$ written up
2 1		I'd like you to review it and then we will
22		decide whether you want to waive it $or$ if you
23		think something is inaccurate we can <b>make a</b>
24		change and we can indicate why.
25		THE WITNESS: You don't want us to
	L	

.≫.			108
1	waive?		
2	MR.	MURPHY: No.	
3	THE	WITNESS: Okay.	
4			
5			
6		LEON I. MANN, M.D.	
7			
8			
9			
1 0			
11			
12			
13			
14			
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
2 0			
2 1			
22			
23			
24			
25			

and the second se

with the state of the state of

	109
1	
2	
3	
4	<u>C E R T I F I C A T E</u>
5	
6	The State of Ohio, ) 55: County of Cuyahoga.)
7	
8	I, Dawn M. Hagestrom, a Notary Public
9	within and for the State of Ohio, authorized to administer oaths and to take and certify
10	depositions, do hereby certify that the above-named <u>LEON I. MANN, M.D.</u> , was by me, before the giving of his deposition, first duly
11	sworn to testify the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth; that the deposition as
12	above-set forth was reduced to writing by me by means of stenotypy, and was later transcribed
13	into typewriting under my direction; that this
14	is a true record of the testimony given by the witness, and was subscribed by said witness in
15	my presence; that <b>said</b> deposition was taken at the aforementioned time, date and place,
16	pursuant to notice or stipulations of counsel; that I am not a relative or employee or attorney of any of the parties, or a relative or employee
17	of such attorney <b>or</b> financially interested in this action.
18	IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my
19	hand and seal of office, at Cleveland, Ohio,
20	this day of, A.D. 19
2 1	
22	
23	Dawn M, Hagestrom, Notary Public, State of Ohio 650 Engineers Building, Cleveland, Ohio 44114
24	My commission <b>expires</b> October 20, 1987
25	
-	

Г

el. internet