

STATE OF OHIO
IN THE COMMON PLEAS FOR THE COUNTY OF CUYAHOGA

KARLA SPEHAR, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.
Civil Action
No. 157883

JEFFREY ORCHEN, D.D.S., et al.,

Defendants.

The Deposition of TERESA M. HUNT, taken
pursuant to Notice in the above-entitled cause, at
210 Nickels Arcade, in the City of Ann Arbor,
Michigan, on Friday, November 9, 1990, commencing at
or about 9:00 a.m., before Barbara J. Turner,
CSR-2343, a Notary Public in and for the County of
Wayne, acting in Washtenaw.

APPEARANCES:

ZIEGLER, METZGER & MILLER
(By: Mr. Timothy M. Bittel)
1900 Huntington Building
Cleveland, Ohio 44115

Appearing on behalf of the Plaintiffs.

BAKER & HOSTETLER
(By: Mr. Patrick J. Jordan)
3200 National City Center
Cleveland, Ohio 44114

Appearing on behalf of Needle
Manufacturers.

COPY

Doc. 198

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

WESTON, HURD, FALLON,
PAISLEY & HOWLEY
(By: Ms. Delrdre G. Henry)
2500 Terminal Tower
Cleveland, Ohio 44113
Appearing on behalf of the defendant,
Doctor Orchen.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

WITNESS

TERESA M. HUNT

Page

INDEX

Examination by Mr. Jordan..... 5
Examination by Ms. Henry.....140

EXHIBITS

None Marked.

1 Ann Arbor, Michigan
2 Friday, November 2, 1990
3 At or about 9:00 a.m.

4
5 TERESA M. HUNT,

6 a witness herein, was first duly sworn by the

7 Notary Public to tell the truth, the whole truth

8 and nothing but the truth, testified as follows:

9 MR. BITTEL: Before we start the

10 deposition, I just want to put on the record the

11 understanding that we three lawyers have reached

12 and the witness reached.

13 We've spoken with Judge Nugent or

14 his office, and he has indicated he has no

15 objection to an agreement that we are going to

16 enter into concerning Doctor Hunt's trial

17 deposition. Specifically, we are not going to

18 take her trial deposition today but rather we will

19 simply proceed with a discovery deposition. The

20 court is uncertain as to whether or not we will

21 have trial on the Friday after Thanksgiving. If

22 we do have trial that day, we will bring Doctor

23 Hunt in as a witness live and out of sequence if

24 it is out of sequence at that time. If we don't

25 have trial, we will take her video trial

1 deposition on the Friday after Thanksgiving. We

2 will do that in Cleveland and either at deposition
3 or if the judge wants to sit, rule on the

4 objections at the time that's up to him. Is that,
5 lady and gentleman, is that satisfactory?

6 MS. HENRY: Yes.

7 MR. JORDAN: Yes, it is.

8 MR. BITTEL: And obviously we are also

9 waiving any filing requirement for the

10 deposition -- trial deposition. Okay. Yes,

11 folks?

12 MR. JORDAN: Yes.

13 MS. HENRY: Yes.

14 MR. JORDAN: We're here to take the

15 deposition of Doctor Teresa Hunt in the case of
16 Spehar versus Orchen. Are there any objections to
17 the taking of this deposition?

18 MR. BITTEL: No.

19 MR. JORDAN: And, Ms. Henry, yes?

20 MS. HENRY: No. No.

21 EXAMINATION

22 BY MR. JORDAN:

23 Q. Just prior to the beginning of the deposition you

24 let us go through your file. Do you have any

25 other notes or any other materials that are

1 significant or relevant to your opinions that are
2 not here in the file that you provided us?
3 A. No.
4 Q. I'll start off with some pertinent questions,
5 such as could you tell us how old you are?
6 A. Thirty-nine.
7 Q. And your place of birth?
8 A. Brooklyn, New York.
9 Q. Attached to the report -- I take it you filed a
10 report in conjunction with Doctor Camille Wortman
11 for this case?
12 A. Yes.
13 Q. And attached to the back of that was a curriculum
14 vitae or resume. Was that an up-to-date resume?
15 A. I believe so. I didn't see it but I believe it
16 was.
17 Q. Maybe take just a minute to review that.
18 How did you become involved in this
19 case?
20 A. Doctor Wortman asked me to evaluate Karla Spehar.
21 And how long have you known Doctor Wortman?
22 A. Since 1986.
23 Q. And how did you come to meet Doctor Wortman?
24 A. She was a researcher at the Institute for Social
25 Research. I'm a clinical psychologist and I

1 accepted a postdoctoral position in research at
 2 the Institute for Social Research for a two year
 3 period.
 4 Q. Was Doctor Wortman your supervisor at that time or
 5 your teacher?
 6 A. She was the principal investigator in most of the
 7 research projects.
 8 Q. What does that mean principal investigator?
 9 A. It means she conducts the research. They are her
 10 projects.
 11 Q. And you assist -- you and other students assist
 12 her in those research projects?
 13 A. That's correct. It was considered postdoctoral
 14 training and research.
 15 Q. And I take it Doctor Wortman is not a clinical
 16 person as you are, is that correct?
 17 A. That's correct.
 18 Q. And how long have you been an active clinician?
 19 A. Since 1981.
 20 Q. And where did you start in May of 1981?
 21 A. I began my training at St. Luke's Roosevelt
 22 Medical Center, the Child And Adolescent
 23 Psychiatry Department, which is the teaching
 24 hospital at Columbia Medical School.
 25 Q. How did you focus your career interests on

children?

A. As I was getting my degree in clinical psychology, I became interested in developmental psychology

which developmental psychology focuses on normal kids and how they develop and different areas of

interest. I was a research assistant during my

clinical program for a developmental psychologist, and so because of my interest in researching kids,

I did research with normal kids and how they

developed, I decided it seemed logical that I was

interested in pursuing clinical work with children having difficulties.

Q. Have you focused most of your attention in the

past several years on children who are having

certain difficulties?

A. The evaluations I have done of the children are in that area, yes.

Q. Have you done analysis and evaluations of normal

children as well?

A. Yes.

Q. How do you --

A. Well, I don't know exactly what you mean by that.

Q. That falls into my next question. How do you

distinguish between a normal child and a child as

we had talked about, a child with difficulties?

1 A. Well, you use a number of techniques but basically
2 if a child is experiencing anxiety, depression and
3 that can be evidenced in a number of ways, if they
4 have experienced an event that could be traumatic,
5 it is likely that they may be having difficulties
6 and so their parents may ask them to be evaluated
7 and treated. If they're not having any trouble
8 then most likely they wouldn't come to the
9 attention of a psychologist.
10 Q. Well, you know in this case there is a lawsuit
11 pending and the reason that Karla Spehar was sent
12 to you was so that you could testify in this
13 lawsuit, is that your understanding?
14 A. Yes.
15 Q. Now, so this isn't quite the normal case where a
16 parent takes their child to a psychiatrist or
17 psychologist to have them clinically treated, is
18 that correct?
19 A. This isn't a normal case in any respect in that
20 sense because of the trauma that she experienced.
21 Q. When you say the trauma she experienced, what are
22 you referring to?
23 A. The needle.
24 Q. Do you know of any other trauma that she has
25 experienced in her young life?

1 A. Can you be more specific?
2 Q. Well, what do you mean when you say trauma? We
3 just talked about the trauma from the needle, what
4 do you mean when you use the word trauma?
5 A. I was told that she experienced -- I got the basic
6 fact pattern from Doctor Wortman that she had had
7 this accident and that I was to evaluate her.
8 Q. Okay. And what were you told by Doctor Wortman?
9 A. That Karla had been taken to a dentist by her
10 mother, that a needle had broken when an
11 anesthesia, local anesthesia, was being attempted,
12 and that they had attempted oral surgery and that
13 she had developed malignant hypothermia and that
14 surgery could not be completed and that she almost
15 died and that now because of the complications
16 that the medical opinion at that point was that
17 there was both a risk of the needle moving but
18 also a risk of doing surgery, so they were sort of
19 in a no-win situation.
20 Q. I noticed in your file that you had a copy of
21 Doctor Indresano's deposition?
22 A. Right.
23 Q. When did you -- I take it you have read that?
24 A. No. I looked through it. I was -- it was given
25 to me about -- awhile ago, maybe a week ago by

1 Mr. Bittel. He gave me a number of materials and
 2 I did not read the whole deposition. I glanced
 3 through it but did not read it.
 4 Q. What do you understand Karla's medical condition
 5 to be at this point?
 6 A. Currently? Right now?
 7 Q. Currently.
 8 A. My understanding is that there is a small chance
 9 of the needle moving. It is not a big percentage,
 10 I believe one percent, but that there is a
 11 slightly greater chance of problems she could have
 12 with surgery, and so because of that, either for
 13 some facial paralysis, nerve damage or hurting an
 14 artery of some kind, so that the decision at this
 15 point is to wait and not do anything.
 16 Q. Is it your understanding that the parents have
 17 some anxiety over the present medical condition of
 18 Karla?
 19 A. Can you be more specific?
 20 Q. Do you think -- I take it you have met the
 21 parents?
 22 A. Sure.
 23 Q. In your opinion do the parents have any anxiety
 24 concerning the present medical condition?
 25 A. They wish, sure, as well as Karla does that the

1 needle can be taken out.

2 Q. Are you familiar with malignant hypothermia?

3 A. Only what I've learned through this case.

4 Q. Is it your understanding that --

5 A. It is a reaction to anesthesia.

6 Q. And is it your understanding that that was a

7 preexisting condition and was not a condition that

8 was by the needle?

9 A. Yes. That it is a rare congenital disease.

10 Q. What is your hourly rate, Doctor?

11 A. Ninety dollars an hour for non-court time.

12 Q. How much is it for court time?

13 A. Hundred and thirty dollars.

14 Q. And how many hours have you put into this case

15 prior to today?

16 A. I spent about six hours with Karla and her family

17 on direct interview, mostly with Karla. I would

18 have to give you that figure. There has been -- I

19 have been reading materials and did a very brief

20 phone contact, and I'm not counting the time that

21 I talked with Mrs. Spehar when I was getting Karla

22 referral for therapy.

23 Q. Did you know Doctor Paul Brinich?

24 A. I spoke with him once on the phone.

25 Q. Were you involved in the selection process in

1 which he was chosen as the treating clinician for

2 the Spehars?

3 A. Not in the selection but in the referral and

4 facilitating the referral.

5 Q. And do you know why he was selected?

6 A. I think he's considered a good treating child

7 clinician.

8 Q. Do you have any reason to disbelieve that?

9 A. No.

10 Q. Do you recall what you told Doctor Brinich when

11 you were referring this case to him?

12 A. That I thought that Karla and the family could use

13 some therapy. Doctor Wortman had been in touch

14 with the family, and I had told Doctor Wortman

15 after I finished the report that ultimately at

16 some point Karla could benefit from therapy

17 because she seemed to benefit from coming for the

18 initial evaluation using the indirect methods, and

19 Doctor Wortman got the name and asked me to follow

20 up on facilitating that referral.

21 Q. I'm going to go back to a couple of questions I

22 asked earlier. Do you think there was some event

23 in your childhood that caused you to go into the

24 field that you're now into?

25 A. One single event, no.

1 Were there several different events that happened during your childhood which pointed you in the direction in which you are now in?

4 A. That's a very complicated question. No, I don't think events, but I do think that personalities and preferences that people develop are influenced by relationships and things that happen. Perhaps I liked healthy people for a very complicated history that I don't think is really, really appropriate nor do I feel I would want to talk about, but everybody's interests are influenced by their life history.

13 Q. Would you agree the loss of a parent or the loss of a close grandparent can be or often is a traumatic event for a child?

16 A. Yes. It can really -- can magnify any existing insecurity that a child has, just further loss can just add to it.

19 Q. Now, would you say that in every instance in which a child loses a parent or a close grandparent that they have an adverse psychological consequence from that event?

23 A. No. Not in every case. It depends on how close they were to the parent or the grandparent, for instance, how important that person was in their

1 lives, and it depends on a number of factors. If
 2 they weren't close at all and really were not even
 3 seeing them, then I don't think it would be that
 4 adverse, as long as the child is in an environment
 5 that she feels or he feels is safe.
 6 Q. If the, I will use the example of the grandparent,
 7 I assume that the incidence of children losing a
 8 close grandparent is not that infrequent, is that
 9 accurate?

10 A. Right.
 11 Q. I take it the primary factor in determining the
 12 effect on the child in the loss of a grandparent
 13 is how close the relationship is between the
 14 grandparent and the child, is that it?

15 A. That's one factor. That's one factor. Yes.
 16 Another factor is how much experience the child
 17 has had with death already. If they've had a
 18 chance to cope with death through a loss of a pet
 19 or something, it may not be as difficult. You
 20 don't want the first loss to be a real close one.
 21 That's really -- that's difficult.

22 Q. Can viewing say the close grandparent at a funeral
 23 home, can that have an effect on a child?
 24 A. How do you mean exactly?
 25 Q. Well, say you take a young three to four-year-old

1 child and the child goes to the funeral home and
2 sees their dead grandmother whom they were close
3 to --
4 A. Okay.
5 Q. -- at the funeral home. Would that have -- could
6 that have an adverse psychological consequence to
7 the child?
8 A. I think it could if they, for instance, if they
9 didn't want to go up and see, and they were forced
10 to or something like that then it might. If the
11 parent didn't follow the child's lead in how she
12 wanted to deal with it. Sometimes kids are
13 curious and they want to come in and see and other
14 times they don't want anything to do with it and
15 you need to respect that.
16 Q. I imagine most children really wouldn't know
17 what's going on until they are actually at the
18 funeral home for the first time. What, in your
19 experience, what is a child's reaction to that
20 type of event, seeing their grandparent say in a
21 casket at the funeral home for the first time, a
22 close grandparent?
23 A. I think you can't -- I can't generalize because it
24 does also depend on what the child's theory is
25 about where the grandparent is, what the child's

1 understanding of death is, and it could be -- it
 2 could be a shock if it is not dealt with correctly
 3 but it is --
 4 Q. Could that type of experience affect how a child
 5 or say how often a child talks about death after
 6 that event?
 7 A. Depends on the context of what else is going on.
 8 Q. Well, would it be unusual for a child after they
 9 learned of the death of a close grandparent and
 10 went to the funeral home and saw their grandparent
 11 to then play with dolls and to have some of the
 12 dolls die?
 13 A. No. That wouldn't be unusual.
 14 Q. And it is really they're reacting to an experience
 15 they have just gone through and that experience
 16 may or may not have a lasting effect, is that
 17 accurate?
 18 A. Does the loss of the grandparent have a lasting
 19 effect?
 20 Q. Okay. I will ask that question.
 21 A. I don't know what you are asking.
 22 Q. All right. Why don't we just use that question.
 23 A. It is different in different cases.
 24 Q. How many children do you see say in a month,
 25 different children?

1 Maybe six or seven different times.

2 Q. Could you estimate, and I'm not holding you to a

3 precise number, if you could just give us a range

4 as to how many say five to six-year-old children

5 you have evaluated in your professional career

6 going back? Karla I think was five and six at the

7 time you saw her.

8 A. Yes. You mean formal evaluation. In my work,

9 okay.

10 Q. Right.

11 A. Maybe about twenty, twenty-five.

12 Q. Now, would you classify those children that you've

13 seen as normal or children with difficulties or

14 was there a range in their pattern or behavior?

15 A. Well, actually now that I'm thinking of it, I did

16 evaluate for research purposes a whole, you know,

17 fifty five year olds but that was for a different

18 purpose, so we are talking about clinical

19 evaluation and clinical evaluation, I mean I've

20 seen a lot of five years olds for research

21 purposes, my dissertation was with five, six year

22 olds, but for clinical reasons you only see

23 children in general that are being referred. A

24 lot of the children I see were in my training at

25 Children's Hospital in Boston that were referred

1 by their parents for different problems.
2 Q. The fifty or so children you saw in your research
3 programs, just focusing on those, I think I
4 understood something you said earlier to say there
5 were a lot of normal children in that group as
6 well?
7 A. I didn't do a clinical evaluation of those
8 children. I was interested in how they thought,
9 their cognitive and emotional abilities, and I was
10 looking at a specific problem, so it is really not
11 relevant but just to let you know, all right.
12 Q. I won't ask you about those fifty if they are not
13 relevant, I will ask you about the twenty,
14 twenty-five.
15 Am I correct in understanding that
16 it is your understanding that most of those
17 children had some difficulties otherwise they
18 wouldn't have been seeing you?
19 A. That's right.
20 Q. How did Karla compare with those twenty to
21 twenty-five on a relative scale? Was she -- was
22 she -- did she have the most difficulties, average
23 amount or towards the least end?
24 A. On an overt level in terms of interacting with
25 her, Karla has a lot of strengths so she was a

very appealing child. And in terms of assessing,

in terms of family support, I saw children in

Boston whose brother was killed by an elevator in the inner city, and we are talking about a whole range of deprivation and difficulty. So, Karla

had support of family in my opinion, and she has got a lot of strengths and so in that way those

are pluses. At the same time I assessed her as

having severe difficulties around fears about her physical and actually psychological safety.

Q. I'll go back. I understand that -- well, maybe I

will expound on the twenty, twenty-five. You

indicated that of the twenty to twenty-five other

children you've examined, a lot of them had some

serious deprivation, either emotional or

physical. What types were you talking about? You

mentioned one where a child had a brother killed

by --

A. Drug abuse of the parents, cognitive problems

because of lead poisoning, things like that. You

know -- okay. That's it.

Q. I take it then that the psychological effects on a

child are related in some manner to the degree of

deprivation or traumatic event that occurs to the

child?

1. A. The psychological effects on the child are related

to the traumatic experiences they have, that's

correct.

4. Q. And when you say that, the more severe the

5. traumatic event the more serious the psychological
6. consequence on the child for the most part?

7. A. It interacts with what the coping resources are of
8. the child and what the coping resources are of the
9. system.

10. Q. Let me just give an example to make sure we're on

11. the same wavelength. If a five-year-old child is

12. severely spooked by her brother, her brother jumps

13. up and says boo, that's a sudden traumatic event

14. but it is not very serious, correct?

15. A. No.

16. Q. Whereas if say somebody held a gun to the child's

17. head and severely beat them that would be a rather

18. serious traumatic event?

19. A. Right.

20. Q. And the psychological consequences from the

21. spooking would be relatively insignificant

22. compared to the psychological consequences of this

23. experience with a gun and beating, is that fair to

24. say?

25. A. Yeah.

1 Q. There is sort of a continuum of traumatic events

2 and it varies from child to child and experience

3 to experience, is that fair?

4 A. There is a continuum of traumatic events, yes.

5 Q. And that's related to the effect on the child as

6 well, correct?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Now, when you evaluate a child clinically how

9 often do you need to see the child?

10 A. It depends on what the evaluation is and for what

11 purpose. If I were going to be treating the

12 child, then evaluation tends to just move into

13 treatment. For the purposes of being able to make

14 an opinion about how this child is doing, you can

15 do it with a fair degree of confidence, as long as

16 you have a long enough time you can do it in one

17 interview. It is better to have five over time of

18 course but certainly it's possible if you spend

19 enough time with the child and do the techniques

20 that you have been trained to do.

21 Q. When you evaluate a person is it -- would you say

22 do you feel more confident in your opinion if you

23 have the opportunity to view the child over

24 several different periods of time?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. Why is that? 25

2 A. It has to do with the notion of convergent 24

3 validity. That to make an opinion or to make an 23

4 assessment it is always helpful to get different 22

5 methods of data, and of course to see someone more 21

6 than once would be helpful to get to know the 20

7 person better. 19

8 Q. So, if you saw a child in one day, you can form an 18

9 opinion, but for some reason the child had 17

10 something bad happen to them or a restless night 16

11 and had a bad day, but if you saw them a second 15

12 time and third and fourth and they were fine those 14

13 other occasions, the one occasion may be abnormal 13

14 where as if they were always in that sort of bad 12

15 mood — 11

16 A. No. I don't think honestly that, depending on 10

17 what the bad day's about, if their mother got 9

18 killed and they came to see you, okay, but the 8

19 point is that I think you can assess how a child 7

20 is doing at that point in time, the current 6

21 functioning, if you have enough time to spend with 5

22 them, and they might be influenced by it if they 4

23 have. It is to some degree, it is not to skew, it 3

24 is not going to make white black in terms of your 2

25 assessment in my opinion. 1

1 Q. After our discussion a little bit if you could
2 answer I think a question I posed earlier and that
3 is where would you rate Karla as far as her
4 psychological abilities to cope with stress with
5 the other twenty-five children you've
6 evaluated?

7 A. I'm not inclined to do that. I can talk about how
8 I see Karla but each individual is so unique and
9 has their own diagnoses, their own set of
10 problems, that it is difficult for me to do that
11 really. I think I mentioned she had some

12 strengths and things that help her, I think she is
13 also dealing with some traumas and some
14 difficulties that other children are not.

15 Q. And I was just asking you to try to evaluate her
16 as opposed to some of the other children?
17 A. It is like apples and oranges, Mr. Jordan.

18 Q. Is that true for all of us, we're all completely
19 different than each other psychologically?

20 MR. BITTEL: I object. I'm not sure. I
21 think inadvertently it may be misleading question.
22 You went from trying to evaluate Karla against the
23 twenty or twenty-five people and she says it is
24 apples and oranges.

25 MR. JORDAN: Right. I want to see is it

1 your opinion that's true.

2 BY MR. JORDAN, CONTINUING:

3 Q. You could never compare anybody else

4 psychologically with the rest of the population
5 because we're all so different?

6 A. Say that again, please.

7 Q. You indicated that you're unwilling to compare

8 Karla with the other twenty to twenty-five

9 children you've evaluated because that would be

10 comparing apples with oranges, and I'm trying

11 to -- what I'm asking is is the reason that you

12 feel that is that because all of us as individuals
13 are different from one another?

14 A. No. I think it is because the kids that I've seen

15 just have a whole diverse range of problems and

16 experiences. I could compare Karla more easily

17 with someone, for instance, who has had a trauma,

18 whose suffered a sudden loss or something like

19 that. That, and I've seen children that have, and

20 I think that she's doing, you know, reasonably

21 well, in terms of her behavioral functioning.

22 She's similar in terms of the underlying anxieties

23 and fears that she's experienced but there are

24 kids that have had trauma that have very little

25 social support that are not doing as well. We

1 talked about that before.

2 Q. What type of children -- excuse me. Not what type
3 of children.

4 What sudden loss have these other
5 children suffered or gone through that you
6 indicated you could compare Karla to?

7 A. Loss of a parent in an accident, catastrophic

8 accident.

9 Q. And how many such children have you evaluated?

10 A. I can't really say. Let me see. Maybe thirty. I
11 don't know about thirty. No. I really don't

12 know. I would have to really reconstruct that.

13 Q. Okay. Because I'm a little -- did you help Doctor
14 Wortman in her study on the effects on children
15 and on individuals as a result of automobile

16 accidents?

17 A. No.

18 Q. You indicated that you had evaluated twenty to

19 twenty-five different children and that's why I
20 was a little puzzled when you indicated it may

21 have been as high as thirty children whom you have
22 seen with a loss of a parent. Out of the twenty

23 to twenty-five how many would you say -- how many
24 children did you see who had suffered a sudden

25 traumatic loss such as -- just that question. A

1 sudden traumatic loss?

2 A. Maybe half.

3 Q. Now, have you gone on to evaluate — excuse me —

4 to treat those twenty to twenty-five children?

5 A. I did in two — in one case I did but in general I
6 haven't. No. I did the evaluation.

7 Q. And how long do you treat children who have

8 psychological problems related to a sudden

9 catastrophic loss?

10 A. Well, as long as it seems necessary.

11 Q. And how long would that typically take?

12 A. It varies. It really does vary. Sometimes when

13 children have had a sudden loss, they need a place
14 to be able to deal with their feelings about it,

15 but then they want to get on to the business of

16 living and forget about it, and sometimes that is

17 necessary for them to do. It doesn't mean that

18 the impact isn't there, it just means it is not

19 going to be dealt with at that moment in time, so

20 there is only so much you can do in the acute

21 crisis and then it sort of goes underground, next

22 developmental hurdle it may come up again.

23 Q. Would you agree that all children, all of us as

24 children, went through certain psychological

25 stresses?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. And that all of us cope with these different

3 stressors in different ways?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. And some of us have more difficulties than others

6 in coping with the same type stress?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. And in fact most of us have gone through the loss

9 of a parent or a grandparent some time in our

10 lives?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. And that doesn't necessarily mean that we have

13 psychiatric problems, does it?

14 A. No.

15 Q. Have you ever treated or examined any patients who

16 have had broken needles left in them?

17 A. No.

18 Q. Have you ever treated any individuals who have had

19 bullet fragments or any foreign object left in

20 them as a result of a car accident or an injury in

21 a war, something like that?

22 A. I think I -- I think I may have -- not evaluated

23 but treated an adult that had something like that

24 with regard to a car accident but in general

25 nothing stands out.

1 Q. Do you know if that was a source of that person's

2 psychological symptoms?

3 A. I can't remember.

4 Q. Would you say a hundred percent of your practice

5 is devoted to the examination of children?

6 A. No.

7 Q. What percentage of your practice is devoted to the

8 examination of children?

9 A. Five to ten percent at this point. It has been

10 changing. It is evolving. I did a lot of family

11 work in the past with children and will still do

12 that but now it is more family and adult

13 individuals.

14 Q. And when I say children what age group are we

15 talking about?

16 A. In the families it ranges.

17 Q. No. When I ask a question about --

18 A. That is also different. That is also different.

19 Q. Okay. Have you testified in court?

20 A. Twice.

21 Q. And when was that?

22 A. I think I can try to find out for you exactly but

23 I think it was 1988.

24 Q. In the same case or two different cases?

25 A. Two different cases.

1 Q. And what were you testifying about just
2 generally? I don't want to know all the
3 specifics.
4 A. About children.
5 Q. And the psychological consequences of some act or
6 event that had occurred to them?
7 A. Yes.
8 Q. Okay. And do you recall what the event was in
9 those two cases?
10 A. Sudden loss.
11 Q. Sudden loss of a parent?
12 A. I'd have to check. It was either a parent or
13 sibling.
14 Q. How many times have you testified in a deposition
15 such as this?
16 A. I think four or five.
17 Q. And were you qualified as an expert when you
18 testified on those two occasions?
19 A. I believe so, yes. Yes, I was.
20 Q. Have you ever been offered as an expert and not
21 qualified?
22 A. No.
23 Q. Do you recall what your area of expertise was on
24 those two occasions?
25 A. Child clinical.

1 Q. Psychology?

2 A. Child clinical psychology, yes.

3 Q. Do you know the difference between a plaintiff and
4 a defendant in a lawsuit?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. And did you testify for the plaintiff on each of

7 those two occasions?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. And of the twenty to twenty-five children you have

10 evaluated did any of them appear normal to you or

11 -- excuse me. Let me restate that question.

12 Were any of those children

13 psychologically normal?

14 A. Of the twenty-five that I evaluated?

15 Q. Yes.

16 A. The ones that I evaluated are all children that

17 either came to me at Children's Hospital at the

18 Judge Baker Guidance Center with difficulties or

19 children that I have evaluated that have had

20 sudden traumas of some kind and so, no, each of

21 them had some difficulties, the difficulties

22 varied. Except for the children that I saw in

23 research. That's different.

24 Q. You didn't clinically evaluate those children?

25 A. No.

1 Q. Would you agree that in general Karla is doing

2 reasonably well?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Would you agree that Karla is doing well in

5 school?

6 A. Well, I hear she's doing well in school now from
7 her mother, but I also understand that she had

8 difficulty beginning school which is not

9 surprising to me given what my evaluation of her

10 was.

11 Q. Now, can you explain -- I saw something in your

12 notes that Karla had some anxiety over when she

13 first started kindergarten, is that what you're

14 referring to?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. And she had some anxiety the first couple of days

17 about --

18 A. She told me that.

19 Q. Does that strike you as unusual that Karla had

20 some anxiety about starting school?

21 A. No.

22 Q. Does it strike you as unusual that any child would

23 have some anxiety about starting school?

24 A. Some children do and some children don't but for

25 kindergarten it is pretty normal to have anxiety.

1 It is not as normal for her to pass out in the
2 beginning of the first day of first grade though
3 with anxiety which is what I heard happened.
4 Q. Yeah. Who told you she passed out the first day
5 at school?
6 A. Her parents.
7 Q. And did anyone ever tell you she's passed out more
8 than once?
9 A. No.
10 Q. Anyone ever tell you that she's been unconscious
11 and had black-outs for one to two minutes?
12 A. I know that they brought her to the doctor and had
13 her checked out.
14 Q. And she had a CAT scan to see if she had some sort
15 of problems?
16 A. That's right.
17 Q. Now, that has happened on four different
18 occasions, that passing out for one to two
19 minutes. Given that — and Karla has been taken
20 to the hospital for treatment for that type of
21 evaluation, maybe I'm misstating it to say
22 treatment but for evaluation. Would you think
23 that type of incident would have some
24 psychological impact on Karla?
25 A. Going to the hospital? I think all of the visits

1 to the doctors given what's she's been through is
2 just very difficult, yes, is adding to it.
3 Q. What about if we just drop the visits to the
4 hospital, what about just these black-out
5 episodes, wouldn't that create some level of
6 anxiety or depression in a child if they were
7 worried about what's happening to them?
8 A. If they didn't know what was going on?
9 Q. Right.
10 A. I don't know. It could. It definitely could.
11 She --
12 Q. Wouldn't it be likely to have some adverse
13 psychological effect on a child to have --
14 A. That she would worry about her physical safety?
15 Q. Yes.
16 A. I suppose so.
17 Q. And I take it part of a child's psychological
18 well-being is affected by their parents' reactions
19 to the child and interaction with the child, is
20 that fair to say?
21 A. Yes.
22 Q. Thus, if say the parents are extremely worried
23 over say these black-out episodes and they convey
24 that sort of concern over these episodes either
25 consciously or subconsciously to the child, that

1 will have some effect on the child?

2 A.

I'd suppose if they did do that.

3 Q.

I take it since I'm telling you for the first time

4

that she had four different black-outs that you're

5

not aware of any such problems that the parents

6

had with dealing with that episode, those

7

episodes?

8 A.

I only know that she was brought to the doctor and

9

the doctor said that the CAT scan was normal and

10

that he attributed it to stress.

11 Q.

And did the -- and do you know when those

12

black-outs started?

13 A.

No.

14

Q.

Were you aware she had black-outs long before this

15

needle incident occurred?

16 A.

No.

17

Q.

Now, it seems -- wouldn't it seem to you if she

18

had black-outs from stress prior to this incident

19

that there was some other causation or some other

20

factor that was affecting her psychological makeup

21

prior to this needle incident?

22 A.

If there were no other physical reasons for it you

23

might want to inquire but it is very hard to

24

dismantle now the causation issue.

25

Q.

Well, wouldn't you agree that if she had stress

1 prior to this incident that there must have been

2 another factor contributing to her psychological

3 state today?

4 A. If it was attributed to stress, yes.

5 Q. And in fact you were told that these black-outs

6 were attributed to stress, correct?

7 A. Yeah.

8 Q. And agree that whenever you have multiple

9 incidents or events such as black-outs and say

10 this broken needle incident, it is difficult to

11 determine what is the cause or primary cause of a

12 child's psychological state?

13 A. Well, some things are a little bit -- some bricks

14 are heavier than others, and I guess it is my

15 opinion that Karla was, you know, very frightened

16 about dying basically but of course it's always

17 difficult to disentangle the exact influence of

18 everything.

19 Q. Now, wouldn't you agree that's part of the reason

20 you like to see children over time because if you

21 see them and you see an event happen to them while

22 you're evaluating them, it is easy -- more easy to

23 determine the causation?

24 A. I don't think that's your purpose to evaluate

25 children over time is to determine the causation.

1 It is to get to know them better and what they are
2 struggling with regardless of whatever the factors
3 are.
4 Q. Well, can you tell me with a reasonable degree of
5 psychological certainty what Karla Spehar's
6 psychological state was prior to October 7th of
7 1987?
8 A. Only through report. Prior to the incident?
9 Q. I'm asking you can you?
10 A. I cannot.
11 Q. Why is that?
12 A. Because I didn't see her.
13 Q. Now, did you talk to anybody who did see her prior
14 to October of 1987?
15 A. Her mother and her father.
16 Q. Did you talk to any doctors who had seen her?
17 A. No.
18 Q. Did you talk to her pediatrician?
19 A. No.
20 Q. Do you think it would have been helpful to talk to
21 her pediatrician?
22 A. My job was to assess how she was doing now.
23 Q. I understand that and all I'm asking you is a
24 couple of different questions. The question is
25 would it have been helpful to talk to Karla

1 Spehar's pediatrician?
 2 A. To get what information?
 3 Q. About her psychological state prior to this needle
 4 incident?
 5 A. I don't know that her pediatrician would know it
 6 frankly.
 7 Q. But the parents would know it?
 8 A. I think the parents are considered the best source
 9 of data especially when you are evaluating young
 10 kids. That's considered a standard part of
 11 assessment is parental report data.
 12 Q. So, is it your testimony it would not have been
 13 helpful to talk to --
 14 A. No. It might have been helpful. It might have
 15 been helpful if she happened to have some -- if he
 16 happened to see her on a day when there was some
 17 information. I just don't know that that is a
 18 certainty that he would have.
 19 Q. She.
 20 A. She. Well, good.
 21 Q. Would you agree that Karla's interaction with her
 22 family is good?
 23 A. Yes. I think she feels supported.
 24 Q. You agree she has no problems with her mother,
 25 father or brother?

1 A. Well, there is different levels. I think that
2 she's very worried about leaving them and that
3 means that if they are that important to her I
4 think she is a little worried about getting
5 anybody mad at her, so, for instance, her mother
6 tells her to close the door and she begins to cry.
7 She is very sensitive as to maybe her mother is
8 angry at her, so in that way I think she may not
9 feel as comfortable as she might if she wasn't
10 feeling so dependent on her.
11 Q. What in your opinion is the cause of Karla's
12 dependence on her — is it on all of her parents
13 or on each of her parents or on more particularly
14 with her mother?
15 A. Well, I believe that she has this idea that
16 staying close to the family is a safer place to be
17 than outside the family. I don't believe she
18 fully believes the family can protect her on an
19 unconscious level. I think she feels it is better
20 than out there, so I do feel she looks to her
21 brother, her father and primarily her mother.
22 Q. I'll ask you more questions about that later.
23 Would you agree that Karla has had no problem
24 making friends?
25 A. No. I wouldn't agree totally with that.

1 Q. And why not?

2 A. My sense from talking with her about her peers,

3 apparently Karla can be with trusted peers. She

4 becomes close, warms up and they enter that safe

5 inner circle, then it's okay, but she doesn't

6 necessarily go out and try to make friends with

7 new people easily. For instance, her mother said

8 she was anxious for the first couple of weeks of

9 first grade. Now better. So, she's sociable

10 within this protected circle.

11 Q. Would you agree then -- there are two different

12 types of people, extroverts and introverts?

13 A. Right.

14 Q. Would you say Karla is an introvert or extrovert?

15 A. She's engaging with people that she likes and

16 trusts, so -- but I would say she is on the timid

17 side.

18 Q. Wouldn't you agree most of us have an orientation

19 one way or the other like that?

20 A. That's right.

21 Q. Some people have huge circles of friends whereas

22 others are more limited in the -- in who they

23 become close to or associate with?

24 A. There are differences.

25 Q. And there is --

1 A. Doesn't mean it is normal though. All I'm saying
 2 is that somebody that would stay very, very close
 3 by, you would be a little worried, you know.
 4 Q. Would you be surprised -- well, let me rephrase it
 5 another way.
 6 Would you expect that Karla would
 7 be the type that would have one or two close
 8 friends at school rather than eight to ten close
 9 friends at school?
 10 A. She talked to me about three or four, some at home
 11 and some at school.
 12 Q. And does that strike you as abnormal?
 13 A. Not in and of itself but -- okay. Not in and of
 14 itself.
 15 Q. Would you feel differently about Karla if she say
 16 had ten friends or spoke of ten friends?
 17 A. I would need to know more information about is she
 18 just listing names or what are the quality of
 19 these, are these the kids in her class or what is
 20 she doing. What I'm talking about is that my
 21 understanding in terms of who she plays with and
 22 who she feels comfortable to be with is that that
 23 circle is quite limited.
 24 Q. Would you agree that Karla has no recurring
 25 nightmares?

1 A. Right now, yes.

2 Q. Did you make any evaluation of whether Karla was
3 properly dressed, what her attire was during your
4 visit with her?

5 A. She was properly dressed as far as I can recall.

6 Q. And that would indicate that on a certain level

7 both her and her parents are interacting properly?
8 A. Properly? That her mother can dress her, yes.

9 Q. Would you agree childhood stress has been linked

10 to bed wetting?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Is there any evidence of bed wetting in this case?

13 A. Not that I know of.

14 Q. Would you agree childhood stress has been linked

15 to stuttering?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Is there any evidence of stuttering or speech

18 impediments in Karla?

19 A. Not to my knowledge.

20 Q. Would you agree childhood stress has been linked

21 to eating disorders?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Any evidence of eating disorders in Karla?

24 A. No. Not that I know of.

25 Q. Would you agree that childhood stress has been

1 linked to temper tantrums?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Any evidence of temper tantrums in Karla?

4 A. Recently Mrs. Spehar is talking to me about that.

5 She says that Karla screams very loudly when her
6 brother takes something away from her to the point
7 she is frightened, she is hurt and does seem she
8 is overreacting. I don't think that would be a
9 classic temper tantrum but she screams very loudly

10 and they are concerned about that right now.

11 Q. Would you agree that a child who encounters stress
12 that's not all that -- that's not necessarily a
13 bad thing to happen?

14 A. What's not a bad thing to happen?

15 Q. For a child to encounter and learn to cope with
16 stress?

17 A. Everybody has to deal with an optimal level of

18 frustration. The problem is when the stress is
19 too much, the personality gets sacrificed, and the
20 defenses that need to be used to deal with that

21 onslaught basically are so massive that they rob

22 the person of energy to invest in the appropriate
23 developmental tasks. They are so busy to keep

24 that stress down, they can't explore, have fun,

25 enjoy.

1 Q. And would you agree in trying to determine how
2 children are affected by events, we look at
3 behavioral symptoms to tell us what's going on in
4 their psychological state?

5 A. With children?

6 Q. With children?

7 A. That's one -- only one source of data because what
8 you see on the surface and what children may be
9 struggling with underneath, that's exactly why you

10 have indirect methods of assessing. Behavioral
11 observations obviously is one line of this
12 convergent validity, but a child can really look
13 okay on the outside and be dealing with underlying
14 feelings that could be a time bomb.

15 Q. Do you think there is a time bomb in Karla Spehar?
16 A. I can't say for certain what's going to happen in
17 the future but I think she is dealing with anxiety
18 and depression underneath.

19 Q. Do you agree that Karla has no overt problems?

20 A. No. Depends on what you mean though by problems.
21 I think she's doing reasonably well. As I said

22 she's got some friends. She plays. On the other
23 hand, she is very anxious about staying close.
24 She has no plan for the future at all. Never
25 wants to leave her mother which is really

1 atypical. The first time I saw her, she wanted to

2 be a nurse, now she doesn't want to be anything,

3 she is just going to stay with her mother, and

4 she's a total perfectionistic about keeping

5 everything in place as a way I think to feel safe,

6 so that worries me. I'm just telling you that

7 worries me a little bit. When you talk about

8 overt, there is different levels of observation.

9 Q. What is Karla's mother do?

10 A. What does she do?

11 Q. Yes.

12 A. My understanding is that she works part-time with

13 her husband.

14 Q. And do you know her prior work history?

15 A. No. I didn't really evaluate Mrs. Spehar.

16 Q. Don't you agree that children often think about

17 doing what their parents do?

18 A. Sure, they do. I mean that's pretty normal.

19 Q. And if Karla's mother didn't work, would it

20 surprise you if Karla's image or thoughts of

21 growing up would be not to have a job or not to

22 focus on a particular job?

23 A. Then she would want to be married and have kids

24 because that's the other. You are either in the

25 house with curtains or you're a career woman. I

1 mean that is sort of the two. Of course there
2 could be others but so to not want to do anything
3 and to stay with mother, I think that is a little
4 atypical.
5 Q. Would you agree that if the parents were having
6 marital difficulties that a child would pick up on
7 that?
8 A. She might. She could.
9 Q. And if the child is having problems with her
10 father she might not particularly think about or
11 desire to be married?
12 A. If she were having problems with her father?
13 Q. Yes. If she were having problems with her father?
14 A. That she wouldn't want a man in her life, you
15 mean?
16 Q. Right. It wouldn't be unusual to expect that she
17 wouldn't think about having a man in her life?
18 A. Well, it is hard to speculate how problems with
19 her father might be manifested in future goals. I
20 suppose, you know, that could be one way.
21 Q. Would you agree that Karla has no major
22 psychiatric symptomatology?
23 A. No.
24 Q. Would you agree Karla has support of a loving
25 family?

1 A. Yes.

2 MS. HENRY: Did you say she had no

3 major?

4 THE WITNESS: I say I do not agree.

5 MR. JORDAN: No. Does not agree.

6 BY MR. JORDAN, CONTINUING:

7 Q. Is it your opinion, Doctor, that any child who

8 undergoes a sudden traumatic event will have some

9 psychiatric mark?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Now, that mark could be good, bad or indifferent,

12 is that accurate?

13 A. No. I don't think so.

14 Q. Is it your opinion, Doctor, that any child that

15 undergoes a sudden traumatic event will have a

16 psychiatric mark that will have adverse an effect

17 upon them?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. So, any child who loses a parent will have an

20 adverse psychological effect from that?

21 A. Well, depends on how the loss is, how it happens,

22 how important the relationship is, and what is the

23 context of support afterwards. It is going to be

24 tough but I don't think it is the same kind of

25 trauma as nearly dying yourself and being worried

1 that you might die every time you move. It is bad

2 losing a parent before sixteen, for instance, is

3 generally considered to be a high risk factor for

4 depression in adulthood, so I'm not saying it is

5 not bad but there are levels of trauma again.

6 Q. Well, I ask you the question earlier. If a child

7 undergoes a sudden traumatic event will that leave

8 some adverse psychological event that will be

9 adverse and you said yes?

10 A. I agree.

11 Q. I'm asking you a child who undergoes or has a

12 parent die will they have an adverse --

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. And will a child who has a close grandparent die

15 on them have an adverse psychological effect?

16 A. I think grandparent is different than parent.

17 Q. Well, I think you indicated that the loss of a

18 close grandparent was a sudden traumatic event,

19 correct?

20 A. I don't remember saying that it was a sudden

21 traumatic. It is a loss but whether it

22 constitutes as a catastrophic trauma I don't know.

23 Q. Well now you indicated something new there. You

24 said a catastrophic loss, is that the type of loss

25 that the child has to undergo to have an adverse

psychological effect?

A.

No. No.

Q.

Okay. So, when I ask you this question, I'm not

asking about catastrophic loss, I'm asking you —

A.

About sudden loss of a close relative?

Q.

Yes. Will that leave an adverse psychological

effect on a child?

A.

Depending on the experience with death before, how

close, depends on the context that is left, the

support environment. I really believe that the

loss of a parent is in a different ballpark than

the loss of a grandparent. That's just my

belief. I don't mean it is not going to have some

adverse effect if the child is close to the

grandparent but it is not going to be the same as

losing your mother when you don't have another

mother.

Q.

Wouldn't you agree that a medical trauma also

depends on your prior experiences, on the degree

of the trauma, as well as not just automatic if

there is a medical treatment or medical problem,

that you're going to have an adverse psychological

effect?

A.

My belief really about that is that as the

stressor gets more traumatic, mitigating, the

1 variety factors wash out. In other words, the
2 brick is hard enough, falls on your head, you
3 don't talk about well this person's head is a
4 little softer than this person or they got more
5 support. As you go up this trauma scale in my
6 opinion then those other sort of factors are less
7 important in interacting with the impact.
8 Q. Okay. I didn't really follow that.
9 A. Do you understand?
10 Q. No. I don't. I will try to put it in terms I
11 will understand.
12 A. Go ahead.
13 Q. All right. Most children have an appendectomy
14 these days. Is that -- does that have a
15 psychological effect on the child?
16 MR. BITTEL: Objection. You said most
17 children have appendectomies these days? Is that
18 what the question was?
19 MR. JORDAN: Yes.
20 MR. BITTEL: I object.
21 MR. JORDAN: He objected. He can make
22 an objection for the record.
23 THE WITNESS: But you can still ask?
24 BY MR. JORDAN, CONTINUING:
25 Q. Right. That's our system of justice. Would an

1 appendectomy have a psychological effect on a
2 child?

3 A. It could.

4 Q. And would getting your tonsils out, a

5 tonsillectomy, have an adverse psychological

6 effect on a child?

7 A. Depends on -- I don't know if that's a severe. I

8 think that anytime a child has to go into the

9 hospital for surgery it is a stress. How it is

10 dealt with is going to be important, and it is all

11 a matter of how severe the life threat is. With

12 an appendectomy if you're talking about it bursts,

13 then that's something completely different than a

14 tonsillitis or tonsillectomy.

15 Q. Can getting braces create anxiety for a child?

16 A. Sure.

17 Q. Can getting braces cause depression in a child?

18 A. I would have to see the child.

19 Q. Is it possible for getting braces to have an

20 adverse psychological effect?

21 A. If that child believed that the braces meant that

22 none of the kids were going to like her anymore

23 and that she attributed -- I don't think it would

24 cause depression but I think it would be how she

25 would explain the depression. In other words,

1 that it would become organized around that, that
2 there may be some depression there and the braces
3 causes it to be manifest.
4 Q. Can getting or wearing eye glasses create anxiety
5 and/or depression for a child?
6 A. Again, I don't think it can create it but
7 depending on the health and the resources of the
8 child it could be a stress. That's what I'll say.
9 Q. And the stress that's created from getting and
10 wearing glasses could that create anxiety?
11 A. Yes. I guess I don't see wearing glasses as such
12 a terrible thing but I guess it could be.
13 Q. Can getting acne affect a child's psychological
14 well-being?
15 A. In adolescence, absolutely.
16 Q. I saw when I looked through your files some of the
17 school records for Karla, is that correct?
18 A. Yes.
19 Q. Did you have those school records before you wrote
20 your report?
21 A. No.
22 Q. Why did you get the school records?
23 A. I was sent a packet of information and I thought
24 it might be helpful. Mr. Bittel sent me a packet
25 of information so I looked at it.

1 Q. Did it affect your opinion in any manner when you

2 looked at the school records?

3 A. No. Mrs. Spehar had told me that Karla was doing

4 reasonably well at school.

5 Q. Did you talk to any of Karla Spehar's teachers?

6 A. No.

7 Q. Did you talk to Doctor Indresano,

8 I n d r e s a n o ?

9 A. No.

10 Q. And I take it you had not read his deposition at

11 the time you wrote your report, is that correct?

12 A. I haven't read it.

13 Q. Did you ever talk to a Doctor Brinich?

14 A. No.

15 Q. Have you viewed any depositions other — excuse me

16 — have you reviewed or examined or read any

17 depositions at all in this case?

18 A. No.

19 Q. I notice several expert reports other than on

20 Doctor Wortman and your own in your file. Did you

21 review any of those reports prior to the time you

22 wrote your report?

23 A. No.

24 Q. Do you think it is relevant in rendering your

25 opinions what the other dental and medical experts

1 have said in this case?

2 A. No. You mean in terms of the dental/medical, no.

3 No.

4 Q. Do you know Kathy Spehar keeps a diary detailing

5 Karla's days?

6 A. I did not know that.

7 Q. Would that be relevant in rendering an opinion as

8 to Karla's well-being, an examination of that

9 record of her daily activities?

10 A. I think the parental report data is relevant, and

11 I think that's what I did -- that is what I did is

12 speak to Mrs. Spehar and get that data.

13 Q. I take it you know that Mrs. Spehar knows there is

14 a lawsuit going on and that your testimony will be

15 used in that lawsuit, is that correct?

16 A. That's correct.

17 Q. Do you think it is possible that what she reports

18 to you or what she indicates to you is influenced

19 in any manner by that fact?

20 A. I can't speculate on what Mrs. Spehar -- how she

21 is influenced. I asked her and what I report I

22 believe that she believes.

23 Q. And what is the reason you can't speculate about

24 Kathy Spehar, is that because you have not

25 clinically evaluated her?

1 A. No. Because you're asking me for her motivations,
2 to disassemble them or something. I just don't, you
3 know, I have no way of knowing that anyway.
4 Q. But you make those sort of evaluations and
5 determinations when you look at Karla, don't you?
6 A. Whether she is lying or -- I don't know --
7 Q. Don't you try to learn what her motivation is when
8 she says certain things to you?
9 MR. BITTEL: Her who? Who are you
10 referring to?
11 BY MR. JORDAN, CONTINUING:
12 Q. Karla?
13 A. Okay. What I try to do is try to assess her
14 behavioral functioning, her overt functioning, and
15 also some of the worries and the feelings and the
16 underlying issues that are impacting her life and
17 her personality and her potential for
18 development. That's what I'm doing.
19 Q. I understand that. Do you try to determine what
20 Karla's motivation is when she tells you certain
21 things?
22 A. Yeah. To communicate. I assume that everything
23 she tells me is a communication to me about what
24 she's experiencing and what she's dealing with.
25 Q. And do you accept everything that Karla says at

1 face value?
2 A. Absolutely not. You never do with children.
3 Q. But with adults do you handle adults differently?
4 A. Well, you do when -- when you are using parental
5 report data, you are asking the parents to comment
6 on what the child does, not what the parent thinks
7 the child feels. That you do. But you're asking
8 him to report what the child is doing, you know,
9 behaviorally. Do I think Mrs. Spehar is lying to
10 me, no. That's what you're asking. That's what
11 you do when you do an evaluation.
12 Q. No. I don't mean lying really. I mean
13 exaggerating, highlighting certain of the
14 negatives because she realizes your testimony is
15 going to affect her lawsuit and that the more
16 negative things that are with Karla presumably the
17 more serious the psychological --
18 A. I see what you're getting to.
19 Q. It seems when she talks to you, it would be
20 natural to highlight the negative aspect of Karla?
21 A. I understand what you're saying but I don't think
22 that's where she is at.
23 Q. How do you know that?
24 A. I think she feels pretty trampled on by this whole
25 process, the whole experience. I think she really

1 feels that. I think because she does, even though

2 I haven't evaluated her, the negative stuff is

3 where she is living. That's really where it is.

4 Q. When you say this process are you referring to the

5 legal process?

6 A. I'm talking about the doctors, about the change,

7 you know, the worry about what should we do and

8 also, yes, this too. I mean just everything

9 surrounding the events -- everything surrounding

10 what happened.

11 Q. And would you agree that all those factors also

12 have an influence on Karla as well?

13 A. Yes, I do.

14 Q. In fact, the trips to your office probably have

15 some sort of effect on Karla's well-being,

16 wouldn't you agree?

17 A. Well, I do, yeah. What is that effect is the

18 question.

19 Q. Right. How about an answer?

20 A. Well, Mrs. Spehar told me that after the first

21 time Karla really seemed to be better, and, you

22 know, I took it at face value but I wasn't sure.

23 After I spoke with Karla the second time, I asked

24 her if she would like to see somebody like me

25 every week where she could play and have a place

1 to go where she could just do drawings and express
2 herself and she said absolutely. She said that
3 she would like to do that. So, that makes me
4 think that at least it hasn't been so awful that
5 she wants to shrink from it.
6 Q. Now, Karla's traveled up here, is that correct, to
7 see you, traveled to Ann Arbor from Cleveland?
8 A. Yes.
9 Q. Are there tests which can be administered to
10 five-year-old and six-year-old children to detect
11 psychiatric symptoms?
12 A. You do a clinical evaluation. I did that with
13 charts what I was trained to do at Judge Baker
14 Guidance Center.
15 Q. Are there tests that can be administered to five
16 or six year olds to detect their psychiatric
17 symptoms?
18 A. What kind of tests?
19 Q. I'm asking you, are there any tests that can be
20 administered to five or six-year-old children?
21 A. Yes. The indirect techniques that I used are
22 considered a method to detect psychiatric
23 symptomatology.
24 Q. Are there any other tests that can be administered
25 to a five or six-year-old child?

1 A. I believe, yes, there is a child depression scale

2 and I don't use it. I'm just not that familiar

3 with it but I suppose there may -- there is that

4 one.

5 Q. That's a standardized test?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. What's the name of that test?

8 A. I am not sure of the exact name of it. It's not

9 something that was used in my training.

10 Q. Are there ink blot tests that can be administered

11 to five or six year olds?

12 A. You're talking about the Rorschach? Yes. That's

13 something that I have been trained to use and

14 could use but it is something that I don't like to

15 use just because I don't think it gets you that

16 much information.

17 Q. Are there behavioral checklists that you can

18 examine or use with a five-year-old and

19 six-year-old child?

20 A. You can use the Achenbach behavioral checklist.

21 A c h e n b a c h, I believe. There are a whole

22 broad spectrum. These are in my training the most

23 consensually accepted indirect techniques with a

24 combination of clinical observation and clinical

25 interview, talk with the child as well as parental

1 report.

2 Q. What is the Achenbach test used for?

3 A. Can be used to see how a child can benefit from

4 therapy. It is basically a parental report, and

5 it is really about the kinds of things I did with

6 Mrs. Spehar informally, and you can see what

7 behaviors are going on before therapy and then do

8 it after therapy to see if therapy has been

9 helpful.

10 Q. To the best of your knowledge does Karla have any

11 physical disabilities as a result of the broken

12 needed? Physical disabilities?

13 A. I understand. Not that I know of.

14 Q. Is Karla aware that she has a condition called

15 malignant hypothermia?

16 A. It didn't really come up. She may be and she

17 wears the emblem but it doesn't seem to be

18 something that, you know, not something that she

19 talked about. It is something that she is more

20 involved with the needle and that effect. She

21 knows that for some reason she can't have surgery.

22 Q. Now, she wears this med-alert bracelet all the

23 time, correct?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Don't you think she wonders why or knows why she

1 wears the bracelet?
 2 A. She might. I don't know.
 3 Q. And this bracelet that we're talking about is
 4 really a medical alert so that if she's ever
 5 treated by somebody who's not familiar with her
 6 condition they will know that she has malignant
 7 hypothermia?
 8 A. That's my understanding.
 9 Q. Did you ever ask her how she feels about wearing
 10 this bracelet all the time?
 11 A. No.
 12 Q. Do you think she feels different because she has
 13 to wear this medical alert bracelet?
 14 A. I don't know. It didn't come up. I didn't -- I
 15 don't know if she feels different about it. I
 16 think that what she focused on is having to tell
 17 kids not to punch her in the mouth because the
 18 needle might move.
 19 Q. Do you know that Karla is worried about malignant
 20 hypothermia?
 21 A. I don't know.
 22 Q. Well, you understand that she could die from
 23 malignant hypothermia, is that your understanding?
 24 A. Yes.
 25 Q. Did Doctor Wortman talk to Karla?

1 A. I don't think so, no.

2 Q. Was Doctor Wortman present when you talked to

3 Karla?

4 A. No.

5 Q. Did you talk to Doctor Wortman about your

6 observations and analysis of Karla?

7 A. I talked with her just regarding my concerns about
8 wanting to at some point get treatment, that I
9 felt that there was a lot of anxiety and that

10 Karla could use some help or the family could use
11 some help.

12 Q. Did Doctor Wortman give you any advice or express
13 any opinions about Karla to you?

14 A. No. That was -- I wrote that report.

15 Q. Well, you submitted a written report to Doctor

16 Wortman, correct?

17 A. That's correct.

18 Q. Now, that report that we have all received?

19 A. Right.

20 Q. Which is, I will just identify it for the record,

21 it is a report that the front page is dated

22 November 29th, 1989, and it is addressed to Mr.

23 Timothy Bittel from Doctor Camille Wortman,

24 subject the Spehar case, and it has eighteen pages

25 in it. That's the report that we're referring to,

1 correct?
2 A. Yes.
3 Q. Now, you've submitted -- you didn't actually write
4 this report, correct?
5 A. No -- yes, I did.
6 Q. Well --
7 A. I wrote that part of it, yeah.
8 Q. Okay. What you're indicating is that on page
9 twelve there is a section that is labeled
10 Devaluation of Karla Spehar?
11 A. Right.
12 Q. And you wrote all the way from there to page
13 seventeen up to the section that starts
14 conclusion?
15 A. That's correct.
16 Q. Now, we talked to Doctor Wortman, Doctor Wortman
17 indicated that you had submitted the report to her
18 and that she finalized the drafting of that
19 section, is that accurate?
20 A. I submitted the report. Whether there were any
21 changes made, I mean in terms of editing, she may
22 have, but this, to my recollection, this
23 represents my report but she normally will go
24 through for just grammatical and she may have --
25 she may have edited but I wrote that portion.

1 Q. Are there any significant changes in that section

2 from what you originally drafted?

3 A. Not that I -- no. I don't think so.

4 Q. Do you have a copy of what you originally gave to

5 Doctor Wortman?

6 A. No.

7 Q. Would you agree that in the editing process Doctor

8 Wortman may have made it a little more dramatic?

9 A. No. I wouldn't agree. I have gone over it before

10 today and this is my report.

11 Q. And it accurately states your conclusions and

12 observations of this case, is that correct?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. On how many different occasions have you spent any

15 time with Karla Spehar?

16 A. Two different occasions.

17 Q. What were the dates of those visits?

18 A. Okay. It was September 29th of 1989. Do you need

19 the exact date? September 29th, 1989 and October

20 28, 1990.

21 MR. JORDAN: At this time could we take

22 a brief break?

23 (Whereupon a discussion was had off the

24 record.)

25 BY MR. JORDAN, CONTINUING:

1 Q. Where did each of the visits occur, I'm referring
2 to the visits you had with Karla Spehar?
3 A. The first one occurred at Doctor Wortman's home,
4 the second one occurred in my office here, right
5 here.
6 Q. Doctor Wortman recently moved so I want to be
7 clear.
8 A. Home in Ann Arbor.
9 Q. And when we say here, we're here in Ann Arbor,
10 correct?
11 A. Right.
12 Q. And how long did each visit last?
13 A. About three hours, two and a half to three hours.
14 Q. Could you just sort of briefly explain what
15 happened during each of those two visits during
16 that time?
17 A. Yes. First visit September 29th, 1989, I met
18 Karla with her parents, and Doctor Wortman went to
19 interview Mrs. Spehar, and I explained to Karla
20 that we were going to be talking and meeting, and
21 I brought her into a playroom that was set aside
22 for that purpose and began my interview of her.
23 Q. And did you ask questions of her and she answered
24 you for the whole two and a half to three hours?
25 A. No.

1 Q. What else happened during that time period?

2 A. In addition to us talking together she also did

3 some doll play, some drawings and she responded to

4 some pretend questions that I gave her.

5 Q. What do you mean pretend questions?

6 A. It is an indirect technique. Basically there are

7 two. One is if you could have anything in the

8 whole world what would you like to have. The

9 three wishes test. You kind of set it up by

10 saying that this is a pretend situation. You can

11 have whatever you want. You can make the future

12 be different, the past be different, you can have

13 anything you want. The other pretend test is if

14 you had to be three animals, which three animals

15 would you love to be and why and which three

16 animals would you hate to be and why.

17 Q. Was there anything else that really occurred

18 during your visits? You talked about your

19 question and answer periods and doll play,

20 drawings and pretend questions, is there anything

21 else?

22 A. One last thing is that I asked Karla to tell some

23 pretend stories to cards. It is called a

24 Traumatic Apperception Test,

25 a p p e r c e p t i o n. Test TAT cards.

1 Basically you ask her to make up the story that

2 has a beginning, middle and an end.

3 Q. Was there anything else that occurred during the

4 visit?

5 A. No.

6 Q. On the second visit just briefly describe what

7 happened?

8 A. On the second visit basically the same with the

9 exception that I had a face-to-face meeting with

10 the parents, too.

11 Q. How long did you meet with Karla on the second

12 occasion?

13 A. The whole interview with Karla and the family was

14 four hours and fifteen minutes, so I was with the

15 parents for about an hour and fifteen minutes, so

16 about -- I would say about three hours.

17 Q. Were either of her parents with Karla during the

18 three hours?

19 A. No. No.

20 Q. Is that true of the first occasion as well?

21 A. That is true. At one point Karla wanted to bring

22 her father in to look at the doll house and he

23 just made a quick visit and left.

24 Q. Was anyone else present during either of these two

25 visits?

1 A. No.
2 Q. Who accompanied Karla to your offices on the
3 second visit?

4 A. Her brother, her father and her mother did.
5 Q. Did you talk to her brother?

6 A. Not really. I said hello to him when we were
7 introduced.

8 Q. Do you have a list of questions that you ask each
9 child you evaluate?

10 A. I have a general sense of what I want to
11 accomplish. It is more in my head though.

12 Q. Do you have anything written, sort of like an
13 outline of these areas I'm going to cover with
14 the five-year-old child?

15 A. With the child himself or in general for the
16 assessment?

17 Q. Well, why don't we ask it both ways. Did you have
18 one for Karla, how about that question first?

19 A. For Karla I seeked to find out how she's doing at
20 present.

21 MR. BITTEL: The question is do you have
22 a written list?

23 THE WITNESS: No.

24 BY MR. JORDAN, CONTINUING:

25 Q. Do you have a written list that you use for any

1 children?

2 A.

No.

3 Q.

On the pretend questions you ask, there is two -- excuse me. Withdraw that question.

5

During the second visit did you

6

follow roughly the same for that as you followed

7

the first visit?

8 A.

Yeah.

9 Q.

Did you notice any change in Karla Spehar's

10

psychiatric state from the time of your first

11

examination on September 29th of 1989 and your

12

second and last visit more recently on October

13

28th of 1990?

14 A.

Yes.

15 Q.

Could you just -- can you briefly summarize what

16

that change was for us?

17 A.

Yes. She was less willing to talk about negative

18

feelings about -- about anything going wrong. She

19

seemed to be repressing more, denying more,

20

everything is okay, everything is fine, and yet I

21

got the feeling sitting with her that wasn't the

22

whole story but she even said I don't want to

23

think about those things, it is not good, I just

24

don't think about them.

25 Q.

Don't you think the more we dwell on certain

1 negative things, the more depressed we get? I say
 2 we just in a general sense, the normal individual?
 3 A. If we ruminate obsessively about something?
 4 Q. Those are your words. Explain your answer.
 5 A. I don't understand your question. Maybe you could
 6 try again. I'm trying to.
 7 Q. Can people ruminate obsessively over negative
 8 things?
 9 A. Yes.
 10 Q. Would you agree it is sometimes better to put bad
 11 things behind us?
 12 A. Yes.
 13 Q. Would you say there is nothing really wrong in
 14 trying to avoid dealing with certain negative
 15 things that have happened to us?
 16 A. I think that's the only thing kids can do. That's
 17 their coping mechanism. It doesn't mean they are
 18 not going to have to deal with it at some point,
 19 but yes, it is what kids do. They avoid, they
 20 escape, they deny. If the denial is too great
 21 from reality then it can be a problem.
 22 Q. But that's a step in the normal coping mechanism
 23 for a child?
 24 A. Is to push it out of awareness, yes, it is.
 25 Q. And that's true for all children?

1 A. No. It's not true for all children. Some kids

2 act it out and have behavioral problems. Some

3 kids turn the symptoms inward, get depressed,

4 other kids try repression as one mechanism.

5 Q. Do you have an opinion as to whether it is a

6 better mechanism, worst mechanism or just you

7 can't evaluate?

8 A. I think it is pretty usual for trauma that kids

9 are going to try to forget it.

10 Q. During any of -- during your two visits when you

11 asked her about the pretend questions -- off the

12 record.

13 (Whereupon a discussion was had off the

14 record.)

15 BY MR. JORDAN, CONTINUING:

16 Q. During the pretend questions you asked Karla

17 during your two visits did Karla ever indicate to

18 you when you asked her if she could have anything

19 in the world that she wanted the needle removed?

20 A. She told me that when we were talking.

21 Q. When you asked her during the pretend questions if

22 she could have anything in the world she wanted,

23 she listed three different things, correct?

24 A. I don't think she listed it then.

25 Q. She didn't say that if she could have anything in

1 the world she wanted the needle out, did she?

2 A. I don't think that was one of her -- not for that
3 particular test. She already told me that.

4 Q. But when you asked her specifically, when you
5 asked her if she could have anything in the world,
6 she didn't even mention the needle, did she?

7 A. She didn't. That wasn't one of her wishes.

8 Q. And that was true both on her first visit in
9 September of 1989 and her more recent visit with
10 you in October of 1990?

11 A. That's true.

12 Q. Don't you think it is natural she would want the
13 needle out?

14 A. I think she knew -- that's a given.

15 Q. Right. That would be natural for anyone who had
16 this incident happen to them?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. I'm sorry. I read your notes and I'm not sure I

19 quite understood the answers on the animal part,
20 when you asked her what animal she liked to be or
21 what she wouldn't be. Was there really anything

22 significant in her response on those questions

23 that are relevant to our discussion here today?

24 A. In the first time especially she spoke about

25 wanting to be animals that could swing around and

1 be free, elephant swings his trunk, the monkey
 2 swings from tree to tree, and the sense that I got
 3 from that was just a longing for her to have more
 4 carefree. Of course what has been relevant in the
 5 animals she would hate to be on both times was her
 6 not wanting to be any animal that is angry or mean
 7 or could hurt her in some way. Just her
 8 discomfort with aggressive feelings and possible
 9 harm.
 10 Q. Is it your understanding that Karla's physical
 11 activities are restricted in some manner because
 12 of this needle incident?
 13 A. She's -- my understanding is that since the first
 14 time I interviewed with her and the second that
 15 both the family and she is trying to do more
 16 things.
 17 Q. Okay. I will stop you here. During your first
 18 visit?
 19 A. Okay.
 20 Q. I will just focus then. Let me back up. At the
 21 time you wrote your report, why don't we use that
 22 as a timetable, I take it the report we referred
 23 to earlier, that's the only report you've prepared
 24 in this case, is that correct?
 25 A. That's correct.

1 Q. At the time you prepared that report that was
2 based upon your evaluation of Karla in September
3 of 1989, correct?

4 A. Right.
5 Q. At the time you wrote your report what was your
6 understanding of Karla's ability to go out and
7 play? What were the restrictions on her physical
8 activities?

9 A. Well, she told me that there were certain things
10 she couldn't do. Let's see if I can find that.
11 That there were certain kinds of things she cannot
12 join in all the activity.

13 Q. Do you recall what some of those things that she
14 mentioned were?
15 A. She can't play basketball and she can't play with
16 the other kids on the monkey bars.
17 Q. Now, she may have mentioned some other things or
18 no?

19 A. That she could do.
20 Q. That she could not do?
21 A. She told me that she just has to be very careful
22 who she played ball with and tell them to be
23 careful about her mouth but that was just she had
24 to be very careful but those were things she
25 mentioned specifically.

1 Q. Okay. I'm trying to think of something. Soccer,
2 was that mentioned?
3 A. That was mentioned that she could, but she must
4 not be -- she must be careful not to get hit in
5 the mouth with the soccer ball.
6 Q. Okay. Now, do you think that the restrictions --
7 who placed restrictions on Karla's activities by
8 the way?
9 A. I believe it was her parents in conjunction with
10 talking with the doctors. That's my
11 understanding.
12 Q. And do you feel -- and it is your understanding
13 that those restrictions were placed upon her by
14 the doctors because of the fact that she has a
15 needle in her mouth?
16 A. Yes.
17 Q. Now, how do these restrictions on her physical
18 activities affect her psychological well-being or
19 at the time of your report how did they affect her
20 behavior?
21 A. My opinion -- she told me she was mad about it.
22 She said it right in the interview. My opinion
23 through the indirect data was that she felt
24 constricted and that she would like to do more
25 things and just be able to mess around and sort of

1 be just more free in general.

2 Q. What psychiatric symptoms did Karla Spehar exhibit
3 in 1989 at the time of your report?

4 A. She had lots of anxiety and I also felt she was
5 depressed.

6 Q. Any other psychiatric problem at that time?

7 A. In terms of psychiatric symptoms per se, I think
8 that covers a whole lot, the anxiety especially.

9 Q. What psychiatric symptoms did Karla exhibit during
10 your last visit with her in October of 1990?

11 A. I think that she -- she's definitely still

12 anxious, perhaps more depressed than the first
13 visit. The first visit I felt she was really

14 dealing with lots of anxiety with physical

15 safety. That seems to be more repressed or less
16 front burner. I felt that she was depressed and
17 feeling stressed by all that she's been going

18 through.

19 Q. And would you say the -- would you say she

20 exhibited anxiety during her last visit in October
21 of 1990?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Just a lesser degree in 1989 when you visited with
24 her?

25 A. I think it is lesser. It is hard to explain but

1 she was exhibiting a lot of anxiety about having
2 to go back to the doctor. She had to have a tooth
3 pulled that week right before I saw her, so I
4 think that she was not exhibiting as much anxiety
5 about the life and death issue but she was still
6 anxious about events related to that trauma going
7 back to the dentist and depressed.
8 Q. Did she tell you that she had been deposed?
9 A. I knew that she had been deposed. We didn't talk
10 about it.
11 Q. Just a few days before you saw her actually,
12 right?
13 A. Yes.
14 Q. And would that have any effect on her state of
15 being, the fact that she was just in a deposition
16 and was talking to lawyers and lawyers were asking
17 her questions about this needle and stuff?
18 A. How did it go?
19 Q. I would be interested in how it went from Karla's
20 perspective?
21 A. From her parents' perspective it was a stressful
22 event for the whole family. We didn't talk about
23 it. I spoke with her parents afterwards so I
24 didn't really know.
25 Q. How about -- did Karla mention it in any way,

1 shape or form?

2 A. Not directly. Not directly.

3 Q. Okay. You say not directly, does that mean that
4 there was some indirect evidence that it was on
5 her mind?

6 A. She knew that -- I got the sense that she knew
7 there was some kind of court action going on and
8 she just -- she said I just don't want to know
9 about it, I don't want to know about it.

10 Q. Did she ever indicate to you that her parents
11 talked about the lawsuit when they did not think
12 she was listening and she actually heard what they
13 were saying?

14 A. Yes. Actually she said that she's heard some
15 things but she really doesn't know, she doesn't
16 want to know, it was very confusing what she was
17 trying to tell me, but it is consistent with the
18 fact that she doesn't want to deal with it, she
19 doesn't want to know.

20 Q. Does Karla know you're a doctor?

21 A. Yes. We talked about that, especially the first
22 time.

23 Q. And does she know what type of doctor you are?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Does she know why you were asking her all these

1 questions?
2 A. We talked about it the first time.
3 Q. And what did you talk to her about? Why did you
4 tell her you were asking her these different
5 questions?
6 A. Because she had been so afraid of doctors before
7 that I -- she was confused. I asked her what was
8 she feeling about coming up to see me, and she
9 said she was -- she didn't know for sure exactly
10 what was going to happen. I think her parents had
11 told her a little bit. Then I explained to her
12 that I was a talking doctor and not a medical
13 doctor and that I talk with children about how
14 they are doing in their lives and how things are
15 going for them, things that are on their mind,
16 things that they like, the things they don't like
17 and the things they worry about, and that it was
18 my job today to get to know her a little bit and
19 that we wouldn't do anything she didn't want to do
20 but that we would play together and get to know
21 each other a little bit.
22 Q. Do you think she would naturally exhibit some
23 anxiety with just talking to you because you were
24 a stranger and a doctor and in a strange place?
25 A. Yes. In fact, it was really clear she began to

1 warm up as time went on. In the beginning she
2 wanted to know where her mother was in the other
3 room, admitted to being nervous and didn't know
4 what to think because of going to doctors. She
5 really opened up as time went on. It was pretty
6 amazing.

7 Q. Is that normal in children?

8 A. To be anxious for a session?

9 Q. Right.

10 A. Absolutely.

11 Q. Did she know that her visit to you had something
12 to do with the needles?

13 A. I don't know for sure.

14 Q. What's your opinion?

15 A. I think I believe that she -- I don't know if I
16 can speculate on what she thought but I think that
17 she knew --

18 MR. BITTEL: You can't speculate. Do
19 you know?

20 THE WITNESS: No.

21 BY MR. JORDAN, CONTINUING:

22 Q. We are asking a reasonable degree of medical
23 probability, not if you know for certain, but if
24 it is more probable than not. If you can't say
25 you can't say?

1 A. I can't say.

2 Q. I'm going to ask you a few questions about the

3 report you have in front of you now. If you want

4 to follow along I'm going to base the next series

5 of questions on that report. I'm going to start

6 with page twelve of the report which is the

7 beginning of the page that -- that's the start of

8 where the section you wrote, that's correct,

9 right?

10 A. Right.

11 Q. I take it you played no role in the writing or

12 drafting of any of the earlier pages that are in

13 that report?

14 A. No involvement.

15 Q. Okay. Now, in the first paragraph you indicate

16 that doctors told the Spehar parents that if the

17 needle moves or is jarred, the result could be

18 fatal, is that correct?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. What -- is that significant in this case that

21 fact?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. And why is it significant?

24 A. Because it means she is living with the threat of

25 death.

Q. Now, actually that statement is that the parents were told that if the needle moves or is jarred the result could be fatal. Isn't it more relevant what she was told in determining her psychological well-being?

A. Yes.
Q. Because if she didn't even know about this, it could hardly affect her psychological well-being, correct?

A. I don't know. I don't know if I can agree with that because kids can pick up. Let's say the parents knew and she wasn't told, kids have a way of picking up anxiety in unconscious ways, so it is hard to be able to answer that definitively.

Q. And kids pick up the anxieties of their parents?

A. Yes.

Q. And based upon the way that parents treat the children that has an effect on the child, correct?
A. That's right.
Q. An overprotective parent will cause certain psychological effects in their child, correct?

A. Overprotective, how do you define overprotective? In what cases? Who decides when that is successive?

Q. That's a very good question. I assume maybe

1 psychiatrists and psychologists would define what

2 overprotective is.

3 A. If parents were acting in excess of real danger,

4 you could consider them overprotective.

5 Q. Just normally when there is some parents that are
6 more protective of their children than others, is
7 that fair to say?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. And the children pick up -- withdrawn.

10 Sometimes that is for a variety of

11 reasons, correct?

12 A. Okay.

13 Q. Sometimes it is the parents' own insecurities that
14 result in this overprotectiveness?

15 A. Could be. It is hard to say.

16 Q. Now, do you know if Karla has been told that if

17 the needle moves or is jarred she could die?

18 A. I know that she believes it because she told me

19 the first session.

20 Q. Do you know what -- who told you that the doctors

21 told the Spehar parents that if the needle moves

22 or is jarred the result could be fatal?

23 A. I believe I got that information from Doctor

24 Wortman.

25 Q. And to the best of your knowledge that statement

1 is accurate, if the needle moves or is jarred the
2 result could be fatal?

3 A. At that time, yes.

4 Q. When you say at that time you're referring to the
5 time you wrote your report?

6 A. Right.

7 Q. Is your opinion any different today about this
8 particular issue?

9 A. What I know from just what I have read in the
10 file, not even what I read in the file but from
11 what the parents told me the second time is that
12 there is less of a percentage chance that it could
13 move. What would happen if it did move I don't

14 know.

15 MR. BITTEL: Excuse me, Doctor.

16 (Whereupon a discussion was had off the
17 record.)

18 BY MR. JORDAN, CONTINUING:

19 Q. Has anyone told you that the needle has not moved
20 since October 7th?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Are you aware that Doctor Indresano -- do you know
23 who Doctor Indresano is?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. And he's Karla's doctor, correct?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Are you aware that Doctor Indresano has said he

3 would leave the needle in and there is less than

4 one percent chance that anything could go wrong?

5 A. I wasn't aware that he said it that way, but I did

6 hear the number one percent chance of moving.

7 Q. Well, did you hear the phrase it was less than a

8 one percent chance that anything could go wrong?

9 A. No. I didn't hear exactly in those words.

10 Q. Are you aware that the needle could be removed now

11 and in the future?

12 A. I understood that there still exists danger to

13 remove the needle.

14 Q. What were you told about the danger of removing

15 the needle?

16 A. With regard to where it is, with regard to the

17 position.

18 Q. What were you told?

19 A. That there is a slight risk of facial

20 disfigurement, facial cranial nerve damage or

21 artery or some kind of blood vessel being hurt.

22 Q. And that risk could be increased once her face

23 grew and at that time it would be better to remove

24 the needle, did you hear that?

25 A. I heard that -- I read in this I believe it was

1 the letter from Doctor Indresano that the,
2 original letter in '89, I'm not hundred percent
3 sure, that it could be re-evaluated as she got
4 older.
5 Q. You indicate in the early part of your report that
6 in part you base your opinion on responses to
7 projective tests?
8 A. Right.
9 Q. What projective tests were you referring to?
10 A. Those are the pretend tests and the TAT card
11 stories.
12 Q. You indicate -- off the record.
13 (Whereupon a discussion was had off the
14 record.)
15 BY MR. JORDAN, CONTINUING:
16 Q. You indicate that verbally Karla tended to
17 minimize the extent of her distress and her fears,
18 correct?
19 A. Yes.
20 Q. Is it fair to say that she did not indicate to you
21 verbally any distress or fears?
22 A. No, that's not fair. That wasn't what happened.
23 Q. So, when you say she tended to minimize -- how do
24 you know she is minimizing her fears if she is not
25 articulating them?

1 A. She may talk about it a little bit and then seek
2 to change the subject or get off the topic or
3 there is just a feeling that you get sitting with
4 her that she is anxious about it and wants to
5 downplay it basically and move on to something
6 else.
7 Q. You know the problem I have with that, Doctor, if
8 she sat there and talked to you for about an hour
9 or two about these fears, I get the feeling that
10 you'd say all she talked about was her fears and
11 distress, obviously she has fears and distress,
12 wouldn't that be accurate?
13 A. Do you mean that I would reach a similar
14 conclusion?
15 Q. Right. If she had talked about her fears and
16 distress for an hour or two?
17 A. It depends on how she talked about it. If she
18 were comfortable talking about a topic that she
19 was asked to talk about, then no, I wouldn't say
20 that.
21 Q. So, if she felt comfortable talking about her
22 fears for an hour or two, you wouldn't think
23 that --
24 A. If I kept asking her those questions but I don't
25 know that I would do that under what

1 circumstances.

2 Q. You bring up a good point. Really her responses
3 and her thoughts are triggered by your questions,
4 aren't they?

5 A. In part.
6 Q. And so the more — do you know if you hadn't
7 mentioned anything about doctors or the needle
8 whether she would have mentioned it at all?

9 A. I don't know.

10 Q. You make a statement in your report just a little
11 bit later that you believe Karla has lost all
12 trust in doctors?

13 A. Where is that?
14 Q. On page thirteen, the second full paragraph, the
15 fourth line.

16 A. The second full paragraph, the fourth line.
17 Q. She clearly had lost all trust in the doctors.
18 A. I don't have that in mine.

19 Q. Maybe we are not on the same page.
20 A. Oh, okay. Thank you.
21 Q. Do you agree that is a rather strong statement?

22 A. It is. I felt that at the time I saw her that she
23 really had had a basic break in trust of other
24 people to keep her safe.

25 Q. You know that sounds like a slightly different

1 thing that she lost all trust in the doctors.
2 Would you agree that perhaps that statement is a
3 little strong?

4 A. I think at the time the incident that I was
5 talking about was when she was in the hospital and
6 I believe that she really was terrorized at that
7 moment. Whether or not it meant that she was
8 going to continue to have no trust ever in any
9 doctor, I don't know, but the way she described it
10 and my understanding of it was that she was very
11 frightened. She thought she had died and she was
12 going to die, so I think it was pretty intense at
13 that moment.

14 Q. Okay. The trouble I have is here the way it is
15 phrased seems to me that if she has lost all trust
16 in doctors that that implies that's an ongoing
17 thing?

18 A. I don't know why it implies that.
19 Q. So, when you make that statement it is not
20 necessarily true that she has lost her faith in
21 doctors at this point in time?
22 A. I don't know how she feels about different

23 particular doctors. What I know, what we are
24 talking about, is the traumatic event in the
25 hospital which I think was incredibly -- she was

1 absolutely terrorized.

2 Q. And so she had some fears about the doctors at

3 that point, right?

4 A. She didn't think anybody could keep her safe. She

5 felt like she was dying.

6 Q. How -- I'm sorry to interrupt you.

7 A. That's okay. Go ahead.

8 Q. She didn't even know whether it was successful or

9 not at that point, the attempt to remove her

10 needle, did she?

11 A. This wasn't a cognitive -- she wasn't cognitively

12 assessing her -- her situation. She was very

13 frightened.

14 Q. She was in the hospital and this is a terrible

15 experience to go through, she was in intensive

16 care for a day or two?

17 A. Exactly.

18 Q. Do you know how she interacts with doctors today

19 or do you have an opinion as to how she would

20 react to doctors today?

21 MR. BITTEL: Which question are you

22 asking?

23 BY MR. JORDAN, CONTINUING:

24 Q. I'll actually restate it.

25 You understand that this incident

1 happened with a dentist?

2 A.

Right.

3 Q.

Do you have an opinion as to how Karla would in the future interact or relate to dentists?

4 A.

I think that in general she's going to be very anxious with unfamiliar dentists, especially

5 unfamiliar dentists, and in dentists in general.

6 It is possible with a very special dentist that --

I believe she is anxious about visits to the

7 dentist. In fact her mother corroborated that.

8 Q.

When you say her mother corroborated that, you mean her mother told you -- I will rephrase that.

9 Did Karla's mother tell you that

Karla was anxious about her visits to the dentist?

10 A.

She told me that Karla screamed when she got her tooth pulled.

11 Q.

Have you ever had your tooth pulled?

12 A.

Yeah.

13 Q.

How old were you? I'm sorry. I don't mean to pry.

14 A.

I had anesthesia so it really --

15 Q.

Does it strike you as unusual anyone much less a child would scream when they have their tooth pulled?

16 A.

It doesn't strike me as unusual that Karla would

1 scream when she had her tooth pulled given what

2 she dealt with.

3 Q. I'm trying to compare Karla's reaction with some

4 of my own or some people I see that are perfectly

5 normal.

6 A. Some people don't like dentists, let's face it.

7 Q. And whether you like dentists or not, the fact you

8 have a tooth pulled might cause you some pain and

9 might cause you to scream, right?

10 A. Could be.

11 Q. And is that all Mrs. Spehar told you about Karla's

12 reactions or interactions with dentists since the

13 time of this incident?

14 A. She mentioned that, I'm not clear about exactly

15 what the procedure was, but that Karla had to go

16 to — go back to the same dentist or another

17 dentist for some impression in her mouth and that

18 was also very difficult for her.

19 Q. Now, are you aware that Karla said she likes going

20 to her new dentist, did you ever hear that?

21 A. I had some sense of it. I don't know where I

22 heard it but that. I don't know if it was Mrs.

23 Spehar or what.

24 Q. Did Mr. Bittel perhaps tell you that's what she

25 said during her deposition?

1 A. No. No. No. 1
2 Q. There is nothing wrong with that? 2
3 A. No. I'm not saying that he didn't but I don't 3
4 remember him saying that. 4
5 Q. Does it strike you as odd that she likes going to 5
6 her new dentist? 6
7 A. I think it is great if this person could have 7
8 calmed her, reassured her and dealt with her in 8
9 such a way that could help her overcome her 9
10 anxiety about dentists, that's a terrific thing. 10
11 Q. Could it also indicate that her anxiety over 11
12 dentists aren't as great perhaps as people that 12
13 are looking at this incident might think they are? 13
14 A. I don't know what the interaction is with this 14
15 particular dentist. I don't know exactly what's 15
16 going on there. 16
17 Q. Well, do you know if she had refused to go to the 17
18 dentist and hated to go to the dentist, wouldn't 18
19 that be significant in rendering your opinion as 19
20 to what her anxiety level is with regard to 20
21 dentists? 21
22 A. That would be very -- that would be an additional 22
23 piece of information, absolutely. 23
24 Q. It would indicate to you that she had a high 24
25 degree of anxiety over dentists, correct? 25

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Now, isn't it also significant if she doesn't have
3 any anxiety over dentists?

4 A. It corroborates my feeling that Karla can be made
5 to feel comfortable with certain people but that
6 she has anxiety about medical procedures in
7 general and dental procedures in general.

8 Q. Later on you mention that Karla has been difficult
9 to manage in subsequent medical visits. What
10 information do you have that indicates that she's
11 been difficult to manage in subsequent medical
12 visits?

13 A. This is referring to -- I have in mind subsequent
14 medical reports became sources of
15 retraumatization.

16 Q. And it goes on to say and she would become
17 panicked in these situations and difficult to
18 manage. I'm sorry. I'm paraphrasing. If I do it
19 inaccurately stop me.

20 A. Okay. That's her mother's report about the
21 difficulty when she had to go get x-rayed after
22 the incident.

23 Q. The next day after the incident?

24 A. No. No. I think some time later.

25 Q. And what did she say about Karla's reaction to

1 these x-rays?
2 A. I'm not a hundred percent sure it was the x-ray
3 but she talked about having to go to the dentist
4 again for some reason which I'm not exactly sure
5 who it was, whether it was the oral surgeon, the
6 regular dentist or what, but she talked about
7 Karla just being very -- having a very difficult
8 time and not wanting to go.
9 Q. Do you still agree with the statement that
10 subsequent medical visits are sources of
11 retraumatization for Karla?
12 A. It sounds like some are and some aren't still,
13 because you have just told me that the dentist,
14 regular dental visits, aren't so bad. I also have
15 been told by both Karla and her mother that it was
16 very difficult when she got her tooth pulled and
17 that was -- she screamed and really had a hard
18 time. We talked about that already. So, I think
19 that was a retrauma because it is just so
20 connected to the event of when she got hurt.
21 Q. Would you agree with this statement that Karla is
22 in a combat zone of high stress?
23 A. That was my opinion.
24 Q. Is it your opinion today that Karla is in a combat
25 zone of high stress?

1 A. I don't think that she is terrorized about her

2 physical survival today like she was when I first

3 saw her.

4 Q. Would you agree that Karla is in a combat zone of

5 high stress today?

6 A. No, not to the degree that I believed then.

7 Q. Is it your opinion that to this day Karla has

8 never had a period of carefree safety since this

9 incident?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Would you agree that any child who goes through a

12 sudden traumatic loss or traumatic event will

13 never have a carefree moment?

14 A. No.

15 Q. Do you think Karla will ever have a carefree

16 moment in her life again?

17 A. I hope she will.

18 Q. And when will that be?

19 A. I think when the -- when she -- when this issue

20 about her ongoing physical safety can be balanced

21 out so that she can subjectively feel that she is

22 going to be okay on some level.

23 Q. How does she pick up the fact that her physical

24 safety is in jeopardy?

25 A. She's aware that she's got a needle in her jaw.

1 Q. Do you know if she knows where the needle is?

2 A. I think she knows what side it is.

3 Q. And why do you say that?

4 A. What do you mean exactly?

5 Q. How do you know she knows which side of her mouth

6 the needle is on?

7 A. She tells me that she tells children not to punch

8 her in the mouth. I think she has an opinion of

9 where it is.

10 Q. Is that significant?

11 A. In what way is that significant?

12 Q. The fact that she knows where the needle is in her

13 mouth?

14 A. Significant in the sense of what?

15 Q. Well, I originated these questions by saying how

16 does Karla know her physical safety is in jeopardy

17 and you indicate well she knows the needle is in

18 her mouth?

19 A. The sense I have is that her feeling is that if

20 she -- what she knows most if she gets hurt or hit

21 that something bad could happen, that the needle

22 could move and she could get hurt. That's

23 something she has been living with for a couple of

24 years.

25 Q. Could it be better for her psychological

1 well-being if she didn't know say which side of
2 the mouth the needle was on, say if she had
3 forgotten that, would that indicate that may be
4 she is not as stressed out if that had been the
5 case?
6 A. I don't think that would tell us anything. She
7 may not want to know about a lot of things. Are
8 you saying would it tell us if she is less anxious
9 knowing?
10 Q. The fact that she does know where it is doesn't
11 tell us anything either, does it?
12 A. I think the fact that she knows she has a
13 condition that could in her mind be potentially
14 life-threatening is the main point.
15 Q. How does she know this is life-threatening? This
16 isn't life-threatening, is it?
17 A. Well, statistical probability and subjective is a
18 little bit different.
19 Q. Okay. That's fair enough. Don't children know
20 that they could get hit by a car if they cross the
21 street?
22 A. Yeah. But she almost died, Mr. Jordan. She
23 almost died. She remembers that. She talked
24 about that part. I think that that has an effect
25 on her ongoing perception of her health.

1 Q. Why did she almost die?
2 A. Because of the surgery and the reaction.
3 Q. And the malignant hypothermia?
4 A. Yes. But this needle is kind of a marker for her,
5 how she perceives it. This needle is there.
6 Q. If she was in a mere car accident would she have
7 the same sort of stress, anxiety and depression,
8 if she almost died in a car accident but had no
9 physical injuries?
10 A. I don't think it would be quite the same. I think
11 it would be very bad. I meant I think she would
12 have a lot of stress, a near-death experience, but
13 the difference is that this is ongoing in her
14 mind.
15 Q. Has anyone told her that she's perfectly healthy?
16 A. I think the family is trying to reach a balance of
17 caution as well as being able to live with this
18 issue, and I think they are working with her. I
19 think she would benefit from that very much.
20 Q. Would Karla be better off without any physical --
21 without any constraints on her physical
22 activities, better off psychologically?
23 A. If she had no constraints? And you're telling me
24 that there would be no danger of her getting hurt?
25 Q. I'm not asking about whether she would be better

1 off physically. I'm just asking -- we will leave

2 that to the medical doctor what would happen to

3 her. I'm just asking you psychologically --

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. -- speaking, would she be better off without any

6 physical constraints on her activities?

7 A. Yes. If she felt she could do whatever she wanted
8 and would not have to worry being hurt that

9 could -- that would be beneficial.

10 Q. Did you ever tell her parents that?

11 A. When I first met them I did tell them that I think
12 they needed to know what they were really up

13 against so that they could try to balance their

14 need to protect their daughter with her need to

15 have a zone of carefree or some modicum of relief

16 from the combat zone of stress that I really felt

17 she was in.

18 Q. Did Karla ever mention a man by the name of Ricky?

19 A. No.

20 Q. Why do you say Karla's future life has all been

21 organized around this event?

22 A. The reason I said that is because of her emphasis

23 on wanting to stay with the family and not having

24 any kind of idea of having a life apart from the

25 family. Even her career choice was I believe a

1 desire to help, to be a nurse, to help people like

2 her, that it just had influenced her thinking.

3 Q. Do you think that is true of most nurses?

4 A. What's that?

5 Q. They had some event that made them desire to help

6 people so that's why they became nurses?

7 A. Could be.

8 Q. Do you think Karla's situation is similar to a

9 combat environment?

10 A. I think honestly that she perceives that she has

11 to be vigilant and she doesn't feel she can just

12 throw it -- throw caution to the wind and be safe.

13 That's what I meant by combat zone. Kind of

14 hypervigilant. I really believe that's how she

15 feels.

16 Q. Would you agree that that hypervigilance, that's

17 not just in Karla, you see that in other children

18 who have not had traumatic events happen to them

19 as well?

20 A. Well, I need to know about these other cases. I

21 don't know. Nothing comes to mind right now.

22 Q. Well, don't you think many children live a very

23 ord -- live in a very ordered, protective

24 environment because of the conditions their

25 parents or the environment their parents create

1 for them?

2 A. A very protected life, yes.

3 Q. Would you agree that a fair description of the

4 Spehar household is that it is a pressure cooker?

5 A. I was referring more to her psychological state.

6 Q. So, her psychological state --

7 what page are you on?

8 Q. Page sixteen, the second to last paragraph.

9 A. Page sixteen, second to last paragraph?

10 Q. Yes.

11 A. Yeah. That was more reference to her emotional

12 world, her own feelings underneath.

13 Q. Do you feel this incident with the needle isolates

14 Karla from other people?

15 A. Somewhat I do.

16 Q. Are you aware -- what evidence suggests that Karla

17 may unconsciously blame her mother for this

18 incident?

19 A. I suggested that possibility based on her answers

20 to some projective tests and -- let's see. What

21 page are we on here?

22 Q. I'll break it down and ask you. I'll just note I

23 interrupted your answer there to keep it moving

24 here a little bit.

25 A. Okay.

1 Q. I take it you agree then that Karla
2 unconsciously -- let me strike that.
3 Can you state with a reasonable
4 degree of psychiatric certainty that Karla
5 unconsciously blames her mother for this incident
6 with the needle?
7 A. I don't know if I -- I wouldn't say definitely. I
8 think that she either blames herself or
9 somebody --
10 Q. I got to interrupt so you know the context. When
11 we say psychiatric certainty it is probability,
12 you can give your opinion on a probability, and so
13 given that would you agree that Karla
14 unconsciously blames her mother for this event?
15 A. I would prefer to say it another way.
16 Q. Okay. But unfortunately I get to ask the
17 questions here, so I'm going to ask you can you
18 state with a reasonable degree of scientific
19 certainty, meaning that it is more probable than
20 not, that Karla unconsciously blames her mother
21 for this incident?
22 A. I believe that she feels that her mother couldn't
23 protect her. Whether she thinks her mother wanted
24 to hurt her is something else, but I think she
25 feels that her mother could not keep her safe.

Q. The question was does she unconsciously blame her

mother?

A. I don't know for sure.

Q. Now, there is another statement in there that

Karla devalues women as unable to be strong and

competent. That strikes me as an extremely strong

statement. I'm going to ask you the same question

within the same parameters. Can you state with a

reasonable degree of psychiatric certainty,

meaning more probable than not, that as a result

of this needle incident Karla devalues women as

unable to be strong and competent?

A. I believe that she has doubts about the ability of

some adults to keep her safe. Whether it is women

or men, that's not clear. In her stories there

was some indication that the mother figure

couldn't help the child because the mother figure

was in trouble herself and so the father was

looked to for help. Whether or not this really

means that, this is something that is -- is --

I'm not able to say with a hundred percent

certainty.

Q. Again, and I'm not asking you for a hundred

percent certainty.

A. Okay. That's why I use may.

1 Q. And that's why I'm asking you about a reasonable

2 degree of medical certainty which is more probable
3 than not.

4 A. Reasonably I believe that she feels that people
5 didn't keep her safe and she has feelings about

6 that.

7 Q. Now, let me back up a bit.

8 A. Okay.

9 Q. This statement here says Karla devalues women as
10 being unable to be strong and competent. It is
11 not she feels bad about people couldn't protect

12 her, right?

13 A. Okay. I answered already, I think.

14 Q. I'm sorry I missed the answer.

15 A. Okay.

16 Q. Can you state with a reasonable degree of medical
17 certainty whether Karla devalues women as unable
18 to be strong and competent?

19 A. I think -- I'm trying to respond honestly -- I

20 think there was some indirect evidence in the

21 first interview that she somehow saw her mother as

22 not being able to protect her and was looking to

23 somebody else to be strong and omnipotent to

24 protect her.

25 Q. Can you state with a reasonable degree of medical

1 certainly whether Karla devalues women as unable
2 to be strong and competent?
3 A. Women in general, no.
4 Q. How about men in general?
5 A. I don't have an opinion on that.
6 MR. BITTEL: What did you say, no?
7 MS. HENRY: She has no opinion.
8 MR. JORDAN: No opinion as to men.
9 BY MR. JORDAN, CONTINUING:
10 Q. Would you agree or is it your opinion and can you
11 state with a reasonable degree of medical
12 certainty that Karla devalues her mother as unable
13 to be strong and competent?
14 A. I think she does in some ways.
15 Q. I'm a little uncertain when you say she does in
16 some ways. Are you stating it is more probable
17 than not that Karla devalues her mother as unable
18 to be strong and competent?
19 A. I think it is complicated because I think that she
20 is very close to her mother and she feels
21 supported by her mother and safer with her mother
22 than outside in the world, but in this particular
23 incident I do think she's affected by the fact
24 that her mother did not keep her safe, and I think
25 that that is a piece of it.

1 Q. Did her father --

2 A. I'm sorry.

3 Q. Did her father keep her safe in this incident?

4 A. No.

5 Q. Does she feel the same way about her father?

6 A. I really don't know.

7 Q. Would you make the same assessment if any medical

8 emergency had come up with Karla? Would she feel,

9 geez, my mother didn't protect me from this

10 appendectomy and maybe not subconsciously, I was

11 articulating that, but would she feel that

12 subconsciously?

13 A. Kids tend to try to explain why something happens

14 to them and it is not rationale, but at a very

15 young age they expect their parents to protect

16 them from all harm even though it is unrealistic.

17 Q. So, it is fair to say we are all -- when we are

18 children, we view our parents as somewhat

19 omnipotent, and when something unusual or negative

20 happens that irritates our psyche a little bit in

21 that regard, is that fair to say?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Would you say that is not at all unhealthy to

24 happen to learn to say that your parents are not

25 omnipotent?

1 A. That's a very good point. It is very important
 2 when it happens, you know, in development. If it
 3 happens it has to happen optimally at a certain
 4 point when the child has enough skills when they
 5 can feel and stand on their own. The problem
 6 happens when it happens much too soon, too early,
 7 that they felt like I got to take care of myself
 8 but I don't feel able to take care of myself but
 9 they are not helping, that's the problem.
 10 Q. And would you agree that different children are
 11 able to cope with that at different ages depending
 12 on their own cognitive skills and abilities,
 13 correct?
 14 A. Well, there is some variation.
 15 Q. Could you give a range of variation meaning what
 16 ages did children typically learn say that their
 17 parents are not omnipotent?
 18 A. I think when they are getting into elementary
 19 school years.
 20 Q. Elementary, six or five?
 21 A. Seven, eight and nine, ten. That's the age of
 22 developing their own skills and focusing on what
 23 they can do.
 24 Q. Is that associated with going to school once they
 25 are starting to go out on their own away from home

1 and starting to learn to handle things by their

2 own?

3 A. They still idealize adults.

4 Q. But not to the same extent when they are at home

5 and that's their whole world?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Once they are beginning to deal with kids on their

8 own, it is a little different than when they are

9 at home always relying on adults?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. In your opinion can you state, and can you state

12 to a reasonable degree of medical certainty,

13 whether or not Karla Spehar feels that she did

14 something to deserve having this incident with the

15 needie?

16 A. I believe with a reasonable degree of certainty

17 that she may have feelings like that in trying to

18 explain it to herself.

19 Q. And that's part of what I guess the answer we just

20 went through, that that's how children cope with

21 these different events?

22 A. I'm sorry.

23 Q. Go ahead. You are better able to explain than I

24 am. Is that an abnormal reaction for a child?

25 A. They come up with theories. The theories tend not

1 to be true to reality but yes, they come up with theories, and that's one of the things that therapy can help with is help clarify some of that later on in life.

5 Q. Did you review Doctor Brinich's report? I noticed
6 it in your file.
7 A. Yes. I saw it.

8 Q. I take it that since it is dated October 17, 1990
9 that it did not play a role in your report or in
10 your opinions or conclusions in this case?
11 A. No.
12 Q. Just so the record is clear, you did see Karla
13 after October 17 of 1990?

14 A. Yes.
15 Q. Did anything Doctor Brinich wrote in his opinion
16 affect or was it significant in your opinion as
17 you sit here today as to Karla Spehar's
18 psychiatric state?

19 A. No.
20 Q. Do you know why you have it?
21 A. It was one of the things I was given and I
22 wanted -- I read it.

23 Q. More curiosity then?
24 A. Yeah. Well, I don't know why I have it exactly
25 but I was interested in what he had to say. I

1 didn't know he had moved because he was taking --

2 he was seeing the family.

3 Q. Is it relevant what another psychologist -- is it

4 relevant what another psychologist -- what another
5 psychologist concludes or opinions are on a

6 particular child?

7 A. Relevant for them, sure.

8 Q. How about relevant for you?

9 A. I know what I know based on what I saw and what I

10 evaluated. I don't know what he -- you know, how

11 he experienced her, what he found. I read this.

12 Q. Do you have any reason to disagree or -- well,

13 excuse me.

14 Different psychologists have

15 different philosophical orientations, is that

16 accurate?

17 A. That's true.

18 Q. Those orientations are based in part on their

19 training?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. They are also based in part on their own

22 upbringing and their own personal experiences?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Now, are you aware that Doctor Brinich's

25 deposition was taken last Saturday in North

1 Carolina?
 2 A. Yes.
 3 Q. And did anyone summarize for you or tell you some
 4 of the things Doctor Brinich said during his
 5 deposition?
 6 A. Mr. Bittel did.
 7 Q. And what did -- do you recall just briefly?
 8 A. Very little.
 9 Q. What was that?
 10 A. That she was not psychotic, doing fairly well
 11 under the circumstances and that she would -- that
 12 she was experiencing anxiety. I'm not sure about
 13 that one. Very little actually.
 14 Q. Okay. Would you agree that Karla is not
 15 psychotic?
 16 A. Yes.
 17 Q. Would you agree that Karla is doing fairly well?
 18 A. Yes. Behaviorally.
 19 Q. Well, Doctor Brinich didn't limit his opinion to
 20 behaviorally, he said she was just doing fairly
 21 well both emotionally and physically, would you
 22 agree with that statement?
 23 A. I think she is doing reasonably well.
 24 Q. Both emotionally and physically?
 25 A. No. I wouldn't agree with that.

1 Q. Because Doctor Brinich, I wasn't asking medical
2 questions of either, we're asking about the
3 emotional state, and Doctor Brinich said that she
4 was emotionally doing fairly well?
5 A. I don't agree with that. I don't agree.
6 Q. How do you account for the fact that, you know,
7 you and Doctor Brinich both examined this child
8 over a period of time and reached different
9 conclusions just say on that basic point of
10 whether she is doing fairly well or not?
11 A. I can't. I mean he did what he did and he came to
12 his conclusions. I did the best I could do with
13 what I know and how I have been trained, and I
14 understand that he also focused his intervention
15 efforts on the parents which is not necessarily,
16 you know, wrong. People intervene at different
17 points but I saw Karla, that's what I did, and I
18 did projective tests and doll play, and I
19 evaluated her, and I came to the conclusions that
20 I came to and that's all really I can say about
21 her.
22 Q. Do you understand that Doctor Brinich was actually
23 offered as to Karla psychiatric state and not on
24 the parent's psychiatric state?
25 A. He saw her, I know that.

1 Q. And he saw her --

2 A. Doctor Wortman wanted to refer Karla to him and

3 that's where we started.

4 Q. Let me ask you this, is it typical in your

5 experience that different psychologists examine a

6 child and reach different conclusions?

7 A. Yes. It can be. Not typical but it can happen.

8 Q. Have you ever been in a lawsuit where different

9 psychologists did not reach different conclusions?

10 A. They did not?

11 Q. Yes.

12 A. Yes. Well, maybe you could tell me more what you

13 mean. Give me an example.

14 Q. It seems to me based on my experience every case

15 I've ever been there is one psychologist that says

16 one thing and another psychologist that says

17 another thing. Has that been your experience in

18 lawsuits?

19 A. No. I don't have that experience to comment on

20 that.

21 Q. Do you think that Karla will have a hard time in

22 enjoying some of the normal physical activities of

23 normal childhood?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. In fact, it is difficulty enjoying some of these

1 normal activities because she is not allowed to do them?

3 A. No. Because she doesn't -- she doesn't -- well, I think she is allowed more now but because she stays so close to home she doesn't even go riding around the block, for instance.

7 Q. Are there any other physical activities that she does not do?

9 A. She stays away from a whole class, anyone that is rambunctious she just stays away from.

11 Q. Do you think Karla Spehar will have any special difficulties -- let me put this in perspective again.

14 Can you state with a reasonable

15 degree of medical certainty that Karla Spehar will have special difficulties in making decisions on whom to marry because of this needle incident which occurred at age three and a half?

19 A. I think she's going to have trouble in -- I think that's a strong possibility that she could have trouble in being able to make a marriage

22 commitment.

23 Q. You know my practice by now, if I don't get what I perceive to be an answer to the question, I reask it.

1 A. Go again. Okay. Let's try. I'm not trying to --

2 I just --

3 Q. Understand that anything is possible and so

4 experts are allowed to testify under the law if
5 they have an opinion that something is more
6 probable than not. There could be a range of

7 possibilities as to what could happen to Karla,

8 correct?

9 A.

Yes.

10 Q.

You indicated a number in your report, all I'm

11 trying to focus on now are what things are more

12 probable than not, and we have identified that in

13 the law as psychological certainty. When I ask

14 that question that's all I'm trying to get at?

15 A.

Okay.

16 Q.

Not whether it is a possibility.

17 A.

I think --

18 Q.

I will restate it so the record is clear.

19

Can you state that it is more

20

probable than not that Karla Spehar will have

21

special difficulties in making decisions on whom

22

to marry because of this needle incident which

23

occurred at age three and a half?

24 A.

Yes.

25

Q. Can you state with a reasonable degree of medical

1 certainty that Karla will have special
 2 difficulties in making decisions on whether to
 3 have children because of this needle incident
 4 which occurred at age three and a half?

A.

Yes.

Q. Are you aware of any medical procedures which

7

Karla cannot undergo?

A.

No.

Q. Would you agree that Karla has no unpleasant

10

conscious memories of the needle — excuse me —

11

of the needle incident?

A.

No, I would not agree. She has conscious memories

13

of the unpleasantness. Was that your question?

Q.

Yes.

15

A. Yes. Not of the exact time that the needle broke

16

but of the incident, I'm clarifying, of the

17

incident in the hospital.

Q.

Of having the incident?

19

A. Right. She remembered half the incident and of

20

the actual time in the dentist office and then she

21

clearly remembered waking up in the hospital.

Q.

Has Karla told you what will happen if the needle

23

moves?

A.

Yes. Her first time I met her.

25

Q. Did you ask her?

1 A. NO.

2 Q. Did you say -- she volunteered?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. What did she say?

5 A. She talked about having to be careful with her
6 mouth. I said why. She said because I don't want
7 to die.

8 Q. What licenses do you have by the way?

9 A. I have a license to practice in Michigan as a

10 clinical psychologist.

11 Q. As a --

12 A. As a clinical psychologist. I'm a fully licensed

13 clinical psychologist.

14 Q. In Michigan?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Have you ever used any needles?

17 A. No.

18 Q. Would you agree that Karla would be better off

19 psychologically speaking if she did not remember

20 anything about this whole incident?

21 A. I think it is too late for that. I don't think it

22 matters at this point.

23 Q. All right. I'll ask the question again. I'm just

24 saying hypothetically if she didn't remember

25 anything about this incident would she be better

1 off psychologically?

2 MR. BITTEL: You mean if there is some

3 way to brainwash her?

4 BY MR. JORDAN, CONTINUING:

5 Q. No. I meant what I said. I've asked Karla and

6 she said I don't remember anything about that

7 incident.

8 A. No. I don't think she would be better off. I

9 really don't. Because it is already there and it

10 is going -- in fact, the main thing about

11 therapy is to help you remember some

12 things that you don't remember but that

13 are having an impact on you.

14 Q. So, on the one hand there are certain things that

15 you're saying she is better off not remembering

16 and there is other things she is better off

17 remembering?

18 A. When did I say there are --

19 Q. Didn't you indicate that she is downplaying

20 certain things?

21 A. I'm saying that's her coping mechanism.

22 Q. And is there anything wrong with that coping

23 mechanism?

24 A. It is kind -- it is natural and necessary but it

25 is not without its costs. That's my only point.

Q. Does Karla Spehar exhibit any symptoms of phobic

anxiety?

A. I think she does.

Q. How come you didn't list that in your report?

A. I talked about it in a descriptive way.

Q. Does Karla Spehar exhibit any symptoms of paranoid

ideation?

A. No.

Q. Does Karla Spehar exhibit any symptoms of

psychosis?

A. No.

Q. Does Karla Spehar exhibit any symptoms of

somatization?

A. Not that I'm aware of. Although, the blacking-out

may be able to be categorized in that way.

Q. Would you agree that most people in our society

have some degree of psychiatric symptoms?

A. Yes, I would.

Q. Is that true for most children as well above the

age of three?

A. As you get older it is more true but I'll agree on

that.

Q. It is not abnormal?

A. Older kids.

Q. It is not abnormal for individuals to exhibit

1 psychiatric symptoms?
 2 A. To be anxious and depressed at times, no.
 3 Q. Most of us are anxious and depressed at times?
 4 A. That's correct. Not at this level.
 5 Q. When you say this level, are you referring to
 6 Karla's age or to the degree of anxiety?
 7 A. The degree of her anxiety. The degree of her
 8 anxiety and fear.
 9 MR. BITTEL: Can I interrupt? Off the
 10 record.
 11 (Whereupon a discussion was had off the
 12 record.)
 13 BY MR. JORDAN, CONTINUING:
 14 Q. Is it your opinion that Karla has some reluctance
 15 and anxiety about playing team sports?
 16 A. I don't know particularly about that.
 17 Q. Well, in light of her psychiatric state would you
 18 expect her to have some anxiety about playing team
 19 sports?
 20 A. Yes, I would.
 21 Q. Are you familiar with the term infantile amnesia?
 22 A. Yes.
 23 Q. What is that?
 24 A. It is amnesia for events that happen when you were
 25 very young.

1 Q. What age does that typically set in? 25

2 A. I'm not exactly sure. It can be different but 24

3 usually some people -- most people don't have 23

4 memories before two, some before three. 22

5 Q. Would you expect Karla to eventually forget what 21

6 happened in regards to the incident in the 20

7 hospital in the dentist office? 19

8 A. She could, yes. In fact, she is sort of saying 18

9 she forgot about it already. 17

10 Q. How do you determine what the cause of a 16

11 psychiatric symptom is? 15

12 A. You make an assessment based on varying lines of 14

13 evidence, and you can't say with a hundred percent 13

14 certainty about what causes what because causality 12

15 is too complicated. It is like any other field, 11

16 and it is not ever linear with psychological 10

17 conditions, it's multi-determined and influenced 9

18 by lots of factors, however, basically the 8

19 stronger the stressor the more that you can expect 7

20 that that will be a greater percentage of the 6

21 cause. 5

22 Q. Well, how do you determine what the greater degree 4

23 of stressor is? 3

24 A. If something is out of the range of normal human 2

25 experience considered to be a trauma that then 1

1 would be considered more causal and determining
2 than other factors.

3 Q. It troubles me a little bit the use of the phrase
4 out of the range of normal human experiences
5 because I would assume from your testimony that
6 the loss of a parent has an adverse psychological
7 effect on people but that's also not out of the
8 normal range of human experience?

9 A. It is for a child to lose a parent before age
10 sixteen. That is untimely. That's considered not
11 what they are supposed to do.

12 Q. All right. I guess the same is true for -- well,
13 are black-outs out of the range of normal
14 experience, the type of black-out --

15 A. I see that more as a manifestation of some
16 condition. It is not that it is of an event that
17 is happening although it can of course have an
18 effect.

19 Q. Well, wouldn't you expect Karla's parents to have
20 certain anxiety over their child if they saw Karla
21 pass out for one to two minutes unconscious with
22 her body being very stiff and her eyes closed,
23 don't you think?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Wouldn't that contribute to Karla's parents being

1 perhaps a little overprotective of their child?

2 A. It might. It might. I would agree they would be
3 anxious about that.

4 Q. Certainly if it happened to your kid or mine, we
5 might look or more carefully scrutinize the
6 activities the child was involved in if we had
7 seen this happen on several occasions?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. And as a result of the parents' concerns for the
10 child over just these black-out episodes now,
11 don't you think the child will pick up some of the

12 parents' feelings and overprotectiveness?

13 A. The child is going to pick up whatever. If the
14 parents are anxious about the child's safety
15 whether it is about dying or living or medical
16 problems such as black-outs, the child will be
17 responsive to that.

18 Q. You'd indicated earlier that the black-out -- you
19 had understood that the black-outs were a reaction
20 to some stress that Karla had, is that correct?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Do you know -- did anyone tell you what sort of
23 stress Karla was under or what the stressor was
24 that caused these black-outs?

25 A. No. What -- well, yes. What I heard about was

1 the time she blacked out the first day of school

2 first grade.

3 Q. Were you aware she had blacked out prior to this

4 needle incident?

5 A. Yes. You just told me.

6 Q. But prior to today had you ever heard that?

7 A. No. No.

8 Q. Now, you had attributed black-outs the first day

9 of school to what?

10 A. Stress.

11 Q. From being the first day of school?

12 A. Yeah. Karla has stress about changes and doing

13 new things.

14 Q. And would you agree that if she had blacked out

15 prior to this incident that that would indicate

16 that Karla had some degree of stress prior to this

17 incident?

18 A. It might. You don't know. I can't speculate on

19 what happened but, yes, if in fact there is no

20 physical basis which I don't know.

21 Q. Well, why don't we assume for the moment there is

22 no physical basis, doctors have examined her and

23 there is no indication that there is any physical

24 problems, so we'll operate with that assumption

25 that there is no physical reason for these

1 black-outs.

2 Does her black-out episodes

3 indicate to you that she has some degree of

4 stress?

5 A. It indicates that that's how she expresses that

6 stress. I don't -- I'm not -- I'm just not in a

7 position to know what stress she was under before

8 October.

9 Q. Right. Fair enough. If there are multiple

10 stressors in her say within a year period of time,

11 within the age of two and a half to three and a

12 half for a child, how can you determine what the

13 cause of psychiatric symptoms that you would see

14 evidenced in a child at age five, how do you go

15 about determining them?

16 A. You use your best clinical judgment and it is

17 difficult to disentangle if the stressors are of

18 equal magnitude. If they are not of equal

19 magnitude then it is not as difficult. Besides

20 that in the indirect play the issues may come out

21 about what the worries are related to.

22 Q. Well, in this case you're asking Karla a lot of

23 questions during your interviews about the needle

24 and doctors and dentists, correct?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. And you really weren't aware of the black-outs at the time you interviewed her?

2 A. No, I wasn't. Right, I wasn't.

3 Q. You are not asking her about the type of stress or stressors that would have occurred in around those times, correct?

4 A. About the black-out, right. That's correct.

5 Q. Now, did you ask her, Karla, any questions about whether she had any close friends or family friends or relatives who had died?

6 A. We didn't talk about that, no.

7 Q. So, you never asked her any questions about how she felt when her grandparents died?

8 A. No.

9 Q. Were you aware that a month before this needle incident happened that the grandmother she was very close to had passed away?

10 A. I'm aware now that there was some relatives that died. I did not know it then.

11 Q. Were you aware that the relative who died was a very close grandmother to Karla, very close to Karla?

12 A. No, I was not aware of that.

13 Q. Were you aware that Karla went to the funeral home and saw her grandmother at the wake just a month

14 25

was involved in, since, that would be a threat to

Q. So, if there was a near-car accident that Karla

more.

the self then that would weight that stressor

issues, the closer to the self and the threat to

So, just in terms of psychic and physical survival

loss or threat of loss to self is the closest.

is not quite as bad as a mother loss, then the

that a grandparent loss, even a close grandparent,

danger is to the self. For instance, I say though

deposition that it has to do with how close the

A. I would refer back to my answer earlier on in the

well-being?

significant in their effect on Karla's psychiatric

and weigh and evaluate which of these is more

doctor as a second stressor, how do you compare

her as one stressor and this incident with the

death of the -- her grandmother who was close to

Q. Now, in comparing the stressors and if we use the

A. Yes.

an adverse psychological impact on Karla?

grandmother whom she was very close to would have

Q. Would you agree that that -- the death of a

A. No. I wasn't aware of that at the time.

before this incident?

1 herself would you say that the psychological

2 impact of that incident would be more serious than
3 the loss of -- the stress caused by the loss of a
4 grandparent who is very close to her?

5 A. If the accident happened, you mean near-miss
6 meaning nothing happened, or there was a crash and
7 she was hurt but not killed?

8 Q. No physical injury to her.

9 A. I would think the accident would be if it were a
10 bad accident and there was some physical -- no
11 physical at all?

12 Q. No physical at all.

13 A. Well, it is hard for me to speculate because --
14 but I think if she experienced she could have died
15 and almost did and perhaps somebody else was hurt
16 in the other car or something like that, then I

17 think that would be a real stressor. I'm not
18 wanting to say which would be greater, but I think
19 I would lean that the closer to the self the more

20 that stressor is affecting her if she is worried
21 about her own physical survival.

22 Q. Would the loss of a close family friend be a

23 stressor for Karla at age three and a half?

24 A. It depends on the relationship.

25 Q. I'll just -- it is hard to quantify these things?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. But if we just assume it is a close family friend,

3 somebody that she felt close to and was close to

4 her parent who had died also in and around this

5 time, could that have --

6 A. Yes. It could be stress if it were somebody that

7 she saw a lot and liked and spent time with and

8 looked up to, if all those things were true.

9 Q. If all those things were true would you expect

10 that the death of that person would have an

11 adverse psychological impact on Karla?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Would you agree that the temperament of a child

14 affects how that child will cope with traumatic

15 events?

16 A. Yes, I would.

17 Q. Would you agree that a child's prior experiences

18 affects how that child will cope with the

19 traumatic event?

20 A. Can you be more specific about what kind of prior

21 experiences?

22 Q. Well, could say the death of a close family friend

23 and death of a close grandparent affect how a

24 child will react to this broken needle incident?

25 A. I think, yes, I think it would be able to -- it

1 would influence the child's available coping resources.

2 Q. Would you agree that a child's age and cognitive skills affects how a child will cope with a traumatic event?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. And I take it the older the child is the better able they are --

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. They are able to handle?

7 A. In general terms. There are so many different factors but in general the more coping mechanisms and cognitive abilities to understand the event, yes.

8 Q. Do you agree that support of parent and family structure will affect how the child handle --

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Will you agree that Karla is in a situation where she has a hovering supportive family?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Can terminating the psychoanalytical treatment of a child prematurely adversely affect a child?

13 A. What might happen? How would that termination happen? You mean if the child decides she didn't want to come any more?

1 Q. The child, the parent?

2 A. No. It does matter.

3 Q. And if say the parents decided that the child

4 should no longer receive psychiatric treatment,

5 couldn't that have an adverse effect on the child?

6 A. Yes. If there is some unresolved issues and if

7 the child is experiencing some impairment in

8 functioning, it could.

9 Q. Did you understand that Doctor Brinich terminated

10 the psychiatric treatment of Karla?

11 A. My understanding was that he chose to focus on the

12 family unit as the point of intervention.

13 Q. Well, are you aware that he examined and visited

14 with Karla on at least five different occasions?

15 A. No, I wasn't aware of how many times.

16 Q. Are you aware that he saw Karla much more than he

17 ever saw Mrs. Spehar or Mr. Spehar?

18 A. I don't know that that's true but if you tell me

19 it is my understanding was that's not true but

20 that he saw the parents.

21 Q. Do you think that Doctor Brinich terminated the

22 psychiatric treatment of Karla Spehar prematurely?

23 A. I think he did what he felt was right under the

24 circumstances. It's not my opinion though. It

25 is -- I'm not going to speculate on what he should

1 have done or not should have done based on what he
2 saw.

3 Q. At the time you evaluated Karla did you recommend
4 any continued treatment for Karla Spehar? Let me
5 rephrase that because you saw her twice.

6 After your first visit with Karla
7 Spehar did you recommend any continued treatment
8 for Karla?

9 A. I thought at some point in the future that she
10 would benefit from some therapy around these
11 underlying fears that she was experiencing and I
12 wrote that in my report.

13 Q. Did you recommend any medication for Karla?

14 A. No.

15 Q. Have you ever recommended medication for a child
16 that you've been treating or evaluating?

17 A. No.

18 Q. Is there a reason for that?

19 A. No. I think it is just the cases I have come

20 across. I have, for instance, there may be times
21 when a child might be evaluated to use Ritalin for
22 hyperactivity but in general medication for
23 children I'm conservative with regard to that.

24 Q. Has the passage of time helped Karla Spehar handle
25 this broken needle incident?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. And I take it the passage of time in the future

3 will continue to help her cope with this?

4 A. I'm not -- I don't know exactly what's going to

5 happen in the future.

6 Q. Well, none of us do, right?

7 A. Right.

8 Q. We're just asking your opinion. Would you

9 expect --

10 A. I would hope over time she and the family would be

11 able to -- able to put it in its place.

12 Q. And you would expect that to happen?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Did you ever interview Mr. or Mrs. Spehar with the

15 purpose of evaluating them?

16 A. No.

17 Q. Have you formed any conclusions or opinions as to

18 Mr. or Mrs. Spehar's psychological state?

19 A. No.

20 Q. Ever talked to Doctor Wortman about her

21 conclusions with regard to Mr. and Mrs. Spehar?

22 A. No.

23 Q. Have you had -- I think you indicated there was a

24 phone conversation. Way back early on when I was

25 asking you what information you had and visits

1 you had, you mentioned a phone conversation, who

2 was that with?

3 A. I had a phone conversation around the time I was

4 writing the report to just clarify some things

5 with Mrs. Spehar. Those, I don't know if I wrote

6 it down. It went right in the word processor so I

7 think it is what's in the report. Then I had a

8 phone conversation very briefly with Mrs. Spehar

9 after the second interview just to follow-up on my

10 notes and that was very brief.

11 Q. Do you recall what you or Mrs. Spehar said during

12 either of those phone conversations?

13 A. The first time it was to collect parental report

14 data for a report I've spoken about. The second

15 time I spoke with her on the phone was just to

16 clarify some behavioral things with Karla and --

17 Q. What type of behavioral things?

18 A. Manifestations of anxiety. I was curious if, in

19 addition to some of the things that Mrs. Spehar

20 had already told me, if -- I wanted to know a

21 little bit more around school, if there were any

22 anxieties she was having.

23 Q. What did she tell you?

24 A. She told me that overtime it's gotten better, that

25 she cried during her first three weeks of first

1 grade, which was a problem, and that she's an
 2 overanxious kid in the sense of being preoccupied
 3 with having her lunch ready for tomorrow and
 4 having her clothes just so and that's an
 5 additional thing that's influencing her
 6 functioning at school.
 7 Q. Do you think that is a result of the broken needle
 8 incident or the training Karla's had at home?
 9 A. I think it's Karla's coping with lots of things
 10 including her worry about her anxiety about the
 11 needle.
 12 Q. Do you think Karla would be any different in
 13 regards to her say neatness, I take it she is a
 14 neat child, she likes to keep everything --
 15 A. Just so, right.
 16 Q. Do you think Karla would be any different in that
 17 particular aspect of her personality if this
 18 broken needle incident hadn't happened?
 19 A. I don't know.
 20 Q. What other aspect -- how would you describe
 21 Karla's personality?
 22 A. I think she's a warm appealing kid, she's got a
 23 lot of friends, she is bright, she's
 24 interpersonally engaging, but I think that she has
 25 an underlying sense of burden of heaviness about

1 what she -- which I attribute to all she is
 2 struggling with and fears about being on her own.
 3 Q. And can you state with a reasonable degree of
 4 medical certainty whether she would be any
 5 different with these fears and stress if just this
 6 broken needle incident had not happened to her?
 7 A. I think -- I attribute it to this event as a --
 8 not totally but as a major stressor, I do. Even
 9 with the neatness I want to add going back to the
 10 other question, I really see that as her attempt
 11 to control an uncontrollable world.
 12 Q. Well, you didn't know anything about her
 13 grandmother dying, right?
 14 A. No.
 15 Q. And you didn't know anything about her close
 16 family friend who had died at the time you wrote
 17 the report?
 18 A. No, I didn't.
 19 Q. You didn't know anything about the black-out that
 20 occurred prior to this needle incident, correct?
 21 A. That's correct.
 22 Q. And --
 23 A. I knew about the black-out recently.
 24 Q. Right. Now, since you didn't know about those
 25 incidents, is it fair to say you didn't probe or

1 ask questions of Karla about those incidents?
 2 A. That's fair.
 3 Q. And you also didn't ask Mrs. Spehar about Karla's
 4 behavioral behavior before and after those events,
 5 correct?
 6 A. No, I didn't.
 7 Q. And I take it in light of the absence of the
 8 knowledge you would have gleaned from that
 9 information, it is hard to determine what effect
 10 those instances had on Karla's psychiatric state,
 11 right?
 12 A. That's correct.
 13 Q. And it is hard to determine how those instances
 14 would have interplayed with this broken needle
 15 incident, correct?
 16 A. I think I can say that they will -- they would
 17 have interplayed but they are not -- in my opinion
 18 from hearing about them again as we talked about I
 19 don't put them at the same level as the threat to
 20 her life.
 21 Q. Well, don't you think the black-outs were a threat
 22 to her life?
 23 A. Not to the same degree. I don't see it.
 24 Q. Wouldn't she have perceived it if she had to go to
 25 the hospital and the parents were concerned and

she had to have a CAT scan similar to the CAT scan
 she had here, from her perception what would the
 difference have been?
 A. I think that the needle incident for her just
 looms bigger. I think I would have heard about it
 if it was a worry because I did talk in general
 about her life, about the black-out.
 Q. Is it possible that the needle is just the tip of
 the iceberg?
 A. What do you mean, Mr. Jordan?
 Q. With her fears and distress that you saw, couldn't
 there be a variety of incidents which have caused
 the fears and distress that you saw evident in
 her?
 A. There could be other factors, definitely,
 influencing these.
 Q. Since there is this lawsuit and since you're
 asking her questions about the needle, that her
 answers and her anxiety could seem to be focused
 on this needle when in fact they are related to a
 lot of other factors?
 A. I asked a lot of open-ended questions too so I
 think if it would have been really important it
 would have come out. Other things did. You know,
 I think it would have come out.

1 Q. Did you -- were you involved in the tabulation of
2 any of the results, any of the psychiatric tests
3 that Camille Wortman performed?
4 A. No.
5 MR. JORDAN: That's all.
6 MS. HENRY: Doctor, my name is Delordre
7 Henry and I represent Doctor Orchen in this
8 case.
9 EXAMINATION
10 BY MS. HENRY:
11 Q. You've been involved in two other legal cases
12 where you have given testimony and those have been
13 where there have been death of a spouse or a
14 parent, correct?
15 A. Yes.
16 Q. And were those referrals through Doctor Wortman?
17 A. Yes.
18 Q. Were there psychologists or psychiatrists
19 testifying on the other side at trial or don't you
20 know?
21 A. I don't remember.
22 Q. Okay. How do you get most of your referrals for
23 patients?
24 A. In general?
25 Q. Yes.

1 A. Through physicians here in Ann Arbor, through EAP
 2 representatives.
 3 Q. EAP is what?
 4 A. Employee Assistant Plan, representatives, through
 5 colleagues.
 6 Q. Okay.
 7 A. Professors at the University of Michigan. There
 8 is one professor who refers to me who knows me and
 9 through a general pool of referrals that is
 10 connected with a clinic that I also am affiliated
 11 with.
 12 Q. What clinic is that?
 13 A. Huron Valley Consultation Center.
 14 Q. What do you do for them?
 15 A. Staff psychologist.
 16 Q. You're a staff psychologist there and you have
 17 your own private practice?
 18 A. That's correct.
 19 Q. What percentage of your time is spent in your own
 20 private practice?
 21 A. I would say about fifty to sixty. It varies.
 22 Q. Okay. And what kind of patients do you see
 23 associated with that Huron Clinic?
 24 A. Families, couples and individuals.
 25 Q. You do not confine it to child psychology?

1 A. No.

2 Q. And you don't currently, and it is not your

3 intention to confine your practice to child

4 psychology?

5 A. That's -- no.

6 Q. Okay. Are you still involved at all with Doctor

7 Wortman in the research program that she is

8 involved with associated at the university?

9 A. Not with the research part, no.

10 Q. This research group -- center?

11 A. You mean the Institute for Social Research?

12 Q. Right.

13 A. I'm no longer post-doctoral.

14 Q. How are you still involved with Doctor Wortman?

15 A. From time-to-time she may ask me to do an

16 evaluation as she did for this case.

17 Q. Since this case have you done other evaluations

18 for her?

19 A. Since this one?

20 Q. Yes. Since you did this one?

21 A. Since '89?

22 Q. Yes.

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. How many?

25 A. I don't know. It is a very small part of my

1 general practice.

2 Q. Well, one, two, five, ten?

3 A. I don't keep records. Maybe five.

4 Q. Okay.

5 A. Three. I'm not sure.

6 Q. Doctor, what's the -- is the DSM-II-R a diagnostic

7 manual that is recognized by psychiatrists and

8 psychologists as a tool for classifying patient's

9 psychological disorders?

10 A. It is used in some settings, yes. It is used

11 primarily in medical settings.

12 Q. Isn't it true that psychologists and psychiatrists

13 use the DSM --

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. -- II-R?

16 A. Yes. Most insurance companies require a DSM-II-R

17 diagnosis, it is considered the standard to

18 classify patients for those purposes.

19 Q. It is a manual used by psychotherapists in making

20 diagnoses of patients, correct?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. And it lists criteria symptoms that must be

23 exhibited before the person fits into that

24 diagnostic category, correct?

25 A. That's right.

1 Q. And if they don't fit into the symptomatology outlined there, then it is not appropriate under the DSM-IIIR to make that kind of a diagnosis of the patient, is that correct?

2

3

4 A. That's right.

5 Q. Okay. If there are six symptoms and they say you must have all six, if they have two, then they don't have that particular DSM-III category?

6

7 A. It's not a matter of -- it is not like you have it or you don't. There are -- it is clinically important and useful in talking about a patient to say they have paranoid features without saying they are paranoid personality.

8

9 Q. Okay.

10 A. So, I think -- okay.

11 Q. If you say someone has paranoid ideation, is that a DSM-IIIR category?

12

13 A. No.

14 Q. Is somatization a DSM-IIIR category?

15

16 A. Not to my knowledge.

17 Q. Okay. Is obsessive compulsiveness?

18

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Okay. And if I looked up the obsessive compulsiveness, they would list criteria symptoms that the patient should exhibit in order to fit

21

22

23

24

25

1 into that category, correct? A. That's correct.

2 And you would be expected to make that diagnosis, Q.

3 to have evaluated a patient and determined they exhibited those criteria symptoms? A. Yes.

4 Once they did you would say they have obsessive compulsiveness? A. Yes.

5 Now, you have said today that various psychologists have different views depending on their training, you have agreed to that, correct, different psychological approaches depending on their training? A. Different treatment approaches, yes.

6 Okay. How would you classify yourself? Q.

7 My training has been primarily a combination of psychodynamic training and family systems. Q.

8 And someone who has that kind of training may view what they see in a patient differently than someone who, you have to hold on here, I have all these different notes here, than someone whose trained largely in behavioristic orientation or in cognitive orientation? A.

9 Behavior, you mean behaviorism?

1 Q. Yes. They may have a different equation or
2 approach to evaluating a patient than you do?
3 A. They would have a different approach to treating,
4 and yes, perhaps evaluating as well. I can't
5 really speak to exactly what they would do in
6 terms of evaluation but certainly treating them.
7 Q. Okay. Is it not true that the various tests that
8 we discussed earlier as listed by Mr. Jordan that
9 you could give for a child other than your dream,
10 ask about your dreams and your TAT tests, more the
11 lists when they answer questions specifically,
12 that those have built-in checks to tell whether
13 someone is actually telling you the truth or not?
14 A. Not to my knowledge.
15 Q. Have you ever talked to Karla on the telephone?
16 A. Yes.
17 Q. Okay. When did you talk to Karla on the
18 telephone?
19 A. Following up the second interview, actually it was
20 last night.
21 Q. What was the purpose for talking to Karla last
22 night?
23 A. I wanted to clarify some of the things that I was
24 thinking about in trying to prepare for today.
25 Q. What did you ask Karla last night?

1 A. I remember that when I went over my report, one of
2 the things I was expected to ask was some of the
3 differences between that time and now, and I
4 recognized in going over my second interview that
5 I thought I hadn't asked Karla about whether or
6 not she is still concerned about something
7 happening to her, so I asked her basically if she
8 feels safe more or less in the family. When she
9 first saw me she said she thought about dying a
10 lot, that she worried about it, and also with
11 peers. I followed up on that.
12 Q. Is that in your notes?
13 A. Yes. You have a copy of it. I included that in
14 my file.
15 Q. Okay. That's something that we have today when we
16 came here, is that correct, it says Karla phone?
17 A. Yes.
18 Q. Okay. Which of these notes Karla phone — is that
19 it here?
20 A. Yes. Karla.
21 Q. What does it say peers, question mark, don't feel
22 different but still have to tell them about the
23 needle and then what else does it say there?
24 A. Ask them not to punch her. I have to ask them not
25 to punch me in the mouth.

1 Q. How did that come up? What did you --
2 specifically what did you ask her to determine how
3 she feels about the needle?
4 A. Excuse me?
5 Q. Specifically what question did you ask her last
6 night to determine what she feels about the
7 needle?
8 A. She told me previously that she tells children
9 when she plays with them that, I wondered -- I was
10 just basically saying are you still doing that.
11 Do you still do that or not talk to them about
12 anything.
13 Q. You mentioned to me before you did that, is that
14 still going on, because there had been some
15 changes?
16 A. I was basically just checking to see if what had
17 been true before was true now.
18 Q. Okay. So, you asked her a direct question about
19 that?
20 A. Yes.
21 Q. Okay. In the course of your evaluation of her she
22 did not tell you about that spontaneously while
23 she was discussing the other things with you, did
24 she?
25 A. She talked about peers and said that she's playing

1 better with them and it didn't --

2 Q. She didn't bring up to you in your second meeting

3 the fact that she still tells them not to punch

4 her?

5 A. No. She was not bringing up very much at all in

6 terms of those kinds of issues.

7 Q. Okay. She also feels safe in her family, you

8 asked her about that?

9 A. That I knew. I think it was even in the second

10 interview.

11 Q. You asked her again last night?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Your next one, confirm at times that she does talk

14 about dead relatives, was reticent about it and

15 seems preoccupied with death, is that correct?

16 A. That's correct.

17 Q. How did that come up in your conversation last

18 night?

19 A. Mrs. Spehar talked to me about it.

20 Q. What did she say?

21 A. Basically she said that -- let's see where it came

22 up. Oh, I asked her if she felt that the anxiety

23 about dying was something that Karla talked about

24 at home still, and she said yes, last week, I'm

25 just reading from the notes, she brought home a

1 book from the school library called It Is Okay To
2 Cry About Death and About Somebody Dying, and then
3 she offered that Karla talks to the ground
4 sometimes around times when she is anxious, like
5 when she was getting her tooth pulled she started
6 talking to the ground. She said she was talking
7 to dead relatives, but Karla — I just asked Karla
8 to confirm that and she did and I didn't pursue
9 it. She didn't want to.
10 Q. You said do you sometimes talk with dead
11 relatives?
12 A. I didn't quite say it that way.
13 Q. How did you ask her that?
14 A. I said that her mom said that sometimes you talk
15 to some of your relatives that are no longer here
16 and, you know, she said yes, she did, but she
17 didn't want — she didn't talk anymore about it so
18 I didn't pursue it.
19 Q. You didn't ask her why?
20 A. She said she wanted to.
21 Q. Okay. Remember events, question mark, with the
22 needle. Did you ask her that last night when you
23 talked to her?
24 A. I asked her if she remembered consciously anything
25 about them. In 1989 she told me she did remember

1 about half of it. I asked her, I said thinking

2 back on it do you remember still the time when it
3 all happened and she said not really. I don't

4 even remember what month it happened.

5 Q. Okay. That did not come up at all in your

6 conversation when she was up here meeting with you
7 at the end of October whether she remembered or

8 didn't remember?

9 A. We didn't talk about it again. I was doing -- I

10 was doing other things with her and I didn't --

11 you know, my evaluation wasn't perfect and there

12 were things that I wanted to check up on that I

13 didn't.

14 Q. Let me ask you this, why is it that you saw her a

15 second time in October, end of October of 1990?

16 How did that come about?

17 A. For the purposes of doing an update for evaluation

18 for this matter. I wanted to be able to testify

19 intelligently and be as honest as I could.

20 Q. Okay. How did that become arranged? Did you get

21 called by Mrs. Spehar or Doctor Wortman or how did

22 that happen?

23 A. Yes. Doctor Wortman and then actually I was

24 talking -- I also talked to Mr. Bittel directly.

25 Q. Now, also in your phone notes you have denies

1 feeling mad, cheated, I can't read the rest. Can
 2 you read me the rest?
 3 A. Yeah. Unfair, blame anyone, just an accident.
 4 Q. Okay. Tell me what that -- how that came about?
 5 A. I wanted to know, and sometimes you ask kids if
 6 they will be able to tell you if they blame anyone
 7 for what happened to them, or if they are feeling
 8 mad or cheated or upset, angry, she doesn't have
 9 any angry feelings. She denies them.
 10 Q. You felt that she could tell you truthfully
 11 whether or not she --
 12 A. No. I wanted to see how -- I feel fairly
 13 confident she does have feelings.
 14 Q. You have just an accident here, she said it is
 15 just an accident?
 16 A. Yeah.
 17 Q. Okay. What did Mr. and Mrs. Spehar tell you about
 18 the procedures that occurred after the tooth was
 19 pulled by Doctor Indresano several weeks ago?
 20 A. What do you mean?
 21 Q. What other procedures were performed?
 22 A. Oh, yeah. Right. There was one other one that I
 23 was told about that just happened very recently,
 24 and I don't know really what -- I wasn't clear
 25 what it was about but she had to have an

1 impression, and it didn't go right, and Karla was
 2 upset, her mother was upset and she was -- just
 3 one more bad experience.
 4 Q. Did they talk to you about the fact that she had
 5 teeth filled, tooth filled after that being
 6 pulled, and that that experience went fine?
 7 A. No.
 8 Q. When you talked about -- in the first interview
 9 with Karla you have that she feels she recalls
 10 half of the incident or half of it?
 11 A. Yes.
 12 Q. And if you look at your notes on page two?
 13 A. Is this in the report?
 14 Q. No. It is on your handwritten notes.
 15 A. Yeah.
 16 Q. Okay. You have event and underlined it. Remember
 17 half of it, what did she tell you?
 18 A. These are, I was writing things as she was talking
 19 to me and what she basically said was that she
 20 remembered before and after waking up to the other
 21 doctor, there was another doctor, but she doesn't
 22 remember the actual event.
 23 Q. She does not have any memories associated with any
 24 kind of pain or problem having to do with getting
 25 the infection or getting the tooth restored while

1 In Doctor Orchen's office, is that correct?

A. Yes.

3 Q. What is your understanding of how that part of the
4 day went, actually in Doctor Orchen's office, the
5 pedodontist?

6 A. I understand the events as were told to me.

7 Q. But as to that part and Karla's reaction what do
8 you understand to be her reaction?

9 A. She blocked it all out. She doesn't remember it.
10 Obviously the needle was broken and she is saying
11 I don't remember that part.

12 Q. No. I'm talking about in the beginning when you

13 first evaluated her, what did her parents or Karla
14 tell you about what actually happened in Doctor

15 Orchen's office as to how Karla reacted?

16 A. Oh, she was very upset from what I gathered.

17 Q. When you say she was upset, what was she doing in

18 Doctor Orchen's office?

19 MR. BITTEL: I'm not sure she knows

20 who --

21 BY MS. HENRY, CONTINUING:

22 Q. Doctor Orchen is the pedodontist.

23 A. I do know and I don't know how to respond to that

24 exactly.

25 Q. Was she crying, was she screaming, what was she

doing from your understanding in Doctor Orchen's

office?

A. My understanding is that she increasingly became

upset as time went on.

Q. Okay. Now, you've indicated that in your report

at least that she has become unmanageable I think

was the word as it relates to any kind of visits

to health care providers, and you elaborated on

that earlier as to the loss of trust in doctors,

and you said that was in the hospital incident?

A. I believe I said that she felt that was in the

hospital and also her mother talked about a

subsequent visit which I can't be specific as to

which one she was referring to. It may have been

the x-ray, that Karla felt upset about, and I do

know that she was upset about the tooth pulling.

Q. What's difficult to manage? I mean what did her

mother tell you?

A. She became difficult to deal with. Mother, being

upset with her, yelling at her, just upset.

Q. Can you define what you mean by depression?

You've used that term frequently, what do you mean

by that?

A. Sad, empty, feelings of aloneness, not too valued.

Q. Do you believe that Karla feels she is not too

1 valued?
2 A. I think Karla does feel alone. It is not —
3 Q. My question was do you think Karla feels not too
4 valued?
5 A. Well, I don't know about that specific aspect of
6 it. Depression can encompass a number of these
7 things. It doesn't have to have all of them.
8 Q. Find. Can you define anxiety for me?
9 A. Yes.
10 Q. Okay.
11 A. It is fearful feelings, unsafe feelings, nervous
12 feelings, basically insecurity about certain
13 aspects of life.
14 Q. Now, you know that Karla has this malignant
15 hypothermia and wears a medical alert bracelet all
16 the time or necklace all the time as a result of
17 that, correct?
18 A. Yes.
19 Q. That's kind of unusual for a child of her age to
20 have to wear something like that, is it not?
21 A. Yes.
22 Q. Did you in the course of your inquiring about
23 her various hospitalizations and trips to the
24 dentist ever ask her how she feels about malignant
25 hypothermia which is what she wears the medical

1 alert bracelet for? A. It came up, not directly, only in the discussion
2 that she understood that she had a condition that
3 she couldn't have surgery and so the needle can't
4 come out but -- Q. It was your understanding that Karla felt
5 because -- told you because of the malignant
6 hypothermia she couldn't have surgery? A. She didn't use those words.
7 That it was a condition she had that she couldn't
8 have surgery? A. I'm not exactly sure. I cannot say with certainty
9 honestly. I'm sorry. Q. Okay. What do most children in the five, six and
10 seven-year-old age group want to be when they grow
11 up? If you ask most kids that question what do
12 you think they say? A. It is different. Some want to be what their
13 mother does, some want to be what their father
14 does, some want to be what they see on TV. Very
15 different. Q. It is not unusual for kids in that younger age
16 group to be things like policemen and firemen and
17 doctors and nurses and teachers and those kinds of
18 people that they look up to in society, is it?

1 A. I don't think so.

2 Q. It is not unusual to want to be those things, is

3 that right?

4 A. It may have some meaning for that child but it is

5 not unusual.

6 Q. Where in the school reports did you find any

7 indication that Karla had a problem getting

8 started or doing well in school?

9 A. My understanding was that the teacher spoke with

10 Mrs. Spehar and I got that information.

11 Q. Which teacher was this, what grade?

12 A. Are you talking about the first grade --

13 Q. Well, you said she had problems?

14 A. What I know of first grade is Mrs. Maroney,

15 that's the only thing I'm referring to. The only

16 thing that I know about kindergarten is what Karla

17 told me.

18 Q. You knew she went to preschool and she did all

19 right, you knew she went to kindergarten and she

20 did all right, you know that from looking at the

21 school records, correct?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. It's a big jump going from kindergarten to first

24 grade for most children, isn't it?

25 A. Sometimes it is a big jump from home to first.

1 Different for different kids.

2 Q. Most kindergartens have half days, they are still

3 at home with their mothers a lot, when they go to

4 first grade it is entirely different, it is a

5 whole day of school and they have a little more

6 structure than they did in kindergarten, most kids

7 have some fears about that, don't they?

8 A. I can't -- I don't know that most kids have lots

9 of fears about it. Some kids love school.

10 Q. Is there an indication that Karla doesn't love

11 school?

12 A. Well, there is an indication from the evidence

13 that I have that it hasn't been easy in the

14 beginning part. My understanding now is that she

15 does like school and she's having a good time with

16 it and she's adjusted which is good.

17 Q. Things like going to first grade or going to a new

18 school or moving to a new neighborhood all have an

19 effect on children because it is a change in their

20 environment that they are not used to, correct?

21 A. Right.

22 Q. And if you take a child and move them to a new

23 neighborhood, a new house, and you put them into

24 the first grade which is at a new school where

25 they don't have their same friends, they are not

1 necessarily going to jump right in with both feet
 2 and be right at ease in that new situation, are
 3 they?
 4 A. What do you want me to do, agree or not agree?
 5 Q. Yes. Agree or not agree?
 6 A. I think it can be helpful. I asked them about
 7 that.
 8 Q. You know that Karla did move to a new house?
 9 A. Yes.
 10 Q. Did go to a new school and did go to first grade
 11 all within the last couple of months here?
 12 A. Yes.
 13 Q. That can have an effect on how she is going to
 14 react when she goes to her first grade class,
 15 couldn't it?
 16 A. It could.
 17 Q. And in Karla's case there is no reason to indicate
 18 that did not affect her, those factors?
 19 A. The parents said they built the house and they
 20 were bringing Karla to that neighborhood over time
 21 and the transition was a lot more gradual than
 22 when you get uprooted.
 23 Q. It is different wandering in a new house that is
 24 being built than actually living in a new house
 25 with a new room and new friends, that's much

1 different than going over for a visit while it is
 2 being built, isn't it?
 3 A. Whatever. My belief is that --
 4 Q. It is?
 5 A. It is my understanding that she knew some people
 6 in the neighborhood before she moved in.
 7 Q. Okay. Have the parents talked to you about the
 8 fact that if they were told that this could be
 9 safely removed that they would do it, the needle,
 10 have they told you that?
 11 A. Karla said she wishes it could be taken out.
 12 Q. My question is in talking to Mrs. Spehar I think
 13 you said they understand -- they wish as Karla
 14 does that the needle could be taken out, and that
 15 if it could be safely done they would do it, am I
 16 mischaracterizing your testimony?
 17 A. No. If I said that then I said that. I'm trying
 18 to -- I'm trying --
 19 Q. Do you recall that to be generally true about what
 20 they told you?
 21 A. My recollection is that they are deferring to the
 22 doctors as to what to do. That's what they told
 23 me this last time, this last visit.
 24 Q. Can you tell me what you found out in the course
 25 of your evaluations that Karla actually knew about

whether or not she was dying or got close to dying

in the hospital?

A. What do I know how she --

Q. I want to strike that question.

I want to know in the course of

your evaluation of Karla what did you come to find out from Karla as to whether she actually knew she died or was close to -- I mean was close to dying and how she came to know that?

A. She said she felt that. I have that in my notes.

Q. She felt --

A. She thought she had died. It all seemed too

strange to her but in general I was not going to probe her too directly. I did not want to do that for her sake.

Q. I was interested by something you said earlier on, and it was talking about the whole question of interaction with her parents, and you said

something like she's worried about leaving them,

and you think or she thinks -- you think she is a

little worried that they may get mad at her about,

for example, you said if her mother tells her to

shut the door she cries?

A. That was just one example.

Q. Something that happened?

1 A. She's sensitive.

2 Q. Oh, she is a sensitive little girl, is that what

3 you're saying by that whole incident, that she is

4 sensitive?

5 A. I think she feels like she needs to stay close to

6 her parents.

7 Q. Do you know how much time Karla spent with her

8 mother prior to this incident?

9 A. You mean how many hours?

10 Q. Yeah.

11 A. I know that she spent time with her mother, yeah.

12 Q. Okay. And what do you know about what the parents

13 did with Karla before she went to school when her

14 mother had to go to work?

15 A. My understanding was that she had a babysitter.

16 Q. You don't understand that her mother took her with

17 her?

18 A. That was -- she did that sometimes also, but she

19 mentioned a babysitter named Loraine as well.

20 Q. And there was no problems leaving Karla with

21 Loraine, the babysitter?

22 A. I don't know.

23 Q. Mother didn't say that Karla reacted adversely to

24 that?

25 A. No, not that I'm aware.

1 Q. All right. You also said that you have the sense
2 that Karla doesn't make friends easily but that
3 she has a few trusted peers that she likes to play
4 with?
5 A. I don't know if those were my exact words that she
6 doesn't make friends easily, but my sense is that
7 she doesn't go out to strangers easily. She is
8 warm and appealing when there is a trusted adult
9 around.
10 Q. It is not unusual for any child not to go out to
11 strangers and be warm and appealing when they are
12 around people they know, is it? That's not
13 unusual?
14 A. You mean in class?
15 Q. Anywhere?
16 A. No. That's not what I meant though. I'm talking
17 about within the context of her class, for
18 instance. Some kids are more outgoing than
19 others, that's all.
20 Q. She does make friends?
21 A. Yes.
22 Q. They are just limited in number?
23 A. Yes.
24 Q. She likes to play more with them than she does
25 with a whole group of people?

1 A. Okay.

2 Q. Is that correct?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. That is not an unusual characteristic for a little

5 girl of Karla's age or is it?

6 A. Well, what seems unusual really from my opinion

7 from my evaluation of her, she seems to have a

8 very strong boundary around the larger peer world

9 and her family and a few close friends.

10 Q. Would you say that it would be unusual if, for

11 example, I told you that I'm very close to my

12 family and I have maybe five friends that I've

13 been very close to and that I don't generally

14 reach out and gather in a lot of friends, would

15 you find that to be an unusual characteristic for

16 someone like me?

17 A. It depends on how you feel about it.

18 Q. Okay. And if I am happiest with a limited number

19 of friends and a close circle of family that I

20 like to spend time with, that does not mean that I

21 have psychological problems, does it?

22 A. Only if it limits your ability to transverse the

23 world, the social and material world.

24 Q. You can't tell at this point in Karla's

25 development whether it has limited her ability to

transverse to the social world, can you?

A. I can't predict the future but I am concerned that that's my opinion, that going out and being more independent socially as well as other ways is going to be one of the things she is going to struggle with.

Q. She may have problems doing that or she may not have problems doing that, you can't tell at this point?

A. I can't say anything for hundred percent sure. I'm not asking you that. Listen to my question. She may have a problem or she may not have a problem is what I want to know?

MR. BITTEL: I'm not sure -- I object. I'm not sure if the doctor was finished with her answer.

MS. HENRY: Fine. Go ahead.
THE WITNESS: I don't know where we are right now.

MS. HENRY: Read that back.
(Whereupon a discussion was had off the record.)
(Whereupon the last question is read back.)

THE WITNESS: That I believe she is

1 going to have problems in independent
 2 functioning.
 3 BY MS. HENRY, CONTINUING:
 4 Q. Would it be fair to say that sometimes we have
 5 dreams that are influenced by what we have been
 6 exposed to during the day, whether it be TV or
 7 something that the kids have been talking about at
 8 school?
 9 A. Yes.
 10 Q. Or a movie or something like that?
 11 A. Yes.
 12 Q. Now, you have said to us that, well, that you feel
 13 that Karla's desire to have things perfect and
 14 very neat is a way of her coping with concerns of
 15 safety in organizing the world, is that pretty
 16 much what you said?
 17 A. That can be one interpretation and that's my
 18 belief.
 19 Q. Okay.
 20 A. That is a way of keeping things organized and safe
 21 and calm.
 22 Q. From the very first meeting she was very careful
 23 to tidy up the playroom when she was done talking
 24 to you, is that correct?
 25 A. Yes.

1 Q. I'd like you to look at your notes that you have
2 there that are on the back of one of the drawings
3 that was done. Here it is. On the back of the
4 picture with the rainbow on it?
5 A. Okay.
6 Q. Page ten, I think. Before I ask you about that,
7 let me ask you this, not only was Karla dressed
8 appropriately but she was very meticulously
9 dressed when she came to see you, was she not?
10 A. I don't remember exactly.
11 Q. I mean everything was coordinated, she had
12 earrings on, her hair done nicely, very neat,
13 meticulous and very clean, is that you're
14 recollection of her?
15 A. Yes. Generally.
16 Q. And that would indicate to you that her mother was
17 very meticulous, tidy, clean about them?
18 A. Yes.
19 Q. Now, Eddie who came, was he also very meticulous,
20 tidy?
21 A. I didn't really make a note of it. He wasn't
22 noticeably unkempt.
23 Q. On the back of this picture you have names, Karla,
24 Eddie, daddy?
25 A. Yeah.

1 Q. Okay. What did you do to get these answers? Did
 2 you say, Karla, what do you think of when you're
 3 happy or what makes you happy?
 4 A. Yeah.
 5 Q. She says when I see a rainbow?
 6 A. What makes Karla happy.
 7 Q. And you got these answers from her?
 8 A. Yes.
 9 Q. What makes you excited is your birthday, what
 10 makes her sad is when mommy yells at her, what
 11 makes her scared, thundering, down in the
 12 basement, and then you have mad, question mark,
 13 what does that mean?
 14 A. What makes you mad.
 15 Q. Okay. When I want to leave my --
 16 A. Bed.
 17 Q. -- a mess and mommy cleans it up?
 18 A. Yes.
 19 Q. Okay. And there is another indication under Eddie
 20 what makes him sad, I think, or third one down?
 21 A. Yeah.
 22 Q. When mommy cleans it up?
 23 A. Yeah.
 24 Q. That's referring to when he messes up the
 25 basement?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Okay. And under that, under Eddie is what, mad?

3 A. Yep.

4 Q. When he is not allowed to use your kitchen stuff?

5 A. I don't remember what that's about. Sorry.

6 Q. All right. Do you get the impression from all of

7 this that part of Karla's desire to keep

8 everything neat and tidy has to do with the

9 orientation of her mother in her approach to the

10 household?

11 A. I think it has to do with her seeing what

12 mechanisms are used to keep things under control.

13 I mean I'm sure she wants to mess at times but

14 overall I didn't ask her to clean up the

15 playroom. I was really struck by that. Nobody

16 asked her and she did it all on her own but —

17 Q. I mean if her mother has a house where nothing is

18 out of line and her bed is cleaned up and the

19 basement is cleaned up and the house is very

20 meticulous, it is not unusual for a girl

21 particularly to parrot what the mother does and

22 approach life in the same way?

23 A. No, it is not.

24 Q. That is not. So, it could equally be arguable

25 that the fact that Karla keeps everything tidy,

1 neat and clean has to do with the influence her

2 mother has had on her?

3 A.

Yes. In part.

4 Q.

Okay. Now, you said that one of the things that

5 Karla -- on your first visit that you observed was

6 that Karla told you she was anxious about being

7 here, that is when she was being evaluated at

8 Doctor Wortman's, is that correct?

9 A.

Yes.

10 Q.

And where does that show up? I think that shows

11 up in your notes on page six. Last night I was

12 shaking, don't know what to expect. Did she tell

13 you what her parents told her about why they were

14 putting her in a car and driving her three and a

15 half hours up to Ann Arbor, Michigan to see

16 A.

somebody?

17 No. I don't think she knew exactly what was

18 happening.

19 Q.

That's an unusual circumstance for a child to be

20 put in a car driven someplace three and a half

21 hours away and left with someone who's going to

22 spend a lot of time asking them questions, that's

23 a very unusual situation?

24 A.

They didn't leave her. They were with her.

25 Q.

They were not in the room with her but that's an

1 unusual situation for any child, wouldn't you say?
 2 A. I think yes, it would be. I think they did tell
 3 her some things but I think she thought I was a
 4 medical doctor.
 5 Q. Also, on the second interview on 10-28-90 if you
 6 look at page five above that squiggly line you
 7 made there?
 8 A. Where are you?
 9 Q. Page five.
 10 A. Second interview. Yeah.
 11 Q. I don't want to know nothing dash why are they
 12 going dash don't want to know. Can you explain to
 13 me what that is?
 14 A. Yeah. She was very conflictive about -- I didn't
 15 know what they had told her about the suit and she
 16 indicated that she hears some things but she
 17 really doesn't know what's going on and doesn't
 18 want to know.
 19 Q. What's this why are they going, what does that
 20 mean? What does she say?
 21 A. I don't know at this point. I've told you what I
 22 think of her first two.
 23 Q. She says they think you're not listening but you
 24 are, that she hears them talking about the
 25 lawsuit?

1 A. Then she blocks it out.

2 Q. She hears them talking about the needle too, is

3 that fair to say?

4 A. I can't tell you if she does.

5 Q. Specifically talking about the court case, she

6 does know that they talk about the court case

7 specifically because that's noted here, isn't it?

8 A. I wrote that.

9 Q. Yes, but you didn't write that of your own accord,

10 why did you write talking about the court case?

11 A. I can't remember exactly how it came up. I'm

12 sorry. I'm trying to be honest.

13 Q. Did you ask her about the court case?

14 A. No.

15 Q. Now, there is some information here about police,

16 does she have friends in the family who are

17 police, do you remember her telling you that?

18 A. Yes. I think so.

19 Q. Okay.

20 A. Friend's father.

21 Q. Is a policeman?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Okay. She has a lot of things that refer to

24 police in some of her stories and that sort of

25 thing?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. I believe that comes from having a friend whose

3 father is a cop?

4 A. Policemen are seen in general by kids as a symbol

5 of law and order and safety and that's a general

6 symbol that gets used in children's play.

7 Q. But also if a child has exposure through friends

8 with someone whose dad is a policeman, they are

9 more inclined to talk about police officers and

10 that sort of thing?

11 A. I guess so. I wouldn't be able to say that with

12 certainty.

13 Q. Some indication here that she worries about her

14 mom?

15 A. Yeah.

16 Q. What does she -- what did she tell you this visit

17 about her mom and whether she worries about her or

18 not?

19 A. That she still worries just in general that mommy

20 is safe. Nothing specific.

21 Q. She had an incident occur that she told you about

22 the first time you saw her which would make any

23 child worry about their mother and their safety?

24 A. Sure.

25 Q. When she ran over her toe with a weed wacker?

1 A. Right.

2 Q. And it was bleeding and her mother was crying?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Okay. It is not unusual for parents to want their

5 children to be safe and mom to be safe?

6 A. No, it is not.

7 Q. And certainly not unusual for them to talk about

8 it?

9 A. It depends.

10 Q. Well, in this case you said you worry about mom?

11 A. Yes, I worry.

12 Q. Something about something happening and recount

13 this weed wacker tale, that doesn't strike you as

14 unusual?

15 A. No. I considered her to be concerned.

16 Q. When she talks about the three wishes she has?

17 A. What page are you on?

18 Q. On the first visit, page four, both on the first

19 visit and on the second visit to you, she did not

20 talk about wishing the needle was out on any of

21 those, is that correct?

22 A. I said that.

23 Q. Okay. Would you look at page 4A down, it says

24 Ricky, Rena, friends of ours?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. Riding something or another for dad, what does
2 that say?
3 A. Ricky works for dad.
4 Q. Okay. How did that come up in the conversation?
5 A. I don't remember. In fact, I don't even remember
6 Ricky because I testified earlier that I didn't
7 remember Ricky.
8 Q. Okay.
9 A. Wasn't important. It didn't seem important.
10 Q. Okay. Did she ever tell you there had ever been a
11 robbery or burglary or something at her father's
12 plant or business?
13 A. Well, she talked about a dream about that.
14 Q. I see.
15 A. Whether or not it happened or not that wasn't my
16 understanding, it was a dream.
17 Q. I was just curious how that came up. If you
18 looked at that picture that she drew?
19 MR. BITTEL: Which one, the rainbow?
20 MS. HENRY: You didn't let me finish.
21 Of the rainbow
22 MR. JORDAN: I object to his
23 interruption.
24 BY MS. HENRY, CONTINUING:
25 Q. Both on the first visit when you were at Doctor

1 Wortman's house and on this visit, the second
2 visit when Karla was here, do you have a box of
3 markers that you let them color with?
4 A. Yes.
5 Q. And they have -- do you have orange, red, pink,
6 yellow, blue, light green, purple, pink, black
7 markers in there?
8 A. Yeah.
9 Q. Okay. And when I had the opportunity to look at
10 this picture in color, the picture in your
11 records, it looks like she used practically every
12 one of the colors you had in the box to make her
13 rainbow?
14 A. That's what a rainbow is.
15 Q. Nothing unusual about this rainbow?
16 A. Look in the middle of the rainbow. What's the
17 heart of the rainbow?
18 Q. Orange? Pink?
19 A. I guess different people have different ideas
20 about it but --
21 Q. If you look at the number above it and below it,
22 if you are getting to the fact that there is a
23 black line in there?
24 A. She says that it was sunny and then rainy which
25 is, you know, the thunder in the middle and then

1 the sun comes out and the rainbow appears and then
2 the rain will not come back, but the heart of this
3 rainbow is black and that's I think unusual for a
4 rainbow to be black in the middle. Also --
5 Q. That's your interpretation?
6 A. What was your question?
7 Q. That's your interpretation of the picture, the
8 fact one of the colors of the rainbow is black
9 means that the heart of this rainbow is black?
10 A. Also that she picked up the black marker
11 spontaneously when we started talking about the
12 events.
13 Q. Was she in the process of drawing this picture
14 when you talked about the event?
15 A. She started drawing her family.
16 Q. Okay. Could I see, just because I don't know what
17 they are, what the TAT cards are?
18 A. I'm not sure I have them. I said I did and I will
19 look. Mr. Bittel, do you have any objection to me
20 showing them the TAT cards?
21 MR. BITTEL: No. Not at all. So long
22 as we could have -- off the record.
23 (Whereupon a discussion was had off the
24 record.)
25 THE WITNESS: These are just some of

1 them.

2 BY MS. HENRY, CONTINUING:

3 Q. Are these drawings specifically for these TAT

4 cards or are these drawings to your knowledge from

5 your training that are like pictures of paintings

6 or things like that?

7 A. No. This is a standardized test. Traumatic

8 Apperception Test.

9 Q. And they are numbered?

10 A. Right.

11 Q. And if I look through the stuff you have to say

12 about Karla, the number on this will coordinate

13 with what she saw in the particular -- in her mind

14 that you recorded, right?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Will you look at page thirteen of --

17 A. Which one?

18 Q. The first interview, September of '89?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Can you read that to me, this guy -- is this from

21 one of the TAT tests?

22 A. Yeah.

23 Q. Is it one that we have here?

24 A. No. I don't even know if I have it. I can.

25 Q. Do you know what that one looks like?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. What does it look like?

3 A. It is an operation. Well, it is ambiguous and

4 that's the whole idea of these TAT cards. I

5 better see if I can get it.

6 Q. I would like to see that so we can focus on one

7 and get a better idea.

8 (Whereupon a discussion was had off the

9 record.)

10 BY MS. HENRY, CONTINUING:

11 Q. Okay. The TAT that you have showed us that goes

12 with the one on page thirteen is a picture of

13 somebody lying somewhere with two people leaning

14 over them, one looks like they are about to apply

15 a knife to their stomach, is that fair? Do you

16 consider that to be a knife or what?

17 A. That's the whole idea.

18 MR. BITTEL: I seriously, very

19 seriously, strenuously object to your

20 interpretation of the picture.

21 MS. HENRY: I would like you to bring

22 this with you.

23 MR. JORDAN: I would ask if you could

24 bring all of your original drawings and files and

25 these TAT cards to trial? Would that be

1 acceptable?

2 MR. BITTEL: Yes.

3 MR. JORDAN: Either during the video

4 deposition or trial.

5 THE WITNESS: It is ambiguous. That's

6 the whole point of this.

7 BY MS. HENRY, CONTINUING:

8 Q. You consider this to be ambiguous?

9 A. There are some things that we can all agree that

10 we see but a fine line.

11 Q. What did she tell you about this picture which is

12 8BM so there is no confusion, it is on page

13 thirteen, you have the number next to it?

14 A. Yes. Okay. She says this guy is getting cut up.

15 This guy looks like this one. That I don't know

16 what that refers to. How come I don't know. You

17 want me to just read this?

18 Q. What's this over the side?

19 A. Yawning.

20 Q. Okay.

21 A. She's --

22 Q. Karla is yawning?

23 A. I felt she really wanted to distance herself with

24 what was coming up.

25 Q. You said to her why are they there?

1 A. Right.

2 Q. And she said?

3 A. She said she was going to die, the hand on the

4 table. Robbers are trying to kill him because

5 they want to. I said why, because they want a

6 silly person bridge. She went into nonsense at

7 that point.

8 Q. If you look on page fifteen, does that refer to

9 any one of these TAT's?

10 A. Page fifteen?

11 Q. Yeah. It starts out climbing up rope.

12 A. That is a TAT card.

13 Q. Does this whole page have to do with that one TAT

14 card?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Which card is that?

17 A. It is -- is right there. I should just bring all

18 these inside.

19 Q. So, how many of these TAT cards are there?

20 A. There are many but I usually just give five or

21 six. I don't give all. No one ever does.

22 Q. How do you decide which ones to give?

23 A. You give the ones that are most normally given.

24 The general ones that are usually given.

25 Q. Okay. If you can look at page three, actually it

1 is the last page, maybe it is 3DP?
 2 A. No. It is three doll play.
 3 Q. What do you do for doll play? How did you elicit
 4 whatever this is, this response?
 5 A. You sit down with the child and you have this
 6 stimuli there, the doll house and all different
 7 dolls and different furniture, and you ask if they
 8 want to play dolls and make a story about whatever
 9 they want to make a story about and --
 10 Q. So she spontaneously came up with this story?
 11 A. Yes.
 12 Q. And it says can or cup?
 13 A. Cup.
 14 Q. I fell off my --
 15 A. Motorbike.
 16 Q. Boom. She holds onto wheel. I found --
 17 A. Some things.
 18 Q. Take back to -- what does that say? Can you read
 19 that for me?
 20 A. I found something to take back to the house, get
 21 in the back, little girl, and then do I have to,
 22 and basically what was happening the cops were
 23 going to go back, and now the family was going to
 24 be under arrest for something.
 25 Q. It says you're under arrest?

1 Mommy, we're under arrest. Mommy. It was very —
 2 she was — the play was pretty spontaneous and
 3 moving around.
 4 Q. You have no idea what that relates to or do you?
 5 A. This is her doll play.
 6 Q. You interpreted it to mean what?
 7 A. It may be influenced by a number of things. I
 8 didn't make a specific interpretation on each
 9 specific piece. It was the totality of the
 10 evidence.
 11 Q. Okay. I see. So, if you look at page three your
 12 notes for the first visit?
 13 A. Yes. I'm getting tired.
 14 Q. I think it says three at the top?
 15 A. Okay.
 16 Q. Okay.
 17 A. I stay home close to mom.
 18 Q. Yeah. Drop down and it says grow up, question
 19 mark?
 20 A. What do you want to be when you grow up.
 21 Q. Read me what she said because I sometimes have a
 22 hard time reading your writing?
 23 A. No kidding. I'm sorry. I was writing these while
 24 I was sitting there with her and it is not
 25 everything I know that is in my head.

1 Q. Okay.

2 A. What would you like me to do?

3 Q. Grow up, question mark. You asked her what she

4 wanted to be when she grows up and what does it

5 say?

6 A. Nurse.

7 Q. No. It says they won't let us get married. Maybe

8 we are on the wrong page.

9 MR. BITTEL: You said page three?

10 MR. JORDAN: There are several page

11 three's.

12 THE WITNESS: There are? How come? Oh,

13 yeah. I see. She said that her parents want to

14 keep her, they won't let us get married, they said

15 so even when we are grown.

16 BY MS. HENRY, CONTINUING:

17 Q. Is that -- who's us?

18 A. She and Eddie.

19 Q. Okay. Next page she says favorite thing to do is

20 cartoons with poky -- Porky Pig. I recognize

21 that. Hate to do, she's doesn't like to go down

22 to the basement, and does she say why?

23 A. Because of fears of monsters.

24 Q. Freddie Kuger. I don't know Freddie Kuger.

25 A. He's a monster.

1 Q. Did she tell you who Freddie Kuger is? 25
2 A. No. 24
3 Q. Do you know who Freddie Kuger is? 23
4 A. No. 22
5 MR. JORDAN: Kuger. 21
6 BY MS. HENRY, CONTINUING: 20
7 Q. He may claw you up, that's what he says here? 19
8 A. Yes. 18
9 Q. You interpret that sequence of events to mean she 17
10 has a fear of danger? 16
11 A. Afraid of -- a lot of kids are afraid of going 15
12 down into the basement or going up into the attic 14
13 or someplace that's not within the safe conscious 13
14 part of the house. The basement is very symbolic 12
15 for sort of the unconscious. 11
16 Q. Okay. That statement by her you didn't find to be 10
17 unusual at all compared to most kids, is that fair 9
18 to say? 8
19 A. I'm not comparing her to most kids but I -- 7
20 Was that of any significance that statement, she 6
21 hates to go down because of Freddie Kuger, he's a 5

1 monster?
 2 A. I take it to mean she was afraid of the basement.
 3 It is not where she wants to hang out.
 4 Q. That's not unusual for kids?
 5 A. No.
 6 Q. Okay.
 7 A. Little kids.
 8 Q. What age group are you talking about?
 9 A. Four, five.
 10 Q. Okay. She told you that she's not allowed to, on
 11 the first visit, not allowed to go on the monkey
 12 bars, climb trees, own a car, I think that's what
 13 she says.
 14 A. Where are you, please?
 15 Q. 4A.
 16 A. Okay.
 17 Q. Not allowed to do monkey bars, climb trees?
 18 A. Own car and basket hoop.
 19 Q. Can't do basketball hoop and sometimes that makes
 20 her feel mad, is that right?
 21 A. Yes.
 22 Q. Do you know why it is that she wasn't allowed to
 23 climb monkey bars or climb trees?
 24 A. I was told it had to do with her condition.
 25 Q. Who told you that it was because of her condition?

1 A. I think her mother told me that.

2 Q. Okay. If you look at the 10-28-90 interview?

3 A. Yeah.

4 Q. She told you she can do whatever she wants to do

5 now, is that correct?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. In fact, she jumps rope, flips?

8 A. Where are you?

9 Q. Next page over, at recess she does skipping,

10 flipping, where it says recess?

11 A. I don't know, I'm sorry. I don't know where you

12 are.

13 Q. Left, I'm sorry. I don't have a page on this.

14 Take your first page for 10-28 and you turn it

15 over?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. It says recess?

18 A. Yeah.

19 Q. Jump rope and flipping?

20 A. Uh-huh.

21 Q. Okay. Is it your understanding that at the

22 present time she has no restrictions as to what

23 she's allowed to do?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. If you look at the next page over on two, she's

1 telling you she sometimes gets in trouble,
 2 example, scream real loud for nothing?
 3 A. That's what she said.
 4 Q. Then what happens?
 5 A. That she gets a paddle.
 6 Q. Is that from her parents or from her teacher?
 7 A. Her parents.
 8 Q. On this time she said she wanted to be a cow, a
 9 dog, nothing else?
 10 A. Yeah. She really -- she didn't want to use her
 11 fantasy this time, she was more closed down I
 12 felt.
 13 Q. She doesn't want to be a lion or a tiger or a
 14 bulldog?
 15 A. Those things stayed the same.
 16 Q. Yeah. It may be she just wasn't inclined on this
 17 particular day to be as open with you or as
 18 talkative with you, isn't that true?
 19 A. I perceived it a little differently.
 20 Q. Okay. How do you perceive it?
 21 A. That she is more repressed right now and that's
 22 part of what kids do to deal with stuff. She is
 23 moving on, trying not to think about all this
 24 negative stuff.
 25 Q. Okay. Page three?

1 A. Yeah.

2 Q. Mom goes out with Mrs. Luck and then after that

3 you see Monday, Tuesday, Wednesday, Thursday,

4 Friday, did you ask her what happens on each day

5 of the week?

6 A. No. I was writing that down. I was going to and

7 then we didn't.

8 Q. You did talk about --

9 I did the first day of the week because I wanted

10 to know what a typical day was like basically.

11 Q. Okay. And she can recount to you pretty much what

12 she does?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. And who comes, who goes, what her favorite day in

15 school is, whether her moms goes bowling or to a

16 bar sometimes, those are -- you have here appears

17 to be preoccupied with memories, comings and

18 goings?

19 A. With mom's.

20 Q. Comings and goings.

21 A. I got the sense she missed her when mom went out.

22 That's all.

23 Q. No big significance to a child missing her mom

24 when she is out?

25 A. No big significance. Just a fact.

Q. At the present time on the visit of 10-28-90 she

talked about an aunt and an uncle, is that

correct, Aunt Denise and Uncle --

A. You're going to have to tell me where. That's

doll play again.

Q. You have Aunt Denise as a family member, is that

in reality?

A. That's her doll figures on the right on page six.

I think Aunt Denise is a family member, yes. I

wrote that down. She is a family member and there

is an Uncle Don and she included him

in her drawing of the family.

Q. Okay. You believe those are in reality people who

exist in the family situation?

A. Yes.

Q. Her real family, not fantasy?

A. Uncle Don I know for sure. I don't know about her

Aunt Denise but I know about Uncle Don for sure.

Q. Okay. In your second report on page six this is

also doll play, I believe, you have baby napping

circled, I believe on your notes, is that correct?

A. Yes.

Q. That's something you went back and circled more

recently like yesterday or because it wasn't

circled in our first set of notes?

1 A. Right. Probably in preparation for this, just
2 things that --
3 Q. Why is baby napping significant?
4 A. Because I think that that is -- it is something
5 that kids do sometimes, they put everybody to
6 sleep in doll play when they don't want to think
7 too much as we talked about before. I saw it as
8 another piece of evidence that could suggest that
9 she's wanting to not think about things. Well,
10 that's what ten years of school does, you kind of
11 have to --
12 Q. All right. Farther down it says big sister goes
13 upstairs, washes her face, goes to the bathroom,
14 how did that come out that whole -- lays down with
15 dad, he's sleeping too?
16 A. She had everybody moving around sleeping, too. I
17 was writing it down as it happened.
18 Q. Some people are awake, mother is awake staying
19 with the baby, father is awake watching the baby,
20 I mean those two people aren't asleep in this?
21 MR. BITTEL: I'm going to object because
22 if you are going to read it, you got to read the
23 whole thing.
24 BY MS. HENRY, CONTINUING:
25 Q. Her comment was that sometimes they put the whole

1 family asleep, that's why she has this baby
 2 napping asleep but all the people in this doll
 3 play are not asleep, are they?
 4 A. No.
 5 Q. Okay.
 6 A. But, so.
 7 Q. Various members of the family are checking on the
 8 baby who is sleeping?
 9 A. The story is progressing.
 10 Q. Okay. Any significance to this big sister goes
 11 upstairs, washes her face, lays down, she is
 12 sleeping too?
 13 A. Not every piece of information is significant.
 14 Q. You write this all down and take -- take out
 15 things that are significant?
 16 A. I look at the totality of the evidence and come up
 17 to my impression what the emotional themes are to
 18 the best of my opinion.
 19 Q. I see. I was interested by it says post-interview
 20 notes. I think it says number one at the top, do
 21 you see these notes, two pages?
 22 A. Maybe -- could I see yours for a minute? Maybe it
 23 is the same thing I have on mine.
 24 Q. I think it is on the back of what you just turned
 25 over.

1 MR. BITTEL: It is on the Judge Baker
2 Guidance Center.
3 THE WITNESS: I think I wrote on it for
4 you guys.
5 BY MS. HENRY, CONTINUING:
6 Q. You wrote on it for our benefit. Okay. If you
7 look on the back of that first page there, you
8 have last fifteen slash sixteen, what is that? I
9 can't read that. Last fifteen -- sickle cell
10 anemia, birth control pills?
11 A. I'm very sorry. I don't know if this is in the
12 right file.
13 Q. It would be kind of unusual, sickle cell anemia is
14 generally not found in people of the caucasian
15 background?
16 A. I really apologize. I think it doesn't belong in
17 this file. Can we just please take it out? I
18 don't know how that got in there. I don't even
19 know what this is about or what it refers to but
20 it doesn't ring a bell for the Spehars.
21 Q. Is the front of that then relevant to Karla or no?
22 A. Yes.
23 Q. The front of that page?
24 A. Yes.
25 Q. Okay. As far as you could tell the second time

1 that you saw her which was the end of October she
 2 wasn't having any problems with dreams?
 3 A. That's correct.
 4 Q. Do you know as it relates to family business what
 5 kind of work the mother does?
 6 A. Yes. I know what kind of work she does. My
 7 understanding is that she works in the office with
 8 her husband's business.
 9 Q. If a child goes into the hospital and is in the
 10 hospital for more than one day even in the absence
 11 of surgery, can that have a stress affect on that
 12 child?
 13 A. What would she be going into the hospital for?
 14 Stay overnight?
 15 Q. For anything where it might be more than one day?
 16 A. If she is separated from her parent and if it is
 17 overnight, yes, it could.
 18 Q. Regardless of whether surgery is involved or not
 19 involved?
 20 A. Surgery would make it worse for sure.
 21 Q. Have you had much experience with trying to
 22 evaluate people's potential bias as to how they
 23 may relate things to you? Do you have someone
 24 tell you something?
 25 A. As part of your clinical training you try to

1 understand people's defense mechanisms and their
2 coping strategies.
3 Q. Do you believe that some people may be influenced
4 or somewhat biased whether intentionally or not in
5 what they relate to you simply by the fact that
6 they have a lawsuit pending?
7 A. I believe they could be.
8 Q. And that they may report to you things that maybe
9 fit in with their lawsuit and may not tell you
10 other things whether intentionally or not simply
11 because they don't fit with the theory of the
12 lawsuit?
13 A. I suppose. Sure.
14 Q. When you made the initial draft or sent the report
15 to Doctor Wortman, was it on letterhead, your
16 particular portion of it?
17 A. It is on a word processor. I just do it on a disk
18 and send it to her.
19 Q. Do you still have the disk for that?
20 A. No.
21 Q. What would it have said at the top of the report?
22 A. Evaluation of Karla Spehar.
23 Q. Okay. Is it your experience in the few cases you
24 had with Doctor Wortman she would keep that
25 original report in the files she has here in Ann

1 Arbor?

2 A. I don't know.

3 Q. Are there standard texts or books that you rely on

4 when you analyze which of the animals a child says

5 they would like to be or not be?

6 A. Well, interpreting symbolically is part of my

7 clinical training, it's what I did at Children's

8 Hospital, and there are some books, I can't

9 remember them after all these years, but it is

10 generally something that it gets taught over the

11 course of experience sitting with children and

12 just the general techniques of interpretation.

13 Q. If I wanted to look at a psychology book

14 somewhere, that would tell me on these pretend

15 questions about the wishes and about the animals

16 what various things might mean?

17 A. No.

18 Q. There are books like that?

19 A. There are books like that for, for instance, for

20 the ink blots which aren't relevant here but there

21 is no cookbook kind of thing for this particular

22 test.

23 Q. Would I see a textbook that would say generally if

24 they talk about monkeys and elephants that they

25 think about freedom, is that, or being free, would

1 I find that in a book somewhere?
 2 A. It is in books indirectly but it is not in the way
 3 you're asking, Ms. Henry.
 4 Q. When Karla was up here on 10-28-90, she came with
 5 her parents and her brother, correct?
 6 A. Yes.
 7 Q. Now, where in your offices which has the inner
 8 room that we're sitting in and has the couch and
 9 chairs and that sort of thing and then there is
 10 another room, do you do any evaluations in the
 11 other room which is the room we entered into?
 12 A. The children I do because the doll play is out
 13 there. Her parents left and left me with Karla.
 14 Q. Okay. So, her parents at her brother left and
 15 left you alone with Karla?
 16 A. Right.
 17 Q. And how long were you alone with Karla here in the
 18 office?
 19 A. I guess about three hours. They came back to
 20 check on her and called, whatnot.
 21 Q. Did her parents, the first visit, leave you alone
 22 for that amount of time with her three hours?
 23 A. I don't know if it was. Yeah. More or less that
 24 amount of time they were in another part of Doctor
 25 Wortman's house.

1 Q. During the hour and fifteen minutes that you think
2 you were talking to Karla's parents where was
3 Karla and her brother?
4 A. They were playing out in the other room.
5 Q. Is there any difference in answers to the animal
6 questions based on the child's sex? Do you find
7 girls tend to say they would rather be bunny
8 rabbits?
9 A. Yeah. There can be. There can be.
10 Q. That sort of thing. You don't generally find boys
11 saying I want to be a bunny rabbit?
12 A. There is a sex-typed animal preference test that
13 is actually used to look at some gender issues,
14 that's not what this is, but your point is correct
15 along those lines.
16 Q. But in the answer to just the straight question
17 what three animals would you like to be and what
18 three animals would you not like to be, do you
19 tend to find there is a difference on the sex of
20 the child as to how they answer that?
21 A. Not necessarily.
22 Q. Had Karla already gone to the dentist by the time
23 you saw her on 10-28-90?
24 A. The second time she had her tooth pulled.
25 Q. Did you ask her about that specifically?

1 A. We spoke very briefly about it, yeah. She said
2 that she screamed and her mother brought a picture
3 that she had drawn on that day.
4 Q. Do you have that picture here?
5 A. You have it, too.
6 Q. It didn't Xerox very well but it is all in blue,
7 is that correct?
8 A. That's correct.
9 Q. And neither her parents nor Karla told you
10 anything about having the fillings done on that
11 day?
12 A. No. I wasn't aware of that.
13 Q. Okay. Who told you that there is a slight risk of
14 facial disfigurement if this needle is removed?
15 A. I don't know.
16 Q. Someone told you that?
17 A. I can't remember if I read it or where I gathered
18 that. I'm sorry.
19 Q. But you came into possession somehow with an
20 understanding that one of the risks of removal is
21 there is a slight risk of facial disfigurement?
22 A. Paralysis of the nerves.
23 Q. You said facial disfigurement?
24 A. I meant paralysis of the facial nerves like she
25 couldn't move part of her face.

1 Q. That would result in outward physical difference?

2 A. I don't know. Maybe.

3 Q. It meant the nerve might be damaged?

4 A. The facial nerve may be damaged.

5 Q. And it would interfere with ability to move the

6 jaw area?

7 A. I think that's what I think. That's what I

8 thought about.

9 Q. All right. Do you know is there a difference in

10 how Karla reacts when she's going to, for example,

11 her pediatrician, her medical doctor, versus the

12 dentist?

13 A. My impression from Mrs. Spehar is that Karla is

14 getting tired of going to doctors in general,

15 although I don't know that's true across the

16 board, but just that the whole going to doctors is

17 not her favorite thing to do.

18 Q. Do you know how long it was between this incident

19 and the next time she got actual dental care?

20 A. My impression was that it was awhile.

21 Q. Did you receive copies of Doctor Brinich's notes

22 he made during Karla's evaluation?

23 A. No.

24 Q. Those were not provided to you?

25 A. No.

1 Q. In your package of material?

2 A. No.

3 Q. We talked about this infantile amnesia. Is there

4 a certain age that that takes over and wipes out

5 past memories?

6 A. I don't have a clear idea of exactly when. I know

7 it varies in patients in terms of their ability to

8 remember back but generally people can't remember

9 the first couple of years of life.

10 Q. Doctor, if you look at page thirteen of your

11 report?

12 A. Yeah.

13 Q. The typed one?

14 A. Typed report. Okay.

15 Q. It says after the incident Karla began, third

16 paragraph, after the incident Karla began to have

17 trouble falling asleep and staying asleep. She

18 noted the stars in the sky sometimes would take on

19 an ominous appearance and look like bats to her

20 which made her nervous. Who told you that she was

21 having trouble falling asleep and staying asleep?

22 A. Her mother. She told me that she got scared at

23 night. Let me see if I can just double-check

24 that.

25 Q. What you recall is that Karla's mother told you

1 she had trouble falling asleep and staying asleep?
 2 A. That's what Karla said too. Karla said I can't
 3 fall asleep, the stars at night look like bats.
 4 Q. Okay. Have you received any information that
 5 Karla has been unable to get along and socialize
 6 in the school setting?
 7 A. No.
 8 Q. That's the kind of place, well with others, that
 9 report cards usually have?
 10 A. The only information was indirectly through Mrs.
 11 Spehar that Karla was slow to start with first
 12 grade which we talked about before.
 13 Q. Okay. Had no problem getting along with her peers
 14 in kindergarten?
 15 A. I don't know for sure about that.
 16 Q. No one told you that she had any problem?
 17 A. No.
 18 Q. Her mother didn't tell you she had a problem?
 19 A. No.
 20 Q. Her mother didn't tell you she had a problem in
 21 preschool, did she?
 22 A. No.
 23 Q. Okay. That's it. Oh, wait a minute. I have one
 24 question.
 25 There was a drawing provided to you

by Karla's mother. Did you ask Karla's mother to

provide any drawings?

A. No, I didn't.

Q. And when did she give you that drawing?

A. At my office October 28th, second interview.

Q. That was a couple weeks ago?

A. Yes.

Q. Did she provide you any other drawings or

photographs?

A. No.

MR. JORDAN: I have nothing further.

MS. HENRY: Nothing further.

I, Barbara J. Turner, of the firm of
HURON REPORTING SERVICE, a Notary Public within and
for the County of Wayne, State of Michigan, duly
commissioned and qualified, do hereby certify that
the witness whose attached deposition was taken
before me in the before-entitled cause on November
9, 1990, was first duly sworn to testify the to
truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth
in the cause aforesaid; that the testimony
contained in said deposition was by me reduced to
writing in the presence of said witness by means of
stenography; afterwards transcribed upon a computer
under my personal supervision; and that the said
deposition is a true and correct transcript of the
whole of the testimony then given by the witness to
the best of my ability.

I do further certify that I am not
connected by blood or marriage with any of the
parties, or their attorneys or agents; that I am
not an employee of either of them, nor interested,
directly or indirectly, in the matter in
controversy, either as counsel, agent, attorney, or

CERTIFICATE OF NOTARY PUBLIC

STATE OF MICHIGAN)
COUNTY OF WAYNE)
SS.)

25
24
23
22
21
20
19
18
17
16
15
14
13
12
11
10
9
8
7
6
5
4
3
2
1

otherwise.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto

set my hand and affixed my Notarial Seal in City of
Ann Arbor, ^{15th} County of Washtenaw, State of Michigan,
this _____ day of November, 1990,
A.D.

Barbara J. Turner, CSR-2343
Notary Public, Wayne County
State of Michigan
Commission Expires November 10, 1992

