The State of Ohio, 1 County of Cuyahoga 2 OF COMMON FLE! IN THE CS 3 4 CLERK OF JOANNE M. CROW. 5 Plaintiffs, 6 ) Case Number 345899 ) 7 - 7/ --) Judge Russo DEBORAH L. DOTSON, Executrix) 8 etc., et al., 9 Defendants. ) 10 11 DEPOSITION OF ROBERT C. CORN, M.D. Thursday, September 24, 1998 12 13 14 Videotape deposition of ROBERT C. CORN, M.D., called by the 15 Defendants for examination under the Ohio Rules of Civil 16 Procedure, taken before me, the undersigned, Aimee N. 17 Szinte, a Notary Public in and for the State of Ohio, at 18 the offices of Gallagher, Sharp, Fulton & Norman, 7th 19 20 Floor, Bulkley Building, Cleveland, Ohio 44115, commencing at 5:10 p.m. the day and date above set forth. 21 22 CORSILLO & GRANDILLO COURT REPORTERS 23 950 Citizens Building Cleveland, Ohio 44114 24 216-523-1700 25

. . .

The stand

rei

1

5.1.2

1

ير ،

ڙي ج ادي حم

. . .

.

1	APPE <sub>ARAN</sub> CES:
2	On Behalf of the Plaintiffs:
3	Jospeh L. Coticchia, Esquire 1640 Standard Building
4	Cleveland, Ohio 44114
5	On Behalf of the Defendants:
6	Mark A. Greer, Esquire Gallagher, Sharp, Fulton & Norman
7	7th Floor, Bulkley Building Cleveland, Ohio 44115
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	,
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

i t<sub>e</sub> v i t<sub>e</sub> j

٦.

. م

1

(44.\* 1.1.)

No.

1	
2	(Defendant's Exhibit A and B were marked
3	for identification.)
4	
5	ROBERT C. CORN, M.D.
6	called by the Defendant for examination under the Ohio
7	Rules of Civil Procedure, after having been first duly
а	sworn, as hereinafter certified, was examined and testified
9	as follows:
10	
11	EXAMINATION
12	
13	BY MR. GREER:
14	<b>Q</b> Doctor, would you please introduce yourself to the
15	jury?
16	A My name is Robert Curtis Corn, C-o-r-n.
17	Q Where are we today, Doctor?
18	A We're at my main office at 850 Brainard Road in
19	Highland Heights, Ohio.
20	Q Doctor, before we get into the issues surrounding the
21	plaintiff, I would like to discuss your education, training
22	and experience with the jury.
23	Where did you go to college, Doctor?
24	A I received my Bachelor of Science in biology from the
25	Albright College in Reading, Pennsylvania. I graduated in

Computer-Aided Transcription By Corsillo & Grandillo Court Reporters

⊥ 1971.
---------

2 Where did you attend medical school? Q 3 Α I then returned to my home town, Philadelphia, 4 Pennsylvania, where I attended the Hahnemann University School of Medicine from 1971 until my graduation in 1975. 5 6 I graduated in June of 1975 with my M.D. degree. 7 What did you do at that point? Q I moved out here to Cleveland in late June of 1975 8 Ä and I started my orthopedic residency training, that is my 9 10 training in my medical specialty, at The Cleveland Clinic. 11 I was at The Clinic from June of 1975 until June of 1979 when I graduated from the program. 12 13 Q Then what did you do at that point? 14 I took a couple months off and then I entered the Α 15 private practice of orthopedic surgery on August 1st, or certainly early August of 1979. And for over 19 years I 16 17 have been a private practice orthopedic surgeon primarily 18 on the east and southeast side of the city. 19 Q Are you licensed, Doctor? I am licensed. 20 Α 21 In which state? Q 22 Just in Ohio. Α When were you licensed, Doctor? 23 Q In 1976. 24 Α

**25 Q** What is your area of practice, Doctor?

Computer-Aided Transcription By Corsillo & Grandillo Court Reporters

Sec. 1 -Li 157 

Lucia I

w.

17

1 A My specialty is known as orthopedic surgery.

2 0 And what exactly does that entail, Doctor? Well, this is the branch of medicine which involves 3 Α the medical and surgical treatment of diseases, disorders, 4 injuries and some tumors involving the musculoskeletal 5 That includes problems with the bones, muscles, 6 system. 7 tendons, joints and ligaments. And we also deal with a variety of other types of injuries and traumas. We cover 8 to emergency rooms, so we get a fair amount of vehicular 9 trauma as well as slip and fall type traumas. We also deal 10 11 with arthritis and joint replacement surgery, sports medicine and arthroscopic surgery, as well as surgery and 12 13 problems of the hand.

14 Q Doctor, you are Board certified?

15 A I am Board certified.

**16** Q What exactly does that mean?

17 A Well, the Board certification is a process. When you
18 are in medical school and you decide what you want to do
19 when you grow up, you contact the Boards, which every
20 medical and surgical subspecialty has a committee which
21 sets up the educational requirements.

So I wanted to go into orthopedic surgery. I had to have completed a residency program in orthopedics. Now, that is a apprenticeship type of program where the more you learn and the longer you're in it, the more responsibility

**[**---]

-33

1.0

стата 1917 г. – С

you get. You learn how to start doing simple surgeries in
 your first year and as your expertise improves, you do the
 more complex types of surgery. So you have to complete a
 residency program.

5 Part of that program is passing an in-training 6 examination, which is an extraordinarily difficult exam, 7 much more difficult than the final Board certification 8 exams. And it's good to weed out the programs, the 9 residencies that may not be as good **as** others to help 10 doctors and these programs develop better training so you 11 have a standard throughout the nation.

12 After graduation I had to be in the clinical practice of orthopedic surgery for one calendar year in one 13 14 geographical location. During that time a peer review 15 takes place. Doctors come and they watch you do surgery, 16 they go through an interview process, they come in while you're making rounds on patients. 17 So **it's** a highly visible 18 type of scrutiny.

19 And then the final step is a series of written and 20 oral examinations, and at that time they were given once a 21 year, and after passing the exam and completing the other 22 requirements, the Board would certify you.

23 Q Are you Board certified in any other areas other than24 orthopedics, Doctor?

25 A Yes, I am.

Computer-Aided Transcription By Corsillo & Grandillo Court Reporters

4

4

1 **a** What other areas are you Board certified in?

2 A In 1996 I was certified by the American College of
3 Forensic Medicine and by the American College of Forensic
4 Medical Examiners.

5 Q And forensic medicine, what does that generally6 entail, Doctor?

7 Well, forensic medicine is the part of medicine that Α deals with law and legal issues or forums. 8 They can be ranging everything from what is disability, what is 9 10 impairment, to the forensics of evidence. You know, what 11 evidence is admissible, what is not. What is appropriate 12 lab testing. It's really a whole field. Just everyplace that law and medicine touch in all different areas, that's 13 14 what forensic medicine essentially is.

15 Q Does that also include such areas as blood testing16 and alcohol levels in a person?

17 A Yes.

18 Doctor, what hospitals are you affiliated with? 0 19 Α I'm a staff orthopedic surgeon at the Meridia 20 Hillcrest Hospital, the Meridia Euclid Hospital, Meridia Huron Hospital, University Hospitals Bedford Medical 21 22 Center, the PHS Mt. Sinai Hospital System, the eastern 23 campus, the Lake County hospital, system if I didn't say 24 that. And these privileges are essentially emergency room, 25 hospital admission privileges and surgical privileges.

## in the second se

: \*\*\*

<u>,</u>4

Contraction of the second

- 3

- 274 51 - 13

VAL. N

14

1 Q Doctor, do you teach?

2 A I do.

**3** Q Where at?

A At this point in time I basically teach doctors, but
I do have faculty appointments at two undergraduate, or I
should say post-graduate programs; Case Western Reserve
University School of Medicine and the Ohio College of
Podiatric Medicine. I'm also an instructor in laser
surgery.

**10** Q Doctor, are you published?

11 A I have published, yes.

12 Q Doctor, I would like to hand you what's been marked 13 as Defendant's Exhibit A and ask you if you recognize that 14 document?

15 A Yes. This is a updated copy of my curriculum vitae.
16 Q Does that set forth your education, your training,
17 your experience, the various boards, organizations that
18 you're a member of as well as the publications that you've
19 made?

20 A Yes.

21 Q Thank you. Now, Doctor, were you asked to review the
22 medical records pertaining to the plaintiff, Joanne Crow,
23 to then examine her and then to issue a medical report?
24 A I was asked to do that, yes.

25 Q Is that what we generally call an independent medical

·靖

<u>.</u>...

ŭ. 1

EU-11

1 examination?

2 A Well, the examination may or may not include the
3 report, but it certainly in this case did include a medical
4 report.

5 Q Doctor, could you show the jury the records that you
6 were asked to review before your examination of the
7 plaintiff?

8 A Well, actually these were reviewed after the exam,
9 but this was part of the evaluation, these medical records.
10 Q Okay. Did it take a fair amount of time for you to
11 review the extensive records?

12 A Yes.

13 Q Did you also examine the plaintiff?

14 A I did.

15 Q After examining the plaintiff and reviewing the 16 records did you write a report?

17 A I did, yes.

18 Q How long is your report, Doctor?

19 A I believe it's five pages.

20 Q Did you charge for your time in reviewing the 21 extensive records, meeting with the plaintiff, examining 22 the plaintiff and then writing your five page report?

23 A I did, yes.

24 Q Are you charging for your time today?

**25** A I am.

Computer-Aided Transcription By Corsillo & Grandillo Court Reporters

### i j <sup>i</sup> t j i

- - -

اللہ ا

10.0

3.3

;::

1

2

Q

That's correct. 3 Α 4 Doctor, have you performed independent medical Q 5 examinations in the past for me? Yes, I have. б A 7 0 Have you performed independent medical examinations 8 for my office in the past? 9 А Yes. 10 Could you give the jury a general idea as to the 0 number of independent medical examinations you perform on , 11 12 average per week? Per week, the average would be two exams per week, 13 Α and that's been an average over the past ten years. 14 During the course of an average week how many 15 0 patients do you generally see? 16 Depending if we're on call at a hospital, anywhere 17 Α from 50 to 80 patients a week. 38 19 0 Do you also see patients and perform surgery, both scheduled and emergency, during the course of a given week? 20 21 Α Yes. 22 So is it fair to state then that the -- that seeing 0 on average two patients for an IME per week constitutes a 23 small fraction of the total number of people you see per 24 25 week? Computer-Aided Transcription By Corsillo & Grandillo Court Reporters

Is that basically because you've blocked off a

certain amount of time today no matter how long we take?

ي ج

de

22

1.9

X - 2

1 Yes. That's true, A 2 Q Did you have a chance to review the records pertaining to the plaintiff? 3 I did. 4 Α 5 Q Doctor, I want to ask you some questions, and in your testimony I want you to base any opinions upon a reasonable 6 degree of medical certainty, okay? 7 Sure. 8 Α 9 From your review of the medical records were you able 0 10 to determine what injuries the plaintiff sustained in the accident, the motor vehicle accident? 11 12 Α Yes. 13 What injuries did you determine that she sustained? 0 Joanne Crow sustained a open fracture of the right 14 Α radius in what we call the distal third, that is the third 15 of the bone closest to the elbow, rather closest to the 16 17 wrist. We typically divide the bones by thirds, the upper, middle and lower third, and this was in the lower half of 18 19 the right radius. 20 Q Were you able to determine what treatment she 21 received? 22 Yes. Α 23 What treatment did she receive? 0 She received appropriate care and treatment on the 24 Α 25 scene by the EMS squad. She had appropriate care and

> Computer-Aided Transcription By Corsillo & Grandillo Court Reporters

Le se

1577

24

10

2.82

ł., 3

treatment in the emergency room at the MetroHealth Medical
 Center. She had the necessary operation and she recovered
 beautifully from that injury and surgery.

4 Q Were you able to determine from the records whether5 the fractures healed properly?

6 A Yes. It is entirely healed and healed in the7 position that it was set in.

8 Q And how, again, would you describe the result that9 was received or obtained?

10 A I think it's an excellent objective result.

11 Q Doctor, from your review of the records pertaining to 12 the plaintiff following her surgery did you see any 13 treatment or doctors' visits from MetroHealth after October 14 1 of **1996** with regards to her right arm or hand?

15 A No.

16 Q So is it fair to state then that approximately three 17 and a half months after the accident it appears as though 18 the plaintiff had no further treatment with regards to her 19 right arm or hand?

20 A That is a true statement, yes.

21 Q Now, you're aware from the records that the plaintiff
22 had a fall approximately one year after the motor vehicle
23 accident?

24 A Yes.

25 **a** During your review of those records of the

5- 11

.

5.3

ي الج

া

plaintiff's treatment in May, June, July and August of 1997
 did you find any record of the plaintiff ever complaining
 about any problems with her right arm or hand?

4 A No. The records were solely for her severe left
5 wrist fracture and no complaints in reference to her right
6 upper extremity.

7 Q During that time frame was the plaintiff seeing8 orthopedic specialists such as yourself?

9 A She was, yes.

10 Q As a physician if a patient were to complain of a 11 problem, would that physician make a note of that in the 12 record?

13 A The standards of care for charting in any medical
14 community involves placing all the patient's complaints,
15 not just the ones that you're most concerned with, any
16 complaints that the patient voices should be placed with an
17 appropriate documentation of an examination.

18 Q And if the plaintiff had complained of problems with
19 her right arm, would you have expected the physicians to
20 have examined her and documented their findings?

A That would be what would be typically seen, certainly
at Metro, that they provide excellent medical care there.
Q And again I want to make sure the jury understands.
There is no record of any problems with her right arm or
hand during May, June, July and August of '97 when she was

- 3

. 19

 $\left( \begin{array}{c} \\ \end{array} \right)$ 

e. ...

(1.12) (1.12) (1.12) 1 seen at MetroHealth Hospital?

2 A I don't believe there is even one reference to her3 right side.

4 Q Now, Doctor, during your review of the records
5 pertaining to the plaintiff did you have a chance to
6 observe the toxicology report?

7 A Yes. She had fairly routine laboratory studies in
8 the emergency room and one of them was a toxicology screen
9 for blood alcohol.

10MR. COTICCHIA: Objection. The Court11has ruled that the alcohol will be excluded12from testimony. The Court has given counsel13for the defendant permission to file a14motion to reconsider.

15Number two, the alcohol is not related16to the cause of the injury, nor is it17related to any knowledge that the plaintiff18may have regarding the driver who was, in

19 fact, intoxicated.

20 Q Doctor, did you have a chance to review the

21 toxicology report?

22 A I did.

23 Q Was a blood alcohol test performed?

**24** A Yea.

25 Q From your review of the records do you know what time

1 the blood alcohol test was taken?

1

12

1.2

1

n =

19

1

•54

Contraction of the

2 A Approximately 12:20 a.m., about an hour after the car3 accident.

4 Q From your review of the records what did the test5 results demonstrate?

6 A It demonstrated a blood alcohol level of .18, which7 is legally intoxicated in the State of Ohio.

8 MR. COTICCHIA: Objection. Move to 9 strike. .1 relates to Chapter 45, the 10 operation of motor vehicles. I would like 11 to know what the doctor's referring to 12 that's not legally permitted or legal level 13 when, in fact, this lady wasn't driving a 14 motor vehicle.

MR. GREER: You've made your objectionfor the record.

MR. COTICCHIA: What's he referring to
that's illegal limit? She's not driving the
car.

20 MR. GREER: I'm going to object to the 21 form of your objection. You've made an 22 objection for the record. You can inquire 23 of the doctor on cross-examination.

Q Doctor, to a reasonable degree of medical certainty
would a blood alcohol level of .18 have an impact upon a

Computer-Aided Transcription By Corsillo & Grandillo Court Reporters

person's perception? 1 2 MR. COTICCHIA: Objection. Move to 3 strike. Contrary to the Court's ruling in 4 limine? 5 Α Yes. Doctor, would a blood alcohol level of .18 have an 6 0 impact upon a person's reactions? 7 MR. COTICCHIA: Objection. 8 Move to 9 strike. Contrary to the Court's order in limine. 10 11 Yes, it would. Α Doctor, would a blood alcohol level of .18 have an 12 0 impact upon a person's judgment? 13 MR. COTICCHIA: Objection. Move to 14 15 strike. Contrary to the Court's order in limine. 16 Yes, it would. 17 Α Doctor, would a blood alcohol level of .18 have an 18 0 impact upon a person's memory? 19 Objection. Move to 20 MR. COTICCHIA: 21 strike, Contrary to the Court's order in limine. 22 Yes, it would. 23 Α Doctor, would a blood alcohol level of .18 have an 24 0 25 impact upon a person's ability to think clearly?

> Computer-Aided Transcription By Corsillo & Grandillo Court Reporters

.3

. . .

言葉

1 MR. COTICCHIA: Objection. Move to 2 strike, Contrary to the Court's order in 3 limine. Yes, it would. 4 Α 5 0 Doctor, you did have a chance to examine the plaintiff, correct? 6 7 Α Yes, I did. When did you examine the plaintiff? 8 0 The examination took place here in my office on 9 Α August 5 of 1998. 10 Could you describe for the jury what you did during 11 0 12 the course of your examination? 13 My examination was a typical orthopedic examination Α for an initial evaluation. It involved taking a medical 14 15 history, observing the patient, doing a detailed physical 16 examination and a detailed neurological examination. Ιt 17 was basically a comprehensive orthopedic exam. 18 0 During the course of your examination, Doctor, was plaintiff's counsel present? 19 20 Yes. Α 21 And did plaintiff's counsel have a video taken of 0 22 your examination? 23 A videographer was there the entire time. Α Doctor, I would like to hand to you what's been 24 0 25 marked as Defendant's Exhibit B. Is that a copy of the

(Tay)

1 video of your examination of the plaintiff?

2 A That's what the label states, yes.

3 Q Now, Doctor, could you describe for the jury the4 findings during your examination?

5 A I would be glad to.

The physical findings, again, the examination was 6 confined to the upper extremities, that is both of the 7 In order to fully evaluate the right upper extremity 8 arms. 9 I evaluated the left upper extremity. And the left upper extremity was actually more abnormal than the right upper 10 11 extremity. This was the wrist fracture area that she sustained about a year after this right wrist fracture in 12 13 the car accident.

Examination of the right upper extremity showed that she had better mobility at the wrist and elbow and, in fact, full mobility at the wrist and the elbow, whereas there was approximately 15 percent restriction of movement in her left upper extremity at the elbow and at the wrist joint.

There was approximately a 5 centimeter laceration, which is about, I don't know, maybe 2 inches -- well, maybe less than 2 inches long, with about a 15 centimeter incision about 5 or so inches long that was on the right radial, that **is** the thumb side of the forearm, that was due to this accident. The laceration was where the bone had

1 A I do have an opinion, yes.

2 Q What is your opinion?

1

100

100

...,

ч, i

1

10.00

3 A The patient sustained a open fracture of the right
4 distal third of the radius and she also sustained a
5 fracture of the distal ulna at that same extremity.

6 Q Do you have an opinion to a reasonable degree of7 medical certainty as to whether the fracture is healed?

8 A I do have an opinion.

9 Q What is that opinion?

10 A The fracture has completely healed radiologically and11 clinically.

12 Q Do you have an opinion to a reasonable degree of 13 medical certainty as to whether the plaintiff obtained a 14 good orthopedic result?

15 A I do have an opinion.

16 Q What is that?

17 A To the best of my diagnostic ability and in comparing
18 this injury to many injuries I've had in my practice
19 similar, she has an excellent result.

20 Q Do you have an opinion to a reasonable degree of 21 medical certainty as to whether the plaintiff is suffering 22 from de Quervain Syndrome today?

23 A There was no evidence of de Quervain Syndrome, which24 is a tendonitis of the thumb.

25 Q Do you have an opinion to a reasonable degree of

13

, 1 . 1

ŝ

1 medical certainty as to whether the plaintiff will need to
2 have the plate in her arm, her right arm, removed at some
3 point?

**4** A I do have an opinion.

5 Q What is that opinion?

I do not believe she needs to have the plate 6 Λ 7 removed. It is a small, more flexible type of plate. It would be totally an option up to the patient and a doctor 8 who would be willing to do it. It is not a medical 9 necessity, nor do I recommend individuals with forearm 10 fractures to have their plates removed, so I would not 11 12 recommend it.

13 Q From your review of the medical records have any of 14 the plaintiff's treating physicians ever advised her that 15 at some point she should have the plate removed?

16 A Not to my knowledge.

17 Q Doctor, do you have an opinion to a reasonable degree18 of medical certainty as to whether the plaintiff has any19 problems or residuals today?

A Other than the complaints that she has, that is of
the stiffness in the arm and the numbress around the
incision, there are no objective or measurable
abnormalities that a physician can find that would be
abnormal. She has the scar from her wound and scar from
her surgery, but that's about it. She has full functional

ं द

- 21

4

1.4

1.4

1 mobility. She has excellent muscular development. And by
2 all criteria doctors use, she has a wonderful result.
3 Q Doctor, with regards to the sensation around the
4 incision site do you have an opinion to a reasonable degree
5 of medical certainty as to whether that will resolve in
6 time?

To answer your question specifically, typically 7 Α people that complain of incisional or what I call 8 peri-incisional, that is around the incision numbness, that 9 typically reduces with time. Again, this is a subjective 10 type of area and it's difficult to document straight across 11 12 the board because you are depending on the patient's voracity in explaining where these abnormalities they claim 13 But typically this gets better with time. 14 are. 15 Doctor, do you have an opinion to a reasonable degree 0 of medical certainty as to whether the plaintiff has any 16

17 functional problems today?

18 A Well, certainly at the time of my evaluation there
19 was no functional impairment of the right upper extremity.
20 There was a definite functional impairment in her left
21 upper extremity.

22 Q And the injury to her left upper extremity was caused 23 how?

24 A By the subsequent injury that happened about a year25 afterwards.



, . .

, -

÷

النينيدا

i Li

1	Q When she fell down the stairs?		
2	A Correct.		
3	Q Doctor, do you have a reasonable do you have an		
4	opinion to a reasonable degree of medical certainty as to		
5	whether the plaintiff has obtained a highly successful		
6	recovery from the injuries she sustained in the car		
7	accident?		
8	MR. COTICCHIA: Objection. Asked and		
9	answered. Move to strike.		
10	A I do believe she's had a very successful recovery,		
11	yes.		
12	MR. GREER: Thank you, Doctor. No		
13	further questions.		
14	MR. COTICCHIA: Dr. Corn, I'm Joe		
15	Coticchia. I represent Joanne Crow and her		
16	husband, Ken Crow.		
17			
18	EXAMINATION		
19			
20	BY MR. COTICCHIA:		
21	Q I'm going to try to find out if we can agree on		
22	anything today, Dr. Corn.		
23	From the report that I have which you sent to the		
24	defendant's lawyer, it's dated August <b>26, 1998,</b> you		
25	examined Joanne Crow on August 5, <b>1998, is</b> that correct?		

23

**1 A** Yes.

\*

्य

-

and.

1997) 1997 - 1997 - 1997 1997 - 1997 - 1997 1997 - 1997 - 1997 1997 - 1997 - 1997 - 1997 1997 - 1997 - 1997 - 1997 - 1997 1997 - 199

1. C. C.

2 Q And that was more than two years from the time of the3 injury, is that correct?

**4 A** Y e s.

5 Q And in your report that the only aspect of Dr.
6 Fumich's report that you disagree with is his high
7 correlation of the development of carpal tunnel syndrome,
8 is that correct?

9 A I don't remember Dr. Fumich's report word for word,
10 but one of the areas I felt that were somewhat inaccurate
11 in his report was the incidence of carpal tunnel syndrome
12 after this type of fracture. It is much more common after
13 the type of fracture she had in her left arm, but not in
14 the right arm.

MR. COTICCHIA: Objection to the 15 answer as not responsive to the question. 16 17 Maybe you didn't understand me. Will you please turn 0 to Page 2 of your report. The last paragraph in the 18 middle, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6 lines down with the first 19 20sentence, isn't it true that you state in this report, Doctor, do you have it in front of you? 21

22 A I do.

23 Q You see the part that I'm quoting?

**24** A I see the exact part that you're quoting.

**25 Q** "The only aspect of Dr. Fumich's report that I

forced its way through the skin and the incision was in
 order to get exposure in order to do the internal fixation
 procedure.

4 Other than the scar and an area of subjective 5 numbress that she seemed to have about the incision, there 6 was no atrophy in the forearm or muscle wasting. The right 7 side was larger than the left side, which was interesting, 8 which means she's using her right side more than the left 9 side. And basically other than the incision she had a 10 normal examination.

11 Q Doctor, have you had an opportunity to review the 12 medical report of Dr. Fumich?

13 A I have.

a transformation and the second secon

13

1.46

. 2

2

54 24

E.V

**14** Q How long is his report?

15 A Just short of two pages.

16 Q Do you know, Doctor, whether Dr. Fumich ever examined17 the plaintiff?

**18** A He never examined the patient.

19 Q As far as you know are you the last physician to have
20 examined the plaintiff with regards to her right arm and
21 hand?

22 A As far as I'm aware of, yes.

23 Q Doctor, do you have an opinion to a reasonable degree
24 of medical certainty what injuries the plaintiff sustained
25 in the motor vehicle accident?

1.15

2

3

の日本

disagree with is the fact that with the distal third radial 1 2 fractures there is a high correlation of development of carpal tunnel. syndrome." 3 Is that, in fact, what you said? 4 5 That is exactly what I said word for word. Α 6 0 And is that, in fact, the only part of Dr. Fumich's 7 report that you disagree with? I don't remember the rest of the report at this point 8 Α in time. 9 0 Then we can take your word for what you've put here 10 in print, can't we? 11 We can take my word on that subject only, that that Α 12 is a point that I had disagreement when I wrote that 13 14 report, yes. 15 0 All right. I also disagree that the plate has to be removed, but 16 Α that never came up before. 17 18 0 In the report --19 Whose report? Α -- prepared by you, you state that Dr. Fumich does 20 0 not mention Joanne Crow's fractured left arm, correct? 21 I don't remember. 22 Α 23 0 In fact, did you read Dr. Fumich's report? 24 I read Dr. Fumich's report, yes, Α 25 0 And, in fact, he refers to that, doesn't he?

13

17

3

1.13

See 2

1.1

He may. I don't remember. A 1 2 Q If he refers to it in this report, would you state that you made a mistake in your report? 3 MR. GREER: Objection. 4 I don't know. S Α 6 Well, Doctor, you state in your report, "Dr. Fumich Q made no reference to Joanne Crow's fractured left arm." 7 Didn't you say that? 8 9 Can you tell me where it is? A 10 I want to go off the record and let you read it 0 yourself. 11 12 I know. But tell me what page it is. Α 13 Q No, I'm not. You told me you reviewed it and I'm asking you a question. I'm not going to review it for 14 you. If you don't remember, you can state on the record 15 16 you don't remember. I told you I didn't remember, twice. 17 Α 18 0 Doctor, I want to mark this as -- I'll just make a note up here, Plaintiff's Exhibit 171, and ask you if this 19 20 is the report of Dr. Fumich that you state that you read. 2% 22 (Plaintiff's Exhibit 171 was marked for identification.) 23 MR. GREER: 24 I'm going to object to the 25 introduction of the report of Dr. Fumich and

 $\frac{1}{2}$ 

Г. <u>В</u> 1. 1.29

· . . .

1		move to strike the report.
2	A	Okay.
3	Q	All right. Is that the is that the same copy that
4	you ha	ave?
5	Α	I think this is the original.
6	Q	And is that what you're claiming there is no
7	refer	ence
8	Α	There is a paragraph on the second page that he does
9	casua	lly mention the left wrist fracture.
10	Q	So your report is mistaken, at least in that aspect,
11	isn't	it?
12	A	If I said that, then I am mistaken, absolutely.
13	Q	Do you agree, Doctor, that Joanne Crow's scar from
14	the surgery is a permanent residual?	
15	Α	Yes.
16	Q	You agree that Joanne's scar, which is where the bone
17	broke	through the skin, is also a permanent residual?
18	A	Unless she has surgery to revise it, yes, it's
19	permar	nent.
20	Q	You agree that these two scars have caused a ${f loss}$ of
21	sensat	tion?
22	Α	She's claiming there has been, yes.
23	Q	I'm asking you if you agree with that statement.
24	A	I don't know, because it's a subjective response. ${\tt I}$
25	can te	ell you what she said, but I don't know.

1 Q Doctor, I call to your attention your report that you
2 sent to the defendant's lawyer and ask you to turn to the
3 last page, Page 5, and I call your attention to your second
4 last sentence. I quote, "Her complaints of pain are
5 similar to individuals with similar injuries." Isn't that
6 what you stated?

7 A That's exactly what it says.

; ...**a** 

-

وتغيرت

ŀ-,

أقتدار

20

---

~ **`** 

 8 Q So if Joanne Crow based on your, as you've testified 9 your wide spread experience in treating injuries of this 10 type, if her complaints are those that are similar to other 11 people with fractured arms, then you have no reason not to 12 believe Joanne Crow, do you?

13 A Well, the complaints of pain are similar, not the 14 complaints of numbness, and I think that's what your 15 original questions were.

16 Q Have you had other patients in which you've performed 17 surgery and plated a fracture for a distal radius?

18 A Sure, many times.

19 Q Have other patients complained of numbress in the 20 area of the incision?

21 A For short periods of time, yes.

Q Have patients complained of numbress in the areawhere the bone has broken through the skin?

A For usually a shorter period of time than from theincision. But they do for weeks or months, yes. Not

1 years.

្ត

, i

ad

تي بيد ل

2 Q If a patient were to continue complaining as Joanne
3 has two years and two to three months following the initial
4 collision, would you agree that this is a permanent
5 residual?

6 A I don't know.

7 Q You do agree that her complaints of pain are
8 consistent with your experience in treating other patients
9 with similar type fractures?

10 A The pain that she claimed to have, yes.

11 Q Those pains I think you also stated that were related12 to transient tendonitis?

13 A Well, I think that that's what it was felt to be.

14 Now, I didn't see her with this, but based on her history

15 that's what I would have called it, yes.

**16** Q And what is tendonitis, Doctor?

17 A If is a temporary inflammation of a tendon.

**18** Q You just testified that you thought that Joanne

19 Crow's treatment was a good surgical result, is that

- 20 correct?
- 21 A Yes.

22 Q Would you agree that the fact that the plate is in
23 her arm and in light of the fact that you don't think it
24 should be removed, isn't that plate a permanent residual of
25 the accident?

# F .

; ]

1

1

14

10

ः ः

. Î

1.000

أنشن

1.2.2

A I guess it is. I never considered that. But yes,
 unless it is removed, it will be there forever.

3 Q It's not normal, is it, as far as a person that --

4 A She wasn't born with it.

5 Q Right. And as a matter of fact, in your report, Dr.
6 Corn, you said that you couldn't even get a normal

7 comparison because she had also had a fractured left arm, 8 is that correct?

9 A Well, she didn't have a normal arm to compare it to,10 yes.

11 Q So essentially we've got a person in Joanne Crow with
12 two arms that are not normal?

13 A No. That's not true. She had full function of her 14 right arm, but her left arm is more -- is the one that's 15 abnormal. There was not a normal one to compare the right 16 arm to. But her indices, that is her range of motion and 17 her size of the muscles, were normal and consistent.

18 Q So is it your testimony that a person with a 19 fractured right arm as you stated from this accident in the 20 collision where the car rolled and then the subsequent fall 21 at home in which she fractured her left arm, that those two 22 arms are normal?

23 A No. The left arm is not normal. The right arm is
24 normal by all objective criteria; that is range of motion,
25 size and muscle development.

1 Q Doctor, in the video -- I assume you've watched the 2 video?

3 A I have not seen the video.

4 Q You didn't observe it?

5 A I did not.

1

1.00

-4

ی سر

1. ...

**ئ**يہ .

77 134 134

 ${\mathbb P}_{\mathbb Q}$ 

6 Q By the way, I noticed in your thorough review of the 7 records you didn't make any reference to the x-rays. Do 8 you have the x-rays here?

9 A I do not.

10 Q Did you ever review the x-rays before you testified 11 today?

12 A I did not.

13 Q And as you know, Joanne Crow signed an authorization 14 for the defendant's lawyer so that you could get all the 15 records.

16 A I have no idea.

17 Q You testified that you gave a thorough review of all18 the records in front of you, is that correct?

19 **A** Yes.

20 Q But, in fact, you haven't thoroughly reviewed all of 21 the medical documents and films relating to Joanne Crow, 22 have you?

23 A I've reviewed everything that was presented to me.
24 Q My question is, in fact, you have not reviewed all of
25 the records and documents including the films related to

32 the fracture of Joanne Crow's right arm? 1 2 I'll answer it the same way. Everything that was Α 3 presented to me I reviewed. If there are any other 4 documents or any other entries, I don't know that they exist, and I have not seen anything else. 5 б Q Okay. So you don't know whether or not x-rays exist, is that correct? 7 Α I have no idea. 8 9 0 Doctor, in fact, will you please turn through those records in front of you that you thoroughly reviewed and 10 11 tell me if there are any x-ray reports? 12 Α There are x-ray reports. 13 0 So then would you agree that x-rays were taken? 14 Α I agree x-rays were taken, sure. 15 0 You just haven't seen them, have you? I just don't know if the x-rays films exists and 16 Α nobody ever presented them to me for review. 17 18 0 You just said you reviewed the reports, and the reports are based on films, is that correct? 19 That would be the normal routine. 20 Δ Yes. 21 Then would you agree with me that x-ray films exist? 0 22 They existed at least at one point in time. Α I don't know if they currently exist. I've never seen them. 23 24So you don't know the alignment of the plate, nor the 0 25 alignment of the fracture of Joanne Crow other than what

17

1

3

٠,

1 you read in the printed matter on the x-ray report?

2 A Well, I could tell by the physical examination that
3 if there was any malrotation or any poor positioning, she
4 would not have as free a range of motion that she has.

5 Q That was not my question.

1

-,.-

A

1.

6 MR. COTICCHIA: Objection as not 7 responsive.

8 Q The question is, you don't know in regard to the 9 alignment of the fracture and you don't know in regard to 10 the alignment of the plate whether it's normal or not other 11 than what you read in the printed report?

12 A Correct. And what I found on physical examination.

13 Q Is it your testimony that you can palpate the

14 alignment and union of a fracture?

15 A You can palpate the alignment. You can't tell union16 without an x-ray.

17 Q Doctor, isn't it true that you did not perform any18 functional strength tests in regard to Joanne Crow?

19 A I did not do any Jamar dynamometer type testing, no.20 That's not part of my examination.

21 MR. COTICCHIA: Objection. Not 22 responsive to the question.

23 Q Isn't it true that you did not perform any functional
24 strength tests in regard to Joanne Crow's right arm?
25 A I don't know what you mean by functional strength

1 tests. Well, you made a reference in the video, did you not, 2 0 to a Finkelstein test? 3 4 Α That's not a strength test. Let me ask you the question, please. 5 Ο 6 Did you not make a reference to the video -- in the 7 video to a Finkelstein test? 8 I did not review the video. I don't know. Α 9 Q You don't remember? I can't remember what I said a month and a half ago. 10 Α Did the defendant's lawyer give you a copy of Dr. 11 0 12 Fumich's deposition? 13 А No. 14 Q Did he give you a summary of Dr. Fumich's deposition? 15 Α No, he did not. So you don't know and you can't even agree or 16 0 disagree if I were to tell you that Dr. Fumich testified 17 under oath in his video that you did not perform a 18 Finkelstein test? 19 20 Α I did perform a Finkelstein test. I don't know what Dr. Fumich's opinion of that was, 21 22 Did you perform any type of test to determine grip 0 strength or pinch strength? 23 24 Α No. 25 0 What does the Finkelstein test do?

.

.

•---

أرجعه

×۲ ن

Contraction of the second

4

A Finkelstein test is strictly a test in which you
 position the wrist in order to elicit soreness within the
 first dorsal compartment of the wrist.

4 Q And will you demonstrate to us on the camera how a5 Finkelstein test is performed?

6 A Use the flexion and ulnar deviation of the wrist is7 the Finkelstein test.

8 Q That is your understanding of a Finkelstein test?

9 A That's what I've used as a Finkelstein test for 2510 years.

11 Q Doctor, do you have Campbell's on Orthopedics here in 12 your library?

**13** A I do.

i.

() ()

. .

1

...;

14 Q Can we go off the record for a minute so we can find15 the Finkelstein test.

16 (Recess was had.)

17 Q Doctor, can we agree that you have been nice enough 18 to allow me to review Campbell's Orthopedic Textbook, 7th 19 edition in regard to --

20 A I don't know how much of it you've read. You've21 certainly looked at Page 462 and 463.

Q Okay. I'm going to quote to you. "Finkelstein test is usually positive on grasping the patient's thumb and quickly abducting the hand ulnarward, the pain over the styloid tip is excruciating."

1 Do you agree with that description of the Finkelstein 2 test?

3 A I do.

7

3

14

1771

3

(Restand

4 Q And you did not do that test to Joanne Crow, did you?
5 A No. I was instructed at The Cleveland Clinic never
6 to do that because it tends to make people more
7 uncomfortable than they need to be. But the test that I do
8 actually is the equivalent, but rarely gives the patients
9 severe amount of pain.

10 Q So it's my understanding that you do not agree with 11 the medical textbook that you keep in this office, is that 12 correct?

13 A I do not agree with that approach. It's a very old 14 test and there are new, more modern ways of doing it that 15 are equally called the Finkelstein test, although it 16 doesn't involve wrenching the thumb. I think that's 17 barbaric.

I have one question here. Again for the record this 18 0 is a drawing by Dr. Netter showing you -- I have not marked 19 this as an exhibit. It's only a diagram. Does that 20 drawing by Dr. Netter show the tissue, muscles and nerves 21 involving those areas that we're talking about whether 22 we're talking about Finkelstein or de Quervain? 23 24 Well, not all of them, but it does show some of the Α 25 areas.
1 0 Is it a reasonable drawing or diagram? 2 It's a reasonable drawing, but it doesn't show where Α the pathology would be in de Quervain's disease. 3 4 0 Where would it be in that drawing? 5 It's the next layer under this one that's drawn. Α 6 Q So it's not shown in this picture? 7 Α I don't see it in that. 8 0 Okay. Thank you. Doctor, what percentage of your practice is related 9 to what we would call here examinations for non-treatment 10 pertaining to injuries or in this case insurance claims or 11 industrial accidents or Workers' Compensation type claims? 12 13 MR. GREER: I'm going to object to the form of the question and move to strike any 14 15 references to insurance. MR. COTICCHIA: Objection is noted. 16 Farmers Insurance is a party to this suit. 17 MR, GREER: Sure. My objection 18 stands. 19 20 All right. What percentage of your practice is 0 related to doing examinations at the request of insurance 21 22 companies or the request of employers or the request of firms that represent insurance companies or law firms that 23 24 represent employers? 25 Α I would say a small portion.

0.0

.

1

1.11

Computer-Aided Transcription By Corsillo & Grandillo Court Reporters

. 6

1

.....

2

1 Q Can you give me a number in relation of 0 to 100
2 percent?

3 A I see an average of 2 a week out of 60 to 70. So I
4 don't know what that percentage would be. 1/15, 1/32. I
5 don't know. I'm not that great at math.

6 Q Dr. Corn, would you disagree if I told you that your
7 secretary under oath said that you see on the average of 3
8 to 4 patients per week for these types of examinations?

9 A Well, you said specifically for insurance. She was10 including the Workman's Comp evaluations as well.

11 Q I also said industrial or for employers who are12 represented by attorneys.

13 A I think it would vary from week to week, but the14 average is still 2. I can see 4.

15 Q I'm going to quote you a deposition question and 16 answer of Marie Millen. Is Marie Millen still your 17 secretary?

She's my office manager and she basically has No. 18 Α nothing to do with the scheduling of individuals, but she 19 certainly has what she considers her knowledge in the area. 20 21 Q All right. On September 9, 1997, which is about a 22 year ago, in the case of Michael Hegedus versus Michael 23 Johnson, apparently you were asked to do an examination of 24 Mr. Hegedus who was injured and involved in a lawsuit. Do 25 you remember that particular case?

1 A Yes.

- 1

24

\_\_\_

فتدتوا

. С. ....

× ....

2 MR. GREER: I'm just going to enter an
3 objection to the form of the question and
4 also foundation.

5 Q On Page 28 Michael Kube asked the following 6 question. "Okay. Over the last let's just talk -- let's 7 take it 6 months, which is more recent time, is that too 8 big a time for you? No. Well, no. I'm going to say it's 9 still going to be the same number, 3 or 4. Answer, a 10 week."

11 Would you agree or disagree with that?

12 Α I would say at one point it time it may have been 13 that. It varies from week to week. The Workman's Comp 14 specialty exams, the C-92 exams we do on a rotational basis 15 with all the other doctors who are licensed and approved in I haven't done one since the middle of July, so 16 the area. 17 I think the numbers have changed, but may have been that at one point in time. 18

19 Q Dr. Corn, it's my understanding that you charge \$900
20 per hour if I am to take your deposition for discovery
21 purposes, is that correct?

22 A My flat rate is \$900 an hour if anybody takes my
23 deposition. It's not just a favored rate for you.
24 Q Dr. Corn, is it my understanding that your rate of
25 \$900 an hour applies to the time you take when you examine

Computer-Aided Transcription By Corsillo & Grandillo Court Reporters

## 1 Joanne Crow?

2 A No. It has nothing to do with it.

3 Q Well, how do you explain a different rate for
4 examining somebody versus your time for providing a
5 deposition or your testimony today?

6 A Well, that's a good question. I do not charge just 7 for the evaluation. I charge one fee for the entire 8 examination which involves review of medical records and 9 report. I don't bill as a separate charge for the 10 examination and, therefore, I don't do it on a flat hourly 11 basis.

12 Q Well, you testified when the defendant's lawyer asked 13 you these same questions that you were charging for a block 14 of time, and my question is --

15 A For my deposition. Not for my independent16 examination.

17 Q All right.

12

18 A Because the blocks of time vary depending on how long 19 it takes to review the medical records and how long it 20 takes to get the records and how many times I've got to go 21 through them. So there's a lot more variables than a 22 straight hourly time as we are doing today.

Q How much time did you take in examining Joanne Crow?
A The actual exam I believe was about 23, 25 minutes,
something like that.

1

1

 $\frac{1}{2}$ 

1

į.

How much time did you take to review the medical 1 Q 2 records in front of you? I don't know. I don't keep a log of that. 3 Α How much time did it take to prepare your report? 4 0 A Another fraction. I didn't fractionate it like 5 6 that. I have no idea, 7 Ο What was the total charge that you charged Farmers Insurance for the examination, the review of the records 8 9 and your report? MR, GREER: I'm going to object and 10 move to strike the question. Dr. Corn was 11 not hired or retained by Farmers Insurance. 12 13 He was hired by me and he was paid by me. MR. COTICCHIA: Farmers Insurance is a 14 party defendant in this case. You represent 15 Farmers Insurance. 16 MR. GREER: I do not represent Farmers 17 18 Insurance. MR. COTICCHIA: All right. 19 MR. GREER: Wait. I want to get an 20 objection on the record. 21 I am not counsel for Farmers 22 Insurance. I am counsel for the defendant, 23 the estate of Douglas Dotson. Dr. Corn was 24 not hired by Farmers Insurance and he was 25

i s s i t s

20

----

'n,

ģ

1 not paid by Farmers Insurance. He was hired 2 by me and he was paid by my office. Ι object to the form of the question and I 3 move to strike the question in its entirety. 4 MR. COTICCHIA: Farmers Insurance is a 5 6 party to this lawsuit. Let's go on with this. Who are you 7 going to bill for reimbursement of the 8 expenses of Gallagher and Sharp for paying 9 Dr. Corn? Who reimburses your office for 10 11 that expense? MR. GREER: I'm not being deposed. 12 13 MR. COTICCHIA: Does the estate of 14 Douglas Dotson reimburse you? 15 MR. GREER: I'm not on deposition here, Mr. Coticchia. 16 All right. Well, let me ask you another question, 17 Q Doctor. Have you ever received a 1099 from Farmers 18 19 Insurance? 20 I have no idea. Α Have you ever done any examinations at the request of 21 0 Nationwide, Allstate, State Farm, Progressive, Motorists 22 Mutual? Any of those sound familiar to you, Dr. Corn? 23 Most of the time I deal directly with the attorneys 24 Α and I don't know exactly which companies that they are 25

> Computer-Aided Transcription By Corsillo & Grandillo Court Reporters

ંસ્

1

17

19

: 23

곗

hired by. I really don't know. I don't keep track of
 them.

3 Q As we were earlier -- I guess I should say as you
4 were earlier testifying, you were asked by the defendant's
5 lawyer hospitals at which you have privileges to treat, and
6 I want to be a little more specific.

7 Tell me what hospitals where you actually performeda surgery let's say in the last 12 months.

9 A I have performed surgery at the Meridia Hillcrest
10 Hospital, at Meridia Euclid Hospital, the Mt. Sinai
11 Hospital. I believe I may have done one at Bedford,
12 although I don't keep track of that. But most of my
13 surgeries are at the Meridia Health Systems.

14 Q So that would be Meridia Hillcrest, Meridia Euclid.15 Do you do any surgery at Meridia Huron?

16 A Not anymore.

**17** O Do you do surgery at University Hospitals?

18 A At the Bedford Medical Center, yes.

19 Q That's an affiliate of University Hospital. Do you20 do surgery at University Hospital at the University?

21 A No, I do not.

22 Q And I think you testified you're a medical instructor23 there, is that correct?

24 A Clinical instructor.

25 Q Clinical. You don't teach at the medical school?

...)

. .

<del>ر</del>...

Les .

N ....

122

ر السار بر الم مراجعة

ିଥି

1

1 A Not anymore.

2 Q Okay. And you don't do surgery at University3 Hospitals?

4 A I've never had privileges at University Hospitals.
5 Q All right. In the last 12 months approximately how
6 many surgeries have you performed at Meridia Hillcrest?
7 A I don't know the numbers of any of the hospitals.

7 A I don't know the numbers of any of the hospitals. I8 don't keep those kind of statistics.

9 Q In the last 12 months how many surgeries have you10 performed at Meridia Euclid?

11 A I don't know. I don't keep those statistics.

12 Q In the last 12 months how many surgeries have you13 performed at Mt. Sinai?

14 A I don't know. I don't keep those statistics.

15 Q Why don't you keep records of the number of surgeries16 that you perform at each one of these hospitals?

17 A Because I don't need to. It's not -- I don't need 18 that to run my office and I long since -- after almost 20 19 years in practice long since care how many operations I do 20 per year. That's something that's unnecessary in the 21 course of my practice or the course of my business.

Q Doctor, I'm going to show you a -- for the record a number of medical records which have been produced pursuant to the subpoena that I filed on behalf of Joanne Crow, and you're welcome to go off the record if you want to look at

these. But I want you to take a look at these and then
 tell me if, in fact, these are all reports that you have
 prepared.

4 A If those are the ones that were forwarded to you by
5 my attorney that were from another case, yes, those are all
6 reports that I prepared at one point in time. I have not
7 seen them for many months.

8 Q They were not forwarded to me from another case.9 They were produced in this case.

10 A They were forwarded to you, and the only reason we 11 had them was because we were specifically ordered to retain 12 those in another case, and that's the only reason that they 13 exist. Normally they would not exist.

14 Q Would you like to stay on the record when you go over 15 these reports?

16 A I'm not going to go over them.

**17** Q You are not?

18 A No.

1

1

े ह

 $\sim 10$ 

?

El altra

· 3

19 Q Will you at least take the time to make sure that20 they are all the same reports that --

21 I wouldn't have any record whether they were or they Α 22 weren't. I'm not even going to look at them. They stand 23 for what they are. They were produced. You know what they 24 I've read the communications between my personal are. attorney and you. You know what they are. 25 I know what

1 1 1 1

1

1

- Y

they are. You know where they came from. I don't know
 what you're making a big deal out of. I'm not going to go
 look at them.

4 Q Will you stipulate that these are your records5 produced by your attorney?

6 A Yes.

7 Q And isn't it true in virtually every one of these8 records your conclusion is the same?

9 MR. GREER: Objection.

If my opinion was that there was little or no injury, Δ 10 11 yes, it would be. That is not my universal goal. It is my -- It may be what these reports may have identified, 12 If there wasn't anything wrong, there is nothing wrong. 13 Isn't it true when it comes to -- as you refer to a 14 0 soft tissue injury you always state, this is a subjective 15 injury, there is no objective evidence of an injury? 16 Mr. Coticchia, I am a physician. If I state that 17 Α 18 there is no objective evidence of injury, there is no objective evidence of injury. That is my opinion. 19 Ιf there is, believe me, I would be the first one to say that 20 there was. 21

22 Q But you always state --

23 A I don't always state anything.

24 Q All right. Now that you said you don't always state25 that, I'm going to represent to you that's what you say in

The state of the state

23

No. No.

every soft tissue case in front of me. 1 2 Α Those are the ones that you have. And I want you to go over them. 3 Q I'm not going to bother to go over them. 4 А MR, GREER: I'm going to object to the 5 6 form of the question. Are you refusing to go over these reports, Doctor? 7 Q I'm not going to waste my time doing that, no. 8 Α 9 Q Well, I think I have a right to determine your credibility and your motives and your bias as a doctor who 10 is persistently hired by the same companies and the same 11 12 law firms. I'm going to object. 13 MR. GREER: Move 14 to strike, 15 0 If you are not going to go over these with me on the record, I'll be happy to leave them here with you and we'll 16 conclude or we'll resume this deposition tomorrow. 17 What is 18 your choice? 19 I have absolutely no intent to look at those files Α 20 again, so you can do what you want with them. You can ask me whatever questions you would like. I will give you a 21 honest medical opinion or an honest answer, but I am not 22 23 going to waste my time. 24Doctor, isn't it true on those occasions where there 0 is an objective condition you always state that that 25

> Computer-Aided Transcription By Corsillo & Grandillo Court Reporters

condition was not caused by the physical trauma involved in
 the accident of the patient you're examining?

3 MR, GREER: Objection to the form of
4 the question and foundation.

5 A If there is an objective problem and I believe it's
6 related to the accident, I will state so. If it is not, I
7 will state that it is not.

8 Q Well, I want you to show me in any one of these 104
9 reports where you state that there is an objective injury
10 and it's directly related to the trauma. Will you do that
11 for me?

12 A There may have been none.

13 Q I see.

ų,

.

- - -

. - <u>8</u>

1.1

14 A If there were none, then there were none at the time15 of the evaluation. It has nothing to go with anything but16 the facts and the truth.

17 Q Are there other reports that I don't have that cover 18 the time period of January 2, 1996 to December 26, 1997 19 that you have prepared?

20 A I don't know. I have no idea.

21 Q So you don't know if these are all the records that 22 you've --

A Those are all the ones that I have retained because I
knew I was going to be requested for them during that time
period.

្ម

1.1

العد سن

11

N 1

1.55

Did you dispose of any that you prepared? 1 0 2 Α If a case settled or a case was concluded, such as this one will be some day, I do not typically keep that 3 with that record. We kept these -- Excuse me. 4 Let me 5 finish. MR. COTICCHIA: Objection. 6 You're not responding. 7 Q I'm answering your question. 8 Α You're not responding to the question. My question 9 0 was, did you dispose of any records independent that I have 10 11 in front of me from January 2, 1996 until December 26, **1997,** yes or no? 12 I don't know. 13 Α 14 MR. GREER: Object to the form of the question. 15 So then you don't know whether or not there are 16 0 records that we don't have pursuant to this subpoena? 17 Again, you have everything that we were able to have 18 Α in relation to another case. Typically we do not keep any 19 So those are the only things that we have reports at all. 20 -- that we had in the office on a chart to chart review of 21 over 10,000 charts, that's the only records that we were 22 able to find. They were specifically not for you, but they 23 were done for a completely different matter and you were 24 25 just lucky that my attorney was honest enough to let you

> Computer-Aided Transcription By Corsillo & Grandillo Court Reporters

know that we had them. And that's basically how you got
 them. Not because you got them from me, because I don't
 even have those.

Well, I'm grateful that I'm so lucky. And I just 4 0 5 wonder how lucky the 104 people whose reports you prepared pertaining to their injuries feel when in every case nobody 6 had a permanent injury, if there was an objective injury, 7 8 it wasn't related to the collision. I just wonder why this happens so consistently and you're telling me you're not 9 10 going to even sit here and review them.

11MR. GREER: I'm going to object to the12form of the question. I'm also going to13object that there is no foundation and move14to strike the question in its entirety.15MR. COTICCHIA: There is no16foundation? Well, then let's start all

17 over.

54

 $\partial \partial$ 

i.m

. .;

18 Q Doctor, did you receive a subpoena captioned Joanne19 Crow versus the estate of Douglas Dotson?

20 A I have received many communications from you.

21 Q No. You received one communication.

22 A I don't remember.

23 Q You don't remember receiving a subpoena?

24 A I send, all my subpoenas that we receive to my25 attorney and he takes care of them.

·\*\*

13

1

2.2

: هدي

100

密索)

Q Well, would you agree that must be the way that you
 and I ended up in front of each other with these records?
 A Probably.

4 Q And that subpoena asked for all of the records and
5 reports that you prepared for insurance companies or law
6 firms that defend insurance companies from the years 1991
7 to 1997, didn't it?

8 A I don't remember.

9 Q All right. And the only records you were able to
10 find were from January of '96 through December of '97?

11 A Correct.

12 Q And those are the ones you say I'm lucky to have, is 13 that correct?

14 A Absolutely.

15 Q You think the people you examined are lucky to have 16 you as their examiner?

17 A I think they're very lucky to have me because I will18 give them an honest and truthful response.

19 Q Why do you destroy or discard these records? Why20 don't you keep them?

A Well, they are not involving patients that I treat, so I don't have to keep them. I don't have a lot of storage space, and it's my typical office practice once we're finished with a case or an evaluation, we don't keep any records. Most doctors don't keep records of anybody

that they see that are not their long-term patients. 1 2 0 Isn't it true, Doctor, that the reason you have these records disposed of promptly is because they reflect your 3 inability to be fair and objective? 4 MR. GREER: Objection. 5 I really -- That is probably one of the most 6 Α No. insulting things that anybody has ever said to me. 7 8 Well, I submit to you that these 104 reports are an 0 insult to people who are honestly injured. 9 10 MR. GREER: I'm going to object and 11 move to strike the question. 12 Well, you know, you don't know who these people are. Α You have no idea what their motives are. You never saw any 13 of those patients. None of them you're familiar with. 14 And you're just assuming that since you know all this medicine 15 that -- and these reports say they didn't have anything 16 wrong with them, that I'm incorrect and you're correct. 17 That's absurd. You're absurd and your requests have been 18 absurd. 19 20 I would never say that. But I think the doctors --0 But that's what you're insinuating. 21 Α 22 0 The doctors who wrote the reports contrary to what you say I think are insulted. And speaking of motives, let 23 me ask you a question. 24 25 I'm going to object and MR, GREER:

303

234

5.00

10

move to strike the question.

2 Q Isn't one of your motives and your primary motive in3 this situation compensation, money?

4 Α No. It is a way of making money, but I feel that I have a duty since I don't know many other doctors that 5 would submit to this kind of bologna that you've given me 6 and these legal hurdles that you're making me jump over and 7 the expense that it costs me to answer all of your 8 questions, both stupid and not stupid, that nobody's 9 willing to do this. No doctors, no reasonably good doctors 10 in this community want to go through this. So I am serving 11 a purpose, what I feel it's almost in this case a moral 12 purpose of sticking to my guns and being able to be 13 14 available as a witness and as an expert. There are nobody that really wants to do this because nobody really wants to 15 16 go to the expense that you're putting me through or the 17 hassles that you put me through. Nobody else wants to do this. 18

**19** Q Thank you for your speech and your moral

20 righteousness.

1

SR

1

1.0

ين بر فو

<u>\_</u>

,.2

1

I would never begin to say I know as much medicine as you. But I will say this, Doctor. I don't understand how you're saying expense that you're going through when you just testified you charge \$900 an hour to sit in front of this camera and explain why you're so morally good.

> Computer-Aided Transcription By Corsillo & Grandillo Court Reporters

1 MR, GREER: Objection. 2 Q How is that an expense? My legal fees --3 A 4 MR. GREER: Objection. Move to 5 strike. My legal fees to date double what I have ever made in 6 Α 7 any IME or deposition. They're over \$3,000 at this point in time answering to your subpoenas and all the bouncing 8 around that's going forth with Judge Russo. I am doing 9 10 this case for free. As a matter of fact, I'm losing \$1,800 11 being involved in this case. 12 0 How are you losing \$1,800? 13 Α Because my expenses are exceeding what I earned. 14 0 Well, Doctor, I would like to know what those expenses are since you've brought them up and since you 15 told us the great sacrifices you're making. What expenses 16 are you talking about? 17 I'm talking about what my running legal expenses are 18 Α in answering your subpoenas and having my attorney present 19 20 at all the pretrials, et cetera. 21 You mean you have to pay a lawyer, is that what 0 you're complaining about? 22 23 MR. GREER: Objection. I am not complaining. I am making a statement that 24 Α because of what you are asking me to produce I have to have 25

- 5

< 1

Computer-Aided Transcription By Corsillo & Grandillo Court Reporters

someone to answer for me in the legal forum. I am not 1 capable of doing that because I'm not a lawyer. 2 Doctor, isn't it a fact that the reason you 3 0 consistently write these reports and the reason you 4 consistently appear on video is because you're able to make 5 6 a substantial income and a substantial part of your 7 practice as a doctor? MR. GREER: Objection. 8 9 One of my reasons for doing this is that it helps pay Α the bills. The major reason I do that is because I enjoy 10 doing it, I enjoy the investigative work, I enjoy being 11 involved in cases, I enjoy reading short stories, and I 12 enjoy making a living from it. I don't enjoy dealing with 13 people like you. 14 Well, thank you, Doctor. I enjoy sitting here and 15 Q asking you these questions because I question your 16 integrity. 17 I'm going to object and 18 MR, GREER: move to strike the question. 19 0 I do want to get it on the record, you don't have to 20 look at every one of these, but I want to get it on the 21 22 record and I've got marked Plaintiff's Exhibits 68 through Plaintiff's Exhibit 170, and a couple of them were stapled 23 24 together so it's probably more than 104, but I want to make sure that these are the same records that you're referring 25 Computer-Aided Transcription By

1

िक्र

Ι,

3

12

Computer-Aided Transcription By Corsillo & Grandillo Court Reporters

i <sup>k</sup> <sup>1</sup> i i i i <sup>1</sup> i i i i i i i i

- 2

١d .

11

1

24

1 to that were produced under subpoena.

2 А I don't know. I'm not going to touch them. I'm not going to look at them. My attorney had them. I haven't 3 even seen them for over a year. I don't really get 4 5 involved with that. And isn't it true the only reason that you have these 6 0 7 is because you're under court order in another case? 8 Α Yes. And it's not the only case in which somebody has 9 0 questioned your motives for writing these reports, is it? 10 MR. GREER: Objection. 11 Nobody's ever -- Nobody's ever questioned my 12 No. A motives for writing the reports. 13 Well, I am, Doctor. 14 0 Nobody's ever to my face insulted me in that way. 15 Α MR. GREER: I'm going to object and 16 move to strike. 17 18 Doctor, I'm looking you in the eye and I'm 0 19 questioning your honesty and your reason and your moral righteousness for writing 104 reports in which every one of 20 21 these injured people either don't have an objective injury, 22 if the injury's objective, of course it's not related to the accident. Please show me one report in your history as 23

25 industry where you wrote somebody was permanently injured

Computer-Aided Transcription By Corsillo & Grandillo Court Reporters

a renowned orthopedic surgeon and a darling of the defense

1	as a direct result of the trauma which was the subject of
2	the litigation.
3	MR. GREER: I'm going to object, move
4	to strike and ask the Court to impose
5	sanctions on plaintiff's counsel for
6	unethical questioning which has continued
7	throughout this case.
8	MR. COTICCHIA: Bias, prejudice and
9	motive is never unethical.
10	MR. GREER: Your questioning is
11	unethical.
12	MR. COTICCHIA: Well, I'll be happy to
13	suspend this deposition because I'm going to
14	have the court order Dr. Corn to go through
15	all of these reports.
16	I don't have anymore questions.
17	
18	FURTHER EXAMINATION
19	
20	BY MR. GREER:
21	Q Doctor, I have a few questions. And I would love to
22	get back to the real issue, which is the plaintiff, Joanne
23	Crow here, okay?
24	A Sure.
25	Q You were asked some questions about her complaints of

(----

 $\square$ 

(**1**-1-1)

...

- 2

• • •

्र इ. --

2

د ۲

1

... ir..

د. و حد مربر

.....

Computer-Aided Transcription By Corsillo & Grandillo Court Reporters

- 1

5

100

1

To a a loss of sensation around the incision site. 1 reasonable degree of medical certainty do you believe that 2 that will improve with time? 3 I do. 4 Α Doctor, you were asked some questions about the plate 0 5 which is in the plaintiff's arm, the small plate. Are 6 there any problems with that plate in the plaintiff's arm 7 at present? 8 А 9 No. Is there any reason to believe that there ever will 10 0 be any problems with that plate remaining in her arm? 11 12 MR. COTICCHIA: Objection. 13 No. Α Do many people who have had fractures and have plates 14 0 on various limbs go throughout the remainder of their lives 15 with those plates still in place? 16 I would say a very large proportion, probably 85 to 17 Α 90 percent of individuals have their plates intact and 18 never have them removed. 19 And do those people have any problems with those 20 0 21 plates? Other than maybe setting off an airline alarm 2.2 Α No. once in a while, but that's not what I would call a 23 24 problem. Doctor, you were asked some questions pertaining to 25 0 Computer-Aided Transcription By Corsillo & Grandillo Court Reporters

1

15

) Sign

ور م

4

.....

You had all of the radiology reports concerning 1 x-rays. x-rays pertaining to the plaintiff, correct? 2 3 A Yes. 4 0 Was there any need for you to see the films? Α No. 5 From your review of Dr. Fumich's report is there any б  $\circ$ indication that he reviewed the x-ray films prior to 7 writing his report? 8 9 Α No. 10 0 You were asked some questions about misalignment of Is there any record the bones in the plaintiff's arm, 11 anywhere from any physician which indicates that there is 12 misalignment of the fractures? 13 No. 14 Α 15 0 Has any doctor mentioned anything or testified as far as you know about any misalignment? 16 Not that I'm aware of. 17 Α 18 0 You were next asked some questions about a 19 Finkelstein test. Could you show the jury how you perform a Finkelstein test and why? 20 I was instructed early on in my residency that 21 Δ Yes. you never grab the patient's thumb because if they have a 22 true de Quervain disease, they will be very painful for 23 weeks if not months afterwards by doing it that way. 24 The whole object in a Finkelstein test is to stretch 25 Computer-Aided Transcription By Corsillo & Grandillo Court Reporters

the first dorsal compartment which contains two tendons, 1 one that moves the second bone in the thumb and one that 2 moves the first bone, the metacarpal and the proximal 3 phalanx, the first digital bone. And what you do is you 4 have the patient -- you can do the exact same thing without 5 wrenching it by having the patient curl their thumb over 6 whereby gently holding their thumb down, flexing the wrist 7 and bringing the wrist in an ulnar direction, instead of 8 doing that which is what the Finkelstein test is. I do it 9 10 a little bit more passively and a little bit more humanely. Would you obtain the same result by performing the 11 0 12 test in that manner?

13 A Absolutely.

- 3

1.2

- 23

in the second

14 Q Now, Doctor, I want to just clarify a couple things15 for the jury.

You mentioned that -- you used the figure 10,000 16 charts in response to Mr. Coticchia's questioning 17 concerning the 104 reports which he has obtained from your 18 19 counsel. Is that approximately the number of patient charts and other charts and files which you had or have? 20 21 It's actually more than that. Closer to Α Yes. 22 12,000.

23 Q And as I understand from Mr. Coticchia's questioning,
24 the 104 reports cover a time frame of January 2 of 1996
25 through December 26 of 1997, essentially two years.

I don't know the dates. I'm not sure. 1 A 2 0 If we assume Mr. Coticchia's questioning, they cover That from January 2 of '96 through December 26 of 1997. 3 4 would be almost two years. 5 А Yes. 6 0 A few days short of that. 7 A Correct. а 0 And if we assume that he is correct that there are 104 reports that were produced, would you agree that that 9 10 essentially means that you prepared one IME report a week? 11 Certainly that would be the mathematics. Α MR, GREER: Thank you, Doctor. 12 No other questions. 13 I have a couple of MR, COTICCHIA: 14 15 questions. - - - -16 FURTHER EXAMINATION 17 18 BY MR, COTICCHIA: 19 20 Isn't it true, Doctor, of those 12,000 charts you 0 21 cannot tell us reasonably what percentage of those charts 22 represent non-treatment parties who are making injury 23 claims? 24 Α None of them are, or none that -- we don't typically keep them unless we're waiting for the deposition or we're 25 Computer-Aided Transcription By

7

1

1

Corsillo & Grandillo Court Reporters

waiting for the medical records to come about or they have 1 not been settled. Those are the only ones that we would 2 have in our files. 3

4 What records do you keep regarding examinations you Q do of injured claimants at the request of insurance 5 companies or defense firms? 6

We basically keep the records through the time of the 7 А examination. We typically send the records back to the 8 9 referring attorney. We typically do not keep the medical 10 report that we forwarded. And if it settles, that's it and 11 then we never have any other contact with it. If it goes to a deposition, then all the material is forwarded back to 12 us for the deposition, So we do not keep anything here in 13 the office. 14

15 Q Speaking of records, in regard to your examination of Joanne Crow do you have any notes or records independent of 16 17 the report you made for the defendant's lawyer?

Basically I have some typewritten notes only. 18 Α

19 Q Can I see those, please?

20 Α Sure.

123

- 3

21 MR. COTICCHIA: We can go off the 22 record for a minute. (Recess was had.) 23

I would like a copy of 24 MR. COTICCHIA: 25

Dr. Corn's notes on the examination of

Computer-Aided Transcription By Corsillo & Grandillo Court Reporters

Joanne Crow. Q Is that all right with you, Doctor? I don't care. Α MR. COTICCHIA: Thank you. I don't have anymore questions. MR. GREER: No questions. - - - - -(Deposition concluded.) - - - - -

2.77

୍ଦ୍ର

ă.

. ~

Computer-Aided Transcription By Corsillo & Grandillo Court Reporters

1 The State of Ohio, ) 2 County of Cuyahoga. ) CERTIFICATE

I, Aimee N. Szinte, a Notary Public within and for 3 the State of Ohio, duly commissioned and qualified, do hereby 4 5 certify that the within-named ROBERT C. CORN, M.D. was by me first duly sworn to testify the truth, the whole truth, 6 and nothing but the truth in the cause aforesaid; that the 7 testimony then given by him/her was by me reduced to 8 stenotypy in the presence of said witness, afterwards 9 transcribed upon a computer, and that the foregoing is a 10 true and correct transcript of the testimony so given by 11 him/her as aforesaid. 12

I do further certify that this deposition was taken at the time and place in the foregoing caption specified and was completed without adjournment.

16 I do further certify that I am not a relative, 17 counsel or attorney of either party or otherwise interested 18 in the event of this action.

**IN WITNESS WHEREOF**, I have hereunto set my hand and affixed my seal of office at Cleveland, Ohio on this 25th day of September, 1998.

in and for the State of Ohio.

25

22

23

24

1

1.3

75

د ني

3

My Commission expires 10-17-01.

ROBERT MARK PUMICH, M.D., F.A.C.S.M., F.A.C.S. = INC.=

ORTHOPAEDIC SURGERY AND SPORTS MEDICINE

June 1, 1998

Joseph L. Coticchia Co., L.P.A. Attorney at Law Ste. 1640 Standard Bldg 1370 Ontario Street Cleveland, Ohio 44113

Joanne M. Crow RE: DOI: 6-19-96

Dear Mr. Coticchia:

This is the review of records and report you requested on Joanne M. Crow in your letter of 5-27-98. Records reviewed were basically the Cleveland Police Crash Report and MetroHealth Medical Center Admission Chart.

Ms. Crow is a 35 year oid female standing 5'10", weighing 150 pounds who was involved in a motor vehicle accident on 6-19-96. She was the restrained front seat passenger in a Ford Escort going SO miles an hour. The driver lost control with the car swerving and hitting the median strip. The police report indicates the car may have flipped twice. There was heavy damage to the vehicle and the driver was killed. Ms. Crow was taken to Metropolitan General Hospital by squad for treatment of a right forearm injury. The forearm was deformed and one could visually see the bone poking out of the skin. There was a 2cm length volar laceration and a volar ulnar laceration. She was taken to surgery by Dr. Petersilge and underwent irrigation and debridement of the wounds followed by open reduction and internal fixation of the distal radius fracture with a seven hole 3-1/2, 3.5 limited contact dynamic compression plate. She was casted for approximately six weeks

Prior to going to the Operating Room, a strength and neurosensory examination was completed which was normal. She was admitted for treatment with IV antibiotics and discharged from the hospital on 6-22-96.

After the accident, cervical spine films were taken which were negative. On 10-1-96, she was evaluated by Dr. Wilbur with the complaints of numbness. He felt she had a de Quervain's disease and sensory deficit to the cutaneous nerves at the level of injury and was referred to a hand clinic, He noted that she did have full supination and pronation on the 10-1-96 visit. Records indicate Ms. Crow having gone to therapy but the frequency and length of time in duration of therapy postoperatively could not be determined from the records provided,

**PLAINTIFF'S** 

**EXHIBIT** 





FAX (216) 464-3021

## Page 2

Records likewise did not include notes from the suggested hand clinic visit nor did they include actual X-rays. It could not be determined from the records whether the patient was right or left hand dominant.

The rest of the Metropolitan General Hospital records are referable to an unrelated left wrist fracture as a result of falling down the stairs on 5-31-97, Apparently she suffered a comminuted left distal radius fracture and underwent a closed reduction which lost position and subsequently required open reduction and fixation with an Illizarov fixator. She developed a pin track infection after this.

No other records were available for review.

Having reviewed the material, it is my opinion that Ms. Crow suffered a compound fracture at the junction of the distal and middle third of the right radius and ulnar styloid fracture as a direct result of the 6-19-96 motor vehicle accident, As a result of the accident and subsequent fracture, she required surgical intervention and hospitalization with IV antibiotic treatment. Records reflect continued residual of numbness and tendinitis in the wrist area.

Records reflect that she did respond to surgical treament with the fracture having healed but that there was residual. As a result of this residual, I must consider the prognosis guarded. She will require future treatment with removal of the plate and screws. In addition, she may require tenovaginotomy of the wrist for the de Quervain's disease and possible surgical intervention for the residual numbress. In addition, there is a high correlation of the development of carpal tunnel syndrome after such injury and subsequent surgery.

Further, residual of stiffness and pain with changes in barometric pressure will be permanent residual as they are with most fractures.

It is my opinion that the above described injury was caused by the 6-19-96 motor vehicle accident.

There were no billing statements for the services rendered in the records reviewed.

I hold the **above** opinions within a reasonable degree of medical certainty and reserve the right to change these opinions pending the review of whatever records may become available for review in the future.

Most respectfully,

Robert Mark Fumich, M.D. RMF:NM