SUPERIOR COURT OF THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA CIVIL DIVISION x DONNO R. MERRIWEATHER, as Mother and next friend of John Merriweather, a Disabled : Minor, Plaintiff, : Civil Action No. 91-CA4094 : Calendar 10 : Judge G. Kessler vs. HOWARD UNIVERSITY, INC. t/a HOWARD UNIVERSITY HOSPITAL : et al.. Defendants. x

Washington, D.C.

Friday, May 29, 1992

The telephonic deposition of ELIAS CHARLES CHALHUB,

M.D., called for examination by counsel for Plaintiff in the above entitled matter, pursuant to Notice, at 2:15 p.m., convened at the offices of Jack H. Olender, 1634 I Street, Northwest, Washington, D.C., before Alice Toigo, a notary public in and for the District of Columbia, when present on behalf of the parties:

AILLER REPORTING CO., INC. 507 C Street, N E. Washington, D C. 20002 202) 146-6666

AΤ

APPEARANCES:

On Behalf of the Plaintiff: HARLOW R. CASE, ESO. Jack H. Olender & Associates 1634 Eye Street, Northwest 11th Floor Washington, D.C. 20006 On Behalf of the Defendants, Howard University MARIANNE DUNAITIS, ESQ. Jordan Coyne Savits & Lopata 1030 15th Street, Northwest Washington, D.C. 20005 On Behalf of the Defendant, Dr. Tanner McMahon: JAMES P. GLEASON, JR., ESQ. Gleason & Flynn, Chartered 2275 Research Boulevard Suite 220 Rockville, Maryland 20850 On Behalf of Defendant, Dr. Lofton: DEE TAHMIN, ESQ. Mahoney, Hogan, Heffler & Heald 777 14th Street, Northwest Suite 600 Washington, D.C. 20005 CONTENTS EXAMINATION BY COUNSEL FOR WITNESS PLAINTIFF DEFENDANTS ELIAS GEORGE CHALHUB, M.D. 3

AILLER REPORTING CO., INC. 507 C Street, N.E. Washington, D.C. 20002 202) 946-6666

PROCEEDINGS 2 Whereupon, 5 the Notary Public, was examined and testified as follows: EXAMINATION BY COUNSEL FOR PLAINTIFF BY MR. CASE: а Q Doctor, please give us your full name. g Elias George Chalhub. Α What is your residence address, Doctor? 10 0 3970 Pine Brook Drive, South Mobile, Alabama. 11 Α Have you given a deposition since October of 1991? Q 12 13 Yes. Α How many times? 14 Q I don't know the exact number; four or five. 15 Α 16 What did those four or five depositions in the last 0 six or seven months involve? 17 A workmen's comp case and some medical negligence 18 А 19 cases. 2 d Q would it be fair to say that there was one worker's 21 comp case and the remainder were medical negligence cases? 22 I guess in general. I really don't recall the Α

MILLER REPORTING CO., INC. 307 C Street. N.E. Washington. D.C. 20002 202) 146-6666

lrk

lrk

specifics of either one of them. It's my understanding that there were four or five 0 cases; is that correct? 3 To the best of my recollection, yes. Α And you can tell us today that one of them was a 5 0 6 worker's comp? I believe so. 7 Α What was the issue in that case? 8 Q I think it was a back injury. 9 Α What role did you play in that back injury case? 10 0 I was the treating physician. 11 Α 12 In the remaining cases, what were the issues? 0 13 Α I don't remember the cases, so I really can't tell you. Did they involve causation in obstetrical negligenc 1 0 matters? No, not all of them. Α 1 Did any of them? 0 1 Yes, I believe so. 19 Α How many of them? 20 0 I don't know. 2 1 Α 22 In the cases where you were offering causation 0

 WILLER REPORTING CO., INC.

 507 C Street, N.E.

 Washington, D.C.
 20002

 202) 546-6666

testimony in obstetric medical malpractice cases in the last six months, were you testifying for doctors and physicians and hospitals, or were you testifying for the patient? Neither. Α 0 Excuse me? Neither. Α 0 Who were you testifying for? I was retained by an attorney to testify on beha f Α of his client. Q And was that client, Doctor, a hospital or 1 C physician? 11 12 Α I really don't recall. You don't remember that? 0 13 No; whether it was a physician or a hospital. 14 Α Was it one or the other? 15 Q 16 Probably. Α Is there any doubt in your mind? 0 17 Is there any doubt in my mind about what, Mr. Case? Α 18 Is there any doubt in -- we can make this depositio 0 19 go on for hours if you would like, Doctor, but I think you 2C know precisely what I am saying. 21 I don't need to be reprimanded by you, Mr. Case. 22 Α **HILLER REPORTING CO., INC.**

lrk

507 C Street. N.E. Vashington, D.C. 20002 302) 546-6666

I

don't want to go on for hours either, but if your question is not clear I can't answer it.

0 Doctor, I have deposed -- I believe you are the last expert in this case. I haven't had to get into this kind of row with any of them.

I'm not trying to get into a row with you. If you Α would ask a direct question, I'll answer it.

If you would take the clear understanding of my 0 question perhaps we could move this along. In those cases, is there any doubt in your mind that you were offering 1 testimony on behalf of a physician or a hospital? 1

There were other defendants, and I cannot tell you, Α 1 1 besides a physician or a hospital. I believe there were some 1 nurses. So, I am not trying to be difficult, but if you want me to be accurate, I will just have to say I can't tell you. 1

> 0 Were you testifying for defendants?

Α Yes.

1

1

2

2

2

Q When is the last time that you offered causation 1 testimony in an obstetric medical negligence case where you 1 offered an opinion that negligence was the cause of an infant's **neurology** deficits?

> I don't believe I have done that in many years. Α

WILLER REPORTINO CO.. INC. 507 C Street, N.E. Washington, D.C. 20002 (202) 146-6666

	Q	Have you ever done it?								
	A	I'm not usually asked that question.								
	Q deficits	Have you ever testified that a child's neurolo gic 								
!	A	That a child's neurologic deficit is the cause?								
ł	Q	Was caused by?								
	A	Yes, I have.								
٤	Q	How many times?								
¢	А	Twice.								
1(Q	When were those two occasions.								
1:	Α	They were a number of years ago.								
1:	Q	Do you recall where that was?								
1:	A	I believe one was in California and one was in								
14	Arkansas.									
15	Q	Do you remember the lawyer for the patient in the								
16	Californi	a case?								
17	А	No, I don't.								
18	Q	Do you remember the lawyer for the patient in the								
19	Arkansas	case?								
2(А	No, I don't.								
21	Q	Have you ever testified for either of those								
22	gentlemen	or ladies again?								

AILLER REPORTING CO.. INC. 107 C Street. N.E. 1723shington, D.C. 20002 202) 546-6666

Α 1 1 1 2 2 case. 2 AILLER REPORTING CO., INC. 107 C Street, N.E. Washington, D.C. 20002 202) 146-6666

whether I have or not. Was the Arkansas lawyer Ralph Cloar? 0 Ralph who? Α Cloar. 0 No, that doesn't sound familiar. Α Are you the doctor who flies first-class to trial? Q MR. GLEASON: I object to that question. fly first-class to trial if you could fly there. THE WITNESS: BY MR. CASE: 1 0 trials out of town; isn't that the case? I don't know what your understanding is. I fly first-class most of the time whether I take a vacation or go on my own business or anybody else's business. It doesn't make any difference whether it has to do with a malpractice Doctor, if you come to Washington, D.C. to testify Q

Α If I can't remember the names, I can't tell you

You would

I take a plane, Mr. Case. Whether I 1 fly first-class or tourist-class usually depends on the time 1 and the availability. It really doesn't make any difference. 1

It was my understanding from the Stevens case that 1 you fly first-class when you go to depositions out of town or 1 1

lrk

-

	in this case, re you coming first-class?											
	A I don't know. I'll tell you when I make the											
	reservations, but I will be glad to tell you.											
	Q Will you please have that information available at											
	trial in this case? Will you Doctor?											
	Α	Sure, Mr. Case, if that is important to you.										
	Q	It may be important to the jury, Doctor.										
	A	Oh really? Tell me why.										
	Q	I'm not being deposed.										
1		Doctor, when were you first contacted in this case?										
1	Α	Let me see if I can recall. Approximately a year										
1.	ago, I be	elieve, Mr. Case.										
1.	Q	Do you have any information available to you that										
1.	would tel	ll you when it was?										
1!	Α	No, I don't. I don't keep cover letters and I was										
11	contacted	d, I believe, by phone, so I can't tell you exactly										
1'	the date.											
11	Q	Who contacted you?										
1!	Α	I believe Mr. Gleason did.										
2(Q	Had you met Mr. Gleason before?										
2.	Α	I don't think so.										
2:	Q	Have you met him since?										

WILLER REPORTING CO., INC. 507 C Street, N E. ∀ashington, D C. 20002 202) 546-6666 lrk

I believe I have. А 0 Under what circumstances? By phone; I don't think I have met him in person. Α Since October of 1991, have you offered opinions in 0 any other cases arising out of care rendered in the District 5 of Columbia other than this case? 6 I believe there was a case with your firm, and I А honestly can't remember the name of it. Stevens seems to be 8 what comes to mind, but I can't be certain. 9 0 How is it that you remember that case name? 10How is it that I -- I don't know. I guess my 11 Α memory allows me to do that. 12 0 What are the other medical negligence cases that 13 14 you have testified in since October, the case names? 15 А I told you I can't remember all of them. I'm not even certain -- if that is the case with your firm, then that 16 is the correct one. 17 You can remember that case but you can't remember 0 18 the names of the patients in the other cases in which you 19 have testified since October of 1991? 20 21 А No, I'm not even certain that is the correct case 22 for you. I mean, if it is, then tell me.

MILLER REPORTING CO., INC. 507 C Street, N.E. Washington, D.C. 20002 202) 146-6666

		11
	Q	It is.
	А	Well good.
	Q	And you don't know any others that you have
	testified	l in since?
	А	No, I can't recall the names.
		MR. CASE: Do I understand, Jim, that Dr. Chalhub
	is not go	oing to offer testimony on standard of care?
		MR. GLEASON: Correct.
		BY MR. CASE:
Ι	Q	Doctor, what opinions do you hold in this case?
1	A	Concerning what?
1	Q	Concerning anything.
1	A	You mean concerning the cause of this child's
1	neurologi	cal deficit?
1	Q	Do you understand that you are rendering opinions
1	in any ot	ther areas in this case?
1	A	It depends on what you ask, Mr. Case. But, in
1	terms of	what I feel caused this child's neurological problem
1	or the et	ciology of it, it appears to me that this child had a
2	chronic,	intrauterine problem most consistent with a
2	developme	ental abnormality of the brain.
2	Q	Is it your opinion that John's problems are not
INC.		
2		

WILLER REPORTING CO., 507 C Street. N.E. Washington, D.C. 20002 202) 146-6666

lrk

£ 14

lrk

12

related to perinatal asphyxi ?

A How do you define perinatal?

Q Around the time of birth.

A That's not the World Health Organization definition so maybe just restate your question again.

Q Why don't you give me the World Health Organizatioc definition **of** perinatal then.

A From the 28th week of gestation to the 7th day post natally.

Q That's not around the time of birth?

I A The 28th week of gestation is around the time of 1: birth? I guess if you are premature and abort at that time 1. it is, but that is not the usual case.

Q What does "peri" mean?

A "Peri" means around.

Q What does "natal" mean?

A "Natal" means being born.

Q Excepting the World Health Organization definition of perinatal asphyxia, do you believe that John's problems are caused by perinatal asphyxia?

A If you mean whether John's problems are caused by an intrapartum event, which is during the birth and delivery

WILLER REPORTING CO., INC. 507 C Street, N.E. ₩2shington, D.C. 20002 202) 146-6666

Ι

1.

I!

11

1'

2:

2:

process, no, I do not. If you mean whether it is related to something that occurred around the 28th week or about that time, I can't be certain, but it would not be inconsistent with a developmental problem.

What caused this developmental problem, in your 0 opinion?

I don't know the answer to that. Α

Q Is it your testimony that you don't know what caused John's problem but it is not an episode that occurred on the 10th or 11th of April?

It is not an intrapartum event; that is correct. A 12 0 Can you be any more specific as to what the cause of his problem is other than it was a developmental problem? 1

Well, 70 percent of children with neurological 1 Α impairments fall into that category where it is difficult to 1 define the exact citing of the etiological agent that caused 1 the developmental malformation of the brain. We simply have 1 11 no way to mark that on an intrauterine process. I mean, 1! considerations would be some metabolic defect in the mother, 2(an infection, some type of trauma or toxic agent or some 2: abnormality in the genetic **pool**.

Are you aware of any metabolic problem that Mom had

WILLER REPORTING CO., INC. i07 C Street, N.E. Washington, D.C. 20002 202) 146-6666

1

1

2:

0

lrk

that caused or contributed to John's current status?

A No, but those can be transient, and they may not be able to be detected at the time of birth.

Q Are you aware of any documentation of any such transient episode?

A No.

Q Are you aware of any genetic abnormality in John?

A Well he certainly has dysmorphic features, which would be consistent with that.

Q What information do you have on any genetic abnormality that John has, other than that he has dysmorphic features?

A That is evidence enough, Mr. Case.

Q Have you seen the report of Dr. Rosenbaum, the geneticist at Children's Hospital?

A Yes.

1

1

1

1

2

Q Is it your conclusion that he believes there is a
 genetic abnormality.

A I'll just have to pull that report out, if we can find it. I can't remember exactly what he said. Again, it depends on what you mean by genetic.

MR. GLEASON: Harlow, I'm looking for that report,

AILLER REPORTING CO., INC. i07 C Street, N.E. Washington, D.C. 20002 202) 146-6666 if you want him to look at the result of it, so bear with me for a second.

BY MR. CASE:

Q The sentence that I am concerned with, Doctor, is that Dr. Rosenbaum, who is the Director of Medical Genetics at Children's Hospital here, is apparently of the belief that on the basis of physical examination he does not feel that John has a recognizable dysmorphic syndrome. Do you agree with Dr. Rosenbaum?

A Well, you mean in terms of a name for the dysmorphi syndrome; yes, I would agree. But that does not mean that the child does not have dysmorphic features and could possibly have a genetic abnormality. Anybody would agree with that.

1 Q You are aware that anticonvulsant therapy can cause 1 dysmorphic features; are you not?

A I'm not certain that is true.

Q You then disagree with Dr. Rosenbaum, the geneticis at Children's Hospital, who says it is possible these findings are the result of anticonvulsant therapy?

A I would disagree with that, yes.

Q You do disagree with Dr. Rosenbaum?

AILLER REPORTING CO., INC. .07 C Street. N.E. Vashington, D.C. 20002 102) 546-6666

1

1

1

2

2

2

lrk

A No I disagree with the statement you made.
 Q What is your experience or your expertise in genetics?

A As a neurologist and as a pediatrician one sees children with genetic diseases and dysmorphic syndromes as well as mental retardation, and I have done so virtually for the past 22 years.

Q Do you believe he has a recognized dysmorphic syndrome?

A Yes, he has recognized dysmorphic features. In
 terms of a name attributable to a syndrome, no -- but that is
 the majority of children that I would see that have delayed
 development and motor deficits.

Q **Are** you aware of any genetic testing that has been done on John?

A Yes, he has had chromosomes done.

Q What is the result of those tests?

1:AThose are normal, but that is only for chromosomal1:disorder.

MR. CASE: Jim, do I have those test results yet? MR. GLEASON: Yes, you do, Harlow.

MR. CASE: Where?

UILLER REPORTING CD.. INC. i07 C Street, N.E. #ashington, D.C. 20002 :02) 546-6666

1.

1!

11

1

2(

2:

2:

lrk

8

22

MR. GLEASON: You cited them to me at the mediation conference. I assumed that you must have gotten them from Rosenbaum himself because it was just on the day that they came into my office. If you don't have them I will send ther to you. It is a one- or two-page report, Harlow, that just simply indicates that the chromosomal study was negative.

> MR. CASE: How about the karyotype findings? THE WITNESS: Same thing.

9 MR. CASE: I haven't seen those, Jim. I mean, I've
10 got his two-page report that is typewritten that is dated,
11 apparently, April 6th, but I don't have anything else.

MR. GLEASON: If you want to take a break I can get stuff faxed from my office now, if you think it is important enough for you to ask questions about it here, Harlow. I genuinely believed and understood that you had them, and it was simply an oversight that they weren't sent to you.

MR. CASE: I don't doubt that, Jim. The last sentence of Rosenbaum's report says, "Blood was obtained today for a karyotype including a fragile X study along with serum quantitative amino acids and T4 and TSH." Do you have the results of those?

MR. GLEASON: They are not here with us right now.

MR. CASE: But do you know the results, Jim? Negative. MR. GLEASON: MR. CASE: All right. MR. GLEASON: I mean,. the results were reported as normal. MR. CASE: All right. BY MR. CASE: Do those results impact on your opinions at all, 8 0 Doctor? Well, sure; you take everything into consideration, 1 А 1 Mr. Case. I'm sure we do. Does that impact on your opinions 1 0 that John has some dysmorphic syndrome? 1 John has dysmorphic features. I don't know what Α 1 1 you mean by impact. I mean, it is evidence that you take into consideration of all the facts. 1 What types of anticonvulsant therapy has John had 1 0 over his lifetime? 1 He has had a number of medications and -- I'm not 1 А 2 sure, without having all the charts to go to, to be honest 2 with you -- I may leave some out: phenobarbital, dilantin, 2 valproic acid, Valium, tegretol and there are some others,

WILLER REPORTING CO., INC. 507 C Street, N.E. Washington, D.C. 20002 202) 546-6666

lrk

```
but I did not look, so I don't know.
         0
              Which of those medications over time can cause an
    individual to develop dysmorphic features?
              I'm not aware that any of them can do that.
         Α
         Q
              When is the last time you looked at that issue?
              I look at it all the time.
         Α
         Q
              Today; yesterday?
              THE WITNESS: Hold on just a second for me.
                                                             I have
    to take a call.
1
               [Break.]
              BY MR. CASE:
1
              What is the cause of the unnamed dysmorphic
         Q
1
    syndrome that you believe John has?
1
              I don't think anybody knows the answer to that, as
         Α
1
    to why there are abnormalities in development of organs and
1
    brains.
             I don't know the answer to that.
1
         Q
              Do you believe that this boy has lysosomal-storage
1
    disease?
1
              Do I believe that he has a lysosomal-storage
1
         Α
2
    disease? No; I don't.
2
         Q
              Why not?
              He doesn't fit the criteria.
2
         Α
```

VILLER REPORTING CO.. INC. 307 C Street, N.E. Washington, D.C. 20002 202) 546-6666

lrk			20
, man		Q	Do you know Susan Farrell?
		A	Do I know her? No, I don't know her personally.
		Q	Do you know her by reputation?
		A	Yes.
		Q	What was John's condition at birth?
		A	John was depressed at birth.
		Q	How depressed?
		Α	It doesn't say how depressed. The operative report
		says he w	as depressed and meconium-stained and was given
	1	Apgar's o	f 1 to 2 at 1 minute and 4 to 6 at 5 minutes.
۹.	1	Q	Do you know what he got the 1 to 2 I-minute Apgar
	1	points fo	r ?
	1	А	No, I don't believe that is itemized.
	1.	Q	You don't believe that is what? Excuse me, Doctor?
	1!	Α	Was itemized or delineated. At least I am not
	1	aware tha	t it <i>is.</i>
	1'	Q	To your knowledge, was he born with a heartbeat?
	1:	A	It says that he was not it really is not
	1:	commented	on by the obstetrician or in the progress notes, so
	21	I assume	that he was.
	2.	Q	Was he born blue?
	2:	А	I don't know. It says he was depressed and
* * .			
	TING CO., INC.		

507 C Street, N.E. Washington, D.C. 20002 202) 546-6666

AILLER

٤

meconium-stained.

0 Was he born limp?

Α If he had Apgar's of 1 to 2, I would assume he probably was.

0 Was he born not breathing?

He was depressed. А

Do you know whether he was born breathing or not? 0

It depends on which report you read. The report of А the pediatrician on 4-12 says "not breathing and with no heartbeat." However, the operative report says he is 1 depressed and the progress notes say that he has Apgar's of 1 1 to 2, so he has to at least be breathing and have some heart 1 rate to have Apgar's of 1 to 2. 1

0 What are you assuming was his condition at birth? 1. Are you assuming he was or wasn't breathing, or you don't 1 know? 11

I'm assuming from the records that he was depressed 1 Α What specifically, regarding his respiratory 0 status, are you assuming, Doctor -- that he was breathing or 1! that he wasn't breathing or you don't know?

Α I don't know. I mean, it is on the reports he was depressed, and whether that means he had a gasping respiration

AILLER REPORTING CO., INC. 507 C Street, N.E. Washington, D.C. 20002 202) 546-6666

1:

21

2

2:

23	l or no r¤spiration I Don t know.	2 Q WPY was than Pis condition at wirtb?	3 A WP Y? Bpca sp hp was nwwrołogic p lly impairpu	4 Q BO YON BE ROHDER?	A No I Don't bulieve so.	6 Q we you have wn opinion what th∞ cousp of JoHo.s	7 right wrist Drop wag tbut is recorded in the records?	A It was propo21y Due to some owurological impairment	During Dows Lopmont	Q How long pip that wrist prop last?	A I don t know wwastly It wos DwacrabeD at the time	of birth I pont spatt comectap on a latar time, so I	gan't tell you.	I Q IFN.t that important for gon to know in order to	s rander an opinion that the ist Drop is associated to	s neurologic damage that he sustained in utero?	A No.	2 Why not?	A Deca_sp to Pave a wrist propping, wether it is on) a transient or a permanent basis, implies that either there	u was malpositioning or malDowelopment, and if it wom	pursistant it would Pave Ruen duscribed and Lid indicate		
lrk	I		1	4	u)	ę		J	σ	10	11	12	С Н	14	15	16	17	18	19	20	21	22	I	ARLER REPORTING CO., INC. 507 C Street, N.E. Washington, D.C. 20002 202) 546-6666

some other structural damage.

1 It is my understanding that you have discounted 0 2 malpositioning as a cause; is that true? I have discounted malpositioning as a cause? Α Ι don't understand that question. 5 Are you discounting malpositioning as a cause of 0 6 this child's right wrist drop at birth? Α No, I'm not discounting that. 9 0 Do you believe that the right wrist drop is caused by malpositioning? 10 It could be. Α 11 0 Do you have an opinion to a reasonable degree of 12 medical certainty in this case that his right wrist drop is 13 associated with malpositioning? 14 It is certainly a possibility, and if it would it 15 Α 16 would indicate that the child was neurologically impaired and malpositioned. 17 Why is that? 0 18 Why is what? 19 Α Why is what you just said? 20 0 21 I don't understand what you mean by why is what. Α Itemize that for me. 2

WILLER REPORTING CO., INC. 507 C Street, N.E. Washington, D.C. 20002 202) 146-6666

Q	s it your testimony that the onl	y child who is
malpositio	ed in utero is a neurologically-	-damaged one?

A Categorically and unequivocally in every, single situation, no; but in this situation, yes.

Q Why?

٤

13

17

18

19

20

21

22

A Because this child has dysmorphic features, the child **has** evidence of a chronic problem, he is neurologically impaired and has right wrist drop.

Q When are dysmorphic features first noted in John? A I think at about 19 -- about a year of age, I believe. I would have to go back and look at the exact month.

Q Can you do that, please?

A Well, I would have to go through all the records.
I think it is at approximately a year of age.

16 Q Who did that?

A I don't remember.

Q Under what circumstances did that person do that?

- A I believe an examination.
- **Q** What type of examination?
 - A A physical examination.

Q Well was it a physiatrist? Was it a neurologist?

MILLER REPORTING CO., INC. 507 C street, N.E. Washington, D.C. 20002 202) 546-6666

Was it a geneticist? Do you know who did it? I don't recall the name. Α 0 Do you know what type of doctor it was? Α No. Does the status of John's fontanelle -- is that of 0 any significance to you in this case? No. Α Is that a yes? 8 0 9 "No," I said. Α You observed the status of his fontanelle at birth? 1**d** 0 I observed it? 11 А 12 In the records. 0 Yes, I observed the records. I have no difficulty 13 А with it. 14 YOU don't believe that that tends to prove or 15 0 disprove either this was caused by perinatal asphyxia or by 16 some neurologic developmental disorder? 17 No, I don't believe that that either proves or 18 Α 19 disproves that. 20 Q Do you have an opinion as to what was causing the Type-2 dips that Dr. George saw in this case? 21 2 I'm sorry; I missed that. Say that again? А

AILLER REPORTING CO.. INC. 507 C Street, N.E. Washington, D.C. 20002 202) 146-6666

AILLER REPORTING CO., INC. 107 C Street, N E.

1

2

2

2:

107 C Street, N E. Washington, D C. 20002 202) 546-6666 Q Yes; do you have an opinion as to what was causing the Type-2 dips that Dr. George saw in this case?

A No, I don't.

Q Doctor, **do** you have an opinion as to what effect, if any, the X-rays that **Ms.** Merriweather apparently had during the first trimester had in this case?

A Do I have an opinion **as** to what they had?

Q What effect they had, if any.

A No, well, I mean, I don't know if there is any specific and direct relationship. You know, 14 to 16 X-rays during a pregnancy certainly could be some type of inciting event in terms of development. Whether it is or not, there is just no way for me to tell you that.

1 Q Did you review -- why don't you give me a list of 1 the materials that you did review in this case.

16 A Sure. The Freedman's Hospital records of Donno
1 Merriweather and John Merriweather; the Group Health
1 Association records of 1973; Howard University records --

MR, GLEASON: Do you want me to help with this, Harlow?

MR. CASE: Please.

THE WITNESS: -- Easter Seal Society records, and

there are various dates of those; Dr. Walton's records --

MR, GLEASON: That's the prenatal record.

THE WITNESS: -- and the series with Children's Hospital records, and that will take me a while if you want every single date.

MR. GLEASON: Let me give you the beginning date 6 7 and the end date of the hospitalizations, and if you want all the ones in between, I'll do it but they are mostly emergency 8 9 treatment record notes. They start on January 24th of '82 and the last one is June 10th of '91 at Children's. He also 10 11 has other records from Children's beginning -- let's see, 12 we've got -- July 18th of '77, July 4th of '83, July 27th of '88, August 23rd of '89, August 31st, '89, December 12th, 13 '89, August 14th of '90 and September 21st of '91. 14

He also, of course, has Donno Merriweather's and John's from Freedman's. He has also received some other Group Health records from me more recently, and those would be those that go back -- let's see if I can find some dates on here -- in essence it is all of Donno Merriweather's records from GHA.

MR. CASE: Okay.

THE WITNESS: Then there are three CT scans. The

WHLLEF REPORTINO CO., INC. 507 C Succe. N.E. Washington, D.C. 20002 202) 146-6666

21

22

lrk

2

3

4

4

27

dates of those are 7-27-88, 7-5-83 and 8-89. MR. GLEASON: All those are from Children's. Then, also, a number of depositions, 3 THE WITNESS: of Drs. Cherish, Abramson, Crawford, Nathanson, Brown -- did 4 5 I mention Cherish? MR. CASE: Yes. THE WITNESS: It seems to me there was one more. Ι believe that's it. There may be an additional one. 8 I don't 9 have -- I just couldn't carry all the depositions today. 10 BY MR. CASE: 0 Did you review the depositions of Drs. LoftOn and 11 George and McMahon? 12 Α 13 Yes. 0 And Mrs. Merriweather? 14 Α Yes. 15 How many hours did it take you to review all these 16 0 materials? 17 I believe about 10 hours. 18 Α 19 And your hourly rate is what? Q Α \$175. Doctor, you indicated you reviewed the prenatal 0 2 chart for Mrs. Merriweather at Dr. Lofton's office?

ATLLER REPORTING CO.. INC. 507 C Street. N.E. Washington, D.C. 20002 202) 546-6666 lrk

29

A Yes.

Q Is there any information in there that causes you concern?

A No.

Q Is there anything about her weight gain that cause: you concern?

A No.

Q Anything in the fetal heart rates reported there that leads you to believe that they are suggestive of an 10 impending neurologically-compromised infant?

A That's probably out of my area of expertise. I
 really have no comment.

Q Why is that out of your area of expertise?

A I am not an obstetrician.

1: Q Do you have an opinion one way or the other whether 1: this baby is growth-retarded?

1: A **Yes.** I don't believe the baby is significantly 1; growth-retarded.

19 MR. CASE: That's all I've got, Doctor. Thank you
20 very much, Jim. Thank you, Doctor.

THE WITNESS: Thanks a lot. I would like to read and sign that if I could, please.

MILLER REPORTING CO., INC. 507 C Street, N.E. Washington, D.C. 20002 202) 146-6666

1:

14

2:

2:

(Whereupon, at 3:05 p.m., the taking of the deposition concluded.)

(Signature not waived.)

 WILLER REPORTING CO., INC.

 507 C Street, N.E.

 Washington, D.C. 20002

 (202) 546-6666



55495

July 38, 1992

Harlow R. Case, Esq. Jack H. Olender & Assoc. 11th Floor 1634 Eye Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20006

> re: Merriweather v. Howard Univ. Hospital, et al Pages 1 thru 32 May 29, 1992

Dear Mr. Case:

4

Enclosed, please find the Original (unsigned) deposition of ELIAS CHARLES CHALHUB, M.D. as attempts to have the deponent read and sign the deposition has failed. This deposition is being SENT without signature,

Very truly yours, Robert E. Balan.

Robert E. Bailey

cc: Despina Tahmin, Esq. Marianne I. Dunaitis, Esq. James P, Gleason, Esq.

Registered Professional Reporters NSRA Certificate of Merit Computer-assisted Transcription Discovery ZX, ASCII and WordPerfect Depositions

507 C Street, N.E. Washington, **D.C.**20002 (202) 546-6666 Fax (202) 546-1502 Arbitrations Congressional Hearings International Meetings Conventions Conferences

CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER

THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

IN THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

I, Alice Toigo, Notary Public, before whom the foregoing deposition was taken, do hereby certify that the witness whose testimony appears in the foregoing pages was duly sworn by me; that the testimony of said witness was recorded by me by stenomask and thereafter reduced to typewritten form; that said deposition is a true record of the testimony given by said witness; that I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties to the action in which this deposition is taken; and, further, that I am not a relative of or employee of any attorney or counsel employed by the parties thereto, nor financially or otherwise interested in the outcome of the action.

> Alice Toigo Notary Public My commission expires: July 14, 1992

ORIGINAL

TRANSCRIPT	OF	PROCEEDINGS
------------	----	-------------

SUPERIOR COURT OF THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

CIVIL DIVISION

DONNO R. MERRIWEATHER, as Mother) and Next Friend of) JOHN MERRIWEATHER, a Disabled Minor,)

Plaintiff,

Defendants.

--1/2--

1. 1

HOWARD UNIVERSITY, INC., t/a HOWARD UNIVERSITY HOSPITAL, et al., Civil Action No. 91-CA4094

Calendar 10

Deposition of ELIAS CHARLES CHALHUB, M.D.

)

9

)

)

)

?ages 1 thru 32

Washington, C.C. May 29, 1992

MILLER REPORTING COMPANY, INC. 507 C Street. N.Z. Washington. D.C. 20002 (202) 546-6666

4-261> Estate of Ashley Carr

DEPOSITION OF ELIAS CHALUB, M.D. [Estate of John Merriweather, disabled minor]

TAKEN ON MAY 29, 1992 by HARLOW CASE, ESQ.

<u>Pg/Ln</u>

27

9/18 In response to did he have info available as to when contacted: "I don't keep cover letters:

25/18 Fontanelle neither proves nor **disproves** perinatal asphyxia at **time** of birth

1.202.294.8984. Meniw, U. Houard 5.29.1992. 9/15- I don't beg chur litter S. fontmelle mette proves non disproves - perinatal aslft at the og binth.

ELIAS CHALHUB, M.D. - Deposition Index Merriweather vs. Howard University, Inc., et al.

- 4) Treating doctor in a back injury case.
- 11) Chronic intrauterine problem consistent with a developmental abnormality of the brain.
- 13) Don't know what caused it; not an intrapartum event.