4623



George Criss, Jr. vs. Consolidated Rail Corp.

Page 1 to Page 38

CONDENSED TRANSCRIPT AND CONCORDANCE PREPARED BY:

Tackla & Associates 1700 Superior Building 815 Superior Avenue Cleveland, OH 44114 Phone: (216)241-3918 FAX: (216)241-3935



	Page 1
(1)	IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
(2)	NORTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO
(3)	EASTERN DIVISION
(4) <b>G</b>	eorge Criss, Jr., )
(5)	Plaintiff, )Case No.
(6)	-vs- )1:97CV2857
(7) <b>C</b>	onsolidated Rail )
(8) <b>C</b>	orporation. )
(9)	Defendant. )
	<u></u>

- 4

-----(10)Deposition of RALPH KOVACH, M.D , an (11)(12) expert witness herein, called by the (13) Plaintiff as if upon cross-examination under (14) the statute, and taken before Luanne Stone. (15) a Notary Public within and for the State of (16) Ohio, pursuant to the agreement of counsel, (17) and pursuant to the further stipulations of (18) counsel herein contained, on Friday, the 3rd (19) day of September, 1999 at 10:00 o'clock A.M. (20) at the offices of Ralph Kovach, M.D., 9700 (21) Garfield Boulevard, the City of Cleveland, (22) the County of Cuyahoga and the State of (23) Ohio. (24)

(25)

	Page 2

(1)	APPEARANCES:
(2)	On behalf of the Plaintiff:
(3)	Chattman, Gaines & Stern, by:
(4)	Michael Michelson, Esq.
(5)	-
(6)	
(7)	On behalf of the Defendant:
(8)	Gallagher, Sharp, Fulton & Norman,
(9)	by:
(10)	Joseph Santoro, Esq.
(11)	
(12)	
(13)	
(14)	
(15)	
(16)	-
(17)	
(18)	
(19)	
(20)	
(21)	
(22)	
(23)	
(24)	
(25)	

Page 3 PROCEEDINGS (1) RALPH KOVACH, M.D., being of lawful (2) (3) age, having been first duly sworn according (4) to law, deposes and says as follows: (5) CROSS-EXAMINATION OF RALPH KOVACH, M.D BY MR. MICHELSON: (6) Hello, Doctor. We're here for this (7)Q (8) discovery deposition in the matter of George (9) Chriss versus Conrail. Any questions Lask (10) You that you don't understand or you don't (11) hear me, please, I'll repeat or explain it. (12) Α Yes, sir. And 111 ask you to keep your voice up Q (13)(14) so that the reporter can get down what you (15) have to say. Let's take a quick look, if we (16) could, through your CV. When were you Board (17) certified? (18)1962. Α Q Okay. You took your orthopedic (19)(20) residency at St. Luke's? (21) А Yes, sir. (22) Q And that was in 1958 that you finished (23) that? (24)А Yes, sir. Q Okay. Did you pass your boards the (25)

# Page 4

	5			
(1) first time you took them?				
(2) A	The first time, yes, sir.			
(3) Q	Okay.			
(4) A	There were several occasions on taking			
(5) the boards.	lt's several parts, so you have			
(6) exams.				
(7) Q	Oral and written?			
(8) A	Yes.			
(9) <b>Q</b>	Okay.			
(10) A				
(11) Q	Okay.			
(12) A	So, to answer your question, the first			
(13) <b>time, yes.</b>				
(14) Q	Are you licensed to practice medicine?			
(15) A	Yes, in Ohio.			
(16) Q				
(17) license for any reason?				
(18) A	No, sir.			
(19) Q	Or had it suspended or anything?			
(20) A	No.			
(21) Q				
(22) instructor in orthopedic surgery at Reserve				
(23) Medical school.				
(24) <b>A</b>				
(25) orthopedic s	(25) orthopedic surgery. Whether that will			

(10)(11)

D 5
Page 5
(1) continue, I don't know because St. Luke's no
(2) longer has a training program, although my
(3) instructorship was just renewed in July.
(4) Q Now, as I understand it, what that
(5) means is that, when they send medical
· · · ·
(6) students or
(7) A Well, may I explain it? It will be
(8) easier.
(9) Q Yes, please.
(10) A They had a certified orthopedic
(11) training program at St. Luke, and that's
(12) where I was an instructor. That's how I
(13) held that position, through Western Reserve
(14) University School of Medicine. Now, St.
15) Luke's has abandoned medicine and surgery.
(16) It will be mainly psychiatric. There no
17) longer is a residency training program. So,
(18) this will probably be just abandoned.
(19) Q You have privileges at the four
(20) hospitals that I listed here?
(21) A Yes.
$\Lambda$

(22)	Q	And you admit patients there?
	^	V

- (23)A Yes.
- Q Okay. That's enough of that. Doctor, (24) (25) tell me a bit about your practice. What

(1) on the I	etterh	nead. That's you and Dr.
(2) Marsha	11	
(3)	А	Yes, sir.
(4)	Q	You and he are partners here?
(5)	А	No. We are associated because this is
(6) not a pa	artner	ship. It's a corporation.
(7) There's	a leg	al difference, as you know
(8) better th	nan I.	So, before I say the wrong
(9)thing		
(10)	Q	No, that's all right.
(11)	А	But
	~	MALLER STATE STATE AND AND A DESCRIPTION AND A D

Page 7

XMAX(2/2)

(12)We're not trying to catch you here. Ω

I know, but I'm trying to be legalistic (13)А

(14)---Q Okay. (15)

-- in my reply. Essentially, I was А (16)

(17) incorporated some 25 years-plus alone, and (18) then I subsequently had several people who (19) were with me, and the last is Dr. Marshall (20) who's been with me now for over 23 years.

Q Now, you've issued a report based upon (21)(22) your evaluation of Mr. Chriss; is that (23) correct?

А Yes, sir. C

(25)

(24)

All right. Now, as I understand it,

#### Page 6 Page 8 (1) type of a practice do you have? (1) you have determined that, or you agree with (2) А General orthopedics. (2) the diagnosis that Mr. Chriss does not have (3) any herniated disks. (3) Q Do you do surgery yourself? А Yes, sir. (4)(4)Α That's my opinion, yes, sir. (5) Q Do vou do back surgery? (5) Q And that there is no nerve root А I no longer do back surgery. I stopped (6) impingement here. (6) (7) doing back surgery possibly five years ago, Yes, sir. (7)А (8) and the reason for that is that the All right, and you also find that there (8) Q (9) insurance premiums did not justify me (9) was no objective evidence to substantiate (10) continuing to do back surgery for the (10) the complaints that he gave you. (11) minimal remuneration that was coming. On my examination, yes, sir. (11)Α So, you no longer do that in the last Q On your examination. (12) Q (12)(13) five years? (13)А Yes. All right. Is that the sum total of I stopped, yes, sir. (14)Q (14)А (15) the opinions that you're rendering here and (15) Q Do you do any other kind of surgery? А Yes. (16) that you intend to render in this case? (16)Q Presently? (17)A Well, that's what I put in my report to (17)Α, Yes. (18)(18) Mr. Dover, yes. Q Now, you've reviewed the George Chriss Q I appreciate that. I just want to make (19)(19)(20) matter. (20) sure that that's --Α Yes, sir. MR. SANTORO: (21)I'd like to just (21)And Cleveland Orthopedic Associates, Q (22) clarify. The report speaks for itself, so (22)(23) before we get to that --(23) the opinions in the report are --А THE WITNESS: (24)Yes. (24)Yes. Q MR. SANTORO: --what opinions (25) -- I notice that there are two people (25)

#### Page 9

(1) Dr. Kovach is bringing to this case, just				
(2) for the record.				
(3)	MR.	MICHELSON: Okay.		
(4)	BY M	MR. MICHELSON:		
(5)	Q	All right. So, those are the opinions		
(6) that you'r	re rei	ndering in this case?		
(7)	Α	Yes, sir.		
(8)	Q	And those are the only opinions that		
(9) <b>you've fo</b>	rmed	d regarding this matter?		
(10)	Α	Yes, yes, sir.		
(11)	Q	Nor do you intend to testify to		
(12) anything	diffe	rent than that.		
(131	Α	No, I would not		
(14)	Q	Imean		
(15)	Α	No, unless you have something new that		
(16) would be different from what is on the				
(17) record, I see no change in what I would				
(18) testify to.				
(19)	Q	Now, Doctor, in general, do you treat		
(20) people who have chronic low back problems?				
(21)	Α	Yes.		
(22)	Q	Have you over the years?		
(23)	Α	Yes, sir.		
(24)	Q	Is the phrase, a mechanical back		
(25) syndrome, one that you are either familiar				

### Page 10

(1) with or agree that it's a condition --A It's a catch word that's out there now. (2)(3) Many people say "mechanical back syndrome," (4) not being really defined as to what it (5) exactly means, but it seems to be (6) pontificating that this is an honest to God (7) thing, but by "mechanical," it would infer (8) that something in the body mechanics may be (9) out of whack, and that would be contributing (10) to the individual's complaints. So, you (11) know, you could put it down rather than (12) saying that he has a degenerated epiphyseal (13) joint, and when it moves under a load, it (14) produces pain. Q The people that you treat for chronic (15)(16) back problems, are there --well, there are (17) -- let me back up. There are people who have chronic (18)(19) pain symptoms in their low back which are (20) the result of multiple problems, correct? Correct. (21)А (22) Q Different kinds of problems can create (23) that condition. (24) А Yes, sir. Q And that condition can exist often (25)

Page 11 (1) without or sometimes without any objective (2) findings; isn't that true? A When you say "sometimes," that doesn't (3) (4) exclude anyone. So, when you say it that (5) way, then, I would have to agree that (6) sometimes that's possible. Q And you have, yourself, treated (7) (8) patients who have significant, ongoing (9) complaints of pain where you cannot pinpoint (10) from any objective finding the specific (11) cause of that pain; is that right? (12) А That's true. Q Okay. Now, out of all of the patients (13)(14) that you've treated and have treated for low (15) back problems, have there been -- ['] (16) withdraw that. (17) How many are there, if you can (18) possibly quantify this, where you recommend (19) surgery on their low back? (20) А How many would I recommend surgery, (21) percentagewise? (22) Q Yes. (23) А I can't give you a percentage, but very (24) few.

Q So, traditionally -- not

(25)

# Dago 12

1 490 12					
<ul> <li>(1) "traditionally," but commonly, low back pain</li> <li>(2) patients are treated conservatively without</li> </ul>					
(3) surgery.					
(4) A Yes, sir.					
(5) Q And that doesn't necessarily mean that					
(6) they don't have a problem; it just means					
(7) that they're not appropriate surgical					
(8) candidates for any one of a number of					
(9) reasons.					
(10) A Yes, sir.					
(11) Q Now, would you agree that there are					
(12) persons who have chronic low back pain or					
(13) chronic low back difficulties that often are					
(14) restricted in the nature or the extent of					
(15) the activities that they can endure without					
(16) difficulty?					
(17) A Yes.					
(18) Q Even those who do not necessarily have					
(19) herniated disks or nerve involvement, or any					
(20) kind of nerve impingement.					
(21) A Yes.					
(22) Q And these types of patients, if they do					
(23) engage in activities, in certain activities,					
(24) it can cause exacerbations of their problem					

(25) that can be fairly significant or severe.

XMAX(4/4)

Page 13				
(1) <b>A Yes.</b>				
(2) Q And if they refrain from the	ose types of			
(3) activities, then, their condition can get				
(4) somewhat quiescent and under control?	?			
(5) A Yes.				
(6) Q Those are fair statements	?			
(7) A Yes.				
(8) Q Okay. With those types of				
(9) it appropriate for orthopedic physicians				
(10) any physicians to then recommend that	they			
(11) restrict themselves from that type of				
(12) activity?				
(13) A Just on the basis of what				
(14) leading up to so far, and just saying that				
(15) you restrict without doing the appropriat	e			
(16) workup and appropriate treatment – (17) Q That's a fair statement.				
(17) Q That's a fail statement. (18) A You know, without doing t	hoso things			
(19) some people will say: okay, we'll restrict (20) your activity because this will produce pain				
(21) for you; so that you won't be painful, you				
(22) don't do that. So, yes, under that				
(23) circumstance, but we haven't gotten into				
(24) whether he tried to make him any better				
(25) Q I understand.	•			

# Page 14

In other words, that's like giving a (1) Α (2) guy a slip that you don't have to work for (3) the next five years because, if you work, it (4) will hurt, rather than trying to get him (5) better. Q I appreciate that. My question, (6) (7) however, if you assume --Yes, assuming that, I agree with your (8) А (9) statement. If you assume that, in fact, the (10)Q (111physician has done appropriate testing to (12) see if they can objectify any particular (13) Course of care that would remedy the (14) situation, and has tried conservative -(15) measures which may include, well, any pain (16) management type thing, physical therapy, if (17) you assume that that's all been done, and we (18) still are left with a patient with this (19) chronic pain condition, that's my question. (20) А We're going to assume all of those (21) things (22)C Right. And under that assumption that the Α (23)(24) appropriate consultation has also been (25) obtained, that the individual, if he can't

### Page 15

(1) find the cause and treatment, would also (2) request proper consultation, and under those (3) circumstances, yes. Q Okay. Now, a musculoligarnentous low (4) (5) back injury --А Yes. (6) Q -- which has chronic symptomatology. (7)(8) all right, which results in that, will you (9) agree that that certainly may very well not (10) be accompanied by positive MRI, CT, X-rays, (11) EMG or nerve conduction studies? A None of those should be positive with (12)(13) that particular injury. (14)Q Okay, and those tests themselves, the (15) purpose of those is to determine the nature (16) and extent and location of nerve and disk (17) injuries in the back, correct? I'm talking (18) about back injuries now. Yeah, plus arthritic changes as well in (19)Α (20) those joints. Okay. Now, orthopedic physicians very (21)Q (22) often get their referrals from either family (23) physicians or internists, primary care (24) people, correct? A Yes, sir. (25)

# Page 16

For patients, it's perfectly Q (1)(2) appropriate to go to a primary care (3) physician and perhaps even engage in a (4) course of treatment or conservative care and (5) testing until such time as the physician (6) determines that he or she ought to be seen (7) by an orthopod. А It is appropriate for any licensed (8) (9) physician to see them, and if they get to (10) the point where they are out of their field (11) of expertise as far as helping the (12) individual, then, they should get (13) consultation, and then that's fine. That's (14) appropriate. (15)Ω All right. Now, is it a fair statement (16) to say that diagnoses of medical problems or (17) conditions in patients are often made based (18) upon history and subjective complaints, even (19) though you can't necessarily objectify them? A The history is most important, most (20)(21) important, and as you said, sometimes the (22) diagnosis is predicated upon the history. Q Okay. Now, my understanding, and you (23)(24) correctme if I'm wrong. A Yes, sir. (25)

#### Page 17

- 5 -				
(1) Q I believe you've told me in the past				
(2) that, when you have patients, your own				
(3) clinical patients, physicians basically,				
(4) unless they can show specifically otherwise,				
(5) you have to rely on the history that your				
(6) patients give you.				
(7) A Yes, you have to take the history				
(8) that's given.				
(9) Q Now, Doctor, tell me, when you would do				
(10) the medical examination of Mr. Chriss and				
(11) other before we leave, Doctor, I just				
(12) want to take a quick look at the file.				
(13) A Allright.				
(14) Q But before we get to that, to do the				
(15) examination of Mr. Chriss, how long did that				
(16) take, or how long did it typically take you?				
(17) A I don't know how long this one took,				
(18) but				
(19) Q Typically.				
(20) A To be in the general ball park, it				
(21) depends on primarily the length of the				
(22) history that's involved because I want to				
(23) get everything that the individual can				
(24) relate to me, so that they have an				
(25) opportunity to tell me everything, and that				

#### Page 18

(1) varies anywhere from five minutes -- it can (2) be a half an hour. I don't know how long it (3) took in this instance, but it was long (4) enough that he was, I'm sure, satisfied (5) because I asked him: is there anything else (6) that you want to tell me? And, that took, (7) perhaps, 15 to 20 minutes. The physical (8) examination will take approximately five to (9) seven minutes. (10) Q Okay, and, then, you then write a (11) report; is that correct? (12)А Well --Or you review documents? (13) Q (14)А Not yet. O Tell me what else is part of the (15)(16) process. (17)Α Then, I'll do the review and then try (18) to tie everything together, and then I'll (19) submit a report. Q I see, and when you say "review," what (20)(21) do you mean by that? Well, pardon me? (22)А (23) Q What do you mean by "review"? Well, I review other documents that (24) Α (25) have been submitted on behalf of the

#### Page 19

(1) individual who has the complaints, such as (2) the past medical treatment, his doctors' (3) reports, sometimes the doctor's records, the (4) letters that may have been written on his (5) behalf, and various reports from either (6) radiologists or others involved, and then (7) when that's digested, then, we'll submit a (8) report. How long would that take you? (9) Q It varies depending on the volume; (10)А (11) anywhere from two hours to five, six hours. Q Okay, and now, you do medical (12)(13) examinations, consult in medical (14) examinations on a fairly regular basis; is (15) that right? Yes, sir. (16) А Okay. Are all of -- other than --(17)Q (18) well, 111 withdraw that. What percentage of the examinations (19)(20) that you're asked to do are on behalf of (21) either defendants, law firms, insurance (22) companies, manufacturers, railroads, (23) businesses?

(24) MR. SANTORO: I'm going to (25) object.

# Page 20

(1)	THE	WITNESS:	You are not
(2) including	a mv	own patients w	ho've been
(3) injured?			
(4)		MR. MICHELSO	ON:
(5)	Q	Right, I'm not i	ncluding them.
(6)	А		iying: do lexamine,
(7) for exam	nple, i	f a plaintiffs att	
			am and a report, I
(9) practical	ly ha	ve done none o	of those.
(10)	Q	So, the others	-
11)	А	If there is an in	dependent examination
(12) requeste	ed, it's	almost always	on the part of
13) the defe	ndant		
(14)	Q	Okay.	
(15)	А	But I do have r	ny own cases which I
		,	y, there will be
		valuate a case	
		ut necessarily e	
19) individua	al on t	the part of a pla	aintiffs
20) attorney			
21)			e other work for Gallagher
22) Sharp ar			
23)		Yes, I have.	
24)		SANTORO:	Objection.
25)	THE	WITNESS:	Yes, I've done some

XMAX(6/6)

Page <b>21</b>	Page 23		
(1) cases for them.	(1) Q Okay. Is it primarily for attorneys?		
(2) BY MR. MICHELSON:	(2) A It's almost always		
(3) Q Consulting for them?	(3) <b>Q Okay</b> .		
(4) A Yes, sir.	(4) A a legal situation or, you know, when		
(5) Q Howoften? Howoften?	(5) we're talking about employers, it isn't.		
(6) A I can't tell you the exact number	(6) Q Okay. Doctor, I want to show this to		
(7) because I don't keep individual count, but	(7) <b>Y</b> OU.		
(8) suffice it to say that it's been probably	(8) (At this time Plaintiffs Exhibit		
(9) more than ten within the last two, three	(9) 1 was marked for identification purposes.)		
(10) <b>years.</b>	(10) BY MR. MICHELSON:		
(11) Q More than ten within the last two or	(11) Q This is what we've previously marked as		
(12) three years?	(12) Plaintiffs Exhibit 1. Doctor, do you		
(13) A Within the last two or three years.	(13) recognize that as a subpoena with some other		
(14) The exact number, I don't keep a record of.	(14)documentsattached that we served on you		
(15) Q Less than 50, more than 50?	(15)Some time ago?		
(16) A Probably less than 50. I'm sure it was	(16) MR. SANTORO: Just for the		
(17) less than 50.	(17) record, some of the documents weren't		
(18) Q Okay. Are there any other law firms	(18) attached to the subpoena.		
(19) that you consistently get, or who are	(19) MR. MICHELSON: That's right In		
(20) clients of yours that send you consulting	(20) there, there's a subpoena with an exhibit		
(21) <b>work?</b>	(21) attached to it, and then there's a couple of		
(22) A No, I don't have any clients.	(22) pieces of correspondence.		
(23) Q Okay, who are folks who ask you to	(23) THE WITNESS: Yes, sir.		
(24)consulton these defense medical	(24) BY MR. MICHELSON:		
(25) examinations?	(25) Q Do you recognize the subpoena?		

Page ZZ			
(1) A Yes, there are other firms.			
(2) MR. SANTORO: Objection.			
(3) THE WITNESS: And individuals who			
(4)do			
(5) BY MR, MICHELSON:			
(6) Q And who are some of those?			
(7) A I can't recall offhand to give you			
(8) names. So, rather than be totally			
(9) inaccurate, I won't answer that.			
(10) Q You can't recall who they are?			
(11) <b>A</b> If you mention names, I can say: yes,			
(12) i recall that name.			
(13) Q Okay. How about insurance companies;			
(14) do you do work for them too, independent			
(15) exams			
(16) MR. SANTORO: Objection.			
(17) BY MR. MICHELSON:			
(18) Q or is it always for law firms who			
(19)Work			
(20) A Well, when you say "insurance			
(21) companies," would you then say a claims			
(22) examiner would ask me to do an examination			
(23) and report? In those instances, yes, that			
(24) has happened where there's no attorney			
(25) involved			

# Page 24

	r ugo z-	
(1) A	Yes, sir	
(2) Q	And in response to that subpoena, I	
(3) know that your attorney, Mr. Mathews, was in		
(4) touch with our office.		
(5) A	Yes. sir.	

(5) Q And he has provided to us a schedule (6) (7) which is in that Exhibit 1.

A Yes, sir. (8)

(9)

(19)

- Q Do you have that there?
- А Yes, sir.

(10) Do you have a copy of it? (11) Q

- (12) А Yes.
  - Q Okay, good. Just give it to her.

(13) Because I have a copy, because I А (14)

(15) submitted that to him.

Q Now, the document that's in there, that (16)(17) is something that you created; is that

(18) right?

А Yes, sir.

Q And you did this by reviewing your (20) (21) records and whatever would be required to (22) conform to that subpoena, to the extent that (23) you have it.

Let me elaborate on your question. (24) А Q Goahead. (25)

#### XMAX(7/7)

		Page 25	
(1)	Α	Because I think the answer will be more	
(2) clear			
(3)	Q	Goahead	
(4)	Α	So that you understand how I did this,	
		r whom I do the examinations	
		eports are not kept separately,	
( ) ) ) ) ) )		ides the U.S. Government	
		n cases. They're all put in ification in the computer, not	
		it all put together, as a PPD.	
		de that's used, telling me that	
		manent partial disability	
		hat includes everything, okay,	
		also we include each case,	
		e computer, I can bring up the	
		of charges or patients that	
(17) I've seen in a year's time and the total			
		ese which are the PPD exams, so	
(19) this is how we arrive at that. That's the			
(20) total, and then when there was a deposition,			
		own a little farther for you.	
(22)	Q A	Okay.	
(23)		During that particular time, that's the deposition was for, but	
		s a deposition, so that's how	
(23) (10) (110	ie wa	s a deposition, so that's now	

Page 26 (1) We arrived at the total on these things, and (2) then, of course, the charges that were out (3) of that total for each one of those. Q Categories? (4) (5) А Those things in those particular years. So, we have here the PPDs which are Q (6) (7) permanent partial exams? (8) Α But like I explained, that's the all-(9) inclusive term for an IME exam, an actual (10) exam for a permanent partial disability, for (11) example, for State Workers' Compensation, a (12) U.S. Department of Labor exam, the U.S. Post (13) Office; all of these things are put in the (14) One category. And then the total number of charges, (15)Ω (16) what is that? That's the number of people in the year (17)Α (18) that I've made charges on. (19) Q That's just the total number of (20) patients you've seen? No, charges. Each one has a charge Α (21) (22) Sometimes if there is no charge, for (23) example, it's a follow-up for a surgical (24) procedure, and there's no second charge. (25) Q Do the total number of charges ---

- Page 27 (1)Α Yes, sir. - in either the -- well. let's just go Q (2)(3) to the number. It says 2399. Yes, over 1996, that's 2399, and that's Δ (4)(5) the monetary charge that those charges (6) amounted to, and included in that 2399 is (7) also the total number of the PPD exams. Okay. (8) Ο Α The depositions in that total of (9) (10) charges Q (11)ISPE Α But as a further breakdown of that (12)(13) total number, so much of that was due to the (14) generation of the PPD exams, and the other (15) is the deposition charges. Q I'm just going from the top of the (16)(17) page Yes, sir Α (18)Q Of the 2399 charges that were made ---(19)(20)Α Yes Q -- 263 of them were for independent (21)(22) medicals or permanent partial evaluations? Yes, of that category, yes, sir. Α (23)In that category, and were those all 0 (24)
- (25) where you were retained by a lawyer or an

# Page 28

(1) insurance examiner or somebody to do an (2) evaluation, or an employer? It could be an employer. It could be (3) А (4) the U.S. Government. For example, the U.S. (5) Department of Labor, they examine - I (6) examine many cases for them, and all of (7) those are categorized in there. Q I see, and the same is true for each of (8) (9) these categories, each of these years; is (10) that the idea? Yes, sir. (11)А (12)Q Okay. Can you tell me how many of the (13) PPD exams, as you've called them here, I (14) mean, whether there's any subcategories for (15) those that you can identify? No. (16)Α You can't do that? (17)Q (18)Α No. (19)Ω Okav Not without trying to find each and (20)Α (21) every one of those charts, trying to find (22) Out who it was, because the charges are just (23) put in under the category.

Okay. Do your normal appointment (24)O (25) calendars carry with them any information

### Page 29

1 490 20				
(1) regarding not only the names of the patients				
(2) and times, but what the purpose of them is,				
(3) on whose behalf you're doing them?				
(4) MR. SANTORO: Before you answer				
(5)that, I'mgoing to object to this question.				
(6) It involves –				
(7) MR. MICHELSON: It involves what?				
(8) MR. SANTORO: It involves an				
(9) answer that will divulge or is trying to				
(10) seek information that's protected by the				
(11) doctor/patient privilege.				
(12) MR. MICHELSON: What information				
(13) is that? I'm sorry.				
(14) MR. SANTORO: This objection has				
(15) been made by Tyler Mathews on behalf of Dr.				
(16) Kovach in a letter to Mr. Michelson.				
(17) MR. MICHELSON: Uh-huh.				
(18) MR. SANTORO: And I just want				
(19) that on the record.				
(20) MR. MICHELSON: Okay, but you can				
(21) answer the question.				
(22) MR. SANTORO: You can answer.				
(23) THE WITNESS: When someone makes				
(24) an appointment, often the receptionist will				
(25) indicate a phone number, who to contact in				
(25) indicate a priorie number, who to contact in				

#### Page 30

(1) case an individual does not show up, so they (2) can be informed that they were not there. The other indication that there (3)(4) might be for an examination is that the time (5) allotted is not five minutes, but we try to (6) allot at least a half an hour for an (7) examination, so that I'm notjammed in the (8) middle, and someone comes in with a (9) youngster, and they're carrying on, and I've (10) got a half an hour exam scheduled ahead of (11) them. So, that would indicate that, and (12) also it would probably be put down who was (13) requesting the examination rather than the (14) individual, because we also try to get a (15) phone number if it's a new patient whom I (16) haven't seen, whether they're for that (17) reason or for some other reason. So, in (18) case something happens to me, we have a (19) number to contact and say: please, he's not (20) going to be able to make it, or something (21) happened to him. Can we reschedule the (22) appointment? Okay. Now, I know your lawyer called (23)Q

(24) me, and I spoke to him regarding some of the (25) information requested in the subpoena. Now, Page 31

(1) some of the information that we requested (2) included a copy of records that had to do (3) with tax forms that would have been supplied (4) to you by those who retained you in a (5) consulting capacity. You do not get any of (6) those from law firms or anybody who hires (7) you for these things?

A Okay. First of all, let me explain. (8) (9) You used the word "retained." My (10) understanding of "retain" is that there's

- (11) money up front. (12)Ω No, that's not it.
- Α

That's my understanding of the word (13) (14)"retained." So, that's why I'm elaborating (15) on my understanding.

Q Goahead. (16)

Meaning if I'm retained to do (17)А (18) something, whether or not I have to complete (19) something or not, where there's a baseline (20) that you're retained for, and you have such (21) income forthcoming because of being (22) retained, that's what the word means, is my (23) understanding.

- Q Right, okay. (24)
- (25) Α So, from that standpoint, no, I'm not

# Page 32

(1) retained where I receive an income from (2) anybody, and, therefore, each case that 1 (3) see would be as an individual contractor for (4) which a 1099 is not submitted, and I have (5) never received one from anyone because I'm (6) not in the employ of anyone. Each case is (7) its own, individual case. Now, the (a) individuals who do retain me for each (9) individual case Right. (10)C - and they pay me, they also will have A (11)(12) to use my corporation's tax ID number to (13) report to the government what they have paid (14) to this firm. (15)Q Right. А You know, they have that, but a 1099 as (16)(17) such is never submitted at any time. In my (18) many years of practice, I have never (19) received one from that standpoint. I have (20) where I was working for someone else, yeah. Q All right. In the matters that you (21) (22) have now -(23) А In these matters, there's no such thing (24) ever submitted. Ω And your company doesn't get a report (25)

# Page 33

	Page 33			
(1) from them either?				
(2) A	4	No.		
(3)	2	Or any document or any copy of any		
(4)document	t that	t they submit to the government?		
		No. Sometimes they will say that this		
		d, but I've never received		
		ng that this has been sent to		
(8) the govern		nt.		
		Okay.		
		That's why that wasn't available.		
(11) C	2	l understand.		
(12) A	4	Okay.		
	ຊ	I'm just asking. You've mentioned to		
		we done some work for, and I		
		ou know, you're not employed by		
(16) them, but Gallagher, Sharp, the attorneys at				
(17) Gallagher, Sharp, Fulton & Norman have asked				
(18) YOU to do these defense medical				
(19) examinations, correct?				
(20) A		Most of the time, it's defense, yes.		
		Right, but Gallagher, Sharp is one of		
(22) the firms that does that?				
• • •	•	Yes.		
1		All right. Can you tell me some of the		
(25) other firms that you do that for?				

#### Page 35

А (1) No. (2) Q -- of who paid you? (3) А You'd have to go through and find each (4) one of those charts out of those 83 to see (5) who the others were. Q Isee. There's no other record that (6) (7) talks about the sum total --No. (8) А - from each provider? (9) Q No, because I've already testified to Α (10)(11) that. There isn't. Okay. That's all I wanted to know. I Q (12) (13) have nothing further. Thank you. MR. SANTORO: Okay. (14) MR. MICHELSON: (15) Do you want to (16) ask any questions? MR. SANTORO: (17) I'm not going to (18) ask anything. We have his video depo coming (19) up on Tuesday. (20) MR. MICHELSON: Doctor, you can (21) either waive your signature or go down to (22) the reporter's office and read it. She'll (23) have it ready for you promptly. What do you (24) want to do? THE WITNESS: (25) I don't want to

# Page 34

(1)	А	No.
(2)	Q	No, you can't?
(3)	Α	If you mention some names, if I recall
(4)them, I'll	tell y	
(5)	Q	Squire, Sanders & Dempsey.
(6)	А	I believe I had once or twice for them,
(7) for that f	irm.	
(8)	Q	James Glowacki & Associates.
(9)	Α	The name is familiar. I haven't seen
(10) Mr. Glov	vacki	i or heard from him for a long
(11)time, but	t the	name is familiar.
(12)	Q	
(13) entire lita	any (	of Cleveland law firms, you've
(14)done 83	exa	minations this year of all kinds
(15)that you'	ve d	escribed to us as PPD.
(16)	Α	Yes, <b>up</b> until August 23rd.
(17)	Q	Who besides Gallagher, Sharp has asked
(18) YOU to do these?		
(19)	А	I can't recall.
(20)	Q	None?
(21)	А	No, no, I can't recall any.
(22)	Q	Okay. Do you have a record of that
(23) anywher	e?	- · ·
(24)	А	No.
(25)	Q	There would be no record –

# Page 36

	l ugo oo
(1) read this	8.
(2)	MR. MICHELSON: Okay.
(3)	THE WITNESS: You were very fair
(4)	MR. MICHELSON: You waive?
(5)	THE WITNESS: Yes, I do.
(6)	MR. MICHELSON: Thank you.
(7)	
(8)	
(9)	000
(10)	
(11)	
(12)	
(13)	
(14)	
(15)	
(16)	
(17)	
(18)	
(19)	
(20)	
(21)	
(22)	
(23)	
(24)	
(25)	

# Page 37

CERTIFICATE (1)(2) The State of Ohio, ) (3) County of Cuyahoga. ) SS: I, Luanne Stone, a Notary Public within (4) (5) and for the State of Ohio, duly commissioned (6) and qualified, do hereby certify that the (7) within-named witness, RALPH KOVACH, M.D., (8) was by me first duly sworn to testify to the (9) truth, the whole truth and nothing but the (10) truth in the case aforesaid; that the (11) testimony then given by the above-referenced (12) witness was by me reduced to stenotypy in (13) the presence of said witness; afterwards (14)transcribed; and that the foregoing is a (15) true and correct transcription of the (16) testimony so given by the above-referenced (17) witness. I do further certify that this (18) (19) deposition was taken at the time and place (20) in the foregoing caption specified and was (21) completed without adjournment. I do further certify that I am not a (22) (23) relative, counsel or attorney for either (24) party, or otherwise interested in the (25) event of this action.

Page 38
(1) IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set (2) my hand and affixed my seal of office at
(3) Cleveland, Ohio this day of
(4), A.D., 1999.
(5)
(6)
(7)
(8) Luanne Stone, f.k.a. Protz
(9) Notary Public
(10) In and for the State of Ohio
(11) My commission expires 4/6/03
(12)
(13)
(14)
(15)
(16)
(17)
(18)
(19)
(20)
(21)
(22)
(23)
(24)
(25)

BSA

#### DEPOSITION OF RALPH KOVACH, M.D.

XMAX(2/12)

determine 15.15 determined 8:1 determines 16:6 diagnoses 16:16 diagnosis 8:2; 16:22 difference 7:7 difficulties 12:13 difficulty 12:16 digested 19:7 disability 25:12; 26:10 discovery 3:8 disk 15:16 disks 8:3; 12:19 DISTRICT 1:1, 2 **DIVISION 1:3** divulge 29:9 Doctor 3:7; 5:24; 9:19; 17:9, 11;23:6, 12;35:20 doctor 29:11 doctor's 19:3 doctors 19:2 document 24:16; 33:3, 4 documents 18:13, 24; 23:14, 17 doesn't 11:3; 12:5; 32:25 Dover 8:18; 20:22 Dr 7:1, 19;9:1;29:15 due 27:13 duly 3:3; 37:5, 8 --E-easier 5:8 EASTERN 1:3 elaborate 24:24

elaborating 31:14 EMG 15:11 employ 32:6 employed 33:15 employer 28:2, 3 employers 23:5 endure 12:15 engage 12:23; 16:3 epiphyseal 10:12 Esq 2:4, 10 Essentially 7:16 evaluate 20:17 evaluation 7:22: 28:2 evaluations 27:22 event 37:25 evidence 8:9 exacerbations 12:24 exact 21:6, 14 exactly 10:5 exam 20:8; 26:9, 10, 12; 30:10 examination 8:11, 12; 17:10, 15; 18:8; 20:11; 22:22; 30:4, 7, 13 examinations 19:13, 14, 19; 21:25; 25:5; 33:19; 34:14 examine 20:6; 28:5, 6 examiner 22:22; 28:1 examining 20:18 example 20:7; 26:11, 23; 28:4 exams 4:6; 22:15; 25:13, 18;

26:7; 27:7, 14; 28:13 exclude 11:4 Exhibit 23:8, 12; 24:7 exhibit 23:20 exist 10:25 expert 1:12 expertise 16:11 expires 38:11 explain 3:11; 5:7; 31:8 explained 26:8 extent 12:14: 15:16: 24:22 --F-f.k.a. 38:8 fact 14:10 fair 13:6, 17; 16:15; 36.3 fairly 12:25; 19.14 familiar 9:25: 34:9, 11 family 15:22 22 field 16:10 file 17:12 find 8:8; 15:1; 28:20, 21; 35:3 finding 11:10 indings 11:2 ine 16:13 inished 3:22 irm 32:14; 34:7 irms 19:21; 21:18; 22:1, 18; 31:6; 33:22, 25; 34:13 First 31:8 irst 3:3; 4:1, 2, 12; 37:8 ive 6:7, 13; 14:3; 18:1, 8; 19:11: 30:5 olks 21:23 ollow-up 26:23 ollows 3:4 oregoing 37:14, 20 ormed 9:9 orms 31:3 orthcoming 31:21 our 5:19 riday 1:18 ront 31:11 <sup>-</sup>ulton 2:8: 33:17 27:21 --G--Jaines 2:3 Jallagher 2:8; 20:21; 33:16, 17.21:34:17 Garfield 1:21 gave 8:10 generation 27:14 George 1:4; 3:8; 6:19 give 11:23; 17:6; 20:17; 22:7; 24:13 aiven 17:8; 37:11, 16 giving 14:1 Glowacki 34:8, 10 God 10:6 gotten 13:23 Government 25:7; 28:4

government 32:13; 33:4, 8

20; 28:1

guy 14:2

--H-half 18:2; 30:6, 10 hand 38:2 happens 30:18 haven't 13:23; 30:16; 34:9 he's 30:19 hear 3:11 heard 34:10 held 5:13 Hello 3:7 helping 16:11 hereby 37:6 herein 1:12, 18 hereunto 38:1 herniated 8:3: 12:19 hires 31:6 history 16:18, 20, 22; 17:5, 7, honest 10:6 hospitals 5:20 hour 18:2; 30:6, 10 hours 19:11 hurt 14:4 ------I'd 8:21 I've 20:25; 25:17; 26:18; 30:9; 33:6; 35:10 ID 32:12 idea 28:10 identification 23:9 identify 28:15 IME 26:9 impingement 8:6; 12:20 mportant 16:20, 21 naccurate 22:9 nclude 14:15: 25:14 ncluded 27:6; 31:2 ncludes 25:7, 13 ncome 31:21; 32:1 ncorporated 7:17 ndependent 20:11; 22:14; ndicate 29:25; 30:11 ndication 30:3 ndividual 14:25; 16:12; 17:23; 19:1; 20:19; 21:7; 30:1, 14; 32:3, 7, 9 ndividual's 10:10 ndividuals 22:3; 25:5; 32:8 nfer 10:7 nformation 28:25; 29:10, 12; 30:25; 31:1 nformed 30:2 njured 20:3 njuries 15:17, 18 njury 15:5, 13 istance 18:3 nstances 22:23 nstructor 4:22, 24; 5:12 nstructorship 5:3 narked 23:9, 11 insurance 6:9; 19:21; 22:13 Marshall 7:2, 19

intend 8:16; 9;11 interested 37:24 internists 15:23 involved 17:22; 19:6; 22:25 involvement 12:19 involves 29:6, 7, 8 issued 7:21 -- | - -James 34:8 jammed 30:7 joint 10:13 ioints 15:20 Joseph 2:10 Jr 1:4 July 5:3 justify 6:9 --K-keep 3:13; 21:7, 14 kept 25:6, 24 kinds 10:22: 34:14 --L--Labor 26:12: 28:5 last 6:12; 7:19; 21;9, 11, 13 law 3:4; 19:21; 21:18; 22:18; 31:6: 34:13 lawful 3:2 lawyer 27:25; 30:23 leading 13:14 leave 17:11 legal 7:7: 23:4 legalistic 7:13 length 17:21 Let's 3:15 let's 27:2 letter 29:16 letterhead 7:1 letters 19:4 license 4:17 licensed 4:14; 16:8 listed 5:20 litany 34:13 load 10:13 location 15:16 lost 4:16 low 9:20; 10:19; 11:14, 19; 12:1, 12, 13; 15:4 Luanne 1:14; 37:4; 38:8 Luke 5:11 Luke's 3:20; 5:1, 15 --M--M.D. 1:11, 20; 3:2, 5; 37:7 mainly 5:16 nanagement 14:16 nanufacturers 19:22

Mathews 24:3; 29:15

From determine to Mathews

#### BSA

# DEPOSITION OF RALPH KOVACH, M.D.

**Concordance** Report Unique Words: 765 Total Occurrences: 1,700 Noise Words: 384 Total Words In File: 5,207 Single File Concordance Case Sensitive Noise Word List(s): NOISE.NOI Cover Pages = 0 Includes ALL Text Occurrences Dates **ON** Includes Pure Numbers Possesive Forms ON -- DATES--4/6/03 38:11 August 23rd 34:16 July 5:3 September, 1999 1:19 --1--1 23:9, 12;24:7 1099 32:4, 16 10:00 1:19 15 18:7 1958 3:22 1962 3:18 1996 27:4 1999 1:19:38:4 1:97CV2857 1:6 --2--20 18:7 23 7:20 2399 27:3, 4, 6, 19 23rd 34:16 25 7:17 263 27:21 --3--3rd 1:18 - - 4 - -4/6/03 38:11 --5--50 21:15, 16, 17 --8--83 34:14: 35:4

--9--

9700 1:20

besides 34:17

- - A - -A.D. 38:4 A.M. 1:19 abandoned 5:15, 18 able 30:20 above-referenced 37:11, 16 accompanied 15:10 according 3:3 action 37:25 activities 12:15, 23; 13:3 activity 13:12, 20 actual 26:9 adjournment 37:21 admit 5:22 affixed 38:2 aforesaid 37:10 afterwards 37:13 age 3:3 agree 8:1; 10:1; 11:5; 12:11; 14:8; 15:9 agreement 1:16 all-inclusive 26:8 allot 30:6 allotted 30:5 alone 7:17 amounted 27:6 answer 4:12; 22:9; 25:1; 29:4 9, 21, 22 anybody 31:6; 32:2 anywhere 18:1; 19:11; 34:23 **APPEARANCES 2:1** appointment 28:24; 29:24; 30:22 appreciate 8:19; 14:6 appropriate 12:7; 13:9, 15, 16 14:11, 24; 16:2, 8, 14 approximately 18:8 arrive 25:19 arrived 26:1 arthritic 15:19 asking 33:13 associated 7:5 Associates 6:22; 34:8 assume 14:7, 10, 17, 20 assuming 14:8 assumption 14:23 attached 23:14, 18, 21 attorney 20:7, 20; 22:24; 24:3 37:23 attorneys 23:1; 33:16 August 34:16 available 33:10 --B-ball 17:20 based 7:21; 16:17 baseline 31:19 basically 17:3 basis 13:13; 19:14 behalf 2:2, 7; 18:25; 19:5, 20; 29:3, 15 believe 17:1; 34:6

bit 5:25 3oard 3:16 boards 3:25; 4:5 body 10:8 3oulevard 1:21 preakdown 27:12 pringing 9:1 proke 25:21 pusinesses 19:23 --C-calendars 28:25 candidates 12:8 capacity 31:5 caption 37:20 :are 14:13; 15.23; 16:2, 4 carry 28:25 carrying 30:9 Case 1:5 case 8:16; 9:1, 6; 20:17; 25:14; 30:1, 18, 32:2, 6, 7, 9, 37:10 cases 20:15; 21:1; 25:8; 28:6 catch 7:12; 10:2 **Categories 26:4** categories 28:9 categorized 28:7 category 26:14; 27:23, 24; 28:23 **CERTIFICATE 37:1** certified 3:17; 5:10 certify 37:6, 18, 22 shange 9:17 changes 15:19 sharge 26:21, 22, 24; 27:5 sharges 25:16; 26:2, 15, 18, 21, 25; 27:5, 10, 15, 19; 28:22 charts 28:21; 35:4 Chattman 2:3 Chriss 3:9; 6:19; 7:22; 8:2; 17:10, 15 chronic 9:20; 10:15, 18; 12:12, 13; 14: 19; 15:7 circumstance 13:23 circumstances 15:3 City 1:21 claims 22:21 clarify 8:22 classification 25:9 clear 25:2 Cleveland 1:21; 6:22; 34:13; 38:3 clients 21:20, 22 clinical 4:24; 17:3 code 25:11 coming 6:11; 35:18 commission 38:11 commissioned 37:5 commonly 12:1 companies 1922; 22:13, 21 company 32:25 Compensation 26:11 compensation 25.8 complaints 8:10; 10:10; 11:9;

16:18; 19.1 complete 31:18 completed 37:21 computer 25:9, 15 condition 10:1, 23, 25; 13:3; 14:19 conditions 16:17 conduction 15:11 conform 24:22 Conrail 3:9 conservative 14:14;16:4 conservatively 12:2 consistently 21:19 Consolidated 1:7 consult 19:13; 21:24 consultation 14:24; 15:2; 16:13 Consulting 21:3 consulting 21:20; 31:5 contact 29:25; 30:19 contained 1:18 continue 5:1 continuing 6:10 contractor 32:3 contributing 10:9 control 13:4 copy 24:11, 14; 31:2; 33:3 Corporation 1:8 corporation 7:6 corporation's 32:12 correspondence 23:22 counsel 1:16, 18; 37:23 count 21:7 County 1:22; 37:3 couple 23:21 course 14:13; 16:4; 26:2 COURT 1:1 create 10:22 created 24:17 Criss 1:4 **CROSS-EXAMINATION 3:5** cross-examination 1:13 CT 15:10 Cuyahoga 1:22; 37:3 CV 3:16

# - - D - -

day 1:19; 38:3 Defendant 1:9; 2:7 defendant 20:13 defendants 19:21 defense 21:24; 33:18, 20 defined 10:4 degenerated 10:12 Dempsey 34:5 Department 26:12;28:5 depending 19:10 depends 17:21 depo 35:18 deposes 3:4 Deposition 1:11 deposition 3:8; 25:20, 24, 25; 27:15; 37:19 depositions 27:9 described 34:15

XMAX(1/11)

From 4/6/03 to described

BSA

matter 3:8; 6:20; 9:9 matters 32:21, 23 mean 9:14; 12:5; 18:21, 23; 28:14 Meaning 31:17 means 5:5; 10:5; 12:6; 31:22 measures 14:15 mechanical 9:24; 10:3, 7 mechanics 10:8 Medical 4:23 medical 5:5; 16:16; 17:10; 19:2, 12, 13;21:24; 33:18 medicals 27:22 Medicine 5:14 medicine 4:14; 5:15 mention 22:11; 34:3 mentioned 33:13 Michael 2:4 MICHELSON 3:6; 9:3, 4; 20:4 21:2; 22:5, 17;23:10, 19, 24; 29:7, 12, 17, 20; 35:15, 20; 36:2, 4, 6 Michelson 2:4; 29:16 middle 30:8 minimal 6:11 minutes 18:1, 7, 9;30:5 monetary 27:5 money 31:11 moves 10:13 MR 3:6; 8:21, 25; 9:3, 4; 19:24: 20:4, 24; 21:2; 22:2, 5 16, 17;23:10, 16, 19, 24; 29: 7, 8, 12, 14, 17, 18, 20, 22; 35:14, 15, 17, 20; 36:2, 4, 6 Mr 7:22; 8:2, 18; 17:10, 15; 20:22; 24:3; 29:16; 34:10 MRI 15:10 multiple 10:20 musculoligamentous 15:4 --N--

name 22:12; 34:9, 11 names 22:8, 11;29:1; 34:3 nature 12:14; 15:15 nerve 8:5; 12:19, 20; 15:11, 16 normal 28:24 Norman 2:8; 33:17 NORTHERN 1:2 Notary 1:15; 37:4; 38:9 notice 4:21; 6:25 number 12:8; 21:6, 14;25:16, 18;26:15, 17, 19, 25; 27:3, 7, 13;29:25; 30:15, 19;32:12

--0--

o'clock 1:19 o0o 1:10; 36:9 object 19:25; 29:5 objectify 14:12; 16:19 Objection 20:24; 22:2, 16 objection 29:14 objective 8:9; 11:1, 10 obtained 14:25 occasionally 20:16

ccasions 4:4 ffhand 22:7 )ffice 26:13 ffice 24:4; 35:22; 38:2 ffices 1:20 )HIO 1:2 Dhio 1:16, 23; 4:15, 16; 37:2, ; 38:3, 10 )kay 3:19, 25; 4:3, 9, 11; ;24; 7:15; 9:3; 11:13; 13:8; 5:4, 14, 21; 16:23; 18:10; 9:12, 17;20:14; 21:18, 23; 2:13; 23:1, 3,6; 24:13; 25:22; 17:8; 28:12, 19, 24; 29:20; 10:23; 31:8; 33:9, 12;34:12, 2:35:12,14:36:2 skay 13:19; 25:13; 31:24 ongoing 11:8 pinion 8:4; 20:18 ppinions 8:15, 23, 25; 9:5, 8 opportunity 17:25 Dral 4:7 **Drthopedic 6:22** orthopedic 3:19; 4:22; 25; 5:10:13:9; 15:21 orthopedics 6:2 orthopod 16:7 ought 16:6 --P--

bage 27:17 baid 32:13; 35:2 pain 10:14, 19;11:9, 11;12:1, 12;13:20; 14:15, 19 painful 13:21 pardon 18:22 bark 17:20 part 18:15; 20:12, 19 partial 25:12; 26:7, 10; 27:22 partners 7:4 partnership 7:6 parts 4:5 party 37:24 pass 3:25 patient 14:18; 29:11; 30:15 patients 5:22; 11:8, 13;12:2, 22; 13:8; 16:1, 17; 17:2, 3, 6; 20:2; 25:16; 26:20; 29:1 pay 32:11 people 6:25; 7:18; 9:20; 10:3, 15, 18; 13: 19; 15: 24; 26: 17 percentage 11:23; 19:19 percentagewise 11:21 perfectly 16:1 permanent 25:12; 26:7, 10; 27:22 persons 12:12 phone 29:25; 30:15 phrase 9:24 physical 14:16; 18:7 physician 14:11; 16:3, 5, 9 physicians 13:9, I0; 15:21, 23; 17:3 pieces 23:22

pinpoint 11:9 place 37:19 Plaintiff 1:5, 13;2:2 Plaintiffs 23:8, 12 plaintiffs 20:7, 19 please 3:11; 5:9; 30:19 plus 15:19 point 16:10 pontificating 10:6 position 5:13 positive 15:10, 12 Post 26:12 PPD 25:10, 18;27:7, 14; PPDs 26:6 practically 20:9 practice 4:14; 5:25; 6:1; 32:18 predicated 16:22 premiums 6:9 presence 37:13 Presently 6:17 previously 23:11 primarily 17:21; 23:1 primary 15:23; 16:2 privilege 29:11 privileges 5:19 problem 12:6, 24 pro 11:15; 16:16 procedure 26:24 process 18:16 produce 13:20 produces 10:14 program 5:2, 11, 17 promptly 35:23 proper 15:2 protected 29:10 Protz 38:8 provided 24:6 provider 35:9 psychiatric 5:16 Public 1:15; 37:4; 38:9 purpose 15:15; 29:2 purposes 23:9 pursuant 1:16, 17 --Q-gualified 37:6 quantify 11:18 question 4:12; 14:6, 19; 24:24; 29:5, 21 questions 3:9; 35:16 quick 3:15; 17:12 quiescent 13:4 --R-radiologists 19:6 Rail 1:7 railroads 19:22 Ralph 1:20

read 35:22: 36:1 reason 4:17;6:8; 30:17 reasons 12:9 recall 22:7, 10, 12:34:3, 19, 21 receive 32:1 received 32:5, 19;33:6 receptionist 29:24 recognize 23:13, 25 recommend 11:18, 20: 13:10 record 9:2, 17:21:14:23:17; 29:19:34:22.25:35:6 records 19:3; 24:21; 31:2 reduced 37:12 referrals 15:22 refrain 13:2 regarding 9:9; 29:1; 30:24 regular 19:14 relate 17:24 relative 37:23 ely 17:5 emedy 14:13 emuneration 6:11 ender 8:16 endering 8:15: 9:6 enewed 5:3 epeat 3:11 eply 7:16 eport 7:21; 8:17, 22, 23; 8:11, 19; 19:8; 20:8; 22:23; 32:13, 25 eported 33:6 eporter 3:14 eporter's 35:22 eports 19:3, 5;25:6 equest 15:2; 20:17 equested 20:12; 30:25; 31:1 equesting 30:13 equired 24:21 eschedule 30:21 Reserve 4:22; 5:13 esidency 3:20; 5:17 esponse 24:2 estrict 13:11, 15, 19 estricted 12:14 esult 10:20 esults 15:8 retain 31:10: 32:8 etained 27:25; 31:4, 9, 14, 17, 20, 22; 32:1 eview 18:13, 17, 20, 23, 24 reviewed 6:19 reviewing 24:20 Right 14:22; 20:5; 31:24; 32:10, 15;33:21 right 7:10, 25;8:8, 14;9:5; 11:11: 15:8: 16:15: 17:13; 19:15; 23:19; 24:18; 32:21; 33:24 root 8:5

Sanders 34:5 SANTORO 8:21, 25; 19:24; 20:24; 22:2, 16;23:16; 29:4, 8, 14, 18, 22; 35:14, 17

Santoro 2:10

--S--

From matter to Santoro

XMAX(3/13)

BSA	DEPOSITION OF RALPH KOVACH, M.D. XMAX(4/14			
satisfied 18:4 saying 10:12; 13:14;20:6; 33:7	subsequently 7:18 substantiate 8:9 suffice 21:8	13, 15, 23 UNITED 1:1	yourself 6:3; 11:7	
schedule 24:6	sum 8:14; 35:7	University 5:14		
scheduled 30:10	supplied 31:3	V		
School 5:14	surgery 4:22, 25; 5:15; 6:3, 5,	varies 18:1; 19:10		
school 4:23 seal 38:2	6, 7, 10, 15; 11:19, 20; 12:3	versus 3:9		
second 26:24	surgical 12:7; 26:23 suspended 4:19	video 35:18		
seek 29:10	sworn 3:3; 37:8	voice 3:13		
send 5:5; 21:20	symptomatology 15:7	volume 19:10		
separately 25:6, 10	symptoms 10:19	<b>vs</b> 1:6		
September 1:19 served 23:14	syndrome 9:25; 10:3	W		
seven 18:9	T	waive 3521; 36:4		
severe 12:25		wanted 35:12		
Sharp 2:8; 20:22; 33:16, 17,	talking 15:17; 23:5 talks 35:7	we'll 13:19, 19:7		
21; 34:17	tax 31:3; 32:12	We're 3:7; 7:12; 14:20		
She'll 35:22 show 17:4; 23:6; 30:1	elling 25:11	we're 23:5		
signature 35:21	:en 21:9, 11	we've 23:11 weren't 23:17		
significant 11:8; 12:25	:erm 26:9			
sir 3:12, 21, 24; 4:2, 18; 6:4,	estified 35:10 estify 9:11, 18;37:8			
14, 21; 7:3, 24; 8:4, 7, 11; 9:7,	estimony 37:11, 16			
10, 23; 10:24; 12:4, 10; 15:25; 16:25; 19:16; 21:4; 23:23;	esting 14:11; 16:5			
24:1, 5, 8, 10, 19; 27:1, 18, 23;	ests 15:14			
28:11	Thank 35:13; 36:6			
situation 14:14;23:4	herapy 14:16 [here's 7:7; 35:6			
six 19:11 slip 14:2	here's 22:24; 23:20, 21;			
somebody 28:1	26:24; 28:14; 31:10, 19; 32:23			
someone 29:23; 30:8; 32:20	They're 25:8			
somewhat 13:4	hey're 12:7; 30:9, 16 hree 21:9, 12, 13			
sorry 29:13	ie 18:18			
speaks 8:22 specific 11:10	imes 29:2			
specifically 17:4	otal 8:14; 25:16, 17, 20; 26:1,			
specified 37:20	I, 15, 19, 25; 27:7, 9, 13; 35:7			
spoke 30:24	otally 22:8 ouch 24:4			
Squire 34:5	raditionally 11:25; 12:1			
SS 37:3 St 3:20; 5:1, 11, 14	raining 5:2, 11, 17			
standpoint 31:25; 32:19	anscribed 37:14			
State 1:15, 22; 26:11; 37:2, 5;	anscription 37:15   treat 9:19; 10:15			
38:10	treated 11:7, 14; 12:2			
statement 13:17; 14:9; 16:15 statements 13:6	treatment 13:16; 15:1; 16:4;			
STATES 1:1	19:2			
statute 1:14	true 11:2, 12;28:8; 37:15 truth 37:9, 10			
stenotypy 37:12	Tuesday 35:19	Yeah 15:19		
Stern 2:3 stipulations 1:17	twice 34:6	yeah 32:20		
Stone 1:14; 37:4; 38:8	Tyler 29:15	fear 26:17; 34:14 {ear's 25:17		
stopped 6:6, 14	type 6:1; 13:11; 14:16	fears 4:10; 6:7, 13; 7:20; 9:22;		
students 5:6	types 12:22; 13:2, 8 Typically 17:19	14:3; 21:10, 12, 13; 26:5; 28:9;		
studies 15:11	typically 17:16	32:18		
subcategories 28:14 subjective 16:18		{ears-plus 7:17		
submit 18:19; 19:7; 20:16;	U	You'd 35:3 You've 33:13		
25:6: 33:4	U.S. 25:7; 26:12; 28:4	/ou've 6:19; 7:21; 9:9; 11:14;		
submitted 18:25; 24:15; 32:4,	Uh-huh 29:17	13:13; 17:1; 26:20; 28:13;		
17, 24 subpoena 23:13, 18, 20, 25;		34:13, 15		
24:2, 22; 30:25	13:25; 25:4; 33:11, 15 understanding 16:23; 31:10,	voungster 30:9 vours 21:20		
From satisfied to yoursalf		0010 21.20		

۰,

From satisfied to yourself

# DEPOSITION OF RALPH KOVACH, M.D.